1 Characterizing spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution in China: a multiscale landscape

2 approach

3

4 Abstract

China's tremendous economic growth in the past three decades has resulted in a number of 5 environmental problems, including the deterioration of air quality. In particular, fine particulate 6 matter (PM) has received increasing attention from scientists, governmental agencies, and the 7 8 public due to its adverse impacts on human health. Monitoring the spatiotemporal patterns of 9 air pollution is important for understanding its transport mechanisms and making effective 10 environmental policies. The main goal of this study, therefore, was to quantify the spatial 11 patterns and movement of air pollution in China at annual, daily, and hourly scales, so that the underlying drivers could be better understood. We used remote sensing data and landscape 12 metrics together to capture spatiotemporal signatures of air pollution. Our results show that, at 13 the annual scale, PM_{2.5} concentrations in China increased gradually from 1999 to 2011, with the 14 highest concentrations occurring in the North China Plain as well as the middle and lower 15 reaches of the Yangtze River Basin. The total population affected by air pollution was about 16 975 million in 2010 (about 70% of China's population). Our more detailed analysis on daily 17 and hourly scale further revealed that a heavy air pollution event occurred, expanded, aggregated, 18 and finally dissipated over Northern China during Oct. 6-12, 2014, suggesting that the 19 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region a center of severe pollution. Crop stalks burning in agricultural 20 21 areas in this region seemed to be one of the leading drivers, along with coal burning and transportation emissions. Our study demonstrates that spatial pattern analysis with landscape 22 metrics is effective for analyzing source-sink dynamics of air pollution and its potential drivers. 23 Our findings of major source areas and movement trajectories should be useful for making air 24 pollution control policies to improve China's air quality. 25

26

27

28 Keywords

PM_{2.5}; haze; urban landscape pattern; air quality; inter-regional transport of air pollutants
30

31 **1 Introduction**

China is the most populous country in the world, with more than half of its population now living 32 in cities since 2010 (Liu et al., 2014; Wu et al., 2014). During the past three decades, the 33 concurrent rapid economic growth and urbanization in China are unprecedented in terms of both 34 35 speed and scale (Ma et al., 2016a; Wu et al., 2014), and have resulted in a number of 36 environmental problems, including the deterioration of air quality in many urban regions across the nation (Huang, 2015; Lue et al., 2010; Shao et al., 2006). Air pollution can have both acute 37 38 and chronic effects on human health, ranging from reversible respiratory problems to lung and 39 heart failure-related mortality (Cox, 2013; Folinsbee, 1993; Kampa and Castanas, 2008; Lave and Seskin, 1970; Pant et al., 2016; Phung et al., 2016; Tsangari et al., 2016). For instance, 40 increased air pollution due to fine particulate matter smaller than 2.5 micrometers (PM_{2.5}) may 41 lead to the cardiopulmonary morbidity and mortality of people (Lelieveld et al., 2015; Pope and 42 Dockery, 2006; Schwartz et al., 1996; Wu et al., 2014). A recent Chinese case study concluded 43 that the reduction in life expectancy of about 3 years may be expected from long-term exposure 44 to an additional 100 μ g/m³ of total suspended particles (TSPs) (Chen et al., 2013). Especially 45 for elder persons, their relative risks for deaths could be larger than for all ages (Schwartz et al., 46 1996). 47

48 In 2012, the Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China

49 (MEP) updated National Ambient Air Quality Standards, which for the first time included PM_{2.5}

50 (MEP, 2012a). Chinese Meteorological Administration (CMA) also updated early-warning

- standards for air pollution, and expanded the indicator set to include $PM_{2.5}$ concentration,
- borizontal visibility, and relative humidity (CMA, 2013). The threshold to define and forecast
- haze days is $75\mu g/m^3$ of 24-hour mean PM_{2.5} concentration according to the World Health
- 54 Organization (WHO, 2005). CMA (2013) defined this threshold as 115μ g/m³ of 24-hour mean

PM_{2.5} concentration with relative humidity of higher than 80% and horizontal visibility of less 55 than 3km, or $150 \mu g/m^3$ of 24-hour mean PM_{2.5} concentration with horizontal visibility of less 56 than 5km. As per the Chinese standard, the total number of haze days in 2013 was more than 57 70 in most of China's megacities, including Beijing, Tianjin, Shanghai, Guangzhou, Shenzhen, 58 and a dozen other densely populated urban areas (MEP, 2013). In general, the increase of air 59 pollution in China was a result of human activities such as economic developments (Xu et al., 60 2016), industrial emissions (Wang et al., 2012a), burning of coal for heating (Tao et al., 2014), 61 and burning of crop stalks (Shi et al., 2014). Rapid urbanization and urban patterns/forms also 62 63 have impacts on urban air quality (Bereitschaft and Debbage, 2013; Lv and Cao, 2011). Sprawl 64 cities tend to generate more transportation emissions of pollution than more compact cities with 65 mixed land uses (Borrego et al., 2006; Martins, 2012).

To clarify the relationship between air pollution and human health, it is necessary to 66 monitor and quantify the spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution, as well as to understand its 67 transport mechanisms (Blanchard et al., 2011; Yuan et al., 2014; Zhang et al., 2010). Towards 68 this end, observations from air quality monitoring stations are crucial (Cheng et al., 2013; Tao et 69 al., 2014; Wang et al., 2014), but the site-specific measurements must be scaled up to obtain 70 spatial distributional patterns of air pollutants on landscape and regional scales (Pope and Wu, 71 2014a, b). The accuracy of quantifying air pollution patterns depends on both the density and 72 configuration of the ground stations within a monitoring network, and is also influenced by the 73 scale of analysis in space and time (Pope and Wu, 2014a; Wu, 1999). Air quality monitoring 74 75 networks provide high temporal resolution data, but their spatial coverage is usually constrained by physical, fiscal, and technical factors (Pope and Wu, 2014b). 76

To complement the ground-based monitoring data, satellite-based or airborne
observations covering broad areas have become increasingly available in recent decades (Tao et al., 2012). Studies have shown that Aerosol Optical Depth (AOD) from satellite observations
and PM₁₀/PM_{2.5} concentrations from ground stations are highly correlated (Engel-Cox et al., 2004; Green et al., 2009; Lee et al., 2011; Ma et al., 2016b; van Donkelaar et al., 2006; Wang

and Christopher, 2003; Wang et al., 2010b). Based on this correlation, van Donkelaar et al. 82 (2010) and Ma et al. (2016b) derived spatial patterns of annual PM_{2.5} concentrations, indicating 83 that the annual PM_{2.5} concentrations of eastern China exceeded 80µg/m³, which was much higher 84 than the WHO standard of $35\mu g/m^3$. In addition to ground and airborne monitoring, remote 85 sensing and Chemical Transport Models (CTMs) have also been used for characterizing the 86 spatiotemporal patterns and simulating the emergence, expansion, and dissipation of the air 87 pollution (Cuchiara et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2012a; Wang et al., 2012b; Wang et al., 2010a; 88 89 Yahya et al., 2014). For example, such modeling studies have indicated that local emissions 90 (Shi et al., 2014), regional transport (Lue et al., 2010), and secondary aerosol generation (Huang 91 et al., 2014) were the main sources of air pollution, whereas local climate conditions such as high 92 humidity and low wind speed were the key environmental controls (Zhang et al., 2009).

