# On the paradox of thriving cold-water coral reefs in the food-limited deep sea

Sandra R. Maier<sup>1,2,</sup>\* ®, Sandra Brooke<sup>3</sup>, Laurence H. De Clippele<sup>4</sup>, Evert de Froe<sup>5,6</sup> ®, Anna-Selma van der Kaaden<sup>2</sup>, Tina Kutti<sup>7</sup>, Furu Mienis<sup>6</sup> and Dick van Oevelen<sup>2</sup>

 $^1$ Greenland Climate Research Centre, Greenland Institute of Natural Resources, Kivioq 2, PO Box 570, Nuuk 3900, Greenlana

 $^2$ Department of Estuarine and Delta Systems, Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ), Korringaweg 7, Yerseke 4401 NT, The Netherlands

 $^3$ Coastal & Marine Laboratory, Florida State University, 3618 Coastal Highway 98, St. Teresa, FL 32327, USA

<sup>4</sup>Changing Oceans Research Group, School of GeoSciences, University of Edinburgh, Grant Institute, King's Buildings, Edinburgh, EH9 3FE, UK<br><sup>5</sup>Centre for Eisheries Ecosystem Research, Eisheries and Marine Institute at Mem

 $^5$ Centre for Fisheries Ecosystem Research, Fisheries and Marine Institute at Memorial University of Newfoundland, 155 Ridge Rd, St. John's NL A1C 5R3, Newfoundland and Labrador, Canada

 $^6$ Department of Ocean Systems, Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ), PO Box 59, Den Burg (Texel) 1790 AB, The Netherlands <sup>7</sup> Institute of Marine Research (IMR), PO box 1870 Nordnes, Bergen NO-5817, Norway

#### ABSTRACT

The deep sea is amongst the most food-limited habitats on Earth, as only a small fraction  $\langle 4\% \rangle$  of the surface primary production is exported below 200 m water depth. Here, cold-water coral (CWC) reefs form oases of life: their biodiversity compares with tropical coral reefs, their biomass and metabolic activity exceed other deep-sea ecosystems by far. We critically assess the paradox of thriving CWC reefs in the food-limited deep sea, by reviewing the literature and open-access data on CWC habitats. This review shows firstly that CWCs typically occur in areas where the food supply is not constantly low, but undergoes pronounced temporal variation. High currents, downwelling and/or vertically migrating zooplankton temporally boost the export of surface organic matter to the seabed, creating 'feast' conditions, interspersed with 'famine' periods during the non-productive season. Secondly, CWCs, particularly the most common reef-builder Desmophyllum pertusum (formerly known as Lophelia pertusa), are well adapted to these fluctuations in food availability. Laboratory and in situ measurements revealed their dietary flexibility, tissue reserves, and temporal variation in growth and energy allocation. Thirdly, the high structural and functional diversity of CWC reefs increases resource retention: acting as giant filters and sustaining complex food webs with diverse recycling pathways, the reefs optimise resource gains over losses. Anthropogenic pressures, including climate change and ocean acidification, threaten this fragile equilibrium through decreased resource supply, increased energy costs, and dissolution of the calcium-carbonate reef framework. Based on this review, we suggest additional criteria to judge the health of CWC reefs and their chance to persist in the future.

 $Key$  words: trophic interaction, carbon, nitrogen, respiration, recycling loop, ecosystem engineer, organic matter, cold-water coral reef, climate change, food web.

## **CONTENTS**



Author for correspondence (Tel.:  $+299 233 171$ ; E-mail: [sama@natur.gl](mailto:sama@natur.gl)).

Biological Reviews 98 (2023) 1768–1795 © 2023 The Authors. Biological Reviews published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Cambridge Philosophical Society.

This is an open access article under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

<span id="page-1-0"></span>

# I. INTRODUCTION

The deep sea is the largest habitat on Earth, located below the continental shelf break from ca. 200 m water depth (Ramirez-Llodra et al., [2010](#page-25-0), [2011\)](#page-25-0). Here, far below the productive waters at the ocean surface, coldwater corals (CWCs, Fig. [1](#page-2-0)) form reefs of surprisingly high biodiversity, biomass, and metabolic activity (Fig. [2,](#page-3-0) Freiwald et al., [2004](#page-22-0); Roberts, Wheeler & Freiwald, [2006](#page-25-0); Cathalot et al., [2015;](#page-21-0) De Clippele et al., [2021](#page-22-0)a).

CWCs encompass different taxonomic groups within the classes Hexacorallia, Octocorallia (sensu McFadden, Ofwegen & Quattrini, [2022\)](#page-24-0), and Hydrozoa. In contrast to their well-known warm-water relatives, CWCs occur at relatively low temperatures (i.e.  $\langle 14 \degree C$  for reef-building CWCs; Freiwald et al., [2004;](#page-22-0) Gómez et al., [2022](#page-22-0)), facilitating an almost global distribution in the deep sea (i.e. >200 m water depth, Fig. [3A\)](#page-4-0). However, they can also occur at shallower depths, e.g. at 36 m depth in Norwegian fjords, when oceanographic conditions are suitable. Many CWCs create structurally complex and diverse 'marine animal forests' (reviewed by Rossi et al., [2017\)](#page-25-0), including soft coral (Octocorallia) gardens (e.g. Long et al., [2020;](#page-24-0) Schejter et al., [2020\)](#page-26-0), black coral (Antipatharia) gardens (e.g. Rakka et al., [2017](#page-25-0), [2020](#page-25-0)), lace coral (Stylasteridae) gardens (e.g. Di Camillo et al., [2017](#page-22-0)), and stony coral (Scleractinia) reefs. In this review, we focus on scleractinian CWCs that can form or contribute to large, long-lasting carbonate reefs in the deep sea (Table [1](#page-5-0)). Small coral polyps  $\leq 1$  cm diameter; Filander et al., [2021\)](#page-22-0) secrete an aragonite (calcium carbonate) skeleton and together can form  $\sim$  1.5 m-high CWC colonies (Fig. [1](#page-2-0); Wilson, [1979](#page-27-0)). Live polyps are restricted to the upper and outer parts of the colonies, as coral polyps in the inner parts become shaded from food-delivering currents and die (Fig. [2](#page-3-0); Wilson, [1979](#page-27-0); Mortensen & Fosså, [2006;](#page-24-0) Hennige et al., [2021\)](#page-23-0). The carbonate skeleton becomes exposed to physical and biological erosion (Beuck & Freiwald, [2005\)](#page-21-0), which causes fragments to break off and develop into new colonies around the original colony (Fig. [2](#page-3-0)). The extending coral framework traps mobile (e.g. resuspended) sediment, leading to framework cementation and formation of elevated, kilometres-long CWC reefs

(Dorschel et al., [2005](#page-22-0); Roberts et al., [2006](#page-25-0)). Over time, CWCs develop large carbonate structures such as the CWC mounds at Rockall Bank in the North East Atlantic, which are 300 m high and thousands to millions of years old (Roberts et al., [2006](#page-25-0)).

The topologically complex reef framework, especially the 'dead' skeleton, provides habitat, feeding grounds and spawning/nursery areas for a variety of associated species (Fig. [2](#page-3-0)), including sessile suspension feeders, such as sponges, other corals, and bivalves (Jonsson *et al.*, [2004;](#page-23-0) Mortensen & Fosså, [2006](#page-24-0); Henry & Roberts, [2007](#page-23-0), [2016;](#page-23-0) Cordes et al., [2008](#page-21-0)), mobile invertebrates, and commercially and socio-economically valuable fish (Costello et al., [2005](#page-21-0); Henry et al., [2013](#page-23-0); Kutti et al., [2014](#page-24-0)). Furthermore, a diverse microbial community grows on and inside the reef framework and associated with reef animals such as sponges and corals (Schöttner et al., [2012,](#page-26-0) [2013;](#page-26-0) Cardoso et al., [2013;](#page-21-0) van Bleijswijk et al., [2015\)](#page-26-0). The biodiversity of CWC reefs is on a par with tropical shallowwater coral reefs (Jonsson et al., [2004;](#page-23-0) Mortensen & Fosså, [2006](#page-24-0); Henry & Roberts, [2007\)](#page-23-0) and directly benefits humanity, e.g. through the provision of fisheries species for food and biotechnological resources for drug development (Rocha et al., [2011](#page-25-0); Armstrong et al., [2014](#page-20-0)). Moreover, the reefs form hotspots of biomass, metabolic activity, and carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) turnover in the deep sea (van Oevelen et al., [2009](#page-26-0); Cathalot et al., [2015](#page-21-0); De Froe et al.,  $2019$ ; De Clippele et al.,  $2021a,b$  $2021a,b$  $2021a,b$ ). Due to their high organic matter retention and biomass, CWC reefs have the potential to sequester C for decades to centuries (Dorschel et al., [2007](#page-22-0); Titschack et al., [2009](#page-26-0); Coppari, Zanella & Rossi, [2019\)](#page-21-0).

The high biodiversity, biomass and metabolic activity of CWC reefs appear paradoxical, as the deep seafloor belongs to the most food-limited habitats on Earth (Ramirez-Llodra et al., [2010\)](#page-25-0). Due to the absence of light, CWCs lack zooxanthellae (Freiwald et al., [2004](#page-22-0)), i.e. symbiotic dinoflagellates that contribute to the nutrition of most reef-building shallow-water corals (Goldberg, [2013](#page-22-0)). Like most deep-sea benthos, CWCs depend on organic matter produced in the sunlit surface waters, such as phytodetritus (remains of phytoplankton), zooplankton, and zooplankton remains (e.g. dead

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1. Reef-forming or structure-forming cold-water corals (CWCs) (see Table [1\)](#page-5-0). (A) Desmophyllum pertusum colony on the wall of Baltimore Canyon, Western Atlantic (434 m). Credit: Deepwater Canyons 2012 Expedition NOAA-OER/BOEM/USGS. (B) Enallopsammia cf. pusilla from the Hawaiian Seamounts (~800 m). Credit: NOAA-OER, 2015 Hohonu Moana. (C) Enallopsammia rostrata colony on the deep wall of the West Florida Escarpment (1900 m). Credit: Brooke et al. ([2022\)](#page-21-0), NOAA-OER/ROV Global Explorer. (D) Enallopsammia profunda from the coral mounds of the southeastern USA (770 m). Credit: Brooke et al. ([2005\)](#page-21-0), NOAA-OE. (E) Madrepora oculata from the coral mounds off Cape Canaveral, Florida (420 m). Credit: Ross & Quattrini ([2009\)](#page-25-0); NOAA DSCRTP/CIOERT/USGS. (F) Madrepora oculata colony on exposed rocky habitats of the Florida Straits, USA (400 m). Credit: Brooke et al. ([2005](#page-21-0)), NOAA-OE. (G) Madrepora carolina colony collected from the Rosalind Bank, Nicaragua (162 m). Credit: Stephen Cairns, Smithsonian Institute of Natural History, USA. (H) Solenosmilia variabilis with individual, larger polyps of Desmophyllum dianthus on the wall of Norfolk Canyon, Western Atlantic (1200 m). Credit: Deepwater Canyons 2013 Expedition NOAA-OER/BOEM/USGS. Scale bars, green: 1 cm, blue: 5 cm, white: 10 cm.

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Fig. 2. Cold-water coral (CWC) reefs, hotspots of biodiversity. (A) Reef framework formed by Desmophyllum pertusum and Madrepora oculata on the Oreo CWC Mound (summit: 750 m depth), SE slope of Rockall Bank, NE Atlantic; large crinoids (orange) and stylasterid corals (white) live on the reef framework. Credit: Research cruise 64PE4202F. (B) Large colonies of D. pertusum on the West Florida Slope; these mounds provide habitat for golden crabs (Chaceon fenneri), which are fished commercially in the southeastern USA (567 m). Credit DISCOVRE expedition 2010 USGS/ BOEMRE. (C) Live and dead structure of a  $D$ . pertusum colony off Cape Canaveral, Florida (430 m) with a blackbelly rosefish (Helicolenus dactylopterus) on the top of the colony, a galatheid crab (Eumunida picta) and a Chain Catshark (Scyliorhinus cf. retifer). Credit: Ross & Quattrini [\(2009](#page-25-0)), NOAA DSCRTP/ CIOERT/USGS. Scale bars (top of images): 10 cm.

zooplankton, faecal pellets) (Duineveld, Lavaleye & Berghuis, [2004;](#page-22-0) Duineveld et al., [2007;](#page-22-0) Naumann et al., [2015;](#page-25-0) van Oevelen et al., [2018\)](#page-26-0). Phytodetritus and zooplankton faecal pellets aggregate and slowly sink from the photic zone to the deep sea as exported particulate organic matter (POM) (Turner, [2015](#page-26-0)). In addition, live zooplankton perform diurnal and/or seasonal vertical migrations between shallow and deep waters (Bandara et al., [2021](#page-20-0)). As passive suspension feeders, CWCs require currents to deliver food particles (Hamann & Blanke, [2022\)](#page-23-0), which they capture with their tentacles or with mucus nets (Zetsche et al., [2016](#page-27-0); Murray et al., [2019](#page-25-0)).

With increasing depth, the vertical flux of particulate organic carbon (POC) decreases exponentially (Fig. [4A](#page-6-0)), as zooplankton and bacterioplankton consume a substantial fraction of the sinking organic material (Suess, [1980;](#page-26-0) Lutz, Dunbar & Caldeira, [2002;](#page-24-0) Boyd & Trull, [2007\)](#page-21-0). In the North Atlantic, 2.5 to 10 mol POC  $m^{-2}$  year<sup>-1</sup> is exported from the photic zone in coastal areas, but only around 0.1 mol POC  $m^{-2}$  year<sup>-1</sup> (1–4%) arrives in the bathyal deep sea (>200 m; Fig. [4A,](#page-6-0) see online Supporting Information, Table S1). On CWC reefs, 0.0003–3.5 mol POC  $m^{-2}$  year<sup>-1</sup> are deposited, as measured by sediment traps deployed at 481–850 m water depth (Fig. [4A](#page-6-0)). At the same time, CWC reefs respire 4–45 mol oxygen m−<sup>2</sup> year−<sup>1</sup> , up to 20 times more than adjacent soft-sediment communities [respiration rates extrapolated from daily measurements of reef-community oxygen consumption on different reefs in the North Atlantic during spring/summer (Cathalot et al., [2015;](#page-21-0) De Froe *et al.*, [2019\)](#page-22-0)]. Assuming a respiratory quotient  $CO_2:O_2$  of 1 (as estimated for CWCs; Khripounoff et al., [2014](#page-23-0)), this leads to a C turnover of 4–45 mol C m<sup>-2</sup> year<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. [4B;](#page-6-0) note that C refers to organic C throughout this review). To sustain this high C turnover, the reefs require an amount C that is orders of magnitude higher than the amount of POC deposited in sediment traps (Fig. [4B](#page-6-0)). The reefs even seem to require a substantial part of the entire primary production at the ocean surface [almost 100% of the local primary production above Mingulay Reef (De Clippele et al., [2021](#page-22-0)a); 5% of the primary production on the entire Norwegian shelf by all known Norwegian reefs combined (Cathalot *et al.*, [2015](#page-21-0))]. This poses the question: how can CWC reefs sustain their high biomass and metabolic activity in the food-limited deep sea, given this apparent mismatch in C supply (Fig. [4B](#page-6-0))?

To approach this 'CWC reef paradox', we review the literature and open-access data and discuss the following questions: are CWC reefs limited to locations with elevated food supply, and what mechanisms increase the food supply to the reefs (Section  $\text{II}$ ); how are CWCs adapted to their food environment (Section [III\)](#page-11-0); how do CWC reefs function as eco-system to maintain high metabolic rates (Section [IV\)](#page-14-0); and how do anthropogenic threats impact food supply, coral adaptations and reef functioning and jeopardise the existence of CWC reefs; from a trophodynamic perspective, how can we optimally protect CWC reefs? (Section [V\)](#page-17-0).

<span id="page-4-0"></span>

Fig. 3. Cold-water coral (CWC) occurrence, surface productivity and benthic current velocity. Data from OBIS [\(2022](#page-25-0)) and Bio\_ORACLE (Tyberghein et al., [2012](#page-26-0); Assis et al., [2018](#page-20-0)). (A) Global occurrence of Desmophyllum pertusum, Enallopsammia pusilla, Enallopsammia profunda, Enallopsammia rostrata, Goniocorella dumosa, Madrepora carolina, Madrepora oculata, and Solenosmilia variabilis. (B) Annual mean of daily surface primary productivity. (C) Annual range of daily surface primary productivity. (D) Annual mean of benthic current velocity. A QGIS version of B–D can be found at <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7097065>.



<span id="page-5-0"></span>Table 1. Colonial, reef-building and/or structure-forming cold-water coral (CWC) species, their colony morphology, the degree to which they are reef-building, their distribution, depth range (mean  $\pm$  standard deviation), and the number of publications mentioning each species (Google Scholar, O1 September 2022). All species are enidarians of the  $\frac{1}{2}$  (1980): Cairns (1982–1995): Koslow et al. Table 1. Colonial, reef-building and/or structure-forming cold-water coral (CWC) species, their colony morphology, the degree to which they are reef-building, their distri standard deviation), and the number of publications mentioning each species (Google Scholar, 01 September 2022). All species are cnidarians of the >200 m water depth were considered. References for presented information: Zibrowius ([1980\)](#page-27-0); Cairns ([1982](#page-21-0), [1995](#page-21-0)); Koslow et al.  $\ddot{z}$ نې<br>پ á order Scleractinia. Only species that occur at bution, depth range (mean ú

<span id="page-6-0"></span>

Fig. 4. Paradox of thriving cold-water coral (CWC) reefs in the food-limited deep sea. (A) Organic matter export from the ocean surface to the deep sea, measured by sediment traps, plotted as annual flux of particulate organic carbon (POC) over depth. Green symbols show POC export from the photic zone (data from coastal water, 50 m water depth; export flux data from directly above CWC reefs are lacking); black symbols show off-shelf POC flux through the water column (data from moored sediment traps); blue symbols show POC flux close to cold-water coral (CWC) reefs (data from sediment traps on benthic landers). Dashed line indicates transition from photic zone to deep sea at 200 m water depth. (B) Simplified organic carbon (OC) budget of CWC reefs, illustrating the mismatch between high C turnover, high OC stock in reef biomass, and low POC deposition measured by sediment traps. OM, organic matter. References for (A): Wassmann ([1990\)](#page-26-0); Antia et al. [\(2001](#page-20-0)); Bermuda Atlantic Time-series Study (BATS), see Steinberg et al. ([2001\)](#page-26-0); Smith & Rabouille [\(2002](#page-26-0)); Duineveld et al. ([2004\)](#page-22-0); Lavaleye et al. [\(2009](#page-24-0)); Mienis et al. ([2009,](#page-24-0) [2012](#page-24-0)); van Oevelen et al. [\(2009](#page-26-0)); Khripounoff et al. [\(2014\)](#page-23-0). Data set summarised in Table S1. References for B: POC deposition as in A; C turnover: Cathalot *et al.* [\(2015](#page-21-0)); De Froe *et al.* [\(2019](#page-22-0)) and references therein; Reef OC stock: De Clippele et al. ([2021](#page-22-0)b).

# II. FOOD SUPPLY TO COLD-WATER CORAL **REEFS**

# (1) Are cold-water coral reefs limited to locations with elevated food supply?

CWCs are supplied with food through primary production at the ocean surface (measured as chlorophyll-a concentration or net primary productivity), export of primary production, flux of POM to the seafloor and/or currents (horizontal and/or vertical) that carry food particles (e.g. Duineveld et al., [2004](#page-22-0); Kiriakoulakis et al., [2004,](#page-23-0) [2007](#page-23-0); Davies et al., [2009;](#page-21-0) De Froe et al., [2022\)](#page-22-0). To evaluate whether CWC reefs are limited to locations with elevated food supply, we first reviewed modelling studies that predict habitat suitability for reef-building/structure-forming CWCs (Table [1](#page-5-0)), based on their environmental requirements including 'food supply' (primary production, export, POC flux and/or current velocity; Table [2](#page-7-0)). Currents were identified as an important predictor of CWC habitat suitability in nine out of 13 models that explicitly included currents (Table [2\)](#page-7-0). The importance of surface primary production and/or POM flux varied between the habitat suitability studies: 40% of the 30 relevant models (i.e. models that included the relevant parameters) describe the importance of primary production/POC flux as (relatively) high, 27% as moderate, and 33% as (relatively) low.

