1 2	Selenium Health Benefit Values Provide a Reliable Index of Seafood Benefits vs. Risks						
3 4 5	Nicholas V.C. Ralston ^{*a} , J. John Kaneko ^b , and Laura J. Raymond ^c						
6	Corresponding Author.						
/ 8 9	 ^{a.} 310 Clifford Hall, Earth Systems Science and Policy, University of North Dakota, Grand Forks, ND 58202 						
10 11 12	^{b.} Hawaii Seafood Council, 1130 N Nimitz Hwy, Suite A263, Honolulu, HI 96817						
12 13 14	^{c.} Sage Green Nutrition Research Guidance, 421 N 19 th Street, Grand Forks, ND 58203						
15 16 17	Word Count: 3626						
18	Number of Figures: 3						
20 21	Number of Tables: 2						
21 22 23	Running Title: Health Benefit Values of Ocean Fish						
24 25 26	Abbreviations:						
27 28 29	Health Benefit Value, HBV Mercury, Hg						
30 31	Methylmercury, CH ₃ Hg Mercury selenide HgSe						
32	Parts per million, ppm						
33 34 35	Polychlorobiphenyls, PCB Selenium, Se						
36 37							
38 39 40	Keywords:						
40 41 42	Selenium, mercury, fish, seafood, brain.						

43 Abstract

44

45 **Background:** Methylmercury (CH₃Hg) toxicity causes irreversible inhibition of selenium (Se)-dependent 46 enzymes, including those that are required to prevent and reverse oxidative damage in the brain. Fish 47 consumption provides numerous essential nutrients required for optimal health, but is also associated with 48 CH₃Hg exposure risks, especially during fetal development. Therefore, it is necessary to assess the 49 amounts of both elements in seafood to evaluate relative risks or benefits. Consumption of ocean fish 50 containing Se in molar excess of CH₃Hg will prevent interruption of selenoenzyme activities, thereby 51 alleviating Hg-exposure risks. Because dietary Se is a pivotal determinant of CH₃Hg's effects, the 52 Selenium Health Benefit Value (HBV) criterion was developed to predict risks or benefits as a result of 53 seafood consumption. A negative HBV indicates Hg is present in molar excess of Se and may impair Se 54 availability while a positive HBV indicates consumption will improve the Se status of the consumer, thus 55 negating risks of Hg toxicity. 56 **Objective:** This study examined the Hg and Se contents of varieties of seafood to establish those with 57 positive HBV's offering benefits and those having negative HBVs indicating potential consumption risks. 58 Methods: The Hg and Se molar concentrations in samples of meat from pilot whale, mako shark, thresher 59 shark, swordfish, bigeye tuna, and skipjack tuna were used to determine their HBV's in relation to body 60 weight. 61 **Results:** The HBVs of pilot whale, mako shark, and swordfish were typically negative and inversely 62 related to body weight, indicating their consumption may impair Se availability. However, the HBV's of 63 thresher shark, bigeye tuna, and skipjack tuna were uniformly positive regardless of body weights, 64 indicating their consumption counteracts Hg-dependent risks of selenoenzyme impairment. 65 **Conclusions**: The HBV criterion provides a reliable basis for differentiating seafoods whose intake 66 should be limited during pregnancy from those that should be consumed to obtain health benefits. 67

68 **1.0 Introduction**

69 Selenium (Se) is an essential trace element that is required for synthesis of selenocysteine (Sec), the 21st 70 genetically encoded amino acid required for the activities of selenoenzymes with critical roles in fetal 71 brain development, growth, thyroid hormone metabolism, calcium regulation and prevention/reversal of 72 oxidative damage.¹⁻⁸ The importance of Se for brain functions is emphasized by the fact that highly 73 conserved mechanisms have evolved to maintain optimal brain Se concentrations even when dietary Se 74 intakes are deficient. Because the brain is preferentially supplied,⁹⁻¹¹ its Se concentrations are maintained 75 near normal (~1 µM) even when prolonged exposures to Se-deficient diets diminish Se concentrations in 76 somatic tissues such as blood or liver to $\sim 2\%$ of their normal levels.² 77 Numerous studies have shown dietary Se counteracts methylmercury (CH₃Hg) toxicity¹²⁻¹⁸ and

78 the protective effect of Se from ocean fish consumption against CH₃Hg, toxicity has been repeatedly shown in laboratory animals.¹⁹⁻²⁴ Serious impairments of brain Se and selenoenzyme activities are only 79 known to occur as a result of genetic knockouts of Se-transport/uptake proteins^{10, 25-26} or following high 80 CH₃Hg exposures.^{24, 27, 28} The ability of Se to decrease or abolish the toxic effects of high Hg exposures 81 has been well established²⁹⁻³² and it is now understood that the mechanism of CH₃Hg toxicity primarily 82 83 occurs through disruption of brain Se metabolism.^{5, 33-38} Prior to recognition of CH₃Hg's role in inhibiting 84 selenoenzyme metabolism, the mechanism of CH_3Hg toxicity was thought to involve its high affinity for 85 thiols (10^{39}) and arise due to disruption of sulfur metabolism. Sulfur is far more abundant in tissues than Se (~300,000:1), but Hg's association constant for Se (10^{45}) is ~1 million times higher than its affinity for 86 87 sulfur.³⁹ Due to their high tissue concentrations, thiomolecules bind CH₃Hg initially, but because they are 88 substrates for selenoenzymes, they directly deliver CH₃Hg into enzyme's active site in the proper 89 orientation to bring the Hg moiety into close proximity with the Se of the catalytic Sec residue. The 90 CH₃Hg transfers from the thiol to the Sec, forming a CH₃Hg-Sec which is degraded into Hg selenide (HgSe), a virtually insoluble (solubility constant 10^{-58} to 10^{-65}) and therefore biologically unavailable form 91 92 of Se,³⁹ which can contribute to a functional Se deficiency if Hg sequestration rates outpace Se transport 93 into the tissue.