93 The main objective of this study was two-fold: (i) to quantify the spatial patterns of air 94 pollution on multiple time scales (annual, daily, and hourly) using landscape metrics; and (ii) to 95 identify the potential source and sink regions and drivers of air pollution.

96

97 **2 Methods**

98 2.1 Data on PM_{2.5}

The annual PM_{2.5} concentrations in China were retrieved from the AOD products of MODIS 99 (Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer) and MISR (Multiangle Imaging 100 Spectroradiometer) (van Donkelaar et al., 2015). The relationship between total-column AOD 101 102 and surface dry PM_{2.5} concentrations required a conversion factor which depends on several parameters, including aerosol size, aerosol type, diurnal variation, relative humidity, and the 103 104 vertical structure of aerosol extinction (van Donkelaar et al., 2010; van Donkelaar et al., 2006). These parameters were obtained through simulations using the GEOS-Chem model (van 105 Donkelaar et al., 2010; van Donkelaar et al., 2006). A three-year running median was used to 106 reduce noise in the annual satellite-derived PM2.5 concentration from 1999 to 2011 (van 107 Donkelaar et al., 2015). 108

109

110 2.2 Air Quality Index

111 Data on Air Quality Index (AQI) from China's national air quality stations in 161 cities during 112 October 6-12 of 2014 were downloaded from Ministry of Environmental Protection of the 113 People's Republic of China (http://www.zhb.gov.cn/) (Fig. 1) and were interpolated spatially 114 using the ordinary Kriging method with ArcGIS software version 10.0. The AQI indicated the 115 potential health impacts (Table 1). The actual concentrations (C_p) of six air pollutants (SO₂, 116 NO₂, CO, O₃, PM₁₀, and PM_{2.5}) were used to calculate AQI (MEP, 2012b):

117
$$IAQI_{n} = (IAQI_{Hi} - IAQI_{Lo}) \times \frac{C_{p} - BP_{Lo}}{BP_{Hi} - BP_{Lo}} + IAQI_{Lo}$$
(1)

118
$$AQI = \max{\{IAQI, IAQI_2, IAQI_3, IAQI_4, IAQI_5, IAQI_6\}}$$
 (2)

where $IAQI_n$ (n=1,2,3,...6) is the individual air quality index for SO₂, NO₂, CO, O₃, PM₁₀, and PM_{2.5}, respectively, BP_{Lo} is the break-point concentration at the lower limit of the AQI categories, BP_{Hi} is the break-point concentration at the upper limit of the AQI categories, $IAQI_{Lo}$ is the index value at the lower limit of the AQI categories, and $IAQI_{Hi}$ is the index value at the upper limit of the AQI categories (Table 2). AQI is the maximum value of all $IAQI_n$.

124 [insert Fig. 1 here]

125 [insert Table 1 here]

126 [insert Table 2 here]

127

128 2.3 Quantifying spatial pattern and movement of air pollution

129 We analyzed the spatial patterns of air pollution on three time scales: the annual, daily, and

130 hourly scales. At the annual scale, we defined an area as "non-polluted" if the annual average

- 131 PM_{2.5} concentration over it was $<35 \,\mu$ g/m³, which was the first interim target of WHO (WHO,
- 132 2005) and also the air quality standard used in China (MEP, 2012a). Accordingly, an area with

annual average PM_{2.5} concentration of \geq 35 µg/m³ was considered "polluted". At the daily and

hourly scales, AQI<150 was chosen as the threshold value to classify non-polluted and polluted

135 areas (MEP, 2012b).

Landscape pattern metrics have long been used to characterize spatiotemporal dynamics 136 of various kinds of landscapes in ecological and geographical sciences (Buyantuyev et al., 2010; 137 Li et al., 2013a; Li et al., 2013b; Wu et al., 2011). Recently, landscape metrics also have been 138 successfully applied to investigate the relationship between urban patterns/forms and air 139 pollution (Bechle et al., 2011; Bereitschaft and Debbage, 2013; Borrego et al., 2006; Lv and Cao, 140 2011). In this study, we selected five class-level landscape metrics to quantify the spatial 141 142 distribution patterns of air pollutants because of their effectiveness for characterizing the spatial 143 extent, aggregation, and interspersion of landscape elements from previous studies of 144 urbanization impacts on environmental conditions, such as biodiversity, net primary productivity, 145 and urban heat islands (Buyantuyev and Wu, 2010; Buyantuyev et al., 2010; Li et al., 2013a; Li et al., 2013b; Wu, 2004; Wu et al., 2011; Wu et al., 2002). They are: Total Area (TA), 146 Largest Patch Index (LPI), Patch Density (PD), Landscape Shape Index (LPI), and Aggregation 147 Index (AI) (Table A.1). Total Area is simply the sum total of all air-polluted patches, where a 148 "patch" is a contiguous air-polluted area. Largest Patch Index is the area of the largest polluted 149 patch relative to the whole study area (i.e., China). Patch Density is the number of patches per 150 unit area, suggestive of the degree of fragmentation or interspersion of polluted areas. 151 Landscape Shape Index is a normalized perimeter/area ratio of patches, a measure of the shape 152 complexity of air-polluted patches. Aggregation Index (He et al., 2000) measures the degree of 153 aggregation or clumping of polluted patches and considers only the adjacencies between polluted 154 155 patches. All the selected metrics were computed with the FRAGSTATS software (v4.2) (McGarigal et al., 2012). 156

Two methods were used to determine the movement of air-polluted areas beyond pattern analysis. One was tracing the geometric center of the largest air pollution patch (AQI>200 or 159 150) in a specific air pollution event using the ARCGIS 10.0 software. The other was simulating the transport of air masses using a process-based HYSPLIT (Hybrid Single-Particle Lagrangian Integrated Trajectory) model (Rolph, 2016; Stein et al., 2015).