Secondly, we carried out a global analysis to test specifically whether surface primary productivity and/or benthic current velocity were above global average at those sites where either of the eight reef-building/structure-forming deep-sea CWC species (Table [1\)](#page-5-0) occur. Publicly available data on the occurrence of these were obtained from OBIS [\(2022](#page-25-0); data sets are available at [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7097065)  $5281/z$ enodo.7097065). Raster layers with values for  $(i)$  the annually averaged surface primary productivity;  $(ii)$  the annual range of surface primary productivity as an indicator of seasonality; and  $(iii)$  the annually averaged current velocity were extracted from Bio-ORACLE (Tyberghein et al., [2012](#page-26-0); Assis et al., [2018;](#page-20-0) resolution 5 arcmin, i.e. ca. 9.2 km at equator). Bio-ORACLE compiles a global environmental data set for species distribution modelling, based on data sets provided by the E.U. Copernicus Marine Service Information (Assis et al., [2018](#page-20-0)). For a detailed description of the methodology, see online supporting information Appendix S1; the full R code for all analyses is available at [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7097065) [5281/zenodo.7097065.](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7097065)

Our global analysis revealed that enhanced food supply through above-average surface productivity and currents drive the distribution of most reef-forming CWC species. Firstly, five out of eight species (i.e. *Desmophyllum pertusum*, Enallopsammia profunda, Goniocorella dumosa, Madrepora oculata, Solenosmilia variabilis) occur in locations with higher primary productivity than the global average (Figs [3B](#page-4-0) and [5A](#page-9-0), Table [3](#page-10-0), Appendix S2). Some species, however, occur in areas of non-enhanced (Enallopsammia pusilla, Enallopsammia rostrata) or even lower (Madrepora carolina) primary



Biological Reviews 98 (2023) 1768-1795 © 2023 The Authors. Biological Reviews published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Cambridge Philosophical Society.

 $\ddot{\phantom{a}}$ 

Table 2. Environmental parameters that best predict suitable habitat for deep-sea scleractinian cold-water corals (CWCs). The table includes only studies that explicitly analysed CWCs or CWC species (not CWC reefs) in relation to food availability ('food parameter') and/or currents. From these studies, the most important 'predictors' are listed, i.e. those environmental parameters that best predict the habitat suitability of CWCs: arag, aragonite saturation; aspect, easterly & northerly aspect; BPI, bathymetric position-

<span id="page-7-0"></span>Table 2. Environmental parameters that best predict suitable habitat for deep-sea scleractinian cold-water corals (CWCs). The table includes only studies that explicitly ana-

lysed CWCs or CWC species (not CWC reefs) in relation to food availability ('food parameter') and/or currents. From these studies, the most important 'predictors' are listed, i.e. those environmental parameters that best predict the habitat suitability of CWGs: arag, aragonite saturation; aspect, easterly & northerly aspect; BPI, bathymetric position-

- 64

(Continues on next page)

(Continues on next page)



1776 Sandra R. Maier and others

productivity compared to global values (Figs [3B](#page-4-0) and [5A\)](#page-9-0). A preference for sites with enhanced primary production does not correlate with species-specific differences in depth range (Table [1](#page-5-0)). Overall, the corals tolerate a broad range of annual primary productivity (Table [3](#page-10-0)). Secondly, six out of eight reef-forming CWC species occur in areas with above global-average current velocity (Figs [3D](#page-4-0) and [5C](#page-9-0), Table [3](#page-10-0)). According to our analysis, reef-forming CWCs occur under current velocities of  $0.11 \pm 0.07$  m s<sup>-1</sup> (mean  $\pm$  SD; Table [3\)](#page-10-0). With their large, three-dimensional, branching skeletal framework, the corals locally reduce current velocities and create niches with optimal flow for their prey capture (Hennige et al., [2021;](#page-23-0) Sanna, Büscher & Freiwald, [2023\)](#page-26-0), i.e. 0.05 m s−<sup>1</sup> for phytoplankton (phytodetritus) capture and  $0.02 \text{ m s}^{-1}$  for zooplankton capture (Purser et al., [2010](#page-25-0); Orejas et al., [2016\)](#page-25-0). Currents further drive CWC distribution as they facilitate specific hydrodynamic processes, which spatially and temporally increase the food supply (see Section  $II.2$  $II.2$ ).

In summary, food supply is an important driver of CWC reef distribution and the combination of enhanced current velocity and increased primary production (among other environmental drivers) can act as powerful predictors of CWC reef presence. However, food supply on and around CWC reefs varies at small spatial and temporal scales, as reviewed below. Accordingly, attempts to predict CWC reef distribution are more or less limited by the resolution of environmental data and the lack of true coral-absence data, due to the high logistic effort and associated costs of surveys (Davies et al., [2008;](#page-21-0) Georgian, Morgan & Wagner, [2021](#page-22-0)). In the future, increasing resolution of environmental data, especially of less-common parameters such as POM flux, high-resolution hydrodynamic models and an increasing number of benthic deep-sea surveys globally (Ramirez-Llodra et al., [2010\)](#page-25-0) will likely improve our ability to predict CWC reef occurrences (Rengstorf et al., [2014](#page-25-0)).

#### (2) Food pulses created by hydrodynamic processes

Instead of a constantly low food supply, CWCs live in a dynamic environment, where hydrodynamic processes create periodic food pulses at different temporal scales, from a few hours for processes linked to internal tidal activity (e.g. Davies et al., [2009](#page-21-0); Duineveld et al., [2012](#page-22-0); De Froe et al., [2022\)](#page-22-0), to seasonal cycles (e.g. Mienis et al., [2009](#page-24-0); Navas et al., [2014](#page-25-0); van der Kaaden et al., [2021\)](#page-26-0) and multiyear cycles such as decadal oscillations (e.g. Guihen, White & Lundälv, [2012](#page-23-0); Kazanidis et al., [2021](#page-23-0)b; Raddatz et al., [2022\)](#page-25-0) and millennial-scale oscillations (Portilho-Ramos et al., [2022](#page-25-0)). Currents interact with the seafloor, especially with elevated seafloor structures such as oceanic banks [e.g. Galicia Bank and Rockall Bank in the North Atlantic (Duineveld *et al.*,  $2004$ ,  $2007$ ; White *et al.*,  $2005$ ], continental margins [e.g. the shelf edges of the Faroe islands and Norway (Frederiksen, Jensen & Westerberg, [1992](#page-22-0); Thiem et al., [2006](#page-26-0))], seamounts (globally, reviewed by White et al., [2007](#page-27-0)), and fjord sills [e.g. in Norway (Rüggeberg

<span id="page-9-0"></span>et al., [2011](#page-26-0); Wagner et al., [2011\)](#page-26-0)]. Similar current–seafloor interactions are caused by large CWC mounds themselves, e.g. in the Logachev mound CWC province at the slope of



Rockall Bank (Mienis et al., [2007](#page-24-0); Cyr et al., [2016;](#page-21-0) Soetaert et al., [2016](#page-26-0); van der Kaaden et al., [2021](#page-26-0)). These current–topography interactions generate periodic hydrodynamic events like internal tides, trapped waves, and hydraulic jumps (Mohn et al., [2014](#page-24-0); van Haren et al., [2014;](#page-26-0) Cyr et al., [2016](#page-21-0)). For instance, if an elevated structure partially blocks (tidal) currents, the isopycnals are depressed downstream of this structure, resulting in so-called 'hydraulic jumps' (Mohn et al., [2014\)](#page-24-0). Isopycnal depressions and hydraulic jumps accelerate the downward transport of organic matter, from typical particle sinking speeds of a few to hundreds of metres per day (Riley et al., [2012\)](#page-25-0) to vertical transport at 10 cm s<sup>-1</sup>, corresponding to >8.5 km day<sup>-1</sup> (Davies et al., [2009;](#page-21-0) Juva et al., [2020\)](#page-23-0). As a result, fresh organic matter is transported from surface waters to CWC reefs in less than 1 h [at the 140 m deep Mingulay reef (Davies *et al.*,  $2009$ ; Findlay *et al.*,  $2013$ ]. As the tide reverses, this food pulse moves over the reef and supplies the entire reef community (Davies et al., [2009](#page-21-0)). Accordingly, fresh, lipid-rich (high-quality) suspended POM has been documented in the bottom water above several CWC reefs/mounds in the North Atlantic (Kiriakoulakis et al., [2007](#page-23-0); Mienis et al., [2007](#page-24-0); Davies et al., [2009;](#page-21-0) De Froe et al., [2022](#page-22-0)). Enhanced concentrations of fresh POM can occur in diurnal or semi-diurnal pulses, linked to the site-specific internal tidal cycle (Duineveld et al., [2007;](#page-22-0) Mienis et al., [2007](#page-24-0); Davies et al., [2009](#page-21-0); De Froe et al., [2022](#page-22-0)). The downward transport of surface organic matter is most pronounced on or close to the reef crest or mound summit (Cyr et al., [2016\)](#page-21-0); accordingly, live CWCs are most abundant here (De Haas et al., [2009](#page-22-0); Lim, Wheeler & Arnaubec, [2017;](#page-24-0) Conti, Lim & Wheeler, [2019;](#page-21-0) Maier et al., [2021\)](#page-24-0). The fact that large CWC mounds can induce a downward transport of surface organic matter with their own structure (Mienis et al., [2007;](#page-24-0) Mohn *et al.*, [2014;](#page-24-0) Soetaert *et al.*, [2016](#page-26-0)) represents a positive feedback of these mounds on coral growth (van der Kaaden et al., [2020](#page-26-0)), a remarkable form of ecosystem engineering (sensu Jones, Lawton & Shachak, [1994\)](#page-23-0).

Next to accelerating vertical particle transport, tidal currents and internal waves resuspend deposited organic material into bottom or intermediate nepheloid layers, providing another temporal food source for the reefs (Frederiksen et al., [1992](#page-22-0); White et al., [2005](#page-27-0); Mienis et al., [2007\)](#page-24-0). Besides tidally induced vertical transport, Ekman drainage was proposed as yet another mechanism

Biological Reviews 98 (2023) 1768–1795 © 2023 The Authors. Biological Reviews published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Cambridge Philosophical Society.

Fig. 5. Primary productivity (A: annual mean, B: annual range) and annual mean current velocity (C) at sites with cold-water corals (in grey) in comparison to global values (in blue). Note log-transformed values; for original data and units see Fig. [3](#page-4-0) and Table [3.](#page-10-0) Boxes of boxplots indicate median, first and third quartiles, dotted lines show minimum and maximum values without outliers. Asterisks indicate significant differences between coral sites and global values  $[P < 0.05$ ; Kruskal– Wallis rank-sum tests with post hoc Dunn tests; R package FSA (Ogle et al., [2018\)](#page-25-0); for detailed statistical results, see Appendix S2.

<span id="page-10-0"></span>Table 3. Primary productivity (annual average and annual seasonal range) and current velocity (annual average) at sites with cold-water corals (CWCs) compared to the global mean. Coordinates of CWC sites were obtained from OBIS [\(2022](#page-25-0)), environmental parameters at CWC sites were provided by Bio-ORACLE (Tyberghein et al., [2012](#page-26-0); Assis et al., [2018\)](#page-20-0), as described in Appendix S1. For CWCs, values are given separately for the indicated CWC species and pooled for all species (CWCs pooled). Temperatures in CWC habitats are additionally compared to the range of temperatures on tropical coral reefs (Freiwald et al., [2004\)](#page-22-0) because temperature influences physiological processes (Dodds et al., [2007](#page-22-0)). All given values are model estimates, given at a resolution of 5 arcmin (ca. 9.2 km) equatorial), not accounting for small-scale variability.

Parameter	Mean $\pm$ SD at locations with CWCs		Global mean $\pm$ SD
Primary	CWC	$7\,\pm\,7$	$4 \pm 5$
productivity:	pooled		
annual average (mg m <sup>-3</sup> day <sup>-1</sup> )	D. pertusum	$8 \pm 10$	
	E. profunda	$5 \pm 2$	
	E. pusilla	$4 \pm 2$	
	E. rostrata	$4 \pm 4$	
	G. dumosa	$9 \pm 5$	
	M. carolina	$2 \pm 3$	
	M. oculata	$6 \pm 8$	
	S. variabilis	$8 \pm 2$	
Primary productivity:	CWC pooled	$19 \pm 13$	$11 \pm 12$
annual range	D. pertusum	$24 \pm 14$	
$\left(\text{mg m}^{-3} \text{ day}^{-1}\right)$	E. profunda	$21 \pm 9$	
	E. pusilla	$11 \pm 7$	
	E. rostrata	$8 \pm 6$	
	G. dumosa	$17 \pm 12$	
	M. carolina	$11 \pm 7$	
	M. oculata	$16 \pm 15$	
	S. variabilis	$16 \pm 7$	
Current	CWC	$0.11 \pm 0.07$	$0.05 \pm 0.04$
velocity: annual	pooled		
average $(m s^{-1})$	D. pertusum	$0.13 \pm 0.08$	
	E. profunda	$0.21 \pm 0.09$	
	E. pusilla	$0.06 \pm 0.06$	
	E. rostrata	$0.06\pm0.03$	
	G. dumosa	$0.05 \pm 0.03$	
	M. carolina	$0.14 \pm 0.1$	
	M. oculata	$0.09 + 0.09$	
	S. variabilis	$0.09 \pm 0.03$	
Temperature:	CWC	$5.1 \pm 3.1$	Global:
annual	pooled		$1.7 \pm 4.1$ ;
average $(^{\circ}C)$	D. pertusum	$6.5 \pm 2.4$	tropical coral
	E. profunda	$8.5 \pm 2$	reefs:
	E. pusilla	$6.1 \pm 3.3$	$20 - 29$ °C
	E. rostrata	$2.5 \pm 1.8$	
	G. dumosa	$6.4 \pm 2$	
	M. carolina	$13.5 \pm 6.8$	
	M. oculata	$6.2 \pm 3.7$	
	S. variabilis	$2.7 \pm 1.3$	

of food supply to CWC reefs at shelf break regions in the North Atlantic (White et al., [2005](#page-27-0); Thiem et al., [2006;](#page-26-0) Simpson & McCandliss, [2013](#page-26-0)). Here, an along-slope surface current is deflected at depth, at an angle of  $90^{\circ}$ , due to the Coriolis force (Ekman, [1905](#page-22-0)). As a result, organic matter-rich bottom water from shallower areas above the continental shelf is transported downwards across the slope at velocities of  $ca. 2 \text{ cm s}^{-1}$  (White *et al.*, [2005;](#page-27-0) Thiem et al., [2006](#page-26-0); Simpson & McCandliss, [2013](#page-26-0)). Due to lower velocities and longer distances cross-slope, particle transport from shallow to deep water by Ekman drainage is slower compared to tidally induced processes, but faster than passive settling (White et al., [2005](#page-27-0); Davies et al., [2009;](#page-21-0) Riley et al., [2012;](#page-25-0) Juva et al., [2020\)](#page-23-0).

In summary, depending on the prevailing hydrodynamic regime, food availability on CWC reefs can change drastically within a couple of hours, creating a 'feast–famine' environment. The relative contribution of different hydrodynamic regimes to food supply is likely reef/region-specific, but this remains to be studied.

# (3) Seasonal variability of food pulses

Most reef-forming CWC species (six out of eight) occur in areas where primary productivity shows higher than average annual variation (Figs [3C](#page-4-0) and [5B,](#page-9-0) Table 3, Appendix S2). In temperate regions, such as the North Atlantic and the South Pacific, the seasonal cycle of light, temperature and nutrient replenishment gives rise to a pronounced spring phytoplankton bloom, followed by a peak in zooplankton abundance (Lalli & Parsons, [1997\)](#page-24-0). In the Gulf of Mexico, seasonal upwelling, variations of mixed layer depth and riverine nutrient discharge cause a strong variation in primary productivity (Müller-Karger et al., [1991;](#page-25-0) Zavala-Hidalgo et al., [2006](#page-27-0)). Seasonal variations in upwelling are also responsible for primary productivity fluctuations on the Mauritanian continental margin (Eisele et al., [2011](#page-22-0)) and in the North East Pacific California Current System (Gruber et al., [2012](#page-23-0); Gómez et al., [2018](#page-22-0)). Periodic peaks of surface primary production create important food peaks for deep-sea benthos (Billett et al., [1983\)](#page-21-0). During the seasonal phytoplankton bloom, POC flux, POC concentration and zooplankton abundance on Tisler reef (North East Skagerrak, depth <200 m) and Nakken reef (Norwegian fjord, depth 200 m) increase by a factor of two or more (Lavaleye et al., [2009;](#page-24-0) Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). Similarly, one/several annual peaks of fluorescence  $(a. 30\%$  increase) above the CWC reefs in the Cape Lookout area (NW Atlantic) and the Gulf of Mexico indicate seasonal pulses of fresh organic matter (Mienis et al., [2012,](#page-24-0) [2014](#page-24-0)). In between the seasonal food peaks, the availability of phytodetritus on the reefs is low (Duineveld et al., [2004](#page-22-0), [2007](#page-22-0); Mienis et al., [2012,](#page-24-0) [2014](#page-24-0); van Engeland et al., [2019\)](#page-26-0). Alternative resources may then be available, e.g. resuspended, more degraded organic matter (Mienis et al., [2009;](#page-24-0) Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a; van der Kaaden et al., [2021](#page-26-0)), bacterioplankton, and dissolved organic matter (DOM) (Wild et al., [2008](#page-27-0), [2009\)](#page-27-0).

Today we know that daily, seasonal, annual, and decadal cycles of primary production shape deep-sea ecosystems, just like in shallow waters. However, the study of 'deep-sea seasonality' remains difficult, especially in temperate and sub-

<span id="page-11-0"></span>polar areas, due to their difficult year-round accessibility. Hence, seasonal C fluxes to CWC reefs have only been measured on few reefs, mostly in the North Atlantic, and future studies should direct efforts to other CWC reefs worldwide.

#### (4) The role of live zooplankton

Vertically migrating zooplankton export substantial amounts of C, especially lipids, from the ocean surface to the deep sea (Jónasdóttir *et al*., [2015;](#page-23-0) Kiko *et al*., [2017;](#page-23-0) Bandara et al., [2021\)](#page-20-0). Most zooplankton spend the night in surface waters, grazing on phytoplankton, and descend to deeper waters (>300 m) at dawn to escape visual predators (Zaret & Suffern, [1976\)](#page-27-0). When passing CWC reefs, they could create important, lipid-rich food pulses for the corals. Vertically migrating zooplankton were observed on CWC reefs over a large depth range, including the relatively shallow Tisler reef (Skagerrak, Norway, <200 m depth; Guihen, White & Lundälv, [2018](#page-23-0)), Hola reef (Norwegian continental shelf, 260 m depth; van Engeland et al., [2019](#page-26-0)), and Mingulay reef (Outer Hebrides, 150 m depth; Duineveld et al., [2007](#page-22-0)), and deeper reefs in the Santa Maria di Leuca CWC Province (Mediterranean, 300–1100 m depth; Carlier et al., [2009\)](#page-21-0), on the Campeche mounds and in the Viosca Knoll area [Gulf of Mexico, ca. 500 m (Mienis et al., [2012;](#page-24-0) Hebbeln et al., [2014\)](#page-23-0)]. Zooplankton are typically also abundant on and above seamounts, sustaining high CWC abundance (Rogers, [1994;](#page-25-0) Duineveld et al., [2004;](#page-22-0) Rowden et al., [2010\)](#page-26-0). By contrast, the large CWC reefs on the slope of Rockall Bank (North-East Atlantic, 800 m depth) showed a low zooplankton abun-dance (Duineveld et al., [2007;](#page-22-0) De Froe et al., [2022\)](#page-22-0).

Site-specific differences in zooplankton abundance in the deep sea relate to patterns of primary productivity (Hernández-León et al., [2020](#page-23-0)). Furthermore, local zooplankton populations have specific depth ranges, varying from 300 to 600 m, e.g. at the Bermuda-Atlantic-Time-Series station (Sargasso Sea; Steinberg et al.,  $2000$ ), to  $>1000$  m depth, e.g. in the Gulf of Mexico (Ochoa et al., [2013](#page-25-0); Ursella  $et al., 2021$ . Finally, zooplankton overwinter at depth in specific areas like the Norwegian Sea at ca. 600 m depth, whereas other areas like the deep Rockall Trough or shallower Norwegian fjords show low zooplankton abundance in winter (Heath et al., [2000](#page-23-0); Campbell & Dower, [2003;](#page-21-0) Maier *et al.*, [2020](#page-24-0)*a*). Corresponding to variations in abundance, the importance of live zooplankton in the CWC diet varies among reefs (Duineveld et al., [2004,](#page-22-0) [2007;](#page-22-0) Carlier et al., [2009](#page-21-0); van Oevelen et al., [2018](#page-26-0)) and seasons (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). However, most information on zooplankton food for CWCs originates from the North Atlantic, and future research is required to reveal global patterns.