An important aspect of dietary CH₃Hg is its ability to cross placental and blood-brain barriers to irreversibly inhibit selenoenzyme activities in the fetal brain.^{27, 28, 42} Therefore, high CH₃Hg exposures during pregnancy are a concern if dietary Se intakes are not adequate to offset losses due to Hg

97 sequestration. Maternal CH₃Hg exposures from eating seafoods with high Hg:Se molar ratios such as

98 certain types of shark⁴³ or pilot whale meats and blubber⁴⁴⁻⁴⁷ have been reported as having subtle adverse

99 effects on child neurodevelopment. Conversely, maternal consumption of ocean fish that contain more Se

100 than Hg has not been associated with health risks, but instead offers health benefits.⁴⁸⁻⁵⁷ With few

101 exceptions, ocean fish contain more Se than Hg⁵⁸ and are abundant sources of important nutrients

102 required for fetal development.^{48,49,59} Therefore, since most ocean fish are rich sources of dietary Se, there 103 is protection against the CH₃Hg they contain.

104 The Health-Benefit-Value (HBV) indicates the relative molar contents of Se and Hg that are 105 present in a food.^{36,41,58,60} Most seafoods have positive HBV's indicating Se is present in molar excess of their CH₃Hg contents, while negative values indicate they contain CH₃Hg in excess of Se.^{58,61} For 106 107 example, pilot whale muscle meat samples have Hg contents (3.31 µg/g; 16.4 µmol/kg) that are far higher than their Se (0.25 μ g/g; 3.1 μ mol/kg) concentrations (Hg:Se molar ratios ~5:1).⁶² Since these results are 108 109 from the 1977 pilot whale data set which was used to estimate maternal Hg exposures in the Faroe 110 Islands,⁴⁴ (the population study which was used to establish maternal seafood consumption advice) it is 111 important to compare the Hg and Se contents of pilot whales to representative varieties of ocean fish. To 112 establish reference ranges of positive and negative HBV seafoods in relation to their body weights, this 113 study compared the molar concentrations of Hg and Se in pilot whale, mako shark, thresher shark, 114 swordfish, bigeye tuna, and skipjack tuna muscle meats.

115

116 **2.0 Methods:**

Because shark and pilot whale meats were the dominant source of Hg in studies which reported finding harmful effects, this study compared their HBVs to those of a selection of commonly consumed varieties of ocean fish. The ocean fish data evaluated in this study are from samples of edible fish portions

120 collected in 2006 from commercial landings of pelagic fish as reported in Kaneko and Ralston.⁵⁸ Briefly,

121 fish harvested from the central Pacific were weighed and 100 g samples of edible muscle from the

122 anterior portion of the dorsal muscle mass were stored frozen in trace metal free plastic bags. Chain of

123 custody was maintained from the time the samples were collected until they were analyzed for Hg and Se.

- 124 Sample aliquots of ~0.4 g (wet weight) weighed to 0.0001 g from each sample were transferred into
- 125 single use trace element free 50 mL digestion tubes (Environmental Express, Mt Pleasant, SC 29464)

126 with every tenth fish sample being prepared in duplicate and with elemental spike recovery samples being

- 127 performed accompanying each batch. Each digestion batch was processed with blank and certified
- 128 standard reference materials (dogfish muscle certified reference material DORM-2, National Research

129 Council of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario Canada). Samples were treated with 5 mL of 16N nitric acid (Fisher

- 130 Trace Metal Grade, Fisher Scientific, www.fishersci.com) and heated at 85°C in deep cell hot blocks
- 131 (Environmental Express, Mt. Pleasant, SC) for 24 hours in capped tubes. Samples were cooled and 1.5
- 132 mL of 30% H₂O₂ (Fisher Certified A.C.S., Fisher Scientific, www.fishersci.com) was added and samples
- 133 were recapped and returned to heating in the dry block at 85°C. Samples were cooled and 15 mL of 12N
- 134 HCl (Fisher Trace Metal Grade, Fisher Scientific, Fisher Scientific, www.fishersci.com) were added.
- 135 Samples were heated at 90°C for 90 minutes to reduce Se-VI to Se-IV, then cooled and diluted to 50 mL

136 with double distilled water. Samples were analyzed for Hg content by cold vapor atomic absorption

- 137 spectrophotometry using a CETAC M-6000A (CETAC Technologies Inc, Omaha, NE), and Se was
- 138 analyzed by hydride generation atomic fluorescence spectroscopy using a PS Analytical Dual Millennium
- 139 Excalibur, (PS Analytical, Deerfield Beach, FL). The Hg and Se molar concentrations of these samples
- 140 were used to calculate their HBV's and Se deficits or excess were evaluated in relation to body weights.

The large sizes of pilot whales (Globicephala melas) precluded weighing to establish body mass.

- As reported in the original literature,⁶² their mass was recorded on the basis of "skinns" (a traditional 142 143 apportionment term) rather than body weights. A 75 kg skinn corresponds to ~50 kg of meat and ~25 kg 144 of blubber along with varying amounts of liver and kidney corresponding to an estimated intake ratio of 145 65:32:3 for muscle meat, blubber, and liver respectively; the amount of kidney consumed was not reported.⁶³ Male pilot whales have a maximum body weight of ~2300 kg and females are up to ~1300 146 147 kg.⁶⁴ Therefore, to estimate pilot whale body weights, the number of skinns per whale was multiplied by 148 1.9; a factor that was determined to provide approximations that conform with their normal weight range. 149 This resulted in a mean estimated adult body weight of ~1187 kg, with the largest whale having a value of
- 150 2280 kg, values which correspond to reference weights reported for this species.
- 151 The Hg and Se mass concentrations (mg/kg) were converted to molar concentrations (µmole/kg), 152 and results were evaluated. The concentrations of Hg and Se in individual fish and whale meat samples 153 were used to calculate corresponding HBVs using the equation described in Ralston et al., 2016:³⁵
- 154

141

- 155
- $HBV = (Se Hg)/Se \cdot (Se + Hg)$ (Equation 1.)
- 156

157 The molar excess of Se ("free" Se) present in the samples was determined by subtracting the molar Hg 158 concentration from the molar Se concentration for individual samples. Means and standard deviations of 159 elemental molar concentrations, HBV's, and Se excess or deficits were calculated, graphed, and 160 evaluated.

