- 1 Historical fluctuations and recent observations of Northern Anchovy *Engraulis mordax* in the Salish Sea
- 2
- 3 William D. P. Duguid^{a*}, Jennifer L. Boldt^b, Lia Chalifour^c, Correigh M. Greene^d, Moira Galbraith^e,
- 4 Douglas Hay^f, Dayv Lowry^g, Skip McKinnell^h, Chrys Nevilleⁱ, Jessica Qualley^j, Todd Sandell^k, Matthew
- 5 Thompson¹, Marc Trudel^m, Kelly Youngⁿ, and Francis Juanes^o
- 6

7 ***Corresponding Author**

- 8
- ⁹ ^aDepartment of Biology, University of Victoria, PO Box 1700, Station CSC, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8W
- 10 2Y2, E-mail: willduguid@hotmail.com
- ¹¹ ^bFisheries and Oceans Canada, Pacific Biological Station, 3190 Hammond Bay Rd, Nanaimo, BC,
- 12 Canada, V9T 6N7, E-mail: Jennifer.Boldt@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- 13 ^cDepartment of Biology, University of Victoria, PO Box 1700, Station CSC, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8W
- 14 2Y2, E-mail: lia.chalifour@gmail.com
- ¹⁵ ^dNational Marine Fisheries Service, Northwest Fisheries Science Center, 2725 Montlake Blvd. East,
- 16 Seattle, WA, USA, 98112, E-mail: correigh.greene@noaa.gov
- ¹⁷ ^eFisheries and Oceans Canada, 9860 W. Saanich Rd., Sidney, BC, Canada, V8L 4B2, E-mail:
- 18 Moira.Galbraith@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- 19 ^fFisheries and Oceans Canada, Emeritus, Pacific Biological Station, 3190 Hammond Bay Rd, Nanaimo,
- 20 BC, Canada, V9T 6N7, E-mail: hay.doug@shaw.ca
- ^gWashington Department of Fish and Wildlife, 1111 Washington St SE, 6th Floor, Olympia, WA, USA
- 22 98504-3150, E-mail: Dayv.Lowry@dfw.wa.gov
- 23 ^hSalmoforsk International Environmental Consulting, 2280 Brighton Ave, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8S
- 24 2G2, E-mail: mckinnell@shaw.ca
- ²⁵ ⁱFisheries and Oceans Canada, Pacific Biological Station, 3190 Hammond Bay Rd, Nanaimo, BC,
- 26 Canada, V9T 6N7, E-mail: Chrys.Neville@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- ^jDepartment of Biology, University of Victoria, PO Box 1700, Station CSC, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8W
- 28 2Y2, E-mail: jqualley@uvic.ca
- 29 ^kWashington Department of Fish and Wildlife, 16018 Mill Creek Boulevard, Mill Creek, WA, USA
- 30 98012-1541, E-mail: Todd.Sandell@dfw.wa.gov
- 31 ¹Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Pacific Biological Station, 3190 Hammond Bay Rd, Nanaimo, BC,
- 32 Canada, V9T 6N7, E-mail: Matthew.Thompson@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- ^mFisheries and Oceans Canada, St. Andrews Biological Station, 531 Brandy Cove Rd., St. Andrews, New
 Brunswick, Canada, E5B 2L9; and,
- 35 Department of Biology, University of Victoria, PO Box 1700, Station CSC, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8W
- 36 2Y2, E-mail: Marc.Trudel@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- ⁿFisheries and Oceans Canada, 9860 W. Saanich Rd., Sidney, BC, Canada, V8L 4B2, E-mail:
- 38 Kelly.Young@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
- ³⁹ ^oDepartment of Biology, University of Victoria, PO Box 1700, Station CSC, Victoria, BC, Canada, V8W
- 40 2Y2, E-mail: juanes@uvic.ca