In conclusion, CWC reefs occur in a highly dynamic 'feast–famine' environment, where food availability changes substantially, depending on the season, the prevailing hydrodynamic regime, and presence of vertically migrating zooplankton. During feast conditions, food supply likely sustains reef C demand. For instance, during the productive

season, POC fluxes of 3–67 mmol C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup> were mea-sured by sediment traps (Duineveld et al., [2004](#page-22-0); Lavaleye et al., [2009](#page-24-0); Mienis et al., [2012](#page-24-0); Khripounoff et al., [2014](#page-23-0)), which is in the same order of magnitude as the reef C turnover of 11–123 mmol C  $\text{m}^{-2}$  day<sup>-1</sup> (4–45 mol C m<sup>-2</sup> year<sup>-1</sup>, Fig. [4B\)](#page-6-0). It should be noted that sediment traps tend to underestimate POC fluxes, especially when they tilt under high currents (Khripounoff et al., [2014\)](#page-23-0). Furthermore, additional input of zooplankton and/or dissolved organic carbon (DOC), which are not measured by sediment traps, may fill the remaining gap. More precise reef C budgets, however, require C flux data at higher temporal and spatial resolution and the inclusion of C fluxes through zooplankton and DOC. The comparatively low food supply to the reefs in 'famine' periods (Duineveld et al., [2004,](#page-22-0) [2007](#page-22-0); Mienis et al.,  $2012$ ,  $2014$ ; van Engeland et al.,  $2019$ ) is reflected in the large annual C mismatch (Fig. [4B\)](#page-6-0) and suggests that other physiological and ecological mechanisms are at play, as outlined in the following sections.

# III. ADAPTATIONS OF COLD-WATER CORALS TO THE FEAST–FAMINE ENVIRONMENT

As established in Section [II](#page-6-0), CWCs live in a feast-famine environment with strong temporal fluctuations in resource availability and hydrodynamic conditions. At the same time, CWCs have a high C demand, as illustrated by the following simplified annual C budget for *Desmophyllum pertusum* (Fig.  $6$ ), the best-studied scleractinian CWC species. Respiration rates of *D. pertusum*, measured by *ex situ* and *in situ* incubations, range between 1.1 and 2.8 mmol C (g coral dry mass) year<sup>-1</sup>, if  $CO_2:O_2 = 1$  (see Section [I;](#page-1-0) Larsson *et al.*, [2013](#page-24-0)*b*; Larsson, Lundälv & van Oevelen, [2013](#page-24-0)a; Khripounoff et al., [2014;](#page-23-0) Maier et al., [2019](#page-24-0), [2020](#page-24-0)a; Baussant et al., [2022](#page-21-0)). C flux ('loss') associated with mucus release has been assessed in fewer studies by ex situ incubations (Maier et al., [2011,](#page-24-0) [2016](#page-24-0); Naumann, Orejas & Ferrier-Pagès, [2014](#page-25-0); Maier *et al.*, [2019\)](#page-24-0) and amounts to 0.2 mmol POC (g coral dry mass)<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup> (Maier *et al.*, [2019;](#page-24-0) other studies used different units, see Appendix S3). Together, the C demand of D. pertusum amounts to 1.3–3.0 mmol C  $(g \, \text{dry mass})^{-1} \, \text{year}^{-1}$  (Fig. [6](#page-12-0), Appendix S3); similar C budgets for other CWC species remain to be investigated. Additional energetic costs incur for reproduction, but these are less well established: it is known that D. pertusum, E. rostrata, G. dumosa, and S. variabilis release a large number of small eggs and sperm (i.e. 'organic C') once per year (broadcast spawning), while M. oculata produces several smaller cohorts of larger eggs and sperm (Burgess & Babcock, [2005;](#page-21-0) Waller & Tyler, [2005](#page-26-0)). The related C expenditure is difficult to assess, but D. pertusum showed a 50% lower organic C content after than before the spawning season (January–March in Norway; Brooke & Järnegren, [2013](#page-21-0)). This difference of 1.5 mmol C (g dry mass)<sup> $-1$ </sup> may correspond to the amount of spawned C and suggests a relatively high reproductive

<span id="page-12-0"></span>

Fig. 6. A simplified annual carbon budget for the cold-water coral *Desmophyllum pertusum*, showing C expenses (right side), leading to estimations of C demand (left side) and corresponding food requirement (phytoplankton, zooplankton). For explanation, references, and calculations see Section [III](#page-11-0) and Appendix S3. DM, dry mass; OC, organic carbon.

cost (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). In total, the annual C budget of D. pertusum (Fig. 6) ranges from 2.8 to 4.5 mmol C (g dry mass) $^{-1}$  year<sup>-1</sup>, or 1.1 to 1.8 mmol C polyp<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup> (for an average-sized D. pertusum polyp of 0.4 g dry mass; Maier et al., [2019\)](#page-24-0). To maintain this C budget, each polyp has to capture ca. 170–2000 copepods per year [one copepod  $\sim$ 0.9 to 6.5 µmol C (Grønvik & Hopkins, [1984;](#page-23-0) Orejas *et al.*, [2016;](#page-25-0) Höfer *et al.*, [2018\)](#page-23-0)] or  $3 \times 10^{5}$  to  $5 \times 10^{5}$  live phytoplankton cells per year [one phytoplankton cell  $\sim$ 0.003 µmol C (Orejas *et al.*, [2016](#page-25-0))]; for calculations, see Appendix S3.

CWCs seem to meet large parts of their annual C demand by efficiently exploiting large food pulses. As passive suspension feeders, CWCs rely on water flow for their food supply (Gili & Coma, [1998\)](#page-22-0). The corals are optimally adapted to site-specific hydrodynamic conditions and food availability, through variable colony morphology among and within species (De Clippele et al., [2017](#page-22-0)b; Vad et al., [2017;](#page-26-0) Hennige et al., [2021;](#page-23-0) Sanna & Freiwald, [2021](#page-26-0); Sanna et al., [2023](#page-26-0)). For example, fan-shaped colonies (M. carolina, E. rostrata) often grow perpendicular to unidirectional currents, optimising prey capture (Fricke & Meischner, [1985\)](#page-22-0). D. pertusum adapts its morphology based on the prevailing hydrodynamic conditions (Sanna et al., [2023](#page-26-0)), forming bush-like colonies with more compact upstream branches under higher, unidirectional flow velocities and symmetrical cauliflower-shaped colonies with thinner, ramified branches under more sheltered conditions with lower, multidirectional flow (De Clippele et al.,  $2017b$  $2017b$ ). These adaptations create efficient suspension feeders. At concentrations of 100 copepods  $l^{-1}$ , D. pertusum can catch around 12–23 copepods polyp<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>, depending on the flow speed (Orejas et al., [2016](#page-25-0); highest

capture at 2 cm  $s^{-1}$ , lowest at 10 cm  $s^{-1}$ ). This corresponds to a C uptake of 11–150 μmol C polyp<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> (using the copepod C content range mentioned above; Appendix S3). Prey capture rates increase further with increasing zooplankton concentration (Purser et al., [2010\)](#page-25-0). The smaller polyps of M. oculata show lower capture rates of large zooplankton compared to D. pertusum, but on the scale of a coral colony, this effect is outweighed by the higher polyp density (Tsounis et al., [2010](#page-26-0)). At high phytoplankton concentrations, as may occur during rapid downwelling events in the produc-tive season (Davies et al., [2009](#page-21-0)), D. pertusum is able to retain up to 6 × 10<sup>4</sup> phytoplankton cells polyp<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>, i.e. *ca*. 200 µmol C polyp<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> (Orejas et al., [2016\)](#page-25-0). Hence, during such zooplankton or phytoplankton food pulses, the corals might be able to sustain 1–17% of their annual C demand in only 1 hour (for calculation, see Appendix S3). In situ data confirm the potential of CWCs to exploit food pulses and their energetic value: on the Norwegian shelf, D. pertusum changes its polyp (feeding) activity in accordance with diurnal changes in current speed and direction, which likely cause periodic changes in food availability (Buhl-Mortensen, Tenningen & Tysseland, [2015](#page-21-0); Osterloff et al., [2019\)](#page-25-0). On Nakken reef (Norwegian fjord), D. pertusum doubled its organic C content or biomass during the annual spring bloom (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a), showing the importance of seasonal food pulses for the annual C budget of these corals.

CWCs store excess assimilated resources from food pulses or periods of high food availability as tissue reserves (Maier et al., [2019](#page-24-0)). To store reserves, CWCs contain a substantial amount of neutral lipids, i.e. triacylglycerols for short-term storage and wax esters for long-term storage (Dodds et al., [2009;](#page-22-0) Larsson et al., [2013](#page-24-0)a; Galand et al., [2020](#page-22-0)). The build-up of lipid reserves depends on the CWC species and diet. Experiments showed that D. pertusum prefers a zooplankton diet to build-up storage lipids (Galand et al., [2020\)](#page-22-0). In situ (Norway), this species formed lipid reserves after the zooplankton bloom in summer, while the earlier spring phytoplankton bloom (phytodetritus peak) was mostly invested in proteins (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). By contrast, M. oculata benefits more from a phytodetritus or mixed phytodetritus– zooplankton diet to build up lipid stores (Galand et al., [2020](#page-22-0)).

The original hypothesis that CWCs draw on their lipid reserves in food-limited periods was, however, not confirmed for D. pertusum. When experimentally starved, the corals showed either no decline in storage lipids (Baussant et al., [2017](#page-21-0)), or a decline in storage lipids that was independent of their feeding status (high versus low food; Larsson et al., [2013](#page-24-0)a). In temperate areas, the lipid content of D. pertusum did not decrease steadily over winter (Dodds et al., [2009\)](#page-22-0). Nevertheless, the species did show a seasonal cycle of build-up and decline in lipids closely related to its gametogenesis and spawning. Lipid reserves were formed during summer, in the period of highest oocyte growth, maintained until late winter (December), following which >50% were released between December and February, presumably during a mass-spawning event (Brooke & Järnegren, [2013;](#page-21-0) Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). Hence, CWCs seem to use their lipid reserves rather to sustain their high reproductive costs than to overcome low-food periods. It appears likely that food availability governs the reproductive timing of broadcast-spawning CWCs for two reasons. Firstly, synchronising cost-intensive spawning with the approaching spring bloom allows the resource-depleted adult coral colonies to restock (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). Secondly, the coral larvae start feeding at 3 weeks of age and might profit from abundant phytoplankton (Strömberg & Larsson, [2017\)](#page-26-0). Increased food availability may also trigger periodic spawners (e.g. M. oculata) to produce and spawn gametes several times a year (Waller & Tyler, [2005\)](#page-26-0).

Conservation of tissue reserves, in spite of low food availability (e.g. in winter), could be facilitated by a switch to alternative resources. For example in the Rockall Bank area, increased internal wave activity in winter resuspends sediment and resupplies the CWC reefs with more degraded organic particles (Mienis et al., [2009](#page-24-0); van der Kaaden et al., [2021\)](#page-26-0), which could, in turn, release DOM and attract bacterioplankton. Feeding experiments demonstrated that CWCs are able to consume these alternative resources, i.e. bacterioplankton, detritus (D. pertusum; Mueller et al., [2014\)](#page-24-0) and DOM [D. pertusum, M. oculata (Gori et al., [2014](#page-23-0); Mueller et al., [2014](#page-24-0))]. Their close association with a species-specific microbiome (Hansson et al., [2009;](#page-23-0) Schöttner et al., [2012](#page-26-0)) further allows *D. pertusum* to feed on inorganic resources, such as inorganic C (coupled to nitrification), dinitrogen and ammonium. However, these chemoautotrophic pathways only contributed 2% to their respiratory C demand (Middelburg et al., [2015\)](#page-24-0). Two studies underline consumption of alternative resources in situ. Firstly, the occurrence of E. rostrata and M. oculata in the New Zealand region is

driven by DOM concentration (Tracey et al., [2011\)](#page-26-0). Secondly, D. pertusum in a Norwegian fjord switched from a zooplankton–phytodetritus diet to more degraded material/bacteria in winter, indicated by decreased  $\delta^{13}C$  and increased bacteria fatty acid trophic markers (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). Other studies, however, indicate that M. oculata is a less-opportunistic feeder than D. pertusum (Galand *et al.*, [2020](#page-22-0)) and therefore less adapted to variations in resource supply (Chapron et al., [2020](#page-21-0)). Future research should address variability in resource flexibility among CWC species.

Finally, CWCs may also conserve tissue reserves and energy through low metabolic activity and growth. Facilitated by lower temperatures (Table [3\)](#page-10-0), the respiration rate of CWCs is almost 60% lower compared to their tropical zooxanthellate relatives (Naumann et al., [2011](#page-25-0)). Correspondingly, CWCs grow about 10 times slower compared to their tropical, shallow-water relatives, i.e. at rates between 0.02% mass increase per day (D. pertusum) and 0.2% per day (*M. oculata*) (Orejas et al.,  $2011a,b$  $2011a,b$  $2011a,b$ ). Nevertheless, growth rates vary considerably depending on the local environmental conditions and can reach up to 4 cm year−<sup>1</sup> , rates compa-rable to some shallow-water corals (Chapron et al., [2020](#page-21-0)). While low metabolism and growth may represent general adaptations of CWCs, their reaction to seasonal food shortage differs among species. Under long-term (7-month) experimental food deprivation, *D. pertusum* slowly reduced its metabolic rate by 40–50% in total, but maintained skeletal growth rates (Larsson et al., [2013](#page-24-0)a; Baussant et al., [2017\)](#page-21-0). By contrast, its close relative Desmophyllum dianthus (a non-reefbuilding, solitary CWC) immediately and strongly reduced skeletal growth and metabolic rate in response to short-term experimental food deprivation (Naumann et al., [2011](#page-25-0)). In situ, D. pertusum maintained skeletal growth and budding in sea-sons with reduced food supply (Lartaud et al., [2014;](#page-24-0) Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). However, increased metabolic rates and decreased skeletal growth during the period of highest oocyte growth suggested an energetic trade-off between reproduction and skeletal growth (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). M. oculata (Mediterranean) showed more pronounced seasonal differences in budding (reduced in summer) and skeletal growth (reduced in winter/spring) compared to  $D$ . pertusum, possibly related to its periodic reproduction or a lower dietary flexibility (Lartaud et al., [2014](#page-24-0)). M. oculata may be more sensitive to varying food availability than D. pertusum (Lartaud et al., [2014;](#page-24-0) Chapron et al., [2020](#page-21-0)). Species-specific differences in CWC C budgets and adaptations to low-food periods may explain differences in distribution and resilience; hence, future research efforts should aim at including a broader range of different CWC species.

Interannual growth patterns also relate to fluctuating food supply. In the NW Mediterranean, D. pertusum and M. oculata grew faster (polyp budding and/or linear growth) in years with higher seasonal downwelling intensity caused by epi-sodic dense shelf water events (Chapron et al., [2020\)](#page-21-0). Furthermore, in years with higher sedimentation, the CWCs grew slower, related to less-efficient feeding and energetic costs of

<span id="page-14-0"></span>sediment cleaning; in years with particularly strong currents, the corals formed thicker colonies and allocated energy to polyp budding over linear growth (Chapron et al., [2020](#page-21-0)).

In summary, D. pertusum is well adapted to the feast–famine environment through its high physiological flexibility:  $(i)$  phytodetritus and zooplankton food pulses are effectively exploited, but when absent, the corals switch to alternative resources; (ii) growth rates are low, but can be boosted during high food availability; (iii) build-up and expenditure of tissue reserves, mostly for reproduction, are synchronised with the seasonal changes in resource supply. Additional work is needed on the physiological flexibility of other CWC species. By contrast, the accumulated knowledge on D. pertusum provides the chance to move from simple C budgets (Fig. [6\)](#page-12-0) to more complex dynamic energy budget (DEB) models (Kooijman, [2000;](#page-24-0) van der Meer, [2006\)](#page-26-0). While rarely applied to deep-sea species due to limited data availability, DEB theory provides a useful model framework to understand, for example, how species can grow (in size, tissue reserves) and reproduce under varying food availability in the deep sea (Gaudron, Lefebvre & Marques, [2021](#page-22-0)).

## IV. HOW DO COLD-WATER CORAL REEFS SUSTAIN THEIR HIGH FOOD DEMAND?

Reef-building CWCs may be well adapted to their 'feast– famine' environment, yet, the entire CWC reef community, i.e. the corals and reef-associated fauna and microbes require more food to sustain their high biomass and metabolic activity than they receive in terms of deposited particulate organic matter (see Section [I](#page-1-0)). Based on the literature reviewed here, we suggest two interdependent mechanisms that may explain this mismatch in the reef (organic) C budget:  $(i)$  the reef acts as a mechanical and biological filter for phytodetritus  $(POM)$ ; and  $(ii)$  recycling (re-use) of C and N within the reef community limits material loss.

# (1) The reef filter

A CWC reef represents a giant filter composed of different filter mechanisms (mechanical and biological) and mesh sizes (Fig. [7;](#page-15-0) Lavaleye et al., [2009](#page-24-0); Soetaert et al., [2016;](#page-26-0) Maier *et al.*,  $2021$ ). The reef framework (Fig. [2\)](#page-3-0) acts as mechanical filter (Fig. [7](#page-15-0)) that baffles the flow and increases the deposition of phytodetritus particles (POM; Dorschel et al., [2005;](#page-22-0) Mienis et al., [2019\)](#page-24-0). Accordingly, organic matter concentration in the sediment below the reef framework is higher than in sediment off-reef (De Froe et al., [2019\)](#page-22-0). Deeper sediment layers below CWC reefs, however, show extremely low rates of anaerobic C mineralisation, because most organic matter is consumed and mineralised in the overlying 'reef filter' (Wehrmann et al., [2009](#page-26-0)). In addition, suspension-feeding epifauna are highly abundant on CWC reefs (Mortensen & Fosså, [2006](#page-24-0); Henry & Roberts, [2007\)](#page-23-0) and create a biological filter for phytodetritus and zooplankton. Reef-forming

CWCs change the environment to optimise (their own) suspension feeding, e.g. by modifying their hydrodynamic environment (Hennige et al., [2021](#page-23-0)) and by reaching into the upper, current-exposed benthic boundary layer (Buhl-Mortensen *et al.*, [2010\)](#page-21-0). This benefits other suspensionfeeding epifauna (Buhl-Mortensen et al., [2010](#page-21-0)). In a 'habitat cascade', different epifauna taxa grow on top of each other [e.g. bryozoans growing on bivalve shells (Kazanidis *et al.*,  $2016$ ; Kazanidis, Henry & Roberts,  $2021a$  $2021a$ ] to access fresh phytodetritus (POM; Duineveld et al., [2007\)](#page-22-0). Suspension feeders have evolved a variety of feeding mechanisms (e.g. active versus passive) and complex feeding structures specialised on different particle sizes (Gili & Coma, [1998\)](#page-22-0). For example, CWCs capture live zooplankton at high rates (Purser et al., [2010](#page-25-0); Orejas et al., [2016](#page-25-0)) when available (see Section [II](#page-6-0).4). The large reef bivalve Acesta excavata (Fabricius, 1779) shows extraordinarily high clearance rates for phytoplankton or phytodetritus (Järnegren & Altin, [2006](#page-23-0)), but only limited consumption of smaller-sized bacteria (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)b). By contrast, sponges such as Geodia barretti (Bowerbank, 1858) or Mycale lingua (Bowerbank, 1866) retain bacterioplankton with a near 100% efficiency (Pile, Patterson & Witman, [1996;](#page-25-0) Maier  $et \ al., \ 2020b$  $et \ al., \ 2020b$  $et \ al., \ 2020b$ ). Similarly, suspension feeders have a specific hydrographical niche, determined, e.g. by small-scale variations in flow (Henry, Davies & Roberts, [2010](#page-23-0)). Active suspension feeders are typically more reliant on POM concentration than on POM flux (Lesser, Witman & Sebnens, [1994](#page-24-0)). Accordingly, some active suspension feeders, e.g. the sponge Hymedesmia paupertas (Bowerbank, 1866), prefer current-sheltered reef sites (Henry et al., [2010\)](#page-23-0). Smallscale spatial segregation (Purser et al., [2013;](#page-25-0) Robert et al., [2020\)](#page-25-0) may reduce competition where dietary niches overlap (van Oevelen et al., [2018](#page-26-0)). Acting as a mechanical and biological filter, CWC reefs deplete phytodetritus (POM) from the bottom water (Lavaleye et al., [2009](#page-24-0); Wagner et al., [2011](#page-26-0)).