162

163 **3 Results**

164 *3.1 Spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on the annual scale*

From 1999 to 2011, annual PM_{2.5} concentrations in China generally increased in both spatial 165 extent and intensity (Fig. 2). High concentrations of PM_{2.5} occurred over a vast region of China, 166 ranging from southern Inner Mongolia to Guangdong latitudinally, and from the east coast to 167 central Sichuan longitudinally, plus the southern part of Xinjiang Province (Fig. 2). In 168 169 particular, the highest concentrations occurred in the North China Plain (Beijing, Tianjin, Hebei, 170 Shandong, Henan, northern Jiangsu, and northern Anhui) and the middle and lower reaches of 171 the Yangtze River Basin (Fig. 2). The air-polluted areas (i.e., places with annual average PM_{2.5} concentrations of higher 172 than $35\mu g/m^3$) increased rapidly from about 2 million km² in 1999 to about 2.8 million km² in 173 2006, and then began to decline slightly after 2006 (Fig. 3a). The total population living within 174 the air-polluted areas was about 975 million in 2010 (about 70% of China's population; 175 population data derived from LandScan 2010 dataset (Bright et al., 2011)). The largest 176 contiguous region of air pollution occurred over the North China Plain and the middle and lower 177 reaches of the Yangtze River Basin, accounting for 14% of China's total land area in 1999 and 22% 178 in 2011 (Fig. 3a). Landscape Shape Index exhibited a quite similar temporal pattern to that of 179 total air polluted areas (Fig. 3b). Patch Density of air polluted areas decreased from 1999 to 180 2006, and then increased rapidly from 2006 to 2011 (Fig. 3b). Aggregation Index increased 181 182 first, peaking in 2006, and then began to decline (Fig. 3c).

- 183 [insert Fig. 2 here]
- 184 [insert Fig. 3 here]
- 185

186 *3.2 Spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on the daily scale*

187 To understand the spatial patterns of air pollution on finer temporal scales, we also examined a

regional air pollution event (AQI>150) that emerged, expanded, and then dissipated in the North

China Plain during Oct. 6-12, 2014 (Fig. 4). Changes in the spatial pattern metrics indicated
some key attributes of the spatial dynamics of this event. Total Area, Largest Patch Index,
Landscape Shape Index, and Aggregation Index of air-polluted areas all increased from Oct. 7 to
Oct. 9, and then decreased from Oct. 9 to Oct. 12 (Fig. 5a to c). Patch Density of air polluted
areas increased initially from Oct. 7 to Oct. 8, and then decreased rapidly from Oct. 9 to Oct. 12
(Fig. 5b).

195 [insert Fig. 4 here]

196 [insert Fig. 5 here]

197

198 *3.3 Spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on the hourly scale*

At the hourly scale, more details were revealed about the spatiotemporal pattern of the regional air pollution event in the North China Plain during Oct. 6-12, 2014: the pollution occurred and expanded from 21:00 of Oct. 6 to 00:00 of Oct. 8 (Fig. 6a to k), sustained from 00:00 of Oct. 8 to 15:00 of Oct. 11, finally weakened and dissipated from 15:00 of Oct. 11 to 12:00 of Oct. 12 (Fig. 6l to s). During this period, Total Area, Largest Patch Index, Landscape Shape Index, and Aggregation Index of air-polluted areas generally peaked during nighttime and slightly decreased during daytime (Fig. 5d to f).

The geometric center of the largest air-polluted patch was at the junction of the Hebei, 206 Henan, and Shandong Province on Oct. 7, moved northward and sustained mostly in 207 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region during Oct. 7-11, and then moved southward and dissipated in 208 209 Shandong Province on Oct. 12 (Fig. 7). The trajectories under more rigid criteria (AQI>200 than 150) indicated that the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region was the center of severe pollution (Fig. 210 7). The simulated trajectories of air masses with HYSPLIT model were also shown that air 211 pollutants could move northward from Henan and Shandong Province to Beijing, Tianjin, and 212 Shijiazhuang during Oct. 7 and Oct. 8, 2014 (Fig. 8). Several locations of burning crop stalks 213 were identified from the daily reports of the Chinese Ministry of Environmental Protection, most 214 of which were adjacent to the trajectories of air masses (Fig. 8). 215

- 216 [insert Fig. 6 here]
- 217 [insert Fig. 7 here]
- 218 [insert Fig. 8 here]
- 219

220 4 Discussion

221 4.1 Quantifying spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on broad scales

The results of our analysis with landscape metrics clearly indicated that air-polluted areas in 222 223 China expanded rapidly during our study period (1999-2011), with the highest increase rate 224 occurring between 1999 and 2006 (Fig. 3a). The unprecedented scale of urbanization, rapid 225 economic growth, and increasing energy use took place on currently with the deterioration of air 226 pollution (Fritze, 2004; Wu et al., 2014). An increase in Aggregation Index and a decrease in Patch Density from 1999 to 2006 indicated that many scattered air-polluted areas merged into 227 fewer, larger and more clumped patches, hanging mainly over the North China Plain, the middle 228 and lower reaches of the Yangtze River Basin, the Pearl River Delta, and the Sichuan Basin. 229 These regions include Beijing, Tianjin, Zhengzhou, Shanghai, Guangzhou, Chengdu and a dozen 230 other densely populated megacities. 231

A decrease in Aggregation Index and an increase in Patch Density from 2006 to 2011 resulted from previously clumped air-polluted patches splitting into smaller pieces. The slight decreases in Total Area, Largest Patch Index, and Landscape Shape Index of air-polluted areas suggested a slowdown or even a halt of the deterioration of air pollution during this period. According to the Statistical Yearbook of China (http://www.stats.gov.cn/tjsj/ndsj/), the country's annual emissions of SO₂ and PM peaked in 2006 and 2005, respectively, and then started to decline. A main reason for this temporary air quality improvement might have been the

239 implementation of flue-gas desulfurization in electricity-generating plants required by the

- 240 Chinese government, leading to substantial reductions of SO₂ (a precursor of PM_{2.5}) emissions
- since 2006 (Li et al., 2010). In addition, the efficiency improvement in central heating systems
- in Chinese cities also reduced the urban household energy consumptions and PM_{2.5} emissions

243 (Guan et al., 2014).

244

245 4.2 Quantifying spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on fine scales

Using Largest Patch Index, we were able to identify that the largest contiguous air-polluted patch 246 with high PM_{2.5} concentration occurred in the North China Plain (Fig. 3a). To understand this 247 heavily polluted region in greater detail, we further analyzed the spatial dynamics of a regional 248 air pollution event on finer temporal scales. The five landscape metrics together captured the 249 250 entire process of the event: from emergence to expansion and dissipation. Total Area, Largest 251 Patch Index, Landscape Shape Index, and Aggregation Index all increased first, then peaked at 252 different times, and finally decreased, exhibiting a unimodal pattern. Patch Density was low at 253 both the beginning and the end of the severe air pollution event, and reached its highest value in between, thus exhibiting a bimodal pattern (Fig. 5b). 254

Compared to those at the daily scale, the changing patterns of Total Area, Largest Patch 255 Index, Landscape Shape Index, and Aggregation Index at the hourly scale peaked mostly during 256 nighttime and decreased slightly during daytime. This diurnal pattern can be explained largely 257 by micrometeorological changes induced by land-atmospheric interactions. At sunset, the 258 ground surface cools faster than the atmosphere, which often leads to the inversion of the normal 259 vertical temperature gradient at low altitudes in the lower atmosphere (a.k.a., temperature 260 inversion), thus hindering the dissipation of air pollution upward during nighttime (Pardyjak et 261 al., 2009; Pope and Wu, 2014a). While this emergence-coalescence-dissipation pattern of a 262 263 heavy air pollution event is can be readily perceived, quantifying it in space and time with landscape metrics improves the precision of our understanding and helps impact assessment and 264 265 policy-making with regard to air pollution.