4	1

ABSTRACT

Many small pelagic fish species exhibit dramatic fluctuations in abundance accompanied by range expansions during periods of favorable environmental conditions. The location and extent of suitable habitats also shift in response to both short term variability and long term trends in climate. Near the margins of a contemporary range, trends in abundance may reflect a continuation of historical variability but may also foreshadow future changes in distribution. The Salish Sea (all inland marine waters of Washington State and British Columbia; made up of the Strait of Georgia, Strait of Juan de Fuca, and Puget Sound) is a highly productive estuarine system at the northern end of the distribution of Northern Anchovy (Engraulis mordax). An apparent recent (2014–2016) increase in Northern Anchovy abundance has generated interest in the dynamics of this species in the Salish Sea. We compiled recent and historical data to understand spatiotemporal patterns of distribution and fluctuations in abundance over the last century. Spatially-consistent occurrence of eggs, larvae, and juveniles, and year-round presence of multiple age classes, confirm that successful spawning and recruitment of Northern Anchovy occurs within the Salish Sea. Most periods of elevated Northern Anchovy abundance in the last century have corresponded to, or lagged, periods of elevated ocean temperature. While a 2005 peak in abundance within the Salish Sea also corresponded to higher abundance of Northern Anchovy in adjacent regions of the coastal Pacific Ocean, it seems unlikely that Salish Sea abundance is controlled primarily by advection or migration from external populations. Persistence of elevated ocean temperatures like those observed from 2014 to 2016 could lead to consistently high abundance of Northern Anchovy within the Salish Sea, with implications for trophic relationships and ecosystem function. Key Words: forage fish; temperature effects; fishery sciences, climate

75 1. Introduction

76 Small pelagic fish populations are often characterized by dramatic changes in abundance through 77 time. At global and ocean basin scales, synchronous fluctuations of geographically distant populations 78 may ultimately be linked to climatic regime shifts (Chavez et al., 2003; Tourre et al., 2007). Density 79 dependence and interspecific competition may also interact with climate to drive changes in population 80 productivity and size (Schwartzlose et al., 1999; Lindegren et al., 2013). Changes in abundance of small 81 pelagic fish at the local scale may or may not be related to global scale causes depending on the regional 82 intensity of resulting effects. When regional biotic and abiotic conditions are favorable, a stock may 83 expand well beyond core production areas into habitat where it otherwise has been contemporarily absent 84 (MacCall, 1990), resulting in patterns of appearance and disappearance that have little to do with local 85 conditions. During periods of low abundance, remnant populations may contract into easily-observed 86 nearshore habitats within their core range, giving a false impression of abundance to fishers and the 87 public (MacCall et al., 2016; Davidson et al., 2017). Superimposed on such periodic fluctuations are long-88 term trends in climate that may be shifting the geographic limits of suitable ranges, allowing expansion 89 into new habitats (Beare et al., 2004; Sabatés et al., 2006). These shifts in distribution may have major 90 ecosystem-level consequences. Due to their abundance and trophic position, small pelagic fish play a 91 critical role in the flow of energy from primary producers and primary consumers to higher trophic levels 92 (Cury et al., 2000; Bakun, 2006). To understand marine ecosystems, it is therefore important to determine 93 if changes in abundance of small pelagic fish reflect intrinsic variability in food web dynamics or 94 foreshadow future ecosystem trajectories. 95 Northern Anchovy (Engraulis mordax; henceforward 'anchovy') occur off the West Coast of

North America from Mexico to British Columbia. They support fisheries which can periodically be very 96 97 valuable, and are an important prey species for marine birds and mammals (Velarde et al., 2015; 98 McClatchie et al., 2016) and commercially important fish species (Brodeur et al., 2014; Dale et al., 2017). 99 Three aggregations of anchovy abundance have been characterized on the Pacific Coast (McHugh, 1951). 100 The northern-most of these is the northern subpopulation, which extends from northern California to 101 central British Columbia. The Columbia River Plume was identified as the primary spawning site for this 102 subpopulation by Richardson (1981); with peak spawning occurring in July. Other studies have recorded 103 the presence of anchovy eggs as early as April (reviewed by Parnel et al., 2008), and during recent 104 anomalous warm conditions (2015–16) larvae have been captured throughout the winter on the Newport 105 hydrographic line off Oregon (Auth et al., in press). Previous stock assessments of the northern 106 subpopulation of anchovy have been limited to the Columbia River plume region (Richardson, 1981; 107 Emmett et al., 1997). Litz et al. (2008) reviewed available commercial catch and fishery-independent 108 sample data for the northern subpopulation in the California Current. These authors suggested that strong