The branched, porous reef framework brings abundant suspension-feeding epifauna into close contact with detritivores (Mortensen et al., [1995](#page-24-0); Henry & Roberts, [2007](#page-23-0)) and a diverse microbial community (van Bleijswijk et al., [2015](#page-26-0)), giving rise to a complex food web (van Oevelen et al., [2009](#page-26-0)). Particles mechanically intercepted by the reef framework serve as a food source for detritivores such as echiuran worms (Kiriakoulakis et al., [2004](#page-23-0)) or ophiuroids (Maier et al., [2021](#page-24-0)). The tube-building polychaete Eunice norvegica (Linnaeus, 1767) forms a symbiosis with  $D$ . pertusum: the polychaete benefits from stealing food particles from the coral and at the same time it keeps its host clean from accumulating detritus and stabilises the reef framework by building tubes between the framework branches (Mortensen, [2001;](#page-24-0) Roberts, [2005;](#page-25-0) Mueller et al., [2013\)](#page-25-0).

# (2) Recycling of metabolic 'waste' products

The high organic matter mineralisation on CWC reefs leads to an accumulation of faunal waste products, e.g. detrital

<span id="page-15-0"></span>

Fig. 7. The cold-water coral (CWC) 'reef filter' and recycling of C and N within the reef community. Filtration and subsequent consumption of phytodetritus, a form of particulate organic matter (POM), are shown in green. Production and recycling of organic matter are in turquoise, e.g. coral mucus [POM, dissolving to dissolved organic matter (DOM)], sponge detritus, or bivalve (pseudo-)faeces. Production and recycling of inorganic matter is in light blue, i.e. dissolved inorganic C (DIC) and N (DIN; ammonium recycling for example).

POM, DOM, dissolved inorganic carbon and nitrogen (DIC, DIN) (Wild et al., [2008;](#page-27-0) Wagner et al., [2011;](#page-26-0) Khripounoff et al., [2014](#page-23-0); De Froe et al., [2019](#page-22-0)). For instance, CWCs release mucus (Wild et al., [2008\)](#page-27-0), a polysaccharide–protein complex, for protection against biofouling and sedimentation and as a feeding aid (Fig. 7; Bythell & Wild, [2011](#page-21-0); Zetsche et al., [2016;](#page-27-0) Murray et al., [2019](#page-25-0)). Mucus detaches from the corals (Wild et al., [2004](#page-27-0)) and enhances the concentration of labile (high-quality) POM downstream of the reef (Wagner et al., [2011](#page-26-0)). Most of the mucus dissolves rapidly, creating a pool of labile DOM (Wild et al., [2008](#page-27-0)). Typically limited in deep-sea water (Carlson & Hansell, [2015](#page-21-0)), coral-derived labile DOM promotes the activity and growth of bacterioplankton (Fig. 7; Wild et al., [2008,](#page-27-0) [2009](#page-27-0)). Bacterioplankton, in turn, provide a high-quality substrate for reef sponges, as outlined above (Pile et al., [1996;](#page-25-0) Leys et al., [2018;](#page-24-0) Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)b). The recycling of 'waste DOM' by bacterioplankton returns material and energy to higher trophic levels (Fig. 7), corresponding to the microbial loop in surface-waters (Azam et al., [1983](#page-20-0)).

Moreover, suspension feeders can directly consume and recycle DOM (Fig. 7, Table [4](#page-16-0)). Deep-sea sponges are wellknown DOM consumers (Table [4\)](#page-16-0), just like their shallowwater counterparts (reviewed by De Goeij, Lesser & Pawlik, [2017\)](#page-22-0). Initially, symbiotic microbes were considered responsible for the high DOM uptake of sponges (Reiswig, [1981;](#page-25-0) Yahel et al., [2003;](#page-27-0) Ribes et al., [2012](#page-25-0)). Specifically in high-microbial-abundance (HMA) sponges, microorganisms contribute 20–35% to the total sponge biomass (Reiswig, [1981;](#page-25-0) Hentschel, Usher & Taylor, [2006\)](#page-23-0). Recent research, however, challenged this paradigm: Firstly, lowmicrobial-abundance (LMA) sponges consume and assimilate DOM at high rates (Table [4](#page-16-0); De Goeij et al., [2017](#page-22-0)), but host microorganisms at concentrations only equivalent to those in the surrounding sea water (Hentschel et al., [2006](#page-23-0)). Secondly, stable isotope tracer experiments demonstrated direct uptake of DOM by sponge cells (Rix et al., [2020\)](#page-25-0) and incorporation of DOM-derived C into de novo-synthesised and/or sponge-specific fatty acids (Rix et al., [2016;](#page-25-0)



<span id="page-16-0"></span>Table 4. Consumption of dissolved organic matter (DOM) by benthic invertebrates from cold-water coral reefs and deep-sea sponge grounds. HMA, high-microbial abundance sponge; LMA, low-microbial abundance sponge. POM, particulate organic matter.

Bart et al., [2020\)](#page-20-0). Thirdly, several other suspension-feeding taxa on CWC reefs consume and assimilate DOM, including several scleractinian CWC species (Gori et al., [2014;](#page-23-0) Mueller et al., [2014](#page-24-0)), hydrozoans, stylasterid corals, and bivalves (Maier *et al.*, [2020](#page-24-0)*b*, [2021](#page-24-0)). The faunal and microbial community growing on and inside the reef framework meets 30% of its respiratory C demand by uptake of natural DOM (Maier *et al.*, [2021](#page-24-0)), demonstrating the quantitative importance of this recycling pathway.

In a recycling pathway termed the 'sponge loop', sponges recycle substantial amounts of assimilated DOM to particulate 'sponge detritus' (POM; Fig. [7](#page-15-0)), which is consumed by reef detritivores (De Goeij et al., [2013\)](#page-22-0). Originally described for tropical coral reefs (De Goeij et al., [2013](#page-22-0)), the sponge loop finds an equivalent on CWC reefs (Rix et al., [2016;](#page-25-0) Bart et al., [2021](#page-21-0)a). Other suspension feeders, such as bivalves, likewise recycle substantial amounts of DOM to detrital POM, in this case bivalve (pseudo-)faeces, which can be consumed by reef detritivores (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)b). The prevalence of DOM consumption by reef invertebrates (Table 4) suggests that these 'suspension feeder' loops (Fig. [7;](#page-15-0) Maier

et al.,  $2020b$  $2020b$ ; Bart et al.,  $2021a$  $2021a$  are ubiquitous within the CWC reef community and future research is likely to reveal more.

Finally, DIC and DIN are recycled by reef microbes that grow on and inside the porous reef framework and as symbionts in invertebrates (Fig. [7](#page-15-0)). Nitrifying bacteria and archaea associated with the reef framework (van Bleijswijk et al., [2015\)](#page-26-0) subsist on (faunal) ammonium, which they transform to nitrate (nitrification; Maier et al., [2021](#page-24-0)); thereby gaining energy for chemoautotrophic DIC fixation. Furthermore, HMA sponges and their diverse microbiome (Hentschel et al., [2006](#page-23-0)) perform a variety of nutrient fluxes together, e.g. aerobic and anaerobic respiration, nitrification of sponge-derived ammonium and coupled DIC fixation, denitrification of nitrate to dinitrogen gas, and anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox) (Hoffmann et al., [2009;](#page-23-0) De Kluijver et al., [2021](#page-22-0)). Microbially fixed C is transferred to the sponge hosts (van Duyl et al., [2020](#page-26-0)), e.g. via the consumption of microbes via phagocytosis (Leys et al., [2018](#page-24-0)). Mediating diverse internal and external recycling pathways, sponges act on and connect several trophic levels and play

<span id="page-17-0"></span>an ubiquitous role in deep-sea ecosystems (Hanz et al., [2022](#page-23-0)). CWCs also host a microbiome, enabling them to perform similar nutrient fluxes, but these play a minor quantitative role in the total CWC metabolism (Middelburg et al., [2015](#page-24-0)). Altogether, the microbial community contributes substantially to the total organic matter mineralisation of CWC reefs (van Oevelen et al., [2009;](#page-26-0) Maier et al., [2021\)](#page-24-0).

In conclusion, the high ecological efficiency of CWC reefs may explain the mismatch in their organic C budget (Fig. [4B\)](#page-6-0). While the 'reef filter' ensures optimal retention of zooplankton, phytodetritus, and bacterioplankton, sediment traps only measure the deposition of phytodetritus (POM). Hence, sediment traps underestimate the actual food retention by CWC reefs, especially under high current velocities (Gardner, Biscaye & Richardson, [1997;](#page-22-0) Mienis et al., [2009](#page-24-0); van Oevelen et al., [2009\)](#page-26-0). Moreover, diverse trophic interactions and material recycling facilitate optimal utilisation of the retained food and exploitation of additional resources beyond deposited POM, such as dissolved organic and inorganic matter. Nevertheless, the quantitative importance of recycling pathways and their link in the reef food web remain vague. Modern mapping attempts of reef biomass and metabolic activity detail the importance of CWC reefs in the regional C cycle (De Clippele et al.,  $2021a,b$  $2021a,b$  $2021a,b$ ). In a logical next step, reef food web (C cycling) models (e.g. van Oevelen et al., [2009](#page-26-0)) could be updated with recycling pathways to estimate how much of the retained and/or metabolised material is recycled, how filtration and recycling contribute to reef (biomass) growth, and how much metabolic 'waste' material is lost from the reef ecosystem. Another essential question in this context is the importance of (functional) biodiversity for the filtration and recycling capacity of the reef, and hence its biomass, metabolic activity and resilience to changing conditions, which we discuss in the following section.

# V. PERSPECTIVES: COLD-WATER CORAL REEFS IN THE ANTHROPOCENE

In the Anthropocene, each of the mechanisms discussed above that sustain CWC reefs in the food-limited deep sea have become threatened. The ocean, including the deep sea, is becoming warmer, less well mixed and more acidic, with pollution, fisheries and mining aggravating global change (Gruber, [2011](#page-23-0); Roberts & Cairns, [2014;](#page-25-0) Sweetman et al., [2017](#page-26-0)). Anthropogenic environmental change disbalances the energy budget of reef-building corals (Fig. [8A\)](#page-18-0) and destabilises the reef framework, resulting in decreased reef biodiversity and functioning (Fig. [8B\)](#page-18-0).

#### (1) Disbalanced energy budget of cold-water corals

A disbalanced energy budget of CWCs is the result of decreasing food supply on the one hand, and increasing energetic costs on the other (Fig. [8A\)](#page-18-0). As the ocean surface is warming more rapidly than the rest of the water column, the water column becomes more stratified (Bopp et al., [2001](#page-21-0); Gruber, [2011;](#page-23-0) Capotondi et al., [2012\)](#page-21-0). Enhanced stratification decreases the intensity of the hydrodynamic mixing processes (Bopp *et al.*,  $2001$ ; Li *et al.*,  $2020$ ) that supply CWC reefs with important food pulses (see Section [II](#page-6-0).2). In addition, reduced upwelling of nutrient-rich bottom water limits diatom growth, further reducing POM export (Bopp et al., [2005](#page-21-0)).

At the same time, bottom-water temperature in the bathyal is projected to increase by  $3-4$  °C by 2100 (Mora et al., [2013;](#page-24-0) Sweetman et al., [2017\)](#page-26-0). Increasing temperatures spur the corals' respiratory activity and metabolic costs (Dodds et al., [2009](#page-22-0); Dorey et al., [2020;](#page-22-0) Gómez et al., [2022](#page-22-0)). Initially, CWCs may benefit from higher temperatures, through enhanced polyp activity, higher prey capture rates (Chapron et al., [2021](#page-21-0)) and growth (Büscher, Form & Riebesell, [2017;](#page-21-0) Büscher et al., [2022\)](#page-21-0). Nevertheless, beyond a certain temperature threshold  $(+4\degree C)$ , enhanced food intake is no longer sufficient to offset the metabolic energy costs (Chapron et al., [2021\)](#page-21-0) or prey capture decreases, leading to decreased growth, tissue reserves, and eventually death (Gómez et al., [2022](#page-22-0)). Furthermore, even small changes in temperature affect the CWC microbiome, with potential consequences for microbially assisted nutrient acquisition and immune responses (Chapron et al., [2021](#page-21-0)).

Moreover, high atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations lead to ocean acidification (Kleypas et al., [1999;](#page-24-0) Wolf-Gladrow et al., [1999\)](#page-27-0) and a projected decrease of 0.3 pH units in the bathyal by 2100 (Sweetman et al., [2017\)](#page-26-0). More acidic conditions render calcification, i.e. the formation of calcium carbonate (aragonite) skeletons, more energetically costly (Cohen & Holcomb, [2009](#page-21-0)). Due to the naturally low carbonate (aragonite) saturation in their deep, cold habitat, CWCs are particularly vulnerable to ocean acidification (Orr et al., [2005](#page-25-0); Guinotte et al., [2006;](#page-23-0) Lunden, Georgian & Cordes, [2013](#page-24-0); Gómez et al., [2018\)](#page-22-0). Nevertheless, CWCs, particularly some genotypes, are able to acclimatise and maintain skeletal growth under long-term exposure to experimental acidification (Form & Riebesell, [2012;](#page-22-0) Maier et al., [2013](#page-24-0); Hennige et al., [2014,](#page-23-0) [2015;](#page-23-0) Movilla et al., [2014;](#page-24-0) Büscher et al., [2017;](#page-21-0) Kurman et al., [2017](#page-24-0); Gammon et al., [2018](#page-22-0)). The metabolic stimulation by higher temperatures may partially offset the negative impact of acidification on CWC growth up to a certain temperature and pH threshold (Büscher et al., [2022](#page-21-0)). At several sites, CWCs (D. pertusum, E. rostrata, G. dumosa, M. oculata, S. variabilis) even grow under aragonite undersaturation (Thresher et al., [2011;](#page-26-0) Bostock et al., [2015](#page-21-0); Baco et al., [2017\)](#page-20-0). To calcify under low pH, corals may upregulate their internal pH through ion transport (McCulloch et al., [2012](#page-24-0)a,[b](#page-24-0); Wall et al., [2015](#page-26-0); Glazier et al., [2020](#page-22-0)). The involved energetic cost, however, increases by 10% per 0.1 pH unit decrease in seawater pH (McCulloch *et al.*,  $2012b$  $2012b$ ), hence, the ability of CWCs to locally acclimatise or adapt to acidified conditions may depend greatly on the respective food supply (Georgian et al., [2016](#page-22-0)).

![](_page_18_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### <span id="page-18-0"></span>Energy budget of cold-water corals (CWCs) A

Fig. 8. Negative impacts of anthropogenic environmental change (in red) on (A) the energy budget of cold-water corals (CWCs) and (B) CWC reef ecosystem functioning. OM, organic matter.

Other anthropogenic impacts additionally disbalance the energy budget of CWCs, by increasing their energetic costs to mitigate stress while at the same time decreasing their prey-capture rates (Fig. 8A); these impacts include physical abrasion and increased sedimentation through fisheries and

mineral extraction (Fossa, Mortensen & Furevik, [2002](#page-22-0); Davies, Roberts & Hall-Spencer, [2007;](#page-21-0) Armstrong & van den Hove, [2008](#page-20-0); Huvenne et al., [2016](#page-23-0)), oxygen stress through increasing deoxygenation of bottom waters (Dodds et al., [2007](#page-22-0); Sweetman et al., [2017](#page-26-0); Hanz et al., [2019](#page-23-0);

Hebbeln et al., [2020\)](#page-23-0), and pollution by oil spills (Weinnig et al., [2020](#page-27-0)) and plastic (Chapron et al., [2018;](#page-21-0) Mouchi et al., [2019](#page-24-0)).

In situ, CWCs already show signs of energetic shortfalls. In seasonal periods of enhanced metabolic activity, possibly due to reproductive tissue modifications, D. pertusum showed on average ca. 70% lower linear skeletal extension rates compared to other seasons (Maier et al., [2020](#page-24-0)a). Likewise, in years of low downwelling/water-column mixing intensity, the species showed on average ca. 80% lower linear skeletal extension rates compared to high-mixing years (Chapron et al., [2020\)](#page-21-0). Furthermore, corals at heavily trawled sites are non-reproductive, possibly because their energy reserves (and colony size) are too low to afford sexual reproduction (Waller & Tyler, [2005\)](#page-26-0). Altogether, global change is predicted to reduce the habitat suitable for CWCs by 79% (Morato et al., [2020\)](#page-24-0) and CWC reef biomass by 38% (Jones et al., [2014](#page-23-0)) by 2100.

#### (2) Reduced reef functioning on 'crumbling' reefs

On the ecosystem level, decreased coral growth on the one hand, and increased erosion of the reef framework on the other hand (Fig. [8B\)](#page-18-0), threaten the reef carbonate budget (Perry et al., [2013;](#page-25-0) Büscher et al., [2019\)](#page-21-0). Under low pH, CWC skeletons are more porous and form a less stable reef framework (Hennige et al., [2015](#page-23-0)). Furthermore, ocean acidification accelerates chemical dissolution and bioerosion of the calcium carbonate reef framework (Wisshak et al., [2012,](#page-27-0) [2014](#page-27-0); Hennige et al., [2015\)](#page-23-0). Altogether, this 'coralporosis' produces instable, 'crumbling' reefs of reduced structural complexity, and in case of aragonite undersaturation, CWC 'reefs' consisting primarily of live coral colonies without a dead framework foundation (Hennige et al., [2020\)](#page-23-0).

Reduced structural complexity will likely diminish CWC reef biodiversity and ecosystem functioning (Fig. [8B\)](#page-18-0), similar to tropical coral reefs (Nelson, Kuempel & Altieri, [2016;](#page-25-0) Sunday et al., [2016;](#page-26-0) Doo, Edmunds & Carpenter, [2019](#page-22-0); Dove et al., [2020\)](#page-22-0). A flat reef structure does not induce downward transport of POM-rich surface water, leading to (further) diminished food supply and retention (White *et al.*, [2005;](#page-27-0) Mienis et al., [2007;](#page-24-0) Soetaert et al., [2016\)](#page-26-0). Reef sessile suspension feeders cannot attach to strongly degraded reef framework and coral rubble (Mortensen & Fosså, [2006;](#page-24-0) Maier et al., [2021](#page-24-0)). Furthermore, suspension feeders appear particularly sensitive to temperature increase, indicated by their reduced abundance under episodic, interannual tempera-ture highs at the Mingulay Reef (Kazanidis et al., [2021](#page-23-0)b). Loss of structural complexity and suspension feeders on CWC reefs will likely impair the mechanical and biological 'reef filter' and concomitantly food particle retention (Fig. [8B](#page-18-0); see Section [IV](#page-14-0)). Reduced food availability and decreased biodiversity may restrain recycling pathways. For instance, lower abundance of CWCs could result in lower production of mucoid DOM, less recycling of DOM by the reef fauna, and less production of detrital waste for detritivores – i.e. an attenuated 'suspension feeder (sponge) loop'

(Fig. [8B\)](#page-18-0). Reduced resource availability might lead to a further decrease of biodiversity (Fig. [8B\)](#page-18-0), creating a detrimental feedback loop that jeopardises the stability of the reef community (Worm & Duffy, [2003](#page-27-0)). In conclusion, the Anthropocene climate may substantially damage the functioning of CWC reef ecosystems, but unlike for tropical coral reefs (Hughes et al., [2010\)](#page-23-0), virtually nothing is known about their resilience and potential phase shifts. In a similar way, global change will likely affect other complex deep-sea ecosystems, such as coral gardens and sponge grounds (Rossi *et al.*, [2019](#page-26-0)).