161

162 **3.0 Results:**

163 The reference material used for Hg and Se in fish tissue was (DORM-2) dogfish (freeze dried powdered 164 Squalus acanthias) muscle obtained from the National Research Council of Canada, with reference values 165 of $1.40 \pm 0.09 \ \mu g$ Se/g and $4.47 \pm 0.32 \ \mu g$ Hg/g (dry weight basis). We observed that Hg recovery was 166 inversely related to the amount of sample digested (p = 0.05), F = 6.91, Adjusted R² = 0.54. While 100 167 mg (or less) of DORM-2 provided recoveries of ~99.9%, Hg recoveries declined as the amount of sample 168 increased. For example; 150 mg provided a recovery of 95.4 ± 0.2% and 200 mg provided a recovery of 169 90.8 ± 0.7 %. This effect was not observed for Se recoveries from DORM-2. Additionally, inclusion of

- 170 HCl in addition to HNO₃ in a quantity approximating aqua regia proportions was essential for complete
- 171 recoveries. The observed Se $(1.36 \pm 0.04 \text{ ug/g}; 97 \pm 3\% \text{ of certified value})$, and Hg contents $(4.32 \pm 0.38 \text{ m})$
- 172 $ug/g; 97 \pm 9\%$ of certified value) indicated the elemental recoveries were reliable and replicate sample
- 173 analyses indicated adequate precision. While digestion blank values for Hg were sufficiently low to be
- 174 considered negligible, digestion blank Se contents $(0.49 \pm 0.17 \text{ ng/ml})$ were subtracted prior to calculating
- 175 Se contents of samples.
- 176

177 3.1 Pilot whales

- 178 The Hg contents of pilot whale meats uniformly exceeded Se contents on a molar basis in adult animals
- 179 (Fig. 1, Fig. 3, Table 2). The amount of Hg increased in direct relation to body size (See Table 1 and Fig.
- 180 1). Aside from the higher Se contents noted in fetal pilot whales (not shown) and very young calves, total
- 181 Se contents were not associated with body size (Fig. 2). This is consistent with previous findings that
- 182 homeostatic controls regulate tissue Se, thus body size does not typically affect the amount of Se present,
- 183 although HgSe accumulation can increase in certain tissues.⁶⁵ Aside from samples of one adult and two
- 184 young calves, the HBV's of pilot whale meat were negative and significantly diminished (p = 0.01; F =
- 185 9.1) as body size increased (Fig. 2, Table 2). Since Hg bioaccumulation was directly associated with body
- 186 size of pilot whales (Fig. 3), the calculated Se-deficit associated with these samples was directly related to
- 187 their Hg contents (p < 0.01; F = 12.7). Males of this species live up to ~40 years and attain maximal
- 188 weights of $\sim 2,300$ kg while females live up to 60 years and attain maximal weights of $\sim 1,300$ kg.⁶⁴
- 189 Although the sex of the assessed samples was not available, this sexual dimorphism may be evident in the
- 190 Hg accumulation and HBV distribution patterns noted in pilot whales (Figures 1 and 2).
- 191

192 3.2 Mako sharks

- 193 The Hg contents of mako shark were directly related to their body size (Table 1, Fig. 2). The HBV of all
- samples included in this assessment were uniformly negative (Fig. 2, Table 2). Although the HBV of
- 195 these samples tended to decline as body size increased, the relationship was not significant (p = 0.11),
- 196 possibly because only 10 samples were assessed and the range of sample body weights examined was
- 197 relatively narrow (40-80 kg). However, like pilot whales, mako shark meat contained more Hg than Se,
- and Se-deficits (Fig. 3) were directly associated with increasing Hg contents (p < 0.001; F = 139.9).
- 199
- 200 3.3 Swordfish

201 The Hg contents of swordfish were directly related to body size (Fig. 1). Although the HBV of the

- swordfish was positive in many specimens, many samples had negative values (Fig. 2) and there was a
- 203 tendency for HBV's to decline in relation to increasing size (p = 0.07). As a result, the average HBV for

swordfish was ~zero, but highly variable (Fig. 2, Table 2). The Se surplus or deficit was dependent on Hg content (p < 0.001; F = 38.5), with samples containing Hg in excess of 5 µmol/kg (~1 mg/kg) having the lowest HBV's (Fig. 3).

207

208 *3.4 Thresher sharks*

209 The Hg contents in thresher shark tended to increase in relation to increasing body size (Fig. 1) but Se

210 contents were consistently higher in all samples assessed (Fig. 2, Table 2). As a result, the HBV of

- 211 thresher shark samples were uniformly positive although they declined with increasing body size due to
- 212 increasing Hg (Fig. 2). Therefore, unlike mako shark, thresher shark meats provide a Se-surplus.
- 213

214 3.5 Bigeye tuna

215 The Hg contents of bigeye tuna samples were lower than those observed in pilot whale, shark or

swordfish (Fig. 1, Table 1). Although their Hg concentrations were directly related to body size (Fig. 1,

Table 1), Se contents were higher than Hg in all samples assessed (Fig. 3, Table 2). As a result, their HBV

values were uniformly positive (Fig. 2, Table 2). There was a gradual decline in surplus Se (p = 0.01; F =

- 219 6.8) associated with increasing Hg concentrations, but the values were consistently positive (Fig. 3).
- 220

221 3.6 Skipjack tuna

The Hg contents of skipjack tuna were low in comparison to other species assessed in this study and not related to body size (Fig. 1, Table 1). The levels of Se in their tissues were variable and unrelated to body size (Fig. 2). The red meat of skipjack tuna had considerably higher Se contents than the lighter muscle mass (data not shown). The source of this variability is unknown and was not observed in any other varieties of ocean fish studied. The HBV of skipjack tuna were uniformly positive and independent of size (Fig. 2, Table 2). The Se-surplus was not significantly related to Hg or Se concentrations.

228

4.0 Discussion:

230 Ocean fish consumption during pregnancy is consistently associated with neurodevelopmental benefits in children compared to those of mothers that avoid fish consumption.^{48-57, 68} Ocean fish are rich 231 232 sources of dietary Se,⁶⁵ and although Se contents vary considerably between species, it is generally 233 independent of fish size. However, CH₃Hg concentrations in ocean fish are directly related to their trophic 234 level, age, size, and can vary by orders of magnitude, negatively affecting their HBV (Fig. 2). As shown 235 in Fig. 1, Hg bioaccumulation during early growth is minimal, so HBVs are the highest in the youngest 236 fish (Fig. 2). As their Hg burdens increase, HBV's gradually decline so those with the lowest values tend 237 to be the oldest and largest of their species (Fig. 2). Although the HBV remains positive in even the

largest of most fish species,⁵⁸ our results indicate this is not the case for pilot whale, mako shark, or
swordfish (see Table 1, Fig. 3).