266

267 4.3 Identifying source and sink areas of air pollution

By computing the geometric center and tracing the movement trajectory of air pollution, we were able to identify the potential source and sink areas for a severe air pollution event in China during October of 2014. Specifically, the air pollution center was formed in Henan Province,
western Shandong Province, and southern Hebei Province on Oct. 7, 2014 (Fig. 7), indicative of
this region as potential source area. During Oct. 8-11, 2014, the center of this heavy pollution
(AQI>200) moved to the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, and then it moved southward to eastern
Shandong Province, and dissipated by northwest wind finally, indicating that eastern Shandong
Province was a sink area for this particular event.

The North China Plain was a densely populated and highly urbanized region with the 276 277 highest frequency of haze events during the past several decades (Hu and Zhou, 2009; Wang et 278 al., 2012a). Our study suggests that burning of crop stalks in Hebei Province, Henan Province 279 and Shandong Province may be one of the potential leading factors, in addition to industrial and 280 motor vehicle emissions, for generating regional air pollution events. PM_{2.5} and other kinds of air pollutants from burning crop stalks maybe transported by southerly wind to the 281 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region (Fig. 8). PM_{2.5} is both a primary and secondary pollutant, which 282 can be emitted directly from vehicle exhaust, agricultural biomass burning, and industrial plants, 283 or formed from Secondary Organic Aerosols (SOA) and Secondary Inorganic Aerosols (SIA) 284 (Beijing Municipal Environmental Protection Bureau, 2014; Huang et al., 2014). These sources 285 have also been found important within the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region (Huang et al., 2014). 286 In addition, reduced wind speed and high relative humidity in this region are two key 287 environmental factors hindering pollution dissipation (Tao et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2012a). 288

289

290 *4.4 Robustness of the results and future directions*

Dense air quality monitoring stations in eastern China provide enough samples for reliable
interpolation of AQI values within this region. However, air quality monitoring stations in
western China are sparse, resulting in less accurate interpolated values of AQI. In particular,
the interpolated AQI values for the provinces of Xinjiang, Tibet, Qinghai, Gansu, and western
Sichuan in Figs. 4 and 6 have relatively high uncertainties. Nevertheless, the general
spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution revealed in our study are robust because numerous

studies have documented that severe air pollution events during the recent decades took placemainly in eastern China.

To improve the accuracy of air pollution assessment at the national level, however, more air quality monitoring stations are needed in western China, which should be designed based on local air pollutants and environmental conditions (Pope and Wu, 2014a, b). In addition, broad-scale analyses based on remote sensing data, such as our study here, should be integrated with fine-scale site measurements to better understand the processes and mechanisms of the source-sink dynamics of air pollution in China.

305

306 5 Conclusions

307 Using remote sensing data, field-based monitoring data, and landscape metrics, we were able to quantify the spatiotemporal patterns of air pollution on multiple scales in China. Our results 308 indicate that the total area, intensity, aggregation, and shape complexity of air-polluted areas 309 increased substantially across China during the study period. The most severely air-polluted 310 area was the North China Plain, within which the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region was the worst. 311 By quantifying the patch dynamics of air pollution and keeping track of the movement of 312 pollution centers, we were also able to identify source and sink areas. We estimated that the 313 total population affected by air pollution in China during 2010 was about 975 million, 314 accounting for almost 70% of China's population. Because long-term exposure to high 315 concentrations of air pollutants has serious detrimental impacts on human health, China needs to 316 317 take immediate and drastic measures to improve its air quality. Towards this end, the results of our study should be useful for designing effective policies to control air pollution on regional and 318 319 national levels by explicitly recognizing major source areas and movement trajectories.

320

321 Acknowledgments

This research was supported by the Chinese Ministry of Science and Technology through the National Basic Research Program of China (2014CB954303, 2014CB954301). We thank the

- 324 members of the Center for Human-Environment System Sustainability (CHESS) at Beijing
- 325 Normal University for their suggestions on this study. We acknowledged the NOAA Air
- 326 Resources Laboratory (ARL) for the provision of the HYSPLIT transport and dispersion model
- 327 and the READY website (http://www.ready.noaa.gov).
- 328

329 **References**

- Bechle, M.J., Millet, D.B., Marshall, J.D., 2011. Effects of Income and Urban Form on Urban
 NO2: Global Evidence from Satellites. Environ. Sci. Technol. 45, 4914-4919,
- doi:10.1021/es103866b.
- Bereitschaft, B., Debbage, K., 2013. Urban Form, Air Pollution, and CO2 Emissions in Large
 U.S. Metropolitan Areas. Prof. Geogr. 65, 612-635, doi:10.1080/00330124.2013.799991.
- Beijing Municipal Environmental Protection Bureau (BJEPB), 2014. Source analysis of PM2.5
 in Beijing, Beijing. Retrieved from -

337 http://www.bjepb.gov.cn/bjepb/323265/340674/396253/index.html.

- Blanchard, C.L., Tanenbaum, S., Motallebi, N., 2011. Spatial and Temporal Characterization of
 PM2.5 Mass Concentrations in California, 1980–2007. J. Air Waste Manage. Assoc. 61,
 339-351, doi:10.3155/1047-3289.61.3.339.
- Borrego, C., Martins, H., Tchepel, O., Salmim, L., Monteiro, A., Miranda, A.I., 2006. How urban
 structure can affect city sustainability from an air quality perspective. Environ. Modell.
 Softw. 21, 461-467, doi:10.1016/j.envsoft.2004.07.009.
- Bright, E.A., Coleman, P.R., Rose, A.N., Urban, M.L., 2011. LandScan 2010, 2010 ed. Oak
 Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, TN.
- Buyantuyev, A., Wu, J., 2010. Urban heat islands and landscape heterogeneity: linking
 spatiotemporal variations in surface temperatures to land-cover and socioeconomic patterns.
 Landscape Ecol. 25, 17-33, doi:10.1007/s10980-009-9402-4.
- Buyantuyev, A., Wu, J., Gries, C., 2010. Multiscale analysis of the urbanization pattern of the
 Phoenix metropolitan landscape of USA: Time, space and thematic resolution. Landscape
 Urban Plan. 94, 206-217, doi:10.1016/j.landurbplan.2009.10.005.
- Chen, Y., Ebenstein, A., Greenstone, M., Li, H., 2013. Evidence on the impact of sustained
 exposure to air pollution on life expectancy from China's Huai River policy. P. Natl. Acad.
 Sci. USA. 110, 12936-12941, doi:10.1073/pnas.1300018110.
- Cheng, Z., Wang, S., Jiang, J., Fu, Q., Chen, C., Xu, B., Yu, J., Fu, X., Hao, J., 2013. Long-term
 trend of haze pollution and impact of particulate matter in the Yangtze River Delta, China.
 Environ. Pollut. 182, 101-110, doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2013.06.043.
- Chinese Meteorological Administration (CMA), 2013. Revised Standard of Haze Warning
 Singles (on trial). China Meteorological News Press, Beijing.
- Cox, L.A., 2013. Caveats for Causal Interpretations of Linear Regression Coefficients for Fine
 Particulate (PM2.5) Air Pollution Health Effects. Risk Anal. 33, 2111-2125,