#### (3) Conservation of cold-water coral reefs in the Anthropocene

The vulnerability of CWC reefs and their importance as ecosystem service providers (see Section [I](#page-1-0)) has been recognised by the United Nations (UN) Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO, [2009](#page-22-0)), declaring CWC reefs as vulnerable marine ecosystems (VMEs), according to the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) resolution 61/105 (UNGA, [2007\)](#page-26-0). VMEs require special protection, e.g. through marine spatial planning with the designation of marine protected areas (MPAs; United Nations, [2017](#page-26-0)). Yet, effective marine spatial planning remains difficult, due to limited scientific knowledge on global CWC distribution, lack of historical baseline data (Durán Muñoz & Sayago-Gil, [2011](#page-22-0); Kazanidis et al., [2020;](#page-23-0) Lim, Wheeler & Conti, [2021](#page-24-0)), and scarce data on MPA effectiveness (Huvenne et al., [2016\)](#page-23-0). Some stressors are not constrained by protected area boundaries, including oil, other pollutants and impacts from global change; however protected areas can provide resilience to global stressors by maintaining ecosystem function. Continued mapping and characterisation of CWC habitats is critical, but we argue that our improved understanding of the 'cold-water coral reef paradox' should also be incorporated into ecosystem assessment and conservation efforts. Live coral cover has been used as a proxy for CWC reef health (Flögel et al., [2014](#page-22-0); Juva et al., [2020](#page-23-0)), yet differences in CWC cover may be natural and do not necessarily provide information on whether a reef is new or on the verge of disappearing (Hughes et al., [2010](#page-23-0)). An integrative approach to assess the environmental status of CWC reefs was presented by Kazanidis et al. [\(2020\)](#page-23-0), including biodiversity indices, coral cover, fish biomass, signs of anthropogenic impacts, etc., as proxies for reef status. Based on Sections II–[IV](#page-6-0), we suggest complementing these ecosystem descriptors by including  $(i)$  organic and inorganic  $C$ budgets for  $(a)$  CWCs and  $(b)$  the reef ecosystem, to evaluate reef growth *versus* erosion; and  $(ii)$  reef functional diversity and food-web complexity, to judge ecosystem functioning and resilience to changing oceanographic conditions. Future research should create a framework to facilitate the assessment of these ecosystem descriptors. For 1a, the energetic status (energy budget) of CWCs at different reefs should be regularly measured, e.g. their metabolic activity and tissue stores (somatic and reproductive). In addition, these measures could be introduced into DEB models, to assess coral

<span id="page-20-0"></span>growth under local and potentially changing environmental conditions (e.g. temperature, food supply). Regarding  $1b$ , video transect annotations of CWC reefs can be combined with predictive modelling to create reef-scale biomass, and organic and inorganic C maps; newly developed machinelearning algorithms will accelerate video annotations in the future (De Clippele et al., [2021](#page-22-0)a). Regarding 2, future research could develop a functional traits database for reef-associated organisms (e.g. their feeding guild) plus open-source code for simple implementation of food-web models. This would allow evaluation of the trophodynamic resilience of different CWC reefs without strong programming skills. Based on these approaches, future research may help to identify CWC reef 'refugia' that are likely to persist during future global change (Morato et al., [2020](#page-24-0)). Spatial measures protecting networks of these refugia from, e.g. bottom-trawling fisheries, appear to be our best chance to preserve CWC reefs and their function as diversity– productivity hotspots in the deep sea.

# VI. CONCLUSIONS

(1) Recent major advances allow us to approach the paradox of how CWC reefs sustain high biodiversity, biomass and metabolic activity in the food-limited deep sea. Suggested answers to this paradox reveal key drivers of CWC reef distribution that are required to achieve effective conservation measures.

(2) Most reef-building CWC species occur in areas of enhanced primary production with high seasonal fluctuations and under elevated current velocity (relative to global averages), indicating that food production and supply are important drivers of CWC reef distribution.

(3) Food supply on CWC reefs is not constantly low, but highly dynamic. Within a couple of hours, food availability can change from very low to very high, depending on the season, the prevailing hydrodynamic regime, and presence of vertically migrating zooplankton.

(4) The best-studied reef-forming CWC species  $D$ . pertusum is well adapted to these extreme temporal fluctuations in food availability, by  $(i)$  high capture rates of phytodetritus and zooplankton, (ii) high resource flexibility (DOM, bacterioplankton, inorganic resources), *(iii)* investing in large tissue reserves for reproduction, and  $(iv)$  synchronising activity with (seasonal) fluctuations in food availability.

(5) On the ecosystem level, CWC reefs sustain high metabolic activity and biomass. They achieve this firstly by efficient retention of phytodetritus, zooplankton and bacterioplankton in the 'reef filter', a combination of a mechanical filter provided by the structurally complex, porous reef framework and a biological filter consisting of diverse, abundant suspension-feeding epifauna. Secondly, diverse trophic interactions and material recycling facilitate optimal resource utilisation and exploitation of additional food sources, such as dissolved organic and inorganic matter.

(6) Climate change, ocean acidification, fisheries, mining, and pollution impact reef functioning in various ways, e.g. by reducing organic matter supply, increasing the animals' energy demands, and dissolving the carbonate reef framework, thereby decreasing structural and biological diversity and ecosystem functioning. Research has only started to reveal the vast complexity, drivers and functioning of CWC reefs, but it is crucial to continue this path to facilitate knowledge-based habitat management for sustaining these diversity–productivity hotspots in the future ocean.

#### VII. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to acknowledge funding by the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (VIDI grant 864.13.007 to D. v. O. and S. R. M., VIDI grant 016.161.360 to F. M.), funding by the European Union's Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation Programme (ATLAS project, grant agreement no. 678760 to D. v. O. and E. d. F.; iAtlantic project, grant agreement no. 818123 to L. H. d. C.), funding by the Greenland Research Council and the Greenland Self Rule Governments funding for science support to S. R. M., and funding by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), by the Bureau of Ocean Energy and Management (BOEM), and by the United States Geological Survey (USGS) to S. B.

#### VIII. REFERENCES

- References identified with an asterisk (\*) are cited only within the supporting information.
- Antia, A. N., Koeve, W., Fischer, G., Blanz, T., Schulz-Bull, D., SCHÖLTEN, J., NEUER, S., KREMLING, K., KUSS, J., PEINERT, R., HEBBELN, D., BATHMANN, U., CONTE, M., FEHNER, U. & ZEITZSCHEL, B. (2001). Basin-wide particulate carbon flux in the Atlantic Ocean: regional export patterns and potential for atmospheric  $\rm CO_2$  sequestration. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 15, 845–862.
- Armstrong, C. W., Foley, N. S., Kahui, V. & Grehan, A. (2014). Cold water coral reef management from an ecosystem service perspective. Marine Policy 50, 126–134.
- ARMSTRONG, C. W. & VAN DEN HOVE, S. (2008). The formation of policy for protection of cold-water coral off the coast of Norway. Marine Policy 32, 66–73.
- Assis, J., Tyberghein, L., Bosch, S., Verbruggen, H., Serrao, E. A. & De Clerck, O. (2018). Bio-ORACLE v2.0: extending marine data layers for bioclimatic modelling. Global Ecology and Biogeography 27, 277–284.
- Azam, F., Fenchel, T., Field, J. G., Gray, J. S., Meyer-Reil, L. A. & Thingstad, F. (1983). The ecological role of water-column microbes in the sea. Marine Ecology Progress Series 10, 257–263.
- Baco, A. R., Morgan, N., Roark, E. B., Silva, M., Shamberger, K. E. F. & Miller, K. (2017). Defying dissolution: discovery of deep-sea scleractinian coral reefs in the North Pacific. Scientific Reports 7, 5436.
- BANDARA, K., VARPE, Ø., WIJEWARDENE, L., TVERBERG, V. & EIANE, K. (2021). Two hundred years of zooplankton vertical migration research. Biological Reviews 96, 1547–1589.
- BARBOSA, R. V., DAVIES, A. J. & SUMIDA, P. Y. G. (2020). Habitat suitability and environmental niche comparison of cold-water coral species along the Brazilian continental margin. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 155, 103147.
- Bargain, A., Foglini, F., Pairaud, I., Bonaldo, D., Carniel, S., Angeletti, L., TAVIANI, M., ROCHETTE, S. & FABRI, M. C. (2018). Predictive habitat modeling in two Mediterranean canyons including hydrodynamic variables. Progress in Oceanography 169, 151–168.
- Bart, M. C., de Kluijver, A., Hoetjes, S., Absalah, S., Mueller, B., KENCHINGTON, E., RAPP, H. T. & DE GOEIJ, J. M. (2020). Differential processing of dissolved and particulate organic matter by deep-sea sponges and their microbial symbionts. Scientific Reports 10, 17515.
- <span id="page-21-0"></span>BART, M. C., HUDSPITH, M., RAPP, H. T., VERDONSCHOT, P. F. M. & DE GOEIL J. M. (2021a). A deep-sea sponge loop? Sponges transfer dissolved and particulate organic carbon and nitrogen to associated fauna. Frontiers in Marine Science **8**. 229.
- Bart, M. C., Mueller, B., Rombouts, T., van de Ven, C., Tompkins, G. J., Osinga, R., Brussaard, C. P. D., MacDonald, B., Engel, A., Rapp, H. T. & DE GOEIJ, J. M. (2021b). Dissolved organic carbon (DOC) is essential to balance the metabolic demands of four dominant North-Atlantic deep-sea sponges. Limnology and Oceanography 66, 925–938.
- Baussant, T., Arnberg, M., Lyng, E., Ramanand, S., Bamber, S., Berry, M., HANSEN, I. M., OEVELEN, D. V. & BREUGEL, P. V. (2022). Identification of tolerance levels on the cold-water coral Desmophyllum pertusum (Lophelia pertusa) from realistic exposure conditions to suspended bentonite, barite and drill cutting particles. PLoS One 17, e0263061.
- Baussant, T., Nilsen, M., Ravagnan, E., Westerlund, S. & Ramanand, S. (2017). Physiological responses and lipid storage of the coral Lophelia pertusa at varying food density. Journal of Toxicology and Environmental Health, Part A 80, 266–284.
- BEUCK, L. & FREIWALD, A. (2005). Bioerosion patterns in a deep-water Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia) thicket (Propeller Mound, northern Porcupine Seabight). In Cold-Water Corals and Ecosystems (eds A. FREIWALD and J. M. ROBERTS), pp. 915–936. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- Billett, D. S. M., Lampitt, R. S., Rice, A. L. & Mantoura, R. F. C. (1983). Seasonal sedimentation of phytoplankton to the deep-sea benthos. Nature 302, 520–522.
- BOPP, L., AUMONT, O., CADULE, P., ALVAIN, S. & GEHLEN, M. (2005). Response of diatoms distribution to global warming and potential implications: a global model study. Geophysical Research Letters 32, 1–4.
- Bopp, L., Monfray, P., Aumont, O., Dufresne, J.-L., Le Treut, H., Madec, G., Terray, L. & Orr, J. C. (2001). Potential impact of climate change on marine export production. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 15, 81–89.
- Bostock, H. C., Tracey, D. M., Currie, K. I., Dunbar, G. B., Handler, M. R., Mikaloff Fletcher, S. E., Smith, A. M. & Williams, M. J. M. (2015). The carbonate mineralogy and distribution of habitat-forming deep-sea corals in the southwest pacific region. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 100, 88–104.
- BOYD, P. W. & TRULL, T. W. (2007). Understanding the export of biogenic particles in oceanic waters: is there consensus? Progress in Oceanography 72, 276–312.
- BROOKE, S. & JÄRNEGREN, J. (2013). Reproductive periodicity of the scleractinian coral Lophelia pertusa from the Trondheim Fjord, Norway. Marine Biology 160, 139–153.
- BROOKE, S., REED, J. & MESSING, C. (2005). Mapping and characterization of deep sea coral ecosystem off the Coast of Florida. Final Report to NOAA Office of Ocean Exploration for grant number NA07OAR4600290.
- Brooke, S. D., Baco-Taylor, A., Ingels, J., Morey, S., Poti, M. & Winship, A. (2022). Combining habitat suitability and physical oceanography models for targeted discovery of new benthic communities on the west Florida slope. Final Report for NOAA OER Grant No. NA180AR0110285, pp 42. NOAA Office of Ocean Exploration.
- Buhl-Mortensen, L., Vanreusel, A., Gooday, A. J., Levin, L. A., Priede, I. G., Buhl-Mortensen, P., Gheerardyn, H., King, N. J. & Raes, M. (2010). Biological structures as a source of habitat heterogeneity and biodiversity on the deep ocean margins. Marine Ecology 31, 21–50.
- Buhl-Mortensen, P., Tenningen, E. & Tysseland, A. B. S. (2015). Effects of water flow and drilling waste exposure on polyp behaviour in Lophelia pertusa. Marine Biology Research 11, 1–13.
- BURGESS, S. N. & BABCOCK, R. C. (2005). Reproductive ecology of three reef-forming, deep-sea corals in the New Zealand region. In Cold-Water Corals and Ecosystems (eds A. FREIWALD and J. M. ROBERTS), pp. 701–713. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- Burgos, J. M., Buhl-Mortensen, L., Buhl-Mortensen, P., Ólafsdóttir, S. H., STEINGRUND, P., RAGNARSSON, S. A. & SKAGSETH, Ø. (2020). Predicting the distribution of indicator taxa of vulnerable marine ecosystems in the Arctic and sub-arctic waters of the Nordic Seas. Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 1-25.
- BÜSCHER, J., FORM, A. U. & RIEBESELL, U. (2017). Interactive effects of ocean acidification and warming on growth, fitness and survival of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa under different food availabilities. Frontiers in Marine Science 4,  $1-14$ .
- BÜSCHER, J. V., FORM, A. U., WISSHAK, M., KIKO, R. & RIEBESELL, U. (2022). Coldwater coral ecosystems under future ocean change: live coral performance vs. framework dissolution and bioerosion. Limnology and Oceanography 67, 2497–2515.
- Büscher, J. V., Wisshak, M., Form, A. U., Titschack, J., Nachtigall, K. & RIEBESELL, U. (2019). In situ growth and bioerosion rates of Lophelia pertusa in a Norwegian fjord and open shelf cold-water coral habitat. Peerf 7, e7586.
- BYTHELL, J. C. & WILD, C. (2011). Biology and ecology of coral mucus release.  ${\it Journal}$ of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 408, 88–93.
- Cairns, S. D. (1982). Antarctic and subantarctic Scleractinia. Antarctic Research Series XI 34, 1–74.
- Cairns, S. D. (1995). The marine fauna of New Zealand: Scleractinia (Cnidaria: Anthozoa). New Zealand Oceanographic Institute Memoir 103, 1-210.
- Campbell, R. W. & Dower, J. F. (2003). Role of lipids in the maintenance of neutral buoyancy by zooplankton. Marine Ecology Progress Series 263, 93–99.
- Capotondi, A., Alexander, M. A., Bond, N. A., Curchitser, E. N. & SCOTT, J. D. (2012). Enhanced upper ocean stratification with climate change in the CMIP3 models. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans* 117, 1-23.
- CARDOSO, J. F. M. F., VAN BLEIJSWIJK, J. D. L., WITTE, H. & VAN DUYL, F. C. (2013). Diversity and abundance of ammonia-oxidizing archaea and bacteria in tropical and cold-water coral reef sponges. Aquatic Microbial Ecology 68, 215-230.
- Carlier, A., Le Guilloux, E., Olu, K., Sarrazin, J., Mastrototaro, F., Taviani, M. & Clavier, J. (2009). Trophic relationships in a deep Mediterranean cold-water coral bank (Santa Maria di Leuca, Ionian Sea). Marine Ecology Progress Series 397, 125–137.
- Carlson, C. A. & Hansell, D. A. (2015). Chapter 3 DOM sources, sinks, reactivity, and budgets. In Biogeochemistry of Marine Dissolved Organic Matter, Second Edition (eds D. A. HANSELL and C. A. CARLSON), pp. 65–126. Academic Press, Boston.
- Cathalot, C., van Oevelen, D., Cox, T. J. S., Kutti, T., Lavaleye, M., Duineveld, G. & Meysman, F. J. R. (2015). Cold-water coral reefs and adjacent sponge grounds: hotspots of benthic respiration and organic carbon cycling in the deep sea. Frontiers in Marine Science 2, 1–12.
- Chapron, L., Galand, P. E., Pruski, A. M., Peru, E., Ve´tion, G., Robin, S. & LARTAUD, F. (2021). Resilience of cold-water coral holobionts to thermal stress. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 288, 20212117.
- Chapron, L., Le Bris, N., Durrieu de Madron, X., Peru, E., Galand, P. E. & LARTAUD, F. (2020). Long term monitoring of cold-water coral growth shows response to episodic meteorological events in the NW Mediterranean. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 160, 103255.
- Chapron, L., Peru, E., Engler, A., Ghiglione, J. F., Meistertzheim, A. L., Pruski, A. M., Purser, A., Vétion, G., Galand, P. E. & Lartaud, F. (2018). Macro- and microplastics affect cold-water corals growth, feeding and behaviour. Scientific Reports 8, 15299.
- Chu, J. W. F., Nephin, J., Georgian, S., Knudby, A., Rooper, C. & Gale, K. S. P. (2019). Modelling the environmental niche space and distributions of cold-water corals and sponges in the Canadian Northeast Pacific Ocean. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 151, 103063.
- COHEN, A. L. & HOLCOMB, M. (2009). Why corals care about ocean acidification: uncovering the mechanism. Oceanography 22, 118-127.
- CONTI, L. A., LIM, A. & WHEELER, A. J. (2019). High resolution mapping of a cold water coral mound. Scientific Reports 9, 1016.
- Coppari, M., Zanella, C. & Rossi, S. (2019). The importance of coastal gorgonians in the blue carbon budget. Scientific Reports 9, 13550.
- CORBERA, G., LO IACONO, C., GRÀCIA, E., GRINYÓ, J., PIERDOMENICO, M., Huvenne, V. A. I., Aguilar, R. & Gili, J. M. (2019). Ecological characterisation of a Mediterranean cold-water coral reef: Cabliers Coral Mound Province (Alboran Sea, western Mediterranean). Progress in Oceanography 175, 245–262.
- Cordes, E. E., McGinley, M. P., Podowski, E. L., Becker, E. L., Lessard-Pilon, S., Viada, S. T. & Fisher, C. R. (2008). Coral communities of the deep Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 55, 777–787.
- COSTELLO, M. J., McCrea, M., Freiwald, A., Lundälv, T., JONSSON, L., Bett, B. J., van Weering, T. C. E., de Haas, H., Roberts, J. M. & Allen, D. (2005). Role of cold-water Lophelia pertusa coral reefs as fish habitat in the NE Atlantic. In Cold-Water Corals and Ecosystems (eds A. FREIWALD and J. M. ROBERTS), pp. 771–805. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- Cyr, F., van Haren, H., Mienis, F., Duineveld, G. & Bourgault, D. (2016). On the influence of cold-water coral mound size on flow hydrodynamics, and vice versa. Geophysical Research Letters 43, 775–783.
- Davies, A. J., Duineveld, G. C. A., Lavaleye, M. S. S., Bergman, M. J. N., van Haren, H. & Roberts, J. M. (2009). Downwelling and deep-water bottom currents as food supply mechanisms to the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia) at the Mingulay reef complex. Limnology and Oceanography 54, 620–629.
- DAVIES, A. J. & GUINOTTE, J. M. (2011). Global habitat suitability for frameworkforming cold-water corals. PLoS One 6, e18483.
- Davies, A. J., Roberts, J. M. & Hall-Spencer, J. (2007). Preserving deep-sea natural heritage: emerging issues in offshore conservation and management. Biological Conservation 138, 299–312.
- Davies, A. J., Wisshak, M., Orr, J. C. & Murray Roberts, J. (2008). Predicting suitable habitat for the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia). Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 55, 1048–1062.
- De Clippele, L. H., Gafeira, J., Robert, K., Hennige, S., Lavaleye, M. S., Duineveld, G. C. A., Huvenne, V. A. I. & Roberts, J. M. (2017a). Using novel acoustic and visual mapping tools to predict the small-scale spatial distribution of live biogenic reef framework in cold-water coral habitats. Coral Reefs 36, 255–268.