240 Seafood consumption advisories currently fail to consider Se, and instead of being based on 241 studies that examined the effects of ocean fish consumption, are based on studies of the effects of Hg 242 exposures which primarily originated from consuming pilot whales, not fish. In the Faroe Islands Study, 243 participant consumption of pilot whale meat, blubber, and liver (in proportions ~65:32:3⁶³ were the source of ~85% of their overall Hg exposures,^{44,61} The livers (and kidneys) had extremely high Hg and cadmium 244 245 contents and whale blubber also contained high concentrations of PCB's and all other persistent bioaccumulative toxicants.^{62,63} Based on the unusually negative HBV of the pilot whale meat, adverse 246 247 effects would be expected in children born to mothers who ate pilot whale meat during pregnancy. 248 However, the Hg-dependent Se losses were offset by Se from the ocean fish also consumed, thus 249 alleviating adverse consequences and significant improvements in health outcomes were observed in 250 children whose mothers consumed increasing amounts of ocean fish.⁶⁷ These benefits are likely due to Se-251 restoration along with other positive effects of ocean fish nutrients required for optimal fetal 252 neurodevelopment.48,49,54,55,57,68

253 In addition, studies of ocean fish consuming populations have found the children of mothers who 254 ate the most fish during pregnancy had significantly improved neurodevelopmental scores in comparison to those whose mothers ate no fish.^{48,49,54,55,57,68} Children in the US whose mothers avoided fish 255 256 consumption during pregnancy lost IO benefits⁵³ that were 60-100 times greater⁶⁰ than the worst-case 257 effects reported with Hg exposures from pilot whale consumption in the Faroes. Maternal seafood intake 258 during pregnancy of less than the amount recommended by the 2004 U.S. fish consumption advisory⁶⁹ 259 (340 g per week) was associated with increased risk of their children being in the lowest quartile for 260 verbal intelligence quotient (IQ) compared with mothers who consumed more than 340 g per week. Low 261 maternal seafood intake was also reported to be associated with increased risk of suboptimum outcomes 262 for prosocial behaviour, fine motor, communication, and social development scores. The authors also 263 stated that for each outcome measure, the lower the intake of seafood during pregnancy, the higher the risk of suboptimum developmental outcome.⁴⁸ Diminished fish consumption also increased children's 264 265 risks for pathological scores in fine motor, communication, and social skills. Conversely, increasing 266 maternal fish consumption beyond the reference dose during pregnancy was associated with improved child performance.48 267

To ensure the safety of the most sensitive population subgroups, recommendations based on the HBV criterion are exceedingly cautious in that it considers only the seafood itself, without regard to other Se sources in the diet. Recognizing that dietary intakes account for ~19.8% of the total variation in maternal blood Hg concentrations⁷⁰ while diet is the exclusive source of Se, the margin of safety afforded 272 by the HBV is purposefully cautious. It does not reflect the amounts of Hg bound to other elements or 273 consider the other sources of Se in the diet. Since seafood consumers generally eat a variety of fish which 274 have positive HBV's and enrich their Se intakes, occasional consumption of a negative HBV seafood is 275 unlikely to diminish Se-status. This may explain why the Faroe Islands study found the effects of high 276 maternal Hg exposures from consumption of even extraordinarily contaminated seafoods such as pilot 277 whale meat, blubber, and liver were only associated with subtle diminishments in their children's subsequent performance assessments.⁶⁷ Children in the Faroes had cord blood Hg concentrations as high 278 as 1 μ M, a concentration which has been associated with adult Hg toxicity⁷¹ and not coincidentally, 279 280 ~equimolar with the average concentration of Se in most body tissues. Maternal fish consumption was 281 highly protective against the effects of Hg exposure in the Faroes,⁶⁷ and ocean fish provided ~80% of their dietary Se.⁶¹ This is fortunate since otherwise fetal Se-status among those with high pilot whale meat 282 283 consumption would have been grossly impaired. Since ocean fish are among the richest dietary sources of 284 nutrients with important roles in brain health and development, including Se, long-chain omega-3 fatty 285 acids, and vitamin D, it is not surprising that increased maternal fish consumption correspond with 286 improved fetal outcomes.

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the U.S. Food and Drug Administration advisory 287 regarding fish consumption for children and pregnant women⁷² includes a chart of >60 types of fish and 288 289 shellfish that women and children are encouraged to eat up to 3 servings per week depending on species. 290 Nearly 90% of fish eaten in the U.S. fall into this "best choices" category, and these recommendations are 291 consistent with positive HBV's based on their high Se contents relative to Hg. The advisory's "choices to 292 avoid" category includes: shark, swordfish, king mackerel and tilefish from the Gulf of Mexico, orange 293 roughy, marlin, and bigeye tuna. The present study found that make sharks and large swordfish have 294 negative HBVs which generally coincides with the Hg-based criteria used to establish EPA/FDA 295 categories. However, thresher sharks had uniformly positive HBV's. Considering there are more than 400 296 shark species and the advisory does not differentiate among them, more work should be done to assess the 297 HBV's of commonly consumed shark varieties to segregate those with positive vs. negative HBV's. The 298 HBV's of king mackerel, tilefish, and orange roughy have not been assessed, but considering their high 299 Hg contents, maternal consumption of these varieties should be limited until assessments have been 300 performed. In contrast to the advisory, we find the uniformly positive HBV's of bigeye tuna (HBV = 11.5301 \pm 3.8; see Table 2), and marlin (HBV = 11.5 \pm 4.2 for blue marlin, 8.0 \pm 3.2 for striped marlin; 302 unpublished data), indicate their Hg contents are unlikely to be problematic and should not be a basis for 303 inclusion in the "choices to avoid" category. Criteria based on fish Hg contents alone lack merit because 304 they include only half the information required to differentiate Hg-exposure risks from nutritional benefits

305 of seafood consumption.