variability in abundance was likely driven by bottom-up regulation of larval survival in the preceding
year. Therriault et al. (2002) reviewed anchovy biology and fisheries in Canadian waters. This review
described low and fluctuating abundance of anchovy in British Columbia and concluded that it was
uncertain whether these stocks were resident or whether abundance was controlled by migration from
more southerly components of the northern subpopulation. We are not aware of previous work that has
specifically addressed that status or history of anchovy within the Salish Sea (SS), the combined inshore
waterways and basins of southern British Columbia and Washington State.

116 Since 2014, evidence from multiple sources has suggested a widespread surge in abundance of 117 anchovy within the SS. These observations were sufficiently unusual that they attracted the attention of 118 the public and media.¹ Independent observations by resource users and fisheries research agencies 119 prompted questions about the scale, cause(s), and ecological significance of the increase in abundance. 120 Consequently, we reviewed available literature and assembled data to piece together the biology and 121 recent dynamics of anchovy in the SS. We characterized spatiotemporal patterns of distribution and 122 seasonal shifts in size and life-history stage. We attempted to define periods of high and low abundance 123 from 1940 to the present by collating qualitative and quantitative fishery-dependent and -independent 124 data. To assess the plausibility of alternative hypotheses underpinning population increases (spillover 125 from adjacent population centers versus increased habitat suitability), we related periods of inferred high 126 and low abundance to sea surface temperature (SST), salinity and dynamics of adjacent anchovy 127 populations. 2. Materials and Methods 128

129 **2.1.** Study Area

130 The Salish Sea (SS) is a complex estuarine system on the north-west coast of North America with three dominant regions: Strait of Georgia (SoG), Strait of Juan de Fuca (SJF) and Puget Sound (PS; 131 132 Figure 1). The Strait of Georgia (Figure 2) is the largest basin and is strongly influenced by large 133 freshwater inflows from the Fraser River that promote stratification and high productivity and drive 134 estuarine circulation (Thomson, 1981). The Strait of Juan de Fuca, which links the SS to the Pacific 135 Ocean, is a tidally-mixed passage that remains comparatively cold throughout the year. To the south, 136 Puget Sound (Figure 3) is a complex network of basins and fjords; the northern portion adjacent to the 137 Strait of Juan de Fuca stays tidally-mixed and cool throughout the year while the more embayed regions 138 can become thermally stratified and quite warm during the summer (Moore et al., 2008).

¹ http://vancouversun.com/news/local-news/anchovy-schools-are-back-in-session-with-phenomenal-numbersspawning-in-howe-sound; accessed 1 July 2017.

139 The SS is home to species of commercial, recreational, and cultural importance. It provides 140 rearing habitat for Pacific salmon (Oncorhynchus spp.) from the Fraser River, Canada's most important salmon producing watershed, and many other rivers draining Washington State, mainland British 141 142 Columbia, and Vancouver Island. Survival of juvenile Chinook (O. tshawytscha) and Coho (O. kisutch) 143 Salmon entering the SS declined dramatically two decades ago and has not rebounded (Beamish et al., 144 2010; Zimmerman et al., 2015). This conspicuous change provided the impetus for a multiyear, binational 145 science initiative (the Salish Sea Marine Survival Project-SSMSP-www.marinesurvivalproject.org) that 146 seeks to identify and explain changes in ecosystem function. Several other marine species occurring in 147 the SS have also experienced substantial population declines over the last several decades and are at risk 148 of extirpation or extinction, resulting in listings under the U.S. Endangered Species Act (Yelloweye 149 Rockfish Sebastes ruberrimus, Bocaccio S. paucispinis, Eulachon Thaleichthys pacificus, Bull Trout 150 Salvelinus confluentus, Green Sturgeon Acipenser medirostris, Marbled Murrelet Brachyramphus 151 *marmoratus*; see http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/about_us/ protected_resources_division.html) 152 and the Canadian Species at Risk Act (SARA) (Marbled Murrelet, Southern Resident Killer Whales 153 Orcinus orca; see https://www.registrelep-sararegistry.gc.ca). 154 The forage fish community of the SS is currently dominated by Pacific Herring (Clupea pallasii)