- <span id="page-22-0"></span>DE CLIPPELE, L. H., HUVENNE, V. A. I., OREJAS, C., LUNDÄLV, T., FOX, A., HENNIGE, S. J. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2017b). The effect of local hydrodynamics on the spatial extent and morphology of cold-water coral habitats at Tisler Reef, Norway. Coral Reefs 37, 1–14.
- DE CLIPPELE, L. H., ROVELLI, L., RAMIRO-SÁNCHEZ, B., KAZANIDIS, G., VAD, J., TURNER, S., GLUD, R. N. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2021a). Mapping cold-water coral biomass: an approach to derive ecosystem functions. Coral Reefs 40, 215–231.
- De Clippele, L. H., van der Kaaden, A.-S., Maier, S. R., de Froe, E. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2021b). Biomass mapping for an improved understanding of the contribution of cold-water coral carbonate mounds to C and N cycling. Frontiers in Marine Science 8, 1608.
- De Froe, E., Maier, S. R., Horn, H. G., Wolff, G. A., Blackbird, S., Mohn, C., Schultz, M., van der Kaaden, A.-S., Cheng, C. H., Wubben, E., van Haastregt, B., Moller, E. F., Lavaleye, M., Soetaert, K., REICHART, G.-J., ET AL. (2022). Hydrography and Food Distribution during a Tidal Cycle above a Cold-Water Coral Mound, p. 103854. Oceanographic Research Papers, Deep Sea Research Part I.
- De Froe, E., Rovelli, L., Glud, R. N., Maier, S. R., Duineveld, G., Mienis, F., Lavaleye, M. & van Oevelen, D. (2019). Benthic oxygen and nitrogen exchange on a cold-water coral reef in the North-East Atlantic Ocean. Frontiers in Marine Science 6, 665.
- DE GOEIJ, J. M., LESSER, M. P. & PAWLIK, J. R. (2017). Nutrient fluxes and ecological functions of coral reef sponges in a changing ocean. In Climate Change, Ocean Acidification and Sponges: Impacts across Multiple Levels of Organization (eds J. L. CARBALLO and J. J. BELL), pp. 373–410. Springer, Cham.
- De Goeij, J. M., van Oevelen, D., Vermeij, M. J. A., Osinga, R., Middelburg, J. J., de Goeij, A. F. P. M. & Admiraal, W. (2013). Surviving in a marine desert: the sponge loop retains resources within coral reefs. Science 342, 108–110.
- De Haas, H., Mienis, F., Frank, N., Richter, T. O., Steinacher, R., de Stigter, H., van der Land, C. & van Weering, T. C. E. (2009). Morphology and sedimentology of (clustered) cold-water coral mounds at the south Rockall Trough margins, NE Atlantic Ocean. Facies 55, 1–26.
- De Kluijver, A., Bart, M. C., van Oevelen, D., de Goeij, J. M., Leys, S. P., Maier, S. R., Maldonado, M., Soetaert, K., Verbiest, S. & MIDDELBURG, J. J. (2021). An integrative model of carbon and nitrogen metabolism in a common deep-sea sponge (Geodia barretti). Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 596251.
- Di Camillo, C. G., Bavestrello, G., Cerrano, C., Gravili, C., Piraino, S., Puce, S. & Boero, F. (2017). Hydroids (Cnidaria, Hydrozoa): a neglected component of animal forests. Marine Animal Forests 20, 397–427.
- DODDS, L. A., BLACK, K. D., ORR, H. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2009). Lipid biomarkers reveal geographical differences in food supply to the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia). Marine Ecology Progress Series 397, 113–124.
- Dodds, L. A., Roberts, J. M., Taylor, A. C. & Marubini, F. (2007). Metabolic tolerance of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia) to temperature and dissolved oxygen change. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 349, 205–214.
- Doo, S. S., Edmunds, P. J. & Carpenter, R. C. (2019). Ocean acidification effects on in situ coral reef metabolism. Scientific Reports 9, 12067.
- DOREY, N., GJELSVIK, Ø., KUTTI, T. & BÜSCHER, J. V. (2020). Broad thermal tolerance in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa from Arctic and boreal reefs. Frontiers in Physiology 10, 1–12.
- DORSCHEL, B., HEBBELN, D., RÜGGEBERG, A. & DULLO, C. (2007). Carbonate budget of a cold-water coral carbonate mound: propeller mound, Porcupine Seabight. International Journal of Earth Sciences 96, 73-83.
- DORSCHEL, B., HEBBELN, D., RÜGGEBERG, A., DULLO, W.-C. & FREIWALD, A. (2005). Growth and erosion of a cold-water coral covered carbonate mound in the Northeast Atlantic during the late Pleistocene and Holocene. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 233, 33–44.
- Dove, S. G., Brown, K. T., van Den Heuvel, A., Chai, A. & Hoegh-GULDBERG, O. (2020). Ocean warming and acidification uncouple calcification from calcifier biomass which accelerates coral reef decline. Communications Earth & Environment 1, 1–9.
- Duineveld, G. C., Jeffreys, R. M., Lavaleye, M. S., Davies, A. J., BERGMAN, M. J., WATMOUGH, T. & WITBAARD, R. (2012). Spatial and tidal variation in food supply to shallow cold-water coral reefs of the Mingulay reef complex (outer Hebrides, Scotland). Marine Ecology Progress Series 444, 97–115.
- Duineveld, G. C. A., Lavaleye, M. S. S. & Berghuis, E. M. (2004). Particle flux and food supply to a seamount cold-water coral community (Galicia Bank, NW Spain). Marine Ecology Progress Series 277, 13-23.
- Duineveld, G. C. A., Lavaleye, M. S. S., Bergman, M. J. N., De Stigter, H. & Mienis, F. (2007). Trophic structure of a cold-water coral mound community (Rockall Bank, NE Atlantic) in relation to the near-bottom particle supply and current regime. Bulletin of Marine Science 81, 449-467.
- DURÁN MUÑOZ, P. & SAYAGO-GIL, M. (2011). An overview of cold-water coral protection on the high seas: The Hatton bank (NE Atlantic)—a case study. Marine Policy 35, 615–622.
- EISELE, M., FRANK, N., WIENBERG, C., HEBBELN, D., LÓPEZ CORREA, M., DOUVILLE, E. & FREIWALD, A. (2011). Productivity controlled cold-water coral growth periods during the last glacial off Mauritania. Marine Geology 280, 143–149.
- Ekman, V. W. (1905). On the influence of the earth's rotation on ocean-currents. In Arkiv för Matematik, Astronomi Och Fysik, Eleventh Edition (). University Microfilms, Inc., Ann Arbor London.
- FAO (2009). Report of the Technical Consultation on International Guidelines for the Management of Deep-Sea Fisheries in the High Seas. Food and Agriculture Organisation, Rome.
- Filander, Z. N., Kitahara, M. V., Cairns, S. D., Sink, K. J. & Lombard, A. T. (2021). Azooxanthellate Scleractinia (Cnidaria, Anthozoa) from South Africa. ZooKeys 1066, 1–198.
- Findlay, H. S., Artioli, Y., Moreno Navas, J., Hennige, S. J., Wicks, L. C., Huvenne, V. A. I., Woodward, E. M. S. & Roberts, J. M. (2013). Tidal downwelling and implications for the carbon biogeochemistry of cold-water corals in relation to future ocean acidification and warming. Global Change Biology 19, 2708–2719.
- FLÖGEL, S., DULLO, W.-C., PFANNKUCHE, O., KIRIAKOULAKIS, K. & RÜGGEBERG, A. (2014). Geochemical and physical constraints for the occurrence of living cold-water corals. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 99, 19–26.
- FORM, A. U. & RIEBESELL, U. (2012). Acclimation to ocean acidification during longterm CO<sub>2</sub> exposure in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa. Global Change Biology 18, 843–853.
- Fossa, J. H., Mortensen, P. B. & Furevik, D. M. (2002). The deep-water coral Lophelia pertusa in Norwegian waters: distribution and fishery impacts. Hydrobiologia 471, 1–12.
- Frederiksen, R., Jensen, A. & Westerberg, H. (1992). The distribution of the scleractinian coral *Lophelia pertusa* around the Faroe Islands and the relation to internal tidal mixing. Sarsia 77, 157–171.
- FREIWALD, A., FOSSÅ, J. H., GREHAN, A., KOSLOW, T. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2004). Cold-Water Coral Reefs. UNEP-WCMC, Cambridge.
- Fricke, H. & Meischner, D. (1985). Depth limits of Bermudan scleractinian corals: a submersible survey. Marine Biology 88, 175–187.
- Galand, P. E., Remize, M., Meistertzheim, A.-L., Pruski, A. M., Peru, E., SUHRHOFF, T. J., LE BRIS, N., VÉTION, G. & LARTAUD, F. (2020). Diet shapes cold-water corals bacterial communities. Environmental Microbiology 22, 354–368.
- Gammon, M. J., Tracey, D. M., Marriott, P. M., Cummings, V. J. & Davy, S. K. (2018). The physiological response of the deep-sea coral Solenosmilia variabilis to ocean acidification. Peerf 6, e5236.
- Gardner, W. D., Biscaye, P. E. & Richardson, M. J. (1997). A sediment trap experiment in the Vema Channel to evaluate the effect of horizontal particle fluxes on measured vertical fluxes. *Journal of Marine Research* 55, 995-1028.
- GAUDRON, S. M., LEFEBVRE, S. & MARQUES, G. M. (2021). Inferring functional traits in a deep-sea wood-boring bivalve using dynamic energy budget theory. Scientific Reports 11, 22720.
- Georgian, S., Morgan, L. & Wagner, D. (2021). The modeled distribution of corals and sponges surrounding the Salas y Gómez and Nazca ridges with implications for high seas conservation. Peer<sub>J</sub> 9, e11972.
- Georgian, S. E., Anderson, O. F. & Rowden, A. A. (2019). Ensemble habitat suitability modeling of vulnerable marine ecosystem indicator taxa to inform deepsea fisheries management in the South Pacific Ocean. Fisheries Research 211, 256–274.
- GEORGIAN, S. E., DUPONT, S., KURMAN, M., BUTLER, A., STRÖMBERG, S. M., LARSSON, A. I. & CORDES, E. E. (2016). Biogeographic variability in the physiological response of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa to ocean acidification. Marine Ecology 37, 1345–1359.
- GEORGIAN, S. E., SHEDD, W. & CORDES, E. E. (2014). High-resolution ecological niche modelling of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa in the Gulf of Mexico. Marine Ecology Progress Series 506, 145–161.
- Gili, J.-M. & Coma, R. (1998). Benthic suspension feeders: their paramount role in littoral marine food webs. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 13, 316-321.
- GLAZIER, A., HERRERA, S., WEINNIG, A., KURMAN, M., GÓMEZ, C. E. & CORDES, E. (2020). Regulation of ion transport and energy metabolism enables certain coral genotypes to maintain calcification under experimental ocean acidification. Molecular Ecology 29, 1657–1673.
- GOLDBERG, W. M. (2013). The Biology of Reefs and Reef Organisms. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.
- GÓMEZ, C. E., GORI, A., WEINNIG, A. M., HALLAJ, A., CHUNG, H. J. & CORDES, E. E. (2022). Natural variability in seawater temperature compromises the metabolic performance of a reef-forming cold-water coral with implications for vulnerability to ongoing global change. Coral Reefs 41, 1225–1237.
- GÓMEZ, C. E., WICKES, L., DEEGAN, D., ETNOYER, P. J. & CORDES, E. E. (2018). Growth and feeding of deep-sea coral Lophelia pertusa from the California margin under simulated ocean acidification conditions. Peer $\tilde{\jmath}$  6, e5671.
- <span id="page-23-0"></span>GORI, A., GROVER, R., OREJAS, C., SIKORSKI, S. & FERRIER-PAGÈS, C. (2014). Uptake of dissolved free amino acids by four cold-water coral species from the Mediterranean Sea. Deep Sea Research II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 99, 42–50.
- Grønvik, S. & Hopkins, C. C. E. (1984). Ecological investigations of the zooplankton community of Balsfjorden, northern Norway: generation cycle, seasonal vertical distribution, and seasonal variations in body weight and carbon and nitrogen content of the copepod Metridia longa (Lubbock). Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 80, 93–107.
- Gruber, N. (2011). Warming up, turning sour, losing breath: ocean biogeochemistry under global change. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences 369, 1980–1996.
- GRUBER, N., HAURI, C., LACHKAR, Z., LOHER, D., FRÖLICHER, T. L. & PLATTNER, G.-K. (2012). Rapid progression of ocean acidification in the California current system. Science 337, 220–223.
- GUIHEN, D., WHITE, M. & LUNDÄLV, T. (2012). Temperature shocks and ecological implications at a cold-water coral reef. Marine Biodiversity Records 5, e68.
- GUIHEN, D., WHITE, M. & LUNDÄLV, T. (2018). Zooplankton drive diurnal changes in oxygen concentration at Tisler cold-water coral reef. Coral Reefs 37, 1013–1025.
- Guinotte, J. M., Orr, J., Cairns, S., Freiwald, A., Morgan, L. & George, R. (2006). Will human-induced changes in seawater chemistry alter the distribution of deep-sea scleractinian corals? Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment 4, 141–146.
- Hamann, L. & Blanke, A. (2022). Suspension feeders: diversity, principles of particle separation and biomimetic potential. Journal of the Royal Society Interface 19, 20210741.
- Hansson, L., Agis, M., Maier, C. & Weinbauer, M. G. (2009). Community composition of bacteria associated with cold-water coral Madrepora oculata: within and between colony variability. Marine Ecology Progress Series 397, 89–102.
- Hanz, U., Riekenberg, P., de Kluijver, A., van der Meer, M., MIDDELBURG, J. J., DE GOEIJ, J. M., BART, M. C., WURZ, E., COLAÇO, A., Duineveld, G. C. A., Reichart, G.-J., Rapp, H.-T. & Mienis, F. (2022). The important role of sponges in carbon and nitrogen cycling in a deep-sea biological hotspot. Functional Ecology 00, 1–12.
- Hanz, U., Wienberg, C., Hebbeln, D., Duineveld, G., Lavaleye, M., Juva, K., DULLO, W.-C., FREIWALD, A., TAMBORRINO, L., REICHART, G.-J., FLÖGEL, S. & Mienis, F. (2019). Environmental factors influencing benthic communities in the oxygen minimum zones on the Angolan and Namibian margins. Biogeosciences 16, 4337–4356.
- Heath, M. R., Fraser, J. G., Gislason, A., Hay, S. J., Jónasdóttir, S. H. & RICHARDSON, K. (2000). Winter distribution of Calanus finmarchicus in the Northeast Atlantic. ICES Journal of Marine Science 57, 1628–1635.
- Hebbeln, D., Wienberg, C., Dullo, W.-C., Freiwald, A., Mienis, F., Orejas, C. & Titschack, J. (2020). Cold-water coral reefs thriving under hypoxia. Coral Reefs 39, 853–859.
- Hebbeln, D., Wienberg, C., Wintersteller, P., Freiwald, A., Becker, M., BEUCK, L., DULLO, C., EBERLI, G. P., GLOGOWSKI, S., MATOS, L., Forster, N., Reyes-Bonilla, H., Taviani, M. & The MSM 20-4 Shipboard SCIENTIFIC PARTY (2014). Environmental forcing of the Campeche cold-water coral province, southern Gulf of Mexico. Biogeosciences 11, 1799–1815.
- Hennige, S. J., Larsson, A. I., Orejas, C., Gori, A., De Clippele, L. H., Lee, Y. C., Jimeno, G., Georgoulas, K., Kamenos, N. A. & Roberts, J. M. (2021). Using the goldilocks principle to model coral ecosystem engineering. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 288, 20211260.
- Hennige, S. J., Wicks, L. C., Kamenos, N. A., Bakker, D. C. E., Findlay, H. S., DUMOUSSEAUD, C. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2014). Short-term metabolic and growth responses of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa to ocean acidification. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 99, 27–35.
- Hennige, S. J., Wicks, L. C., Kamenos, N. A., Perna, G., Findlay, H. S. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2015). Hidden impacts of ocean acidification to live and dead coral framework. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 282, 1-10.
- Hennige, S. J., Wolfram, U., Wickes, L., Murray, F., Roberts, J. M., Kamenos, N. A., Schofield, S., Groetsch, A., Spiesz, E. M., Aubin-Tam, M.-E. & Etnoyer, P. J. (2020). Crumbling reefs and cold-water coral habitat loss in a future ocean: evidence of 'coralporosis' as an undicator of habitat integrity. Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 668.
- Henry, L.-A., Davies, A. J. & Roberts, J. M. (2010). Beta diversity of cold-water coral reef communities off western Scotland. Coral Reefs 29, 427–436.
- Henry, L.-A., Navas, J. M., Hennige, S. J., Wicks, L. C., Vad, J. & Murray ROBERTS, J. (2013). Cold-water coral reef habitats benefit recreationally valuable sharks. Biological Conservation 161, 67-70.
- HENRY, L.-A. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2007). Biodiversity and ecological composition of macrobenthos on cold-water coral mounds and adjacent off-mound habitat in the bathyal Porcupine Seabight, NE Atlantic. Deep Sea Research I 54, 654–672.
- Henry, L.-A. & Roberts, J. M. (2016). Global biodiversity in cold-water coral reef ecosystems. In Marine Animal Forests: The Ecology of Benthic Biodiversity Hotspots (eds S. ROSSI, L. BRAMANTI, A. GORI and C. O. S. DEL VALLE), pp. 1–21. Springer International Publishing, Cham.
- Hentschel, U., Usher, K. M. & Taylor, M. W. (2006). Marine sponges as microbial fermenters. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 55, 167–177.
- HERNÁNDEZ-LEÓN, S., KOPPELMANN, R., FRAILE-NUEZ, E., BODE, A., MOMPEÁN, C., IRIGOIEN, X., OLIVAR, M. P., ECHEVARRÍA, F., FERNÁNDEZ DE PUELLES, M. L., GONZÁLEZ-GORDILLO, J. I., CÓZAR, A., ACUÑA, J. L., Agustı´, S. & Duarte, C. M. (2020). Large deep-sea zooplankton biomass mirrors primary production in the global ocean. Nature Communications 11, 6048.
- Höfer, J., González, H. E., Laudien, J., Schmidt, G. M., Häussermann, V. & RICHTER, C. (2018). All you can eat: the functional response of the cold-water coral Desmophyllum dianthus feeding on krill and copepods. Peerf 6, e5872.
- Hoffmann, F., Radax, R., Woebken, D., Holtappels, M., Lavik, G., RAPP, H. T., SCHLÄPPY, M. L., SCHLEPER, C. & KUYPERS, M. M. M. (2009). Complex nitrogen cycling in the sponge Geodia barretti. Environmental Microbiology 11, 2228–2243.
- Hughes, T. P., Graham, N. A. J., Jackson, J. B. C., Mumby, P. J. & Steneck, R. S. (2010). Rising to the challenge of sustaining coral reef resilience. Trends in Ecology  $\mathcal{C}$ Evolution 25, 633–642.
- Huvenne, V. A. I., Bett, B. J., Masson, D. G., Le Bas, T. P. & Wheeler, A. J. (2016). Effectiveness of a deep-sea cold-water coral marine protected area, following eight years of fisheries closure. Biological Conservation 200, 60-69.
- JÄRNEGREN, J. & ALTIN, D. (2006). Filtration and respiration of the deep living bivalve Acesta excavata (J.C. Fabricius, 1779) (Bivalvia; Limidae). Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 334, 122–129.
- JÓNASDÓTTIR, S. H., VISSER, A. W., RICHARDSON, K. & HEATH, M. R. (2015). Seasonal copepod lipid pump promotes carbon sequestration in the deep North Atlantic. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 112, 12122–12126.
- Jones, C. G., Lawton, J. H. & Shachak, M. (1994). Organisms as ecosystem engineers. In Ecosystem Management: Selected Readings (eds F. B. SAMSON and F. L. KNOPF), pp. 130–147. Springer, New York.
- Jones, D. O. B., Yool, A., Wei, C.-L., Henson, S. A., Ruhl, H. A., WATSON, R. A. & GEHLEN, M. (2014). Global reductions in seafloor biomass in response to climate change. Global Change Biology 20, 1861-1872.
- JONSSON, L. G., NILSSON, P. G., FLORUTA, F. & LUNDÄLV, T. (2004). Distributional patterns of macro- and megafauna associated with a reef of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa on the Swedish west coast. Marine Ecology Progress Series 284, 163–171.
- JUVA, K., FLÖGEL, S., KARSTENSEN, J., LINKE, P. & DULLO, W.-C. (2020). Tidal dynamics control on cold-water coral growth: a high-resolution multivariable study on eastern Atlantic cold-water coral sites. Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 1–23.
- KAZANIDIS, G., HENRY, L.-A. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2021a). Hidden structural heterogeneity enhances marine hotspots' biodiversity. Coral Reefs 40, 1615–1630.
- Kazanidis, G., Henry, L.-A., Roberts, J. M. & Witte, U. F. M. (2016). Biodiversity of Spongosorites coralliophaga (Stephens, 1915) on coral rubble at two contrasting cold-water coral reef settings. Coral Reefs 35, 193–208.
- Kazanidis, G., Henry, L.-A., Vad, J., Johnson, C., De Clippele, L. H. & ROBERTS, J. M. (2021b). Sensitivity of a cold-water coral reef to interannual variability in regional oceanography. Diversity and Distributions 27, 1719-1731.
- Kazanidis, G., Orejas, C., Borja, A., Kenchington, E., Henry, L.-A., Callery, O., Carreiro-Silva, M., Egilsdottir, H., Giacomello, E., GREHAN, A., MENOT, L., MORATO, T., RAGNARSSON, S. Á., RUEDA, J. L., STIRLING, D., ET AL. (2020). Assessing the environmental status of selected North Atlantic deep-sea ecosystems. Ecological Indicators 119, 106624.
- KAZANIDIS, G., VAN OEVELEN, D., VEUGER, B. & WITTE, U. F. M. (2018). Unravelling the versatile feeding and metabolic strategies of the cold-water ecosystem engineer Spongosorites coralliophaga (Stephens, 1915). Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 141, 71–82.
- Khripounoff, A., Caprais, J.-C., Le Bruchec, J., Rodier, P., Noel, P. & Cathalot, C. (2014). Deep cold-water coral ecosystems in the Brittany submarine canyons (Northeast Atlantic): hydrodynamics, particle supply, respiration, and carbon cycling. Limnology and Oceanography 59, 87–98.
- Kiko, R., Biastoch, A., Brandt, P., Cravatte, S., Hauss, H., Hummels, R., Kriest, I., Marin, F., McDonnell, A. M. P., Oschlies, A., Picheral, M., Schwarzkopf, F. U., Thurnherr, A. M. & Stemmann, L. (2017). Biological and physical influences on marine snowfall at the equator. Nature Geoscience 10, 852–858.
- Kinlan, B. P., Poti, M., Drohan, A. F., Packer, D. B., Dorfman, D. S. & Nizinski, M. S. (2020). Predictive modeling of suitable habitat for deep-sea corals offshore the Northeast United States. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 158, 103229.
- Kiriakoulakis, K., Bett, B. J., White, M. & Wolff, G. A. (2004). Organic biogeochemistry of the Darwin Mounds, a deep-water coral ecosystem, of the NE Atlantic. Deep-Sea Research 151, 1937-1954.
- Kiriakoulakis, K., Freiwald, A., Fisher, E. & Wolff, G. A. (2007). Organic matter quality and supply to deep-water coral/mound systems of the NW European Continental Margin. International Journal of Earth Sciences 96, 159–170.