306 It is important to point out that the amount of Se in the food web of freshwater bodies and 307 estuaries can vary depending on Se availability in their watersheds. Thus, the CH₃Hg and Se levels in 308 freshwater fish can differ considerably. Bioaccumulation of CH₃Hg in piscivorous freshwater fish is 309 inversely related to Se bioavailability.⁷⁴⁻⁸⁰ Fish from regions with poor soil Se levels (e.g., in Finland, 310 Canada, South America) will tend to have increased CH₃Hg contents and lower HBV's. Since Se-status 311 of remote populations in Se-poor regions is likely to be low, Hg exposure risks may be exacerbated in 312 subsistence fish consumers.⁶⁰ The current EPA freshwater fish advisories are based solely on Hg levels 313 and vary from state to state. However, like ocean fish, freshwater fish from most North American watersheds generally contain significantly more Se than Hg^{81,82} and therefore have positive HBV's. This 314 315 suggests that many water bodies currently listed as "impaired" based on fish Hg contents may need to be 316 reevaluated. In contrast, the low Se levels which tend to be common in high-Hg freshwater fish from Se-317 poor watersheds may indicate accentuated Hg-related risks which are currently being overlooked. This is 318 especially true of subsistence fish consumers whose locally-sourced foods may also be Se poor would be 319 at greatest risk from eating fish with negative HBVs. Therefore, freshwater fish and other foods which 320 may contain high concentrations of Hg and other metallic or organic electrophiles should be evaluated 321 using HBV criteria to identify populations that are increased at-risk and enhance the reliability of future 322 risk assessments.

323

324 **4.1 Conclusions:**

325 It is more rational to base maternal seafood consumption advice on the outcomes of studies of 326 ocean fish eating populations than on the effects of exposures to toxicants which were predominantly 327 from eating pilot whale meat, organs, and blubber. As previously observed with the majority of other 328 ocean fish species, this study found skipjack tuna has a uniformly positive HBV that indicates it is safe 329 and beneficial to eat. Since the HBV's of bigeye tuna, marlin, and thresher shark were also uniformly 330 positive, they should not be considered "choices to avoid". While the negative HBV of mako sharks and 331 large swordfish superficially aligns with the FDA/EPA "choices to avoid" category, suggesting avoidance 332 may be inappropriate since most consumers fail to distinguish between different types of fish and many 333 over-react to food-safety warnings. Therefore, to minimize risk of harm while optimizing fetal/infant 334 neurodevelopment, the most prudent advice is to encourage maternal consumption of a variety of ocean 335 fish with emphasis on those with positive HBV's.

336

337 **References:**

- Köhrle J, Brigelius-Flohe R, Bock A, Gartner R, Meyer O, Flohe L. Selenium in biology: Facts and medical perspectives. Biol Chem 2000;381:849-864.
- Behne D, Pfeifer H, Rothlein D, Kyriakopoulos A. Cellular and subcellular distribution of selenium and selenium-containing proteins in the rat. In Trace Elements in Man and Animals 10. Roussel AM, Favier AE, Anderson RA, editors. New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers. 2000. 29–34.
- 345 3. Chen J, Berry MJ. Selenium and selenoproteins in the brain and brain diseases. J Neurochem 2003;86:1–12.
 347
- Schweizer U, Bräuer AU, Köhrle J, Nitsch R, Savaskan NE. Selenium and brain function: a poorly recognized liaison. Brain Res Rev 2004;45:164-178.
- Yang DY, Chen YW, Gunn JM, Belzile N. Selenium and mercury in organisms: Interactions and mechanisms. Environ Rev 2008;16:71-92.
- Reeves M A, and Hoffmann PR. The human selenoproteome: recent insights into functions and
 regulation. Cell Mol Life Sci 2009;66(15):2457–2478.
- 7. Köhrle J, Gärtner R. Selenium and thyroid: Best Pract Res Clin Endocrinol Metab 2009;23:815-827.
- 8. Reich HJ, Hondal RJ. why Nature Chose Selenium. ACS Chem Biol 2016;11(4):821–841.
- 361
 9. Burk RF, Hill KE. Selenoprotein P: an extracellular protein with unique physical characteristics and a
 362 role in selenium homeostasis. Annu Rev Nutr 2005;25:215–235.
 363
- Burk RF, Hill KE, Olson GE, Weeber EJ, Motley AK, Winfrey VP, Austin LM. Deletion of
 apolipoprotein E receptor-2 in mice lowers brain selenium and causes severe neurological
 dysfunction and death when a low selenium diet is fed. J Neurosci 2007;27(23):6207–6211.
- 368 11. Burk RF, Olson GE, Hill KE, Winfrey VP, Motley AK, Kurokawa S. Maternal-fetal transfer of
 369 selenium in the mouse. FASEB J 2013;27(8):3249-56.
 370
- 12. Pařízek, J., Oštádalová, I. The protective effect of small amounts of selenite in sublimate intoxication,
 Experiential 1967;23:142–143.
- 374 13. Ganther H, Goudie C, Sunde M, Kopeckey M, Wagner S, Hoekstra W. Selenium: Relation to
 375 decreased Toxicity of Methylmercury Added to Diets Containing Tuna. Science 1972;175:1122–
 376 1124.
 377
- 378 14. Wada O, Yamaguchi N, Ono T, Nagahashi M, Morimura T. Inhibitory effect of mercury on kidney
 379 glutathione peroxidase and its prevention by selenium. Environ Res 1976;12:75-80.
 380
- 15. El-Begearmi MM, Ganther HE, Sunde ML. Dietary interaction between methylmercury, selenium,
 arsenic, and sulfur amino acids in Japanese quail. Poult Sci 1982;61:272–9.
- 16. El-Demerdash FM. Effects of Selenium and mercury on the enzymatic activities and lipid
 peroxidation in brain, liver, and blood of rats. J Environ Sci Health. 2001;36:489–99.