- doi:10.1111/risa.12084.
- Cuchiara, G.C., Li, X., Carvalho, J., Rappenglück, B., 2014. Intercomparison of planetary
 boundary layer parameterization and its impacts on surface ozone concentration in the
 WRF/Chem model for a case study in Houston/Texas. Atmos. Environ. 96, 175-185,
- doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.07.013.
- Engel-Cox, J.A., Holloman, C.H., Coutant, B.W., Hoff, R.M., 2004. Qualitative and quantitative
 evaluation of MODIS satellite sensor data for regional and urban scale air quality. Atmos.
 Environ. 38, 2495-2509, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2004.01.039.
- Folinsbee, L.J., 1993. Human health effects of air pollution. Environ. Health. Persp. 100, 45-56,
 doi:10.1289/ehp.9310045.
- Fritze, 2004. Urbanization, Energy, and Air Pollution in China, Urbanization, Energy, and Air
 Pollution in China. The national academies press, Washinton, D. C., p. 1.
- Green, M., Kondragunta, S., Ciren, P., Xu, C., 2009. Comparison of GOES and MODIS Aerosol
 Optical Depth (AOD) to Aerosol Robotic Network (AERONET) AOD and IMPROVE
- PM2.5 Mass at Bondville, Illinois. J. Air Waste Manage. Assoc. 59, 1082-1091,
 doi:10.3155/1047-3289.59.9.1082.
- Guan, D., Su, X., Zhang, Q., Peters, P.G., Liu, Z., Lei, Y., He, K., 2014. The socioeconomic
 drivers of China's primary PM 2.5 emissions. Environ. Res. Lett. 9, 024010, doi:
 10.1088/1748-9326/9/2/024010.
- He, H., DeZonia, B., Mladenoff, D., 2000. An aggregation index (AI) to quantify spatial patterns
 of landscapes. Landscape Ecol. 15, 591-601, doi:10.1023/a:1008102521322.
- Hu, Y., Zhou, Z., 2009. Climatic characteristics of haze in China. Meteorological Monthly (in
 Chinese) 35, 73-78.
- Huang, G., 2015. PM2.5 opened a door to public participation addressing environmental
 challenges in China. Environ. Pollut. 197, 313-315, doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2014.12.001.
- Huang, R., Zhang, Y., Bozzetti, C., Ho, K., Cao, J., Han, Y., Daellenbach, K.R., Slowik, J.G.,
 Platt, S.M., Canonaco, F., Zotter, P., Wolf, R., Pieber, S.M., Bruns, E.A., Crippa, M.,
- 389 Ciarelli, G., Piazzalunga, A., Schwikowski, M., Abbaszade, G., Schnelle-Kreis, J.,
- Zimmermann, R., An, Z., Szidat, S., Baltensperger, U., Haddad, I.E., Prevot, A.S.H., 2014.
- High secondary aerosol contribution to particulate pollution during haze events in China.
- 392 Nature 514, 218-222, doi:10.1038/nature13774.
- Kampa, M., Castanas, E., 2008. Human health effects of air pollution. Environ. Pollut. 151,
 362-367, doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2007.06.012.
- Lave, L.B., Seskin, E.P., 1970. Air Pollution and Human Health. Science 169, 723-733.
- Lee, H.J., Liu, Y., Coull, B.A., Schwartz, J., Koutrakis, P., 2011. A novel calibration approach of MODIS AOD data to predict PM2.5 concentrations. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 11, 7991-8002,
- doi:10.5194/acp-11-7991-2011.
- Lelieveld, J., Evans, J.S., Fnais, M., Giannadaki, D., Pozzer, A., 2015. The contribution of
 outdoor air pollution sources to premature mortality on a global scale. Nature 525, 367-371,
 doi:10.1038/nature15371.
- Li, C., Li, J., Wu, J., 2013a. Quantifying the speed, growth modes, and landscape pattern changes

- of urbanization: a hierarchical patch dynamics approach. Landscape Ecol. 28, 1875-1888,
 doi:10.1007/s10980-013-9933-6.
- Li, C., Zhang, Q., Krotkov, N.A., Streets, D.G., He, K., Tsay, S.C., Gleason, J.F., 2010. Recent
 large reduction in sulfur dioxide emissions from Chinese power plants observed by the
 Ozone Monitoring Instrument. Geogr. Res. Lett. 37, 292-305, doi:10.1029/2010gl042594.
- Li, J., Li, C., Zhu, F., Song, C., Wu, J., 2013b. Spatiotemporal pattern of urbanization in
 Shanghai, China between 1989 and 2005. Landscape Ecol. 28, 1545-1565,
 doi:10.1007/s10980-013-9901-1.
- Liu, Z., He, C., Zhou, Y., Wu, J., 2014. How much of the world's land has been urbanized, really?
 A hierarchical framework for avoiding confusion. Landscape Ecol. 29, 763-771,
 doi:10.1007/s10980-014-0034-y.
- Lue, Y., Liu, L.Y., Hu, X., Wang, L., Guo, L.L., Gao, S.Y., Zhang, X.X., Tang, Y., Qu, Z.Q., Cao,
 H.W., Jia, Z.J., Xu, H.Y., Yang, Y.Y., 2010. Characteristics and provenance of dustfall
 during an unusual floating dust event. Atmos. Environ. 44, 3477-3484,
- 417 doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.06.027.
- Lv, B., Cao, N., 2011. Environmental Performance Evaluation of Chinese Urban Form. Urban
 Studies (in Chinese) 18, 38-47.
- Ma, Q., Wu, J., He, C., 2016a. A hierarchical analysis of the relationship between urban
 impervious surfaces and land surface temperatures: spatial scale dependence, temporal
 variations, and bioclimatic modulation. Landscape Ecol. 31, 1139-1153,
 doi:10.1007/s10080.016.0356.z
- 423 doi:10.1007/s10980-016-0356-z.
- Ma, Z., Hu, X., Sayer, A.M., Levy, R., Zhang, Q., Xue, Y., Tong, S., Bi, J., Huang, L., Liu, Y.,
 2016b. Satellite-based spatiotemporal trends in PM2.5 concentrations: China, 2004–2013.
 Environ. Health. Persp. 124, 184–192, doi:10.1289/ehp.1409481.
- 427 Martins, H., 2012. Urban compaction or dispersion? An air quality modelling study. Atmos.
 428 Environ. 54, 60-72, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.02.075.
- McGarigal, K., Cushman, S.A., Ene, E., 2012. FRAGSTATS v4: Spatial Pattern Analysis
 Program for Categorical and Continuous Maps. Computer software program produced by
 the authors at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.
- 432 Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China (MEP), 2012a. Ambient
 433 air quality standards. China Environmental Science Press, Beijing.
- 434 Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China (MEP), 2012b.
- 435 Technical Regulation on Ambient Air Quality Index (on trial), HJ 633-2012. China
 436 Environmental Science Press, Beijing.
- 437 Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China (MEP), 2013. Analysis
 438 Report on the State of the Environment in China, 2013, Beijing.
- Pant, P., Guttikunda, S.K., Peltier, R.E., 2016. Exposure to particulate matter in India: A
 synthesis of findings and future directions. Environ. Res. 147, 480-496,
- 441 doi:10.1016/j.envres.2016.03.011.
- Phung, D., Hien, T.T., Linh, H.N., Luong, L.M.T., Morawska, L., Chu, C., Binh, N.D., Thai, P.K.,
 2016. Air pollution and risk of respiratory and cardiovascular hospitalizations in the most