- <span id="page-24-0"></span>Kleypas, J. A., Buddemeier, R. W., Archer, D., Gattuso, J.-P., Langdon, C. & Opdyke, B. N. (1999). Geochemical consequences of increased atmospheric carbon dioxide on coral reefs. Science 284, 118–120.
- KOOIJMAN, S. A. L. M. (2000). Dynamic Energy and Mass Budgets in Biological Systems. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Koslow, J. A., Gowlett-Holmes, K., Lowry, J. K., O'Hara, T., POORE, G. C. B. & WILLIAMS, A. (2001). Seamount benthic macrofauna off southern Tasmania: community structure and impacts of trawling. Marine Ecology Progress Series 213, 111–125.
- KURMAN, M. D., GÓMEZ, C. E., GEORGIAN, S. E., LUNDEN, J. L. & CORDES, E. E. (2017). Intra-specific variation reveals potential for adaptation to ocean acidification in a cold-water coral from the Gulf of Mexico. Frontiers in Marine Science 4, 1–14.
- KUTTI, T., BERGSTAD, O. A., FOSSÅ, J. H. & HELLE, K. (2014). Cold-water coral mounds and sponge-beds as habitats for demersal fish on the Norwegian shelf. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 99, 122-133.
- LALLI, C. M. & PARSONS, T. R. (1997). Biological Oceanography: An Introduction, 2nd Edition (). Elsevier Ltd., Oxford.
- LARSSON, A. I., LUNDÄLV, T. & VAN OEVELEN, D. (2013a). Skeletal growth, respiration rate and fatty acid composition in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa under varying food conditions. Marine Ecology Progress Series 483, 169–184.
- LARSSON, A. I., VAN OEVELEN, D., PURSER, A. & THOMSEN, L. (2013b). Tolerance to long-term exposure of suspended benthic sediments and drill cuttings in the coldwater coral Lophelia pertusa. Marine Pollution Bulletin 70, 176–188.
- LARTAUD, F., PAREIGE, S., DE RAFÉLIS, M., FEUILLASSIER, L., BIDEAU, M., PERU, E., DE LA VEGA, E., NEDONCELLE, K., ROMANS, P. & LE BRIS, N. (2014). Temporal changes in the growth of two Mediterranean cold-water coral species, in situ and in aquaria. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography  $99, 64-70$ .
- LAVALEYE, M., DUINEVELD, G., LUNDÄLV, T., WHITE, M., GUIHEN, D., KIRIAKOULAKIS, K. & WOLFF, G. A. (2009). Cold-water corals on the Tisler Reef. Oceanography 22, 76–84.
- LESSER, M. P., WITMAN, J. D. & SEBNENS, K. P. (1994). Effects of flow and seston availability on scope for growth of benthic suspension-feeding invertebrates from the Gulf of Maine. The Biological Bulletin 187, 319-335.
- Leys, S. P., KAHN, A. S., FANG, J. K. H., KUTTI, T. & BANNISTER, R. J. (2018). Phagocytosis of microbial symbionts balances the carbon and nitrogen budget for the deep-water boreal sponge Geodia barretti. Limnology and Oceanography 63, 187–202.
- Li, G., Cheng, L., Zhu, J., Trenberth, K. E., Mann, M. E. & Abraham, J. P. (2020). Increasing ocean stratification over the past half-century. Nature Climate Change 10, 1116–1123.
- Lim, A., Wheeler, A. J. & Arnaubec, A. (2017). High-resolution facies zonation within a cold-water coral mound: the case of the Piddington mound, Porcupine Seabight, NE Atlantic. Marine Geology 390, 120-130.
- LIM, A., WHEELER, A. J. & CONTI, L. (2021). Cold-water coral habitat mapping: trends and developments in acquisition and processing methods. Geosciences 11, 9.
- LONG, S., SPARROW-SCINOCCA, B., BLICHER, M. E., HAMMEKEN ARBOE, N. Fuhrmann, M., Kemp, K. M., Nygaard, R., Zinglersen, K. & Yesson, C. (2020). Identification of a soft coral garden candidate vulnerable marine ecosystem (VME) using video imagery, Davis Strait, West Greenland. Frontiers in Marine Science  $7, 1–19.$
- LUNDEN, J.J., GEORGIAN, S. E. & CORDES, E. E. (2013). Aragonite saturation states at cold-water coral reefs structured by Lophelia pertusa in the northern Gulf of Mexico. Limnology and Oceanography 58, 354–362.
- LUTZ, M., DUNBAR, R. & CALDEIRA, K. (2002). Regional variability in the vertical flux of particulate organic carbon in the ocean interior. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 16, 11-1–11-18.
- Maier, C., De Kluijver, A., Agis, M., Brussaard, C. P. D., van Duyl, F. C. & WEINBAUER, M. G. (2011). Dynamics of nutrients, total organic carbon, prokaryotes and viruses in onboard incubations of cold-water corals. Biogeosciences 8, 2609–2620.
- Maier, C., Popp, P., Sollfrank, N., Weinbauer, M. G., Wild, C. & GATTUSO, J.-P. (2016). Effects of elevated  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$  and feeding on net calcification and energy budget of the Mediterranean cold-water coral Madrepora oculata. Journal of Experimental Biology 219, 3208–3217.
- MAIER, C., SCHUBERT, A., BERZUNZA SANCHEZ, M. M., WEINBAUER, M. G., WATREMEZ, P. & GATTUSO, J. P. (2013). End of the century  $pCO_2$  levels do not impact calcification in Mediterranean cold-water corals. PLoS One 8, e62655.
- MAIER, S. R., BANNISTER, R. J., VAN OEVELEN, D. & KUTTI, T. (2020a). Seasonal controls on the diet, metabolic activity, tissue reserves and growth of the coldwater coral Lophelia pertusa. Coral Reefs 39, 173–187.
- Maier, S. R., Kutti, T., Bannister, R. J., Fang, J. K.-H., van Breugel, P., van Rijswijk, P. & van Oevelen, D. (2020b). Recycling pathways in cold-water coral reefs: use of dissolved organic matter and bacteria by key suspension feeding taxa. Scientific Reports 10, 9942.
- Maier, S. R., Kutti, T., Bannister, R. J., van Breugel, P., van Rijswijk, P. & van Oevelen, D. (2019). Survival under conditions of variable food availability:

resource utilization and storage in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa. Limnology and Oceanography 64, 1651-1671.

- Maier, S. R., Mienis, F., de Froe, E., Soetaert, K., Lavaleye, M., Duineveld, G., Beauchard, O., van der Kaaden, A.-S., Koch, B. P. & van Oevelen, D. (2021). Reef communities associated with 'dead' cold-water coral framework drive resource retention and recycling in the deep sea. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 175, 103574.
- McCulloch, M., Falter, J., Trotter, J. & Montagna, P. (2012a). Coral resilience to ocean acidification and global warming through pH up-regulation. Nature Climate Change 2, 623-627.
- McCulloch, M., Trotter, J., Montagna, P., Falter, J., Dunbar, R., FREIWALD, A., FÖRSTERRA, G., LÓPEZ CORREA, M., MAIER, C., RÜGGEBERG, A. & TAVIANI, M. (2012b). Resilience of cold-water scleractinian corals to ocean acidification: boron isotopic systematics of pH and saturation state up-regulation. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 87, 21–34.
- McFadden, C. S., van Ofwegen, L. P. & Quattrini, A. M. (2022). Revisionary systematics of Octocorallia (Cnidaria: Anthozoa) guided by phylogenomics. Bulletin of the Society of Systematic Biologists 1, 1–79.
- Middelburg, J. J., Mueller, C. E., Veuger, B., Larsson, A. I., Form, A. & van Oevelen, D. (2015). Discovery of symbiotic nitrogen fixation and chemoautotrophy in cold-water corals. Scientific Reports 5, 17962.
- Mienis, F., Bouma, T. J., Witbaard, R., van Oevelen, D. & Duineveld, G. C. A. (2019). Experimental assessment of the effects of cold-water coral patches on water flow. Marine Ecology Progress Series 609, 101-117.
- Mienis, F., de Stigter, H. C., de Haas, H. & van Weering, T. C. E. (2009). Nearbed particle deposition and resuspension in a cold-water coral mound area at the Southwest Rockall Trough margin, NE Atlantic. Deep-Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 56, 1026–1038.
- Mienis, F., de Stigter, H. C., White, M., Duineveld, G., de Haas, H. & van WEERING, T. C. E. (2007). Hydrodynamic controls on cold-water coral growth and carbonate-mound development at the SW and SE Rockall Trough Margin, NE Atlantic Ocean. Deep Sea Research I-Oceanographic Research Papers 54, 1655–1674.
- Mienis, F., Duineveld, G. C. A., Davies, A. J., Lavaleye, M. M. S., Ross, S. W., Seim, H., Bane, J., van Haren, H., Bergman, M. J. N., de Haas, H., Brooke, S. & van Weering, T. C. E. (2014). Cold-water coral growth under extreme environmental conditions, the Cape Lookout area, NW Atlantic. Biogeosciences 11, 2543–2560.
- Mienis, F., Duineveld, G. C. A., Davies, A. J., Ross, S. W., Seim, H., Bane, J. & van Weering, T. C. E. (2012). The influence of near-bed hydrodynamic conditions on cold-water corals in the Viosca Knoll area, Gulf of Mexico. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 60, 32–45.
- Mohn, C., Rengstorf, A., White, M., Duineveld, G., Mienis, F., SOETAERT, K. & GREHAN, A. (2014). Linking benthic hydrodynamics and coldwater coral occurrences: a high-resolution model study at three cold-water coral provinces in the NE Atlantic. Progress in Oceanography 122, 92–104.
- Mora, C., Wei, C.-L., Rollo, A., Amaro, T., Baco, A. R., Billett, D., Bopp, L., Chen, Q., Collier, M., Danovaro, R., Gooday, A. J., Grupe, B. M., Halloran, P. R., Ingels, J., Jones, D. O. B., ET AL. (2013). Biotic and human vulnerability to projected changes in ocean biogeochemistry over the 21st century. PLoS Biology 11, e1001682.
- MORATO, T., GONZÁLEZ-IRUSTA, J.-M., DOMINGUEZ-CARRIÓ, C., WEI, C.-L., DAVIES, A., SWEETMAN, A. K., TARANTO, G. H., BEAZLEY, L., GARCÍA-Alegre, A., Grehan, A., Laffargue, P., Murillo, F. J., Sacau, M., Vaz, S., KENCHINGTON, E., ET AL. (2020). Climate-induced changes in the suitable habitat of cold-water corals and commercially important deep-sea fishes in the North Atlantic. Global Change Biology 26, 2181–2202.
- MORTENSEN, P. B. (2001). Aquarium observations on the deep-water coral *Lophelia* pertusa (L., 1758) (Scleractinia) and selected associated invertebrates. Ophelia 54, 83–104.
- MORTENSEN, P. B. & FOSSÅ, J. H. (2006). Species diversity and spatial distribution of invertebrates on deep-water Lophelia reefs in Norway. In Proceedings of 10th International Coral Reef Symposium, pp. 1849–1868. ICRS, Okinawa.
- Mortensen, P. B., Hovland, M., Brattegard, T. & Farestveit, R. (1995). Deep water bioherms of the scleractinian coral *Lophelia pertusa* (L.) at  $64^{\circ}$  n on the Norwegian shelf: structure and associated megafauna. Sarsia 80, 145–158.
- Mouchi, V., Chapron, L., Peru, E., Pruski, A. M., Meistertzheim, A.-L., Vétion, G., Galand, P. E. & Lartaud, F. (2019). Long-term aquaria study suggests species-specific responses of two cold-water corals to macro-and microplastics exposure. Environmental Pollution 253, 322–329.
- Movilla, J., Gori, A., Calvo, E., Orejas, C., López-Sanz, Á., Domínguez-CARRIÓ, C., GRINYÓ, J. & PELEJERO, C. (2014). Resistance of two Mediterranean cold-water coral species to low-pH conditions. Water 6, 59–67.
- Mueller, C. E., Larsson, A. I., Veuger, B., Middelburg, J. J. & van Oevelen, D. (2014). Opportunistic feeding on various organic food sources by the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa. Biogeosciences 11, 123–133.