387 17. Ralston NVC, Blackwell JL, Raymond LJ. Importance of Molar Ratios in Selenium-Dependent 388 Protection Against Methylmercury Toxicity. Biol Trace Elem Res 2007;119(3):255-268. 389 390 18. Ralston NVC, Ralston CR, Blackwell III JL, and Raymond LJ. Dietary and Tissue Selenium in 391 Relation to Methylmercury Toxicity. Neurotoxicology 2008;29:802-811. 392 393 19. Ganther HE, Sunde ML. Effect of tuna fish and selenium on the toxicity of methylmercury: a progress 394 report. J Food Sci 1974;39:1-5. 395 396 20. Stillings BR, Lagally H, Bauersfield P, Soares J. Effect of Cystine, Selenium, and Fish Protein on the 397 Toxicity and Metabolism of Methylmercury in Rats. Toxicol Appl Pharmacol 1974;30:243-254. 398 399 21. Ohi G, Nishigaki, S., Seki, H., Tamura, Y., Maki, T. Efficacy of Selenium in Tuna and Selenite in 400 Modifying Methylmercury Intoxication. Environ Res 1976;12:49-58. 401 402 22. Ohi, G., Nishigaki, S., Seki, H., Tamura, Y., Maki, T., Minowa, K., Shimamura, Y., Mizoguchi, I. 403 The Protective Potency of Marine Animal Meat Against the Neurotoxicity of Methylmercury: Its 404 Relationship with the Organ Distribution of Mercury and Selenium in the Rat. Food Cosmet Toxicol 405 1980;18:139-145. 406 407 23. Freidman MA, Eaton LR, Carter WH. Protective effects of freeze-dried swordfish on methylmercury content. Bull Environ Contam Toxicol 1978;19:436-443. 408 409 410 24. Ralston NVC, Raymond LJ. Functional Deletion of Brain Selenoenzymes by Methylmercury. In; 411 Selenium in the Environment and Human Health. G.S. Banuelos and Z.-Q. Lin, Eds. Taylor and 412 Francis (London, UK). 2015. pp 71-72. 413 414 25. Valentine WM, Abel TW, Hill KE, Austin LM. Burk RF. Neurodegeneration in Mice Resulting from 415 Loss of Functional Selenoprotein P or Its Receptor Apolipoprotein E Receptor 2. J. Neuropath. Exp. 416 Neurology. 2008;67(1):68-77. 417 418 26. Hill KE, Zhou J, McMahan WJ, Motley AK, Atkins JF, Gesteland RF, Burk RF. Deletion of 419 Selenoprotein P alters distribution of selenium in the mouse, J. Biolog. Chem. 2003;278(16):13640-420 13646. 421 422 27. Watanabe C, Yin K, Kasanuma Y, Satoh H. In Utero Exposure to Methylmercury and Se Deficiency 423 Converge on the Neurobehavioral Outcome in Mice. Neurotoxicol Teratol 1999;21:83-88. 424 425 28. Watanabe C, Yoshida K, Kasanuma Y, Kun Y, Satoh H. In Utero Methylmercury Exposure 426 Differentially Affects the Activities of Selenoenzymes in the Fetal Mouse Brain. Environ Res 427 1999;80:208-14. 428 429 29. Bjørklund G, Aaseth J, Ajsuvakovad OP, Nikonorove AA, Skalny AV, Skalnay MG, Tinkov AA. 430 Molecular interaction between mercury and selenium in neurotoxicity. Coord. Chem. Rev. 431 2017;332:30-37. 432 433 30. Spiller HA. Rethinking mercury: the role of selenium in the pathophysiology of mercury toxicity. Clin 434 Toxicol 2017;10:1-14. 435 436 31. Ralston NVC and Raymond LJ Mercury's neurotoxicity is characterized by its disruption of selenium 437 biochemistry. Biochim Biophys Acta Gen Subj. 2018;1862:2405-2416.

438		
439	32.	Ralston NVC Effects of soft electrophiles on selenium physiology. Free Radic Biol Med.
440		2018:127:134-144.
441		
442	33	Prohaska IR Ganther HE Interactions between selenium and methylmercury in rat brain Chem Biol
443	22.	Interact 1977:16(2):155-67
444		interact 1977;10(2):155 07.
111	34	Sannönan K. Soininan D.Salonan IT Lotionan S.Laatikainan P. Does Mercury Promote Linid
77 <i>J</i> <i>1</i> /6	54.	Perovidation? An In Vitro Study Concerning Mercury Copper, and Iron in Perovidation of Low
447		Density Lineprotein Biol Trace Elem Bes 2004:101(2):117-22
118		Density Lipoprotein. Bior frace Lieni Kes $2004, 101(2), 117-52$.
440	25	Convolto CMI Chow F H Hashamy SI Ly I Halmaran A Inhibition of the human thiorodoxin
449	55.	Carvaino Civil, Chew E-H, Hasheniy SI, Lu J, Holniglell, A. Initiofuoli of the human unoredoxin
450		system: A molecular mechanism of mercury loxicity. J Biol Chem 2008;285:11915-11925.
451	20	$\mathbf{D}_{\mathbf{A}} = \mathbf{N} \mathbf{V} \mathbf{C} \mathbf{D}_{\mathbf{A}} = \mathbf{U} \mathbf{A} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{C} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{U} U$
452	36.	Raiston NVC, Raymond LJ. Selenium Health Benefit Values as Seafood Safety Criteria. NOAA Final
453		Report 2010. NA08NMF4520492.
454	27	
455	37.	Branco V, Godinho-Santos A, Gonçalves J, Lu J, Holmgren A, Carvalho C. Mitochondrial
456		thioredoxin reductase inhibition, selenium status, and Nrf-2 activation are determinant factors
457		modulating the toxicity of mercury compounds. Free Radic Biol Med 2014;73:95-105.
458		
459	38.	Ralston NVC, Raymond LJ. The "SOS" Mechanisms of Methylmercury Toxicity. In; Selenium in the
460		Environment and Human Health. G.S. Banuelos and ZQ. Lin, Eds. Taylor and Francis (London,
461		UK). 2015. pp 73-74.
462		
463	39.	Dyrssen D, Wedborg M. The Sulfur-mercury (II) system in natural waters. Water Air Soil Pollut
464		1991;56:507–519.
465		
466	40.	Ralston NVC, Raymond LJ. Dietary selenium's protective effects against methylmercury toxicity.
467		Toxicology 2010;278:112-123.
468		
469	41.	Ralston NVC, Ralston CR, Raymond LJ. Selenium Health Benefit Values: Updated Criteria for
470		Mercury Risk Assessments. Biol Trace Elem Res 2016;171:262-269.
471		
472	42.	Stringari J, Nunes AKC, Franco JL, Bohrer D, Garcia SC, Dafre AL, Milatovic D, Souza DO, Rocha
473		JBT, Aschner M, Farina M. Prenatal methylmercury exposure hampers glutathione antioxidant
474		system ontogenesis and causes long-lasting oxidative stress in the mouse brain. Toxicol Appl
475		Pharmacol. 2008:227:147-154.
476		
477	43.	Crump KS, Kiellstrom T, Shipp AM, Silvers A, Stewart A, Influence of Prenatal Mercury Exposure
478		upon Scholastic and Psychological Test Performance: Benchmark Analysis of a New Zealand Cohort.
479		Risk Anal 1998:18:701–13
480		
481	$\Delta \Delta$	Grandiean P. Weihe P. Jorgenson PI. Clarkson T. Cernichiari F. Videro T. Impact of maternal
482		seafood diet on fetal exposure to mercury selenium and lead Arch Environ Health 1992:47(3):185-
483		195
484		170.
485	45	Grandiean P. Weihe P. White RF. Debes F. Araki S. Murata K. Cognitive deficit in 7 year old
486	чJ.	children with prenatal exposure to methylmercury. Neurotoxicol Teratol 1007.10.417 428
487		enheren with prenatal exposure to methymnereary. Neurotoxicor relator 1777,17.417-420.
т07		