- populous city in Vietnam. Sci. Total Environ. 557-558, 322-330, 444
- doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.070. 445
- Pope, C.A., Dockery, D.W., 2006. Health effects of fine particulate air pollution: lines that 446 connect. J. Air Waste Manage. Assoc. 56, 709-742, doi:10.1080/10473289.2006.10464545 447
- Pope, R., Wu, J., 2014a. Characterizing air pollution patterns on multiple time scales in urban 448 areas: a landscape ecological approach. Urban Ecosyst. 17, 855-874, 449 450

doi:10.1007/s11252-014-0357-0.

- Pope, R., Wu, J., 2014b. A multi-objective assessment of an air quality monitoring network using 451 environmental, economic, and social indicators and GIS-based models. J. Air Waste Manage. 452 Assoc. 64, 721-737, doi:10.1080/10962247.2014.888378. 453
- Rolph, G.D., 2016. Real-time Environmental Applications and Display sYstem (READY) 454 Website (http://www.ready.noaa.gov). NOAA Air Resources Laboratory, College Park, MD. 455
- Schwartz, J., Dockery, D.W., Neas, L.M., 1996. Is daily mortality associated specifically with 456 457 fine particles? J. Air Waste Manage. Assoc. 46, 927-939,
- 458 doi:10.1080/10473289.1996.10467528.
- Shao, M., Tang, X., Zhang, Y., Li, W., 2006. City clusters in China: air and surface water 459 460 pollution. Front. Ecol. Environ. 4, 353-361,
- doi:10.1890/1540-9295(2006)004[0353:ccicaa]2.0.co;2. 461
- Shi, T., Liu, Y., Zhang, L., Hao, L., Gao, Z., 2014. Burning in agricultural landscapes: an 462 emerging natural and human issue in China. Landscape Ecol. 29, 1785-1798, 463 doi:10.1007/s10980-014-0060-9. 464
- Stein, A.F., Draxler, R.R., Rolph, G.D., Stunder, B.J.B., Cohen, M.D., Ngan, F., 2015. NOAA's 465 HYSPLIT Atmospheric Transport and Dispersion Modeling System. B. AM. Meteorol. Soc. 466 96, 2059-2077, doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-14-00110.1. 467
- Tao, M., Chen, L., Su, L., Tao, J., 2012. Satellite observation of regional haze pollution over the 468 North China Plain. J. Geogr. Sci. Atmo. 117, D12203, doi:10.1029/2012jd017915. 469
- Tao, M., Chen, L., Wang, Z., Ma, P., Tao, J., Jia, S., 2014. A study of urban pollution and haze 470 clouds over northern China during the dusty season based on satellite and surface 471 observations. Atmos. Environ. 82, 183-192, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.10.010. 472
- Tsangari, H., Paschalidou, A.K., Kassomenos, A.P., Vardoulakis, S., Heaviside, C., Georgiou, 473
- K.E., Yamasaki, E.N., 2016. Extreme weather and air pollution effects on cardiovascular 474 and respiratory hospital admissions in Cyprus. Sci. Total Environ. 542, Part A, 247-253, 475 doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.10.106. 476
- 477 van Donkelaar, A., Martin, R.V., Brauer, M., Boys, B.L., 2015. Use of Satellite Observations for 478 Long-Term Exposure Assessment of Global Concentrations of Fine Particulate Matter.
- Environ. Health. Persp. 123, 135-143, doi:10.1289/ehp.1408646. 479
- van Donkelaar, A., Martin, R.V., Brauer, M., Kahn, R., Levy, R., Verduzco, C., Villeneuve, P.J., 480
- 2010. Global estimates of ambient fine particulate matter concentrations from 481
- satellite-based aerosol optical depth: development and application. Environ. Health. Persp. 482 118, 847-855, doi:10.1289/ehp.090162. 483
- van Donkelaar, A., Martin, R.V., Park, R.J., 2006. Estimating ground-level PM2.5 using aerosol 484

- optical depth determined from satellite remote sensing. J. Geogr. Sci. Atmo. 111, D21201,
 doi:10.1029/2005jd006996.
- Wang, H., Tan, S., Wang, Y., Jiang, C., Shi, G., Zhang, M., Che, H., 2014. A multisource
 observation study of the severe prolonged regional haze episode over eastern China in
 January 2013. Atmos. Environ. 89, 807-815, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.03.004.
- Wang, J., Christopher, S.A., 2003. Intercomparison between satellite-derived aerosol optical
 thickness and PM2.5 mass: Implications for air quality studies. Geogr. Res. Lett. 30, 2095,
 doi:10.1029/2003gl018174.
- Wang, L., Xu, J., Yang, J., Zhao, X., Wei, W., Cheng, D., Pan, X., Su, J., 2012a. Understanding
 haze pollution over the southern Hebei area of China using the CMAQ model. Atmos.
 Environ. 56, 69-79, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.04.013.
- Wang, T., Jiang, F., Deng, J., Shen, Y., Fu, Q., Wang, Q., Fu, Y., Xu, J., Zhang, D., 2012b. Urban
 air quality and regional haze weather forecast for Yangtze River Delta region. Atmos.
 Environ. 58, 70-83, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.01.014.
- Wang, X., Liang, X., Jiang, W., Tao, Z., Wang, J.X.L., Liu, H., Han, Z., Liu, S., Zhang, Y., Grell,
 G.A., Peckham, S.E., 2010a. WRF-Chem simulation of East Asian air quality: Sensitivity to
 temporal and vertical emissions distributions. Atmos. Environ. 44, 660-669,
 doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.11.011.
- Wang, Z., Chen, L., Tao, J., Zhang, Y., Su, L., 2010b. Satellite-based estimation of regional
 particulate matter (PM) in Beijing using vertical-and-RH correcting method. Remote Sens.
 Environ. 114, 50-63, doi:10.1016/j.rse.2009.08.009.
- World Health Organization (WHO), 2005. Air Quality Guidelines: Global Update 2005. World
 Health Organization.
- Wu, J., 1999. Hierarchy and scaling : Extrapolating information along a scaling ladder. Can. J.
 Remote Sens. 25, 367-380, doi:10.1080/07038992.1999.10874736
- 510 Wu, J., 2004. Effects of changing scale on landscape pattern analysis: scaling relations.
 511 Landscape Ecol. 19, 125-138, doi:10.1023/B:LAND.0000021711.40074.ae.
- Wu, J., Jenerette, G.D., Buyantuyev, A., Redman, C.L., 2011. Quantifying spatiotemporal
 patterns of urbanization: The case of the two fastest growing metropolitan regions in the
 United States. Ecol. Complex. 8, 1-8, doi:10.1016/j.ecocom.2010.03.002.
- Wu, J., Shen, W., Sun, W., Tueller, P.T., 2002. Empirical patterns of the effects of changing scale
 on landscape metrics. Landscape Ecol. 17, 761-782, doi:10.1023/a:1022995922992.
- Wu, J., Xiang, W., Zhao, J., 2014. Urban ecology in China: Historical developments and future
 directions. Landscape Urban Plan. 125, 222-233, doi:10.1016/j.landurbplan.2014.02.010.
- Xu, B., Luo, L., Lin, B., 2016. A dynamic analysis of air pollution emissions in China: Evidence
 from nonparametric additive regression models. Ecol. Indic. 63, 346-358,
- 521 doi:10.1016/j.ecolind.2015.11.012.
- Yahya, K., Zhang, Y., Vukovich, J.M., 2014. Real-time air quality forecasting over the
 southeastern United States using WRF/Chem-MADRID: Multiple-year assessment and
- sensitivity studies. Atmos. Environ. 92, 318-338, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.04.024.
- 525 Yuan, Q., Yang, L., Dong, C., Yan, C., Meng, C., Sui, X., Wang, W., 2014. Temporal variations,