- <span id="page-25-0"></span>MUELLER, C. E., LUNDÄLV, T., MIDDELBURG, J. J. & VAN OEVELEN, D. (2013). The symbiosis between Lophelia pertusa and Eunice norvegica stimulates coral calcification and worm assimilation. PLoS One 8, 1–9.
- MÜLLER-KARGER, F. E., WALSH, J. J., EVANS, R. H. & MEYERS, M. B. (1991). On the seasonal phytoplankton concentration and sea surface temperature cycles of the Gulf of Mexico as determined by satellites. Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans 96, 12645–12665.
- Murray, F., de Clippele, L. H. D., Hiley, A., Wicks, L., Roberts, J. M. & HENNIGE, S. (2019). Multiple feeding strategies observed in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom 99, 1281–1283.
- NAUMANN, M. S., OREJAS, C. & FERRIER-PAGÈS, C. (2014). Species-specific physiological response by the cold-water corals Lophelia pertusa and Madrepora oculata to variations within their natural temperature range. Deep-Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 99, 36–41.
- Naumann, M. S., Orejas, C., Wild, C. & Ferrier-Pages, C. (2011). First evidence for zooplankton feeding sustaining key physiological processes in a scleractinian coldwater coral. Journal of Experimental Biology 214, 3570–3576.
- Naumann, M. S., Tolosa, I., Taviani, M., Grover, R. & Ferrier-Page`s, C. (2015). Trophic ecology of two cold-water coral species from the Mediterranean Sea revealed by lipid biomarkers and compound-specific isotope analyses. Coral Reefs 34, 1165–1175.
- Navas, J. M., Miller, P. L., Henry, L.-A., Hennige, S. J. & Roberts, J. M. (2014). Ecohydrodynamics of cold-water coral reefs: a case study of the Mingulay Reef Complex (Western Scotland). PLoS One 9, e98218.
- Nelson, H. R., Kuempel, C. D. & Altieri, A. H. (2016). The resilience of reef invertebrate biodiversity to coral mortality. Ecosphere 7, e01399.
- OBIS (2022). Ocean biodiversity information system. Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission of UNESCO. Electronic file available at [www.obis.](http://www.obis.org) [org.](http://www.obis.org) Accessed 13.04.2023.
- Ochoa, J., Maske, H., Sheinbaumc, J. & Candela, J. (2013). Diel and lunar cycles of vertical migration extending to below 1000 m in the ocean and the vertical connectivity of depth-tiered populations. Limnology and Oceanography 58, 1207–1214.
- Ogle, D. H., Wheeler, P. & Dinno, A. (2018). FSA: fisheries stock analysis. R package version 0.8.22, [https://github.com/droglenc/FSA.](https://github.com/droglenc/FSA) Accessed 11.02.2022.
- Orejas, C., Ferrier-Page`s, C., Reynaud, S., Gori, A., Beraud, E., Tsounis, G., Allemand, D. & Gili, J. M. (2011a). Long-term growth rates of four Mediterranean cold-water coral species maintained in aquaria. Marine Ecology Progress Series 429, 57-65.
- Orejas, C., Ferrier-Page`s, C., Reynaud, S., Tsounis, G., Allemand, D. & GILI, J. M. (2011b). Experimental comparison of skeletal growth rates in the coldwater coral Madrepora oculata Linnaeus, 1758 and three tropical scleractinian corals. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 405, 1–5.
- Orejas, C., Gori, A., Rad-Menéndez, C., Last, K. S., Davies, A. J., Beveridge, C. M., Sadd, D., Kiriakoulakis, K., Witte, U. & Roberts, J. M. (2016). The effect of flow speed and food size on the capture efficiency and feeding behaviour of the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 481, 34–40.
- Orr, J., Fabry, V., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Doney, S., Feely, R., Gnanadesikan, A., Gruber, N., Ishida, A., Joos, F., Key, R., Lindsay, K., Maier-Reimer, E., Matear, R., Monfray, P., ET AL. (2005). Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the twenty-first century and its impact on calcifying organisms. Nature 437, 681–686.
- OSTERLOFF, J., NILSSEN, I., JÄRNEGREN, J., VAN ENGELAND, T., BUHL-Mortensen, P. & Nattkemper, T. W. (2019). Computer vision enables shortand long-term analysis of Lophelia pertusa polyp behaviour and colour from an underwater observatory. Scientific Reports 9, 6578.
- PERRY, C. T., MURPHY, G. N., KENCH, P. S., SMITHERS, S. G., EDINGER, E. N., Steneck, R. S. & Mumby, P. J. (2013). Caribbean-wide decline in carbonate production threatens coral reef growth. Nature Communications 4, 1402.
- PILE, A. J., PATTERSON, M. R. & WITMAN, J. D. (1996). In situ grazing on plankton <10 μm by the boreal sponge Mycale lingua. Marine Ecology Progress Series 141, 95–102.
- PORTILHO-RAMOS, R. D. C., TITSCHACK, J., WIENBERG, C., ROJAS, M. G. S., Yokoyama, Y. & Hebbeln, D. (2022). Major environmental drivers determining life and death of cold-water corals through time. PLoS Biology 20, e3001628.
- \*Provoost, P. & Bosch, S. (2018). obistools: Tools for Data Enhancement and Quality Control. Ocean Biogeographic Information System. Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission of UNESCO. [https://cran.r-project.org/package](https://cran.r-project.org/package=obistools)=[obistools.](https://cran.r-project.org/package=obistools)
- \*Provoost, P. & Bosch, S. (2019). robis: R Client to access data from the OBIS API. Ocean Biogeographic Information System. Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission of UNESCO. R package version 2.1.8, [https://cran.r-project.org/](https://cran.r-project.org/package=robis) [package](https://cran.r-project.org/package=robis)=[robis](https://cran.r-project.org/package=robis).
- Purser, A., Larsson, A. I., Thomsen, L. & van Oevelen, D. (2010). The influence of flow velocity and food concentration on Lophelia pertusa (Scleractinia) zooplankton capture rates. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 395, 55–62.
- PURSER, A., OREJAS, C., GORI, A., TONG, R., UNNITHAN, V. & THOMSEN, L. (2013). Local variation in the distribution of benthic megafauna species associated with coldwater coral reefs on the Norwegian margin. Continental Shelf Research 54, 37-51.
- \*R Core Team (2020). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna [https://www.R-project.org/.](https://www.r-project.org/)
- RADDATZ, J., LIEBETRAU, V., RÜGGEBERG, A., FOUBERT, A., FLÖGEL, S., Nürnberg, D., Hissmann, K., Musiol, J., Goepfert, T. J., Eisenhauer, A. & Dullo, W.-C. (2022). Living on the edge: environmental variability of a shallow late Holocene cold-water coral mound. Coral Reefs 41, 1255–1271.
- Raddatz, J., Titschack, J., Frank, N., Freiwald, A., Conforti, A., OSBORNE, A., SKORNITZKE, S., STILLER, W., RÜGGEBERG, A., VOIGT, S., ALBUQUERQUE, A. L. S., VERTINO, A., SCHRÖDER-RITZRAU, A. & BAHR, A. (2020). Solenosmilia variabilis-bearing cold-water coral mounds off Brazil. Coral Reefs 39, 69–83.
- Rakka, M., Orejas, C., Maier, S. R., van Oevelen, D., Godinho, A., Bilan, M. & Carreiro-Silva, M. (2020). Feeding biology of a habitat-forming antipatharian in the Azores Archipelago. Coral Reefs 39, 1469-1482.
- Rakka, M., Orejas, C., Sampaio, I., Monteiro, J., Parra, H. & Carreiro-SILVA, M. (2017). Reproductive biology of the black coral Antipathella wollastoni (Cnidaria: Antipatharia) in the Azores (NE Atlantic). Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 145, 131–141.
- Ramirez-Llodra, E., Brandt, A., Danovaro, R., De Mol, B., Escobar, E., German, C., Levin, L., Arbizu, P., Menot, L., Buhl-Mortensen, P., Narayanaswamy, B. E., Smith, C. R., Tittensor, D. P., Tyler, P. A., Vanreusel, A., ET AL. (2010). Deep, diverse and definitely different: unique attributes of the world's largest ecosystem. Biogeosciences 7, 2851–2899.
- Ramirez-Llodra, E., Typer, P., Baker, M., Bergstad, O., Clark, M., Escobar, E., Levin, L., Menot, L., Rowdem, A., Smith, C. & van Dover, C. (2011). Man and the last great wilderness: human impact on the deep sea. PLoS One 6, e22588.
- REED, J. K. (2002). Comparison of deep-water coral reefs and lithoherms off southeastern USA. Hydrobiologia 471, 57-69.
- Reiswig, H. M. (1981). Partial carbon and energy budgets of the bacteriosponge Verohgia fistularis (Porifera: Demospongiae) in Barbados. Marine Ecology 2, 273–293.
- Rengstorf, A. M., Mohn, C., Brown, C., Wisz, M. S. & Grehan, A. J. (2014). Predicting the distribution of deep-sea vulnerable marine ecosystems using highresolution data: considerations and novel approaches. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 93, 72–82.
- RENGSTORF, A. M., YESSON, C., BROWN, C. & GREHAN, A. J. (2013). High-resolution habitat suitability modelling can improve conservation of vulnerable marine ecosystems in the deep sea. Journal of Biogeography 40, 1702-1714.
- RIBES, M., JIMÉNEZ, E., YAHEL, G., LÓPEZ-SENDINO, P., DIEZ, B., MASSANA, R., SHARP, J. H. & COMA, R. (2012). Functional convergence of microbes associated with temperate marine sponges. Environmental Microbiology 14, 1224–1239.
- Riley, J. S., Sanders, R., Marsay, C., Le Moigne, F. A. C., Achterberg, E. P. & POULTON, A. J. (2012). The relative contribution of fast and slow sinking particles to ocean carbon export. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 26, 1–10.
- Rix, L., Naumann, M. S., de Goeij, J. M., Mueller, C. E., Struck, U., Middleburg, J. J., van Duyl, F. C., Al-Horani, F. A., Wild, C. & van Oevelen, D. (2016). Coral mucus fuels the sponge loop in warm- and cold-water coral reef ecosystems. Scientific Reports 6, 1-11.
- Rix, L., Ribes, M., Coma, R., Jahn, M. T., de Goeij, J. M., van Oevelen, D., ESCRIG, S., MEIBOM, A. & HENTSCHEL, U. (2020). Heterotrophy in the earliest gut: a single-cell view of heterotrophic carbon and nitrogen assimilation in spongemicrobe symbioses. The ISME Journal 14, 1-14.
- Robert, K., Jones, D. O. B., Georgiopoulou, A. & Huvenne, V. A. I. (2020). Cold-water coral assemblages on vertical walls from the Northeast Atlantic. Diversity and Distributions 26, 284–298.
- Roberts, J. M. (2005). Reef-aggregating behaviour by symbiotic eunicid polychaetes from cold-water corals: do worms assemble reefs? *Journal of the Marine Biological* Association of the United Kingdom 85, 813–819.
- ROBERTS, J. M. & CAIRNS, S. D. (2014). Cold-water corals in a changing ocean. Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability 7, 118–126.
- Roberts, J. M., Wheeler, A. J. & Freiwald, A. (2006). Reefs of the deep: the biology and geology of cold-water coral ecosystems. Science 312, 543-547.
- Rocha, J., Peixe, L., Gomes, N. C. M. & Calado, R. (2011). Cnidarians as a source of new marine bioactive compounds – an overview of the last decade and future steps for bioprospecting. Marine Drugs 9, 1860-1886.
- ROGERS, A. D. (1994). The biology of seamounts. In Advances in Marine Biology (eds J. H. S. BLAXTER and A. J. SOUTHWARD), pp. 305–350. Academic Press, Cambridge, Massachussets.
- Ross, S. W. & QUATTRINI, A. M. (2009). Deep-sea reef fish assemblage patterns on the Blake Plateau (Western North Atlantic Ocean). Marine Ecology 30, 74–92.
- Rossi, S., Bramanti, L., Gori, A. & Orejas, C. (2017). Marine Animal Forests: The Ecology of Benthic Biodiversity Hotspots. Springer International Publishing, Cham.
- <span id="page-26-0"></span>Rossi, S., Isla, E., Bosch-Belmar, M., Galli, G., Gori, A., Gristina, M., Ingrosso, G., Milisenda, G., Piraino, S., Rizzo, L., Schubert, N., SOARES, M., SOLIDORO, C., THURSTAN, R., VILADRICH, N., ET AL. (2019). Changes of energy fluxes in marine animal forests of the Anthropocene: factors shaping the future seascape. ICES Journal of Marine Science 76, 2008–2019.
- Rowden, A. A., Schlacher, T. A., Williams, A., Clark, M. R., Stewart, R., Althaus, F., Bowden, D. A., Consalvey, M., Robinson, W. & Dowdney, J. (2010). A test of the seamount oasis hypothesis: seamounts support higher epibenthic megafaunal biomass than adjacent slopes. Marine Ecology 31, 95–106.
- RÜGGEBERG, A., FLÖGEL, S., DULLO, W.-C., HISSMANN, K. & FREIWALD, A. (2011). Water mass characteristics and sill dynamics in a subpolar cold-water coral reef setting at Stjernsund, northern Norway. Marine Geology 282, 5-12.
- SANNA, G., BÜSCHER, J. V. & FREIWALD, A. (2023). Cold-water coral framework architecture is selectively shaped by bottom current flow. Coral Reefs 42, 483–495.
- SANNA, G. & FREIWALD, A. (2021). Deciphering the composite morphological diversity of Lophelia pertusa, a cosmopolitan deep-water ecosystem engineer. Ecosphere 12, e03802.
- SCHEJTER, L., GENZANO, G., GAITÁN, E., PEREZ, C. D. & BREMEC, C. S. (2020). Benthic communities in the Southwest Atlantic Ocean: conservation value of animal forests at the Burdwood Bank slope. Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems 30, 426–439.
- Schöttner, S., Hoffmann, F., Cárdenas, P., Rapp, H. T., Boetius, A. & RAMETTE, A. (2013). Relationships between host phylogeny, host type and bacterial community diversity in cold-water coral reef sponges. PLoS One 8, e55505.
- SCHÖTTNER, S., WILD, C., HOFFMANN, F., BOETIUS, A. & RAMETTE, A. (2012). Spatial scales of bacterial diversity in cold-water coral reef ecosystems. PLoS One 7, e32093.
- Simpson, J. H. & McCandliss, R. R. (2013). 'The Ekman Drain': a conduit to the deep ocean for shelf material. Ocean Dynamics 63, 1063-1072.
- SMITH, C. R. & RABOUILLE, C. (2002). What controls the mixed-layer depth in deep-sea sediments? The importance of POC flux. Limnology and Oceanography 47, 418–426.
- Soetaert, K., Mohn, C., Rengstorf, A., Grehan, A. & van Oevelen, D. (2016). Ecosystem engineering creates a direct nutritional link between 600-m deep coldwater coral mounds and surface productivity. Scientific Reports 6, 35057.
- Steinberg, D. K., Carlson, C. A., Bates, N. R., Goldthwait, S. A., Madin, L. P. & Michaels, A. F. (2000). Zooplankton vertical migration and the active transport of dissolved organic and inorganic carbon in the Sargasso Sea. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 47, 137–158.
- STEINBERG, D. K., CARLSON, C. A., BATES, N. R., JOHNSON, R. J., Michaels, A. F. & Knap, A. H. (2001). Overview of the US JGOFS Bermuda Atlantic Time-series study (BATS): a decade-scale look at ocean biology and biogeochemistry. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 48, 1405–1447.
- STRÖMBERG, S. M. & LARSSON, A. I. (2017). Larval behavior and longevity in the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa indicate potential for longdistance dispersal. Frontiers in Marine Science 4, 1–14.
- Suess, E. (1980). Particulate organic carbon flux in the oceans surface productivity and oxygen utilization. Nature 288, 260–263.
- Sundahl, H., Buhl-Mortensen, P. & Buhl-Mortensen, L. (2020). Distribution and suitable habitat of the cold-water corals Lophelia pertusa, Paragorgia arborea, and Primnoa resedaeformis on the Norwegian continental shelf. Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 1–22.
- Sunday, J. M., Fabricius, K. E., Kroeker, K. J., Anderson, K. M., Brown, N. E., Barry, J. P., Connell, S. D., Dupont, S., Gaylord, B., Hall-Spencer, J. M., Klinger, T., Milazzo, M., Munday, P. L., Russell, B. D., Sanford, E., ET AL. (2016). Ocean acidification can mediate biodiversity shifts by changing biogenic habitat. Nature Climate Change 7, 81-85.
- Sweetman, A. K., Thurber, A. R., Smith, C. R., Levin, L. A., Mora, C., Wei, C.-L., Gooday, A. J., Jones, D. O. B., Rex, M., Yasuhara, M., INGELS, J., RUHL, H. A., FRIEDER, C. A., DANOVARO, R., WÜRZBERG, L., ET AL. (2017). Major impacts of climate change on deep-sea benthic ecosystems. Elementa: Science of the Anthropocene 5, 4.
- THIEM, Ø., RAVAGNAN, E., FOSSÅ, J. H. & BERNTSEN, J. (2006). Food supply mechanisms for cold-water corals along a continental shelf edge. Journal of Marine Systems 60, 207–219.
- Thresher, R. E., Tilbrook, B., Fallon, S., Wilson, N. C. & Adkins, J. (2011). Effects of chronic low carbonate saturation levels on the distribution, growth and skeletal chemistry of deep-sea corals and other seamount megabenthos. Marine Ecology Progress Series 442, 87–99.
- Titschack, J., Thierens, M., Dorschel, B., Schulbert, C., Freiwald, A., KANO, A., TAKASHIMA, C., KAWAGOE, N. & LI, X. (2009). Carbonate budget of a cold-water coral mound (Challenger Mound, IODP Exp. 307). Marine Geology 259, 36–46.
- Tittensor, D. P., Baco, A. R., Brewin, P. E., Clark, M. R., Consalvey, M., Hall-Spencer, J., Rowden, A. A., Schlacher, T., Stocks, K. I. &

Rogers, A. D. (2009). Predicting global habitat suitability for stony corals on seamounts. Journal of Biogeography 36, 1111-1128.

- Tracey, D. M., Rowden, A. A., Mackay, K. A. & Compton, T. (2011). Habitatforming cold-water corals show affinity for seamounts in the New Zealand region. Marine Ecology Progress Series 430, 1–22.
- Tsounis, G., Orejas, C., Reynaud, S., Gili, J. M., Allemand, D. & Ferrier-PAGÈS, C. (2010). Prey-capture rates in four Mediterranean cold water corals. Marine Ecology Progress Series 398, 149–155.
- Turner, J. T. (2015). Zooplankton fecal pellets, marine snow, phytodetritus and the ocean's biological pump. Progress in Oceanography 130, 205–248.
- Tyberghein, L., Verbruggen, H., Pauly, K., Troupin, C., Mineur, F. & De Clerck, O. (2012). Bio-ORACLE: a global environmental dataset for marine species distribution modelling. Global Ecology and Biogeography 21, 272-281.
- UNGA (2007). Resolution 61/105: Sustainable fisheries, including through the 1995 agreement for the Implementation of the Provisions of the United nations Convention on the law of the Sea of 10 December 1982 relating to the Conservation and management of Straddling fish Stocks and highly migratory fish Stocks, and related instruments. In p. 21.
- UNITED NATIONS (ED) (2017). Cold-water corals. In The First Global Integrated Marine Assessment: World Ocean Assessment I, pp. 803–816. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, England.
- Ursella, L., Pensieri, S., Palla`s-Sanz, E., Herzka, S. Z., Bozzano, R., Tenreiro, M., Cardin, V., Candela, J. & Sheinbaum, J. (2021). Diel, lunar and seasonal vertical migration in the deep western Gulf of Mexico evidenced from a long-term data series of acoustic backscatter. Progress in Oceanography 195, 102562.
- Vad, J., Orejas, C., Moreno-Navas, J., Findlay, H. S. & Roberts, J. M. (2017). Assessing the living and dead proportions of cold-water coral colonies: implications for deep-water marine protected area monitoring in a changing ocean. Peer $\tilde{\jmath}$  5, e3705.
- Van Bleijswijk, J. D. L., Whalen, C., Duineveld, G. C. A., Lavaleye, M. S. S., WITTE, H. J. & MIENIS, F. (2015). Microbial assemblages on a cold-water coral mound at the SE Rockall Bank (NE Atlantic): interactions with hydrography and topography. Biogeosciences 12, 4483–4496.
- Van der Kaaden, A.-S., Mohn, C., Gerkema, T., Maier, S. R., de Froe, E., van de Koppel, J., Rietkerk, M., Soetaert, K. & van Oevelen, D. (2021). Feedbacks between hydrodynamics and cold-water coral mound development. Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 178, 103641.
- Van der Kaaden, A.-S., van Oevelen, D., Rietkerk, M., Soetaert, K. & van de Koppel, J. (2020). Spatial self-organization as a new perspective on cold-water coral mound development. Frontiers in Marine Science 7, 631.
- VAN DER MEER, J. (2006). An introduction to dynamic energy budget (DEB) models with special emphasis on parameter estimation. Journal of Sea Research 56, 85-102.
- Van Duyl, F. C., Hegeman, J., Hoogstraten, A. & Maier, C. (2008). Dissolved carbon fixation by sponge-microbe consortia of deep water coral mounds in the Northeastern Atlantic Ocean. Marine Ecology Progress Series 358, 137–150.
- VAN DUYL, F. C., LENGGER, S. K., SCHOUTEN, S., LUNDÄLV, T., VAN OEVELEN, D. & MÜLLER, C. E. (2020). Dark  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation into phospholipidderived fatty acids by the cold-water coral associated sponge Hymedesmia (Stylopus) coriacea (Tisler Reef, NE Skagerrak). Marine Biology Research 16, 1–17.
- Van Engeland, T., Godø, O. R., Johnsen, E., Duineveld, G. C. A. & van Oevelen, D. (2019). Cabled ocean observatory data reveal food supply mechanisms to a cold-water coral reef. Progress in Oceanography 172, 51-64.
- Van Haren, H., Mienis, F., Duineveld, G. C. A.& Lavaleye, M. S. S. (2014). Highresolution temperature observations of a trapped nonlinear diurnal tide influencing cold-water corals on the Logachev mounds. Progress in Oceanography 125, 16-25.
- Van Oevelen, D., Duineveld, G., Lavaleye, M., Mienis, F., Soetaert, K. & Heip, C. H. R. (2009). The cold-water coral community as hotspot of carbon cycling on continental margins: a food-web analysis from Rockall Bank (Northeast Atlantic). Limnology and Oceanography 54, 1829–1844.
- Van Oevelen, D., Duineveld, G. C. A., Lavaleye, M. S. S., Kutti, T. & SOETAERT, K. (2018). Trophic structure of cold-water coral communities revealed from the analysis of tissue isotopes and fatty acid composition. Marine Biology Research 14, 287–306.
- WAGNER, H., PURSER, A., THOMSEN, L., JESUS, C. C. & LUNDÄLV, T. (2011). Particulate organic matter fluxes and hydrodynamics at the Tisler cold-water coral reef. Journal of Marine Systems 85, 19–29.
- WALL, M., RAGAZZOLA, F., FOSTER, L. C., FORM, A. & SCHMIDT, D. N. (2015). pH upregulation as a potential mechanism for the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa to sustain growth in aragonite undersaturated conditions. Biogeosciences 12, 6869–6880.
- Waller, R. G. & Tyler, P. A. (2005). The reproductive biology of two deep-water, reef-building scleractinians from the NE Atlantic Ocean. Coral Reefs 24, 514–522.
- Wassmann, P. (1990). Relationship between primary and export production in the boreal coastal zone of the North Atlantic. Limnology and Oceanography 35, 464–471.
- Wehrmann, L. M., Knab, N. J., Pirlet, H., Unnithan, V., Wild, C. & FERDELMAN, T. G. (2009). Carbon mineralization and carbonate preservation in
- Biological Reviews 98 (2023) 1768–1795 © 2023 The Authors. Biological Reviews published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of Cambridge Philosophical Society.

<span id="page-27-0"></span>modern cold-water coral reef sediments on the Norwegian shelf. Biogeosciences Discussions 6, 663–680.

- WEINNIG, A. M., GÓMEZ, C. E., HALLAJ, A. & CORDES, E. E. (2020). Cold-water coral (Lophelia pertusa) response to multiple stressors: high temperature affects recovery from short-term pollution exposure. Scientific Reports 10, 1768.
- WHITE, M., BASHMACHNIKOV, I., ARÍSTEGUI, J. & MARTINS, A. (2007). Chapter 4: physical processes and seamount productivity. In Seamounts: Ecology, Fisheries & Conservation (eds T. J. PITCHER, T. MORATO, P. J. B. HART, M. R. CLARK, N. HAGGAN and R. S. SANTOS). Blackwell Publishing Ltd, Oxford.
- WHITE, M., MOHN, C., STIGTER, H. & MOTTRAM, G. (2005). Deep-water coral development as a function of hydrodynamics and surface productivity around the submarine banks of the Rockall Trough, NE Atlantic. In Cold-Water Corals and Ecosystems (eds A. FREIWALD and J. M. ROBERTS), pp. 503–514. Springer-Verlag, Berlin Heidelberg.
- WILD, C., MAYR, C., WEHRMANN, L., SCHÖTTNER, S., NAUMANN, M., Hoffmann, F. & Rapp, H. T. (2008). Organic matter release by cold water corals and its implication for fauna-microbe interaction. Marine Ecology Progress Series 372, 67–75.
- Wild, C., Rasheed, M., Werner, U., Franke, U., Johnstone, R. & Huettel, M. (2004). Degradation and mineralization of coral mucus in reef environments. Marine Ecology Progress Series 267, 159–171.
- WILD, C., WEHRMANN, L. M., MAYR, C., SCHÖTTNER, S. L. ALLERS, E. & Lunda Lundav, T. (2009). Microbial degradation of cold-water coral-derived organic matter: potential implication for organic C cycling in the water column above Tisler Reef. Aquatic Biology 7, 71–80.
- Wilson, J. B. (1979). 'Patch' development of the deep-water coral Lophelia pertusa (L.) on Rockall Bank. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom 59, 165–177.
- WISSHAK, M., SCHÖNBERG, C. H. L., FORM, A. & FREIWALD, A. (2012). Ocean acidification accelerates reef bioerosion. PLoS One 7, e45124.
- WISSHAK, M., SCHÖNBERG, C. H. L., FORM, A. & FREIWALD, A. (2014). Sponge bioerosion accelerated by ocean acidification across species and latitudes? Helgoland Marine Research 68, 253–262.
- Wolf-Gladrow, D. A., Riebesell, U., Burkhardt, S. & Bijma, J. (1999). Direct effects of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on growth and isotopic composition of marine plankton. Tellus B 51, 461–476.
- WORM, B. & DUFFY, J. E. (2003). Biodiversity, productivity and stability in real food webs. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 18, 628-632.
- YAHEL, G., SHARP, J. H., MARIE, D., HÄSE, C. & GENIN, A. (2003). In situ feeding and element removal in the symbiont-bearing sponge Theonella swinhoei: bulk DOC is the major source for carbon. Limnology and Oceanography 48, 141–149.
- ZARET, T. M. & SUFFERN, J. S. (1976). Vertical migration in zooplankton as a predator avoidance mechanism. Limnology and Oceanography 21, 804-813.
- ZAVALA-HIDALGO, J., GALLEGOS-GARCÍA, A., MARTÍNEZ-LÓPEZ, B. Morey, S. L. & O'Brien, J. J. (2006). Seasonal upwelling on the Western and Southern Shelves of the Gulf of Mexico. Ocean Dynamics 56, 333-338.
- Zetsche, E. M., Baussant, T., Meysman, F. J. R. & van Oevelen, D. (2016). Direct visualization of mucus production by the cold-water coral Lophelia pertusa with digital holographic microscopy. PLoS One 11, e0146766.
- ZIBROWIUS, H. (1980). Les Scléractiniaires de la Méditerranée et de l'Atlantique nord-oriental. Mémoires de l'Institut océanographique, Monaco.

#### IX. SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

Appendix S1. Detailed methods.

Appendix S2. Results of statistical analysis of comparisons of primary productivity annual average and annual range, and current velocity annual average at cold-water coral sites with the global mean.

Appendix S3. Respiration, organic matter release, food demand, and food capture of cold-water corals.

Table S1. Flux of particulate organic carbon (POC\_flux) measured by sediment trap at the indicated sites, depth and during the indicated time span.

(Received 21 September 2022; revised 26 April 2023; accepted 1 May 2023; published online 26 May 2023)