488 46. Grandjean P, Weihe P, White RF, Debes F. Cognitive performance of children prenatally exposed to 489 "safe" levels of methylmercury. Environ Res 1998;77:165–172. 490 491 47. Debes F, Budtz-Jorgensen E, Weihe P, White RF, Grandjean P. Impact of prenatal methylmercury 492 exposure on neurobehavioral function at age 14 years. Neurotoxicol Teratol 2011;28(3):363–375. 493 494 48. Hibbeln JR, Davis JM, Steer C, Emmett P, Rogers I, Williams C, Golding J. Maternal seafood 495 consumption in pregnancy and neurodevelopmental outcomes in childhood (ALSPAC study): an 496 observational cohort study. Lancet 2007;369:578-585. 497 498 49. Davidson PW, Cory-Slechta DA, Thurston SW, Huang L-S, Shamlaye CF, Gunzler D, Watson G, van 499 Wijngaarden E, Zareba G, Klein JD, Clarkson TW, Strain JJ, Mvers GJ. Fish consumption and 500 prenatal methylmercury exposure: Cognitive and behavioral outcomes in the main cohort at 17 years 501 from the Sevchelles child development study. Neurotoxicology 2011;32:711-717. 502 503 50. Myers GJ, Davidson PW. Prenatal Methylmercury Exposure and Children: Neurologic, 504 Developmental, and Behavioral Research. Env Health Persp 1998;106(3):841–847. 505 506 51. Myers GJ, Davidson PW, Cox C, Shamlaye C, Cernichiari E, Clarkson TW. Twenty-seven years 507 studying the human neurotoxicity of methylmercury exposure. Environ Res 2000;83(3):275-285. 508 509 52. Myers GJ, Davidson PW, Strain JJ. Nutrient and methyl mercury exposure from consuming fish. J 510 Nutr 2007;137:2805-2808. 511 512 53. Lederman SA, Jones RL, Caldwell KL, Rau V, Sheets SE, Tang D, Viswanathan S, Becker M, Stein 513 JL, Wang RL, Perera FP. Relation between cord blood mercury levels and early child development in 514 a World Trade Center cohort. Environ Health Perspect 2008;116:1085-1091. 515 516 54. Daniels JL, Longnecker MP, Rowland AS, Golding J. Fish intake during pregnancy and early 517 cognitive development of offspring. Epidemiology 2004;15:394-402. 518 519 55. Julvez J, Méndez M, Fernandez-Barres S, Romaguera D, Vioque J, Llop S, Riaño I. Maternal 520 consumption of seafood in pregnancy and child neuropsychological development: a longitudinal 521 study based on a population with high consumption levels. Am J Epidemiol 2016;183:169–182. 522 523 56. Llop S, Ballester F, Murcia M, Forns J, Tardon A, Andiarena A, Vioque J, Ibarluzea J, Fernández-524 Somoano A, Sunyer J, Julvez J, Rebagliato M, Lopez-Espinosa MJ. Prenatal exposure to mercury and 525 neuropsychological development in young children: the role of fish consumption. Int J Epidemiol 526 2017;46(3):827-838. 527 528 57. Golding J, Hibbeln JR, Gregory SM, Iles-Caven Y, Emond A, Taylor CM. Maternal prenatal blood 529 mercury is not adversely associated with offspring IQ at 8 years provided the mother eats fish: A 530 British prebirth cohort study. Int J Hyg Environ Health 2017;220(7):1161-1167. 531 532 58. Kaneko JJ, Ralston NVC. Selenium and Mercury in Pelagic Fish in the Central North Pacific near 533 Hawaii. Biol Trace Element Res 2007;119(3):242-254. 534 535 59. Davidson PW, Myers GJ, Cox C, Axtell C, Shamlaye C, Sloane-Reeves J, Cernichiari E, Needham L, 536 Choi A, Wang Y, Berlin M, Clarkson TW. Effects of Prenatal and Postnatal Methylmercury Exposure 537 from Fish Consumption on Neurodevelopment: Outcomes at 66 months of Age in the Seychelles 538 Child Development Study. JAMA 1998;280:701-707.