526	acidity, and transport patterns of PM2.5 ionic components at a background site in the
527	Yellow River Delta, China. Air Qual. Atmos. Health. 7, 143-153,
528	doi:10.1007/s11869-014-0236-0.
529	Zhang, X.Y., Wang, Y.Q., Lin, W.L., Zhang, Y.M., Zhang, X.C., Zhao, P., Yang, Y.Q., Wang, J.Z.,
530	Hou, Q., Che, H.Z., Guo, J.P., Li, Y., Gong, S., Zhang, X.L., 2009. Changes of atmospheric
531	composition and optical properties over Beijing—2008 Olympic Monitoring Campaign. B.
532	AM. Meteorol. Soc. 90, 1633-1651, doi:10.1175/2009bams2804.1.
533	Zhang, X.X., Shi, P.J., Liu, L.Y., Tang, Y., Cao, H.W., Zhang, X.N., Hu, X., Guo, L.L., Lue, Y.L.,
534	Qu, Z.Q., Jia, Z.J., Yang, Y.Y., 2010. Ambient TSP concentration and dustfall in major cities
535	of China: Spatial distribution and temporal variability. Atmos. Environ. 44, 1641-1648,
536	doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.01.035.
537	
538	
539	
540	
541	
542	
543	
544	
545	
546	
547	
548	
549	
550	
551	
552	
553	
554	
555	
550	
557	
550	
559	
561	
562	
563	
564	
565	
566	

567 Tables:

Table 1. Air Quality Index categories, air pollution levels, and health implications (Ministry of
Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China, 2012b).

AQI	Air pollution level	Health implications
0 - 50	Excellent	No harm to human health
51 -100	Good	Hypersensitive individuals should limit the outdoor activities
101 - 150	Light Pollution	Children, elder and people with breathing or heart problems should reduce outdoor activities
151 - 200	Moderate Pollution	Children, elder and people with breathing or heart problems should avoid outdoor exercise
201 - 300	Heavy Pollution	Children, elder and people with breathing or heart problems should stop outdoor exercise
> 300	Severe Pollution	Children, elder and people with breathing or heart problems should stay indoors

IAQI	SO_2	NO ₂	СО	O ₃	PM_{10}	PM _{2.5}
(No unit)	$(\mu g/m^3)$	$(\mu g/m^3)$	(mg/m^3)	(mg/m^3)	$(\mu g/m^3)$	$(\mu g/m^3)$
0	0	0	0	0	0	0
50	50	40	2	100	50	35
100	150	80	4	160	150	75
150	475	180	14	215	250	115
200	800	280	24	265	350	150
300	1600	565	36	800	420	250
400	2100	750	48		500	350
500	2620	940	60		600	500

Table 2. Air quality standards for specific air pollutants (Ministry of Environmental Protection of
the People's Republic of China, 2012b).

596 Figure captions

550	rigure captions
597	Fig.1 Spatial distribution of the 161 Chinese cities having national air quality stations in 2014.
598	
599	Fig.2 Spatial patterns of annual PM _{2.5} concentrations ($\mu g/m^3$) in China from 1999 to 2011. We
600	created these maps with ARCGIS 10.0 software. Original $PM_{2.5}$ concentration data were from
601	van Donkelaar et al. 2015 and spatial resolution was 0.1 degrees).
602	
603	Fig.3 Spatiotemporal patterns of air-polluted areas (annual average PM _{2.5}
604	concentration >35 μ g/m ³) in China as described by five class-level pattern metrics.
605	
606	Fig. 4 Temporal changes in the spatial pattern of daily AQI in China during Oct. 6-12, 2014,
607	highlighting the emergence-coalescence-dissipation process of a severe air pollution event
608	(AQI>150) that occurred in the North China Plain from Oct. 7 to Oct. 11, 2014.
609	
610	Fig. 5 Spatiotemporal patterns of air-polluted areas in China during Oct. 7-12, 2014 as described
611	by five class-level pattern metrics. Daily patterns were shown in (a)-(c), corresponding to the
612	maps in Fig. 4, and hourly patterns were illustrated in (d)-(f), corresponding to the maps in Fig.
613	6.
614	
615	Fig. 6 Temporal changes in the spatial pattern of hourly AQI in China, showing that the severe
616	air pollution event occurred and expanded in the North China Plain between 21:00 of Oct. 6 and
617	00:00 of Oct. 8 (a-k), and then weakened and dissipated between 15:00 of Oct. 11 and 12:00 of
618	Oct. 12, 2014 (l-s).
619	
620	Fig. 7 The geometric center and trajectory of the largest air pollution patch (hourly AQI >150 as
621	thinner dashed lines and AQI>200 as thicker dashed lines) in the North China Plain between
622	21:00 of Oct. 6 and 12:00 of Oct. 12, 2014. The trajectory in (a) was drawn per 6 hours, and
623	the one in (b) was per 12 hours. The geometric center and trajectory were calculated and drawn
624	with ARCGIS 10.0 software.
625	
626	Fig. 8 Spatial patterns of PM _{2.5} concentrations and 60-hour backward trajectories of air masses
627	moving through Beijing, Tianjin, Shijiazhuang, Taiyuan, and Xi'an from 00:00 of Oct. 6 to 12:00
628	of Oct. 8, 2014. Trajectories of air masses at the altitudes of 500m (a) and 1000m (b) were
629	shown. Crosses denoted the sites of burning crop stalks which were detected by satellite (data
630	from http://www.zhb.gov.cn/). The trajectories of air masses were simulated by HYSPLIT
631	model (Rolph, 2016; Stein et al., 2015).
632	













Calendar Year (AD)



Year AD (or Calendar Yr. CE)





	0	400	500	600	700	800	900	1000	1100	1200	1300
--	---	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	------	------	------	------

Year AD (or Calendar Yr. CE)

1 Table 1: Summary of the six proxies with a list of possible controlling factors and their climatic significance, when known or

2 available. Indicated with an asterisk (*) are the immediate controls for δ^{18} O and δ^{13} C for Stalagmite MA3.

PROXIES	DEFINITION/CONTROLLING FACTORS	REFERENCES
δ ¹⁸ Ο	 δ¹⁸O=[(¹⁸O/¹⁶O)_{sample} (¹⁸O/¹⁶O)_{standard})]/ (¹⁸O/¹⁶O)_{standard}) Variations in δ¹⁸O of moisture source supplying drip water to the cave. This is mainly significant to decipher glacial (greater δ¹⁸O) and interglacial intervals (smaller δ¹⁸O). Variations in atmospheric temperature: although δ¹⁸O values are typically lower in the winter and higher in the summer in several regions, the opposite has been observed in Madagascar (greater δ¹⁸O during winter, smaller δ¹⁸O during summers, Fig. 6) Distance of transport from the vapor source (continental effect): typically water δ¹⁸O values decrease with distance from the ocean, but it could be influenced by high δ¹⁸O recycled continental moisture back to the atmosphere from evaporation of soil water, lakes, and rivers. Altitude effect: smaller δ¹⁸O with increasing elevation. * Variations in the δ¹⁸O_w of the dripwater which reflect the δ¹⁸O of atmospheric precipitation (amount effect). It varies depending on seasonality of rainfall (e.g in tropical warm summers, δ¹⁸O is smaller with increased rainfall amount; whereas in mid-latitude colder regions, mean winter rainfall is often more depleted in ¹⁸O) Variations in cave temperature: greater δ¹⁸O with colder temperature, and smaller δ¹⁸O with warmer temperature Magnitude of kinetic fractionation of dripwater or water films precipitating carbonate Evaporation inside and outside the cave: greater δ¹⁸O with increased evaporation. 	Burns et al., 2002 Clark and Fritz, 1997 Cuthbert et al., 2014 Dansgaard, 1964 Deininger et al., 2012 Fairchild and Treble, 2009 Hoefs, 2009 Koster et al., 1993 Lachniet, 2009; McDermott, 2004 Quade, 2004 Railsback, 2010 Rozanski et al., 1993 Wong and Breeker, 2015
δ ¹³ C	 δ¹³C =[(¹³C/¹²C)_{sample}-(¹³C/¹²C)_{standard})]/ (¹³C/¹²C)_{standard} Variations of δ¹³C of CO₂ in the atmosphere Smaller δ¹³C due to the Suess effect Smaller δ¹³C during glacial and greater δ¹³C during interglacial * Photosynthetic pathway: smaller δ¹³C for C₃ plants and greater δ¹³C for C₄ plants. * Extent of vegetation, soil biomass productivity (as a function of meteoric precipitation): smaller δ¹³C with more vegetation cover * Rate of passage of water through soil to limestone Closed system: greater δ¹³C with faster passage if water and thus lesser input of soil CO₂ Open system: lesser δ¹³C with slower passage of water and thus greater input of soil CO₂ δ¹³C of limestone * Extent of degassing of CO₂ and Prior Calcite Precipitation (or more generally Prior Carbonate Precipitation). The relationship between degassing and prior calcite precipitation results in systematic rises in δ¹³C. Cave ventilation which could accelerate the rate of degassing and PCP, leading to an increase in δ¹³C. 	Baldini et al., 2005 Brook et al., 1999, 20010 Brook et al., 2006 Burns et al., 2016 Cross et al., 2015 Cruz et al., 2015 Denniston et al., 2013 Dreybrodt and Scholz, 2011 Fairchild and McMillan, 2007 Frisia et al., 2011 Genty et al., 2001; 2003; 2006 Hesterberg and Siegenthaler, 1991 Johnson et al., 2006 Lauritzen and Lundberg, 1999 Meyer et al., 2014 Mickler et al., 2014 Mickler et al., 2010 Quade, 2004 Railsback, 2010 Suess, 1955 Verburg, 2007 Wong and Breecker, 2015
Layer bounding surfaces	Surfaces between two spelean layers that delimit series of layers and represent periods of non-deposition Type E: surfaces below which spelean layers are truncated, microscopic examination shows signs of dissolution • Type E surfaces represent exceptionally wet conditions and faster drip rate. Type L: surfaces below which layers thin upward and/or have lesser lateral extent upward (the layer-specific width decreases) • Type L surfaces represent exceptionally dry conditions and slower drip rate.	Railsback et al. 2011, 2013 Sletten et al., 2013 Voarintsoa et al., 2016

Layer-specific width	 The width across the stalagmite between the points at which the layer is tangent to a line inclined at specific angle (here it is 10°) relative to the growth axis of the stalagmite Smaller values represent drier conditions and reduced drip rate. Greater values represent wetter conditions and increased drip rate. 	Dreydbrodt (1999) Railsback et al 2014 Sletten et al 2013 Yadava et al., 2004
Macroholes	 Axial holes: Syngenetic holes aligned along the stalagmite axis and maintain open contact with the cave atmosphere during stalagmite formation Local variation in the rate of calcite precipitation: increased deposition rate as drip water loses CO₂ to the cave atmosphere (this degassing process start where the falling drop first meets the stalagmite surface): could indicate wetter conditions, particularly when layers dip toward the growth axis of the stalagmite Off axis holes: elongated, ellipsoidal, post-depositional holes parallel to the growth axis of the spelean layers. They often crosscut growth layers after an internal erosion of the previously formed stalagmite no known significant climatic meaning, but could suggest wetter conditions 	Shtober-Zisu et al., 2012 Shtober-Zisu et al., 2014
Mineralogy	 There are several spelean minerals but the most common ones are calcite and aragonite. Factors directly favoring the formation of aragonite, rather than calcite, under cave conditions are: high temperature, drip water composition in trace elements (high concentration of Mg, Sr, Pb), which could reflect the composition of the bedrock drier conditions extensive evaporation seasonal dryness prior carbonate precipitation 	Bischoff and Fyfe, 1968 Bischoff, 1968 Cabrol and Coudray, 1982 Caddeo et al., 2011 Fischbeck, 1976 Frisia et al., 2002 González and Lohmann, 1988 Hill and Forti, 1997 McMillan, 2005 Moore, 1956 Murray, 1954 Pobeguin, 1965 Railsback et al. 1994 Riechelman et al., 2014 Siegel, 1965 Sletten et al., 2013 Thrailkill, 1971