539

564

582

- 60. Ralston NVC. Selenium Health Benefit Values as Seafood Safety Criteria. EcoHealth 2008;5:442455.
- 61. Ralston NVC, Azenkeng A, Ralston CR, Raymond LJ. Selenium-Health Benefit Values as Seafood
 Safety Criteria. In "Seafood Science; Advances in Chemistry, Technology and Applications" SeKwon Kim, Ed. CRC Press. 2014. pp 433-457.
- 547 62. Julshamn K, Anderson A, Ringdal O, Morkore J. Trace elements intake in the Faroe Islands, I.
 548 Element levels in edible parts of pilot whales (Globicephalus meleanus). Sci Total Environ
 549 1987;65:53–62.
- 63. Anderson A, Julshamn K, Ringdal O, Mórkóre J. Trace elements intake in the Faroe Islands II. Intake
 of mercury and other elements by consumption of pilot whales (Globicephalus meleanus). Sci Total
 Environ 1987;65:63-68.
- 64. NOAA Fisheries, Office of Protected Resources. Long-finned pilot whale (Globicephala melas)
 http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/pr/species/mammals/cetaceans/pilotwhale_longfinned.htm. Accessed
 August, 2018.
- 65. Huggins F, Raverty SA, Nielsen OS, Sharp N, Robertson JD, Ralston NVC. An XAFS investigation
 of mercury and selenium in beluga whale tissues Environ Bioind 2009;4:291-302.
- 562 66. USDA. United States Department of Agriculture Agricultural Research Service Food Composition
 563 Databases. https://ndb.nal.usda.gov/ndb/ (Accessed July 2018)
- 565 67. Budtz-Jørgensen E, Grandjean P, Weihe P. Separation of risks and benefits of seafood intake. Environ
 566 Health Perspect 2007;115:323-327.
- 568 68. Avella-Garcia CB, Julvez J. Seafood intake and neurodevelopment: a systematic review. Curr Environ
 569 Health Rep 2014;11:46–77.
 570
- 69. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, and U.S. Food and Drug Administration. 2004. What you need to know about mercury in fish and shellfish. Advice for women who might become pregnant, women who are pregnant, nursing mothers and children. Washington DC: U.S. https://www.lejeune.
 574 marines.mil/Portals/27/Documents/CLEO/MERCURY_IN_FISH_AND_SHELLFISH.pdf
- 576 70. Golding J, Steer CD, Hibbeln JR, Emmett PM, Lowery T, Jones R. Dietary predictors of maternal
 577 prenatal blood mercury levels in the ALSPAC birth cohort study. Environ Health Perspect
 578 2013;121(10):1214-1218.
 579
- 580 71. Clarkson TW, Magos L. The Toxicology of Mercury and Its Chemical Compounds. Critical Reviews
 581 in Toxicology 2006;36:608-662.
- 583 72. Environmental Protection Agency and U.S. Food and Drug Administration. EPA-823-F-04-009.
 584 http://www.fda.gov/Food/FoodbornelllnessContaminants/Metals/ucm393070.htm Accessed:
 585 1/7/2019.
 586
- 73. Paulsson K, Lindbergh K. The Selenium Method for Treatment of Lakes for Elevated Levels of
 Mercury in Fish. Sci Total Environ 1989;87(88):495–507.

- 590 74. Southworth, G.R.; Peterson, M.J.; Ryon, M.G. Long Term Increased Bioaccumulation of Mercury in
 591 Largemouth Bass Follows Reduction of Waterborne Selenium. Chemosph 2000;41(7):1101–5.
 592
- 593 75. Strapáč I, Sokol J, Žatko D, Baranová M. Mercury and selenium concentrations in muscle tissue of
 594 different species of predatory freshwater fish and correlation between these elements. Food Addit
 595 Contam Part B Surveill 2012;5(3):194-9.
- 597 76. Turner MA, Rudd JWM. The English Wabigoon River System III. Selenium in Lake Enclosures: Its
 598 Geochemistry, Bioaccumulation, and Ability to Reduce Mercury Bioaccumulation. Can J Fish Aquat
 599 Sci 1983;40:2228–2240.
- 77. Sampaio da Silva D, Lucotte M, Paquet S, Brux G, Lemire M. Inverse mercury and selenium
 concentration patterns between herbivorous and piscivorous fish in the Tapajos River, Brazilian
 Amazon. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 2013;97:17-25.
- 78. Lino AS, Kasper D, Guida YS, Thomaz JR, Malm O. Mercury and selenium in fishes from the
 Tapajós River in the Brazilian Amazon: An evaluation of human exposure. J Trace Elem Med Biol
 2018;48:196-201.
- Find the second secon
- 80. Peterson SA, Ralston NVC, Whanger PD, Oldfield JE, Mosher WD. Selenium and mercury
 interactions in fish tissue. Environ Bioind 2009;4(4):318-334.

615 616

600

604

81. Peterson SA, Ralston NV, Peck DV, Van Sickle J, Robertson JD, Spate VL, Morris JS. How might
selenium moderate the toxic effects of mercury in stream fish of the western U.S.? Environ Sci
Technol 2009;43(10):3919-25.

619

(6 graphs comparing Hg contents of different seafoods)

Fig. 1. Total Hg concentrations (μ mol/kg) for the seafoods assessed in this study.



(6 graphs comparing Se contents of different seafoods)

And

(6 graphs comparing HBV_{Se} of different seafoods)

Fig. 2. Total Se concentrations (μ mol/kg), and calculated HBVs for the seafoods studied.



(6 graphs comparing Se Deficit or surplus of different seafoods)

Fig. 3. The relative Se deficit or excess (μ mol/kg) shown in relation to seafood Hg contents.



Seafood	n	Body Wt.	mg Hg/kg	µmol Hg/kg	Slope (Hg x Wt.)	Adj. R ²	F	p value
		-				-		-
Pilot whale	18	992.4±507.6	1.56 ± 0.73	7.75 ± 3.62	0.004(x) + 3.51	0.32	8.93	<0.01
Mako shark	10	57.4±12.5	1.81±0.40	9.01±1.99	0.111(x) + 2.66	0.41	7.41	0.03
Swordfish	49	80.8±55.8	1.00±0.37	4.99±1.85	0.017(x) + 3.91	0.09	6.16	0.01
Thresher shark	10	71.3±69.4	0.97±0.32	4.86±1.60	0.032(x) + 2.57	0.26	4.24	0.07
Bigeye tuna	50	41.2±20.4	0.60 ± 0.25	3.00±1.23	0.040(x) + 1.34	0.44	39.02	< 0.001
Skipjack tuna	10	8.6±1.2	0.34±0.10	1.67±0.52	NS	NS	NS	NS

 Table 1. Seafood Mercury Contents and Relationships to Body Weight

Seafood	n	mg Se/kg	µmol Se/kg	(µmol Se-Hg/kg)	HBV
Pilot whale	18	0.41±0.31	5.23 ± 3.88	-2.52 ± 6.40	-14.79±19.98
Mako shark	10	0.32±0.04	4.07±0.48	-4.93±1.79	-16.44±8.57
Swordfish	49	0.43±0.12	5.40 ± 1.48	0.41 ± 1.80	0.28±3.73
Thresher shark	10	0.52±0.12	6.55±1.51	1.68 ± 1.43	2.67±2.04
Bigeye tuna	50	0.99±0.28	12.38±3.47	9.40±3.73	11.47±3.79
Skipjack tuna	10	1.56±0.92	19.83±11.71	18.15±11.74	19.61±11.83

 Table 2.
 Seafood Selenium Contents, Selenium Deficit or Surplus, and Health Benefit Values.