155 and, to a lesser extent, Pacific Sand Lance (Ammodytes personatus) and various species of smelt 156 (Osmeridae) (Therriault et al., 2009). While numerous sources have documented the presence of anchovy 157 in the SS (e.g., Therriault et al., 2009; Beamish, 2014; Greene et al., 2015), they have not generally been 158 considered to play an important role in the ecosystem. Recent anecdotal observations of large 159 concentrations of anchovy in the SS, along with increased frequency of catches in fishery-independent 160 surveys, suggest that this may no longer be the case. The present work seeks to clarify recent and historical dynamics of anchovy in the SS to inform ongoing efforts to understand the ecology of this 161 162 valuable ecosystem.

163 **2.2.** Spatiotemporal Patterns in Distribution and Size Frequency

To characterize spatiotemporal patterns of distribution and seasonal shifts in anchovy size and life-history stage we assembled available fishery-independent survey data for the SS (Table 1). No surveys specifically target anchovy in the SS; however, anchovy are encountered as incidental catches in surveys for other species and as part of broad-based ecosystem surveys using non-selecting gear. We assembled results of six fishery-independent surveys that provided informative spatial and/or temporal coverage. These included ecosystem monitoring programs and targeted assessments of commercially important marine fish species.

Locations of gear deployments ('sets') and catches (either log(x+1) transformed catch per set or
catch per hour) were mapped using the "PBSmapping" package (Schnute et al., 2008) in R (R Core Team
2016). Specific details for each dataset are provided in section 2.4 and Table 1.

174 Length data were available for anchovy captured in four of these datasets, facilitating inference of 175 life-history stage-specific temporal patterns of distribution within the SS. Different surveys employed 176 different types of length measurements (i.e., standard, total, and fork lengths). To allow comparisons 177 among surveys, seasons, and years we converted all lengths to fork length (FL) using rearrangements of 178 length-weight regression formulae of Gartz (2004), where FL = fork length, TL = total length, and SL = 179 standard length.

180 $FL = (TL^{3.1423} (0.5683))^{0.3242}$ 181 $FL = (SL^{2.922} (2.7148))^{0.3242}$

182 **2.3.** Trends in Abundance

183 We attempted to define periods of high and low abundance from 1940 to the present using a 184 combination of quantitative and qualitative fishery-dependent and -independent data. For quantitative 185 analysis, we assembled ten fishery-independent datasets (Table 1) that used different gear types and 186 varied in the metrics used to record anchovy catch (counts, total weights, and/or individual 187 measurements). Therefore, we limited our analysis of inter-annual variation to frequency of sets that 188 captured anchovy (ie. % presence). These proportions were arcsine square root transformed to improve 189 normality and converted to anomalies from the mean for each dataset. These anomalies were then 190 averaged across datasets for each year to derive a quantitative index of anchovy abundance for all years in 191 which there were data. To investigate temporal links between environmental variables and abundance we 192 fit linear models ("Im" in the base stats package in "R"; R Core Team 2016) relating this quantitative 193 abundance index to annual indices of Salish Sea SST, Coastal SST, and Salish Sea salinity (see section 194 2.4.13 for details). Models were fit to environmental indices averaged over the last 1 to 3 years and 195 lagged by 0 to 3 years. Lags were chosen based on an assumption that most anchovy encountered in 196 Salish Sea surveys would between age-0 and age-3 (Pike, 1951). Data were weighted by the number of 197 data sources contributing to the anchovy abundance index for each year.

198 This quantitative approach could not be applied to all the datasets collated in the present study,

199 including all data prior to the 1960s. We therefore employed a qualitative approach to combine all

200 available data. Quantitative datasets described in the previous paragraph were converted to qualitative

201 scores: for net gears (trawl, purse seine, and beach seine) we defined > 30 % presence as 'abundant'

202 (score = 1), 5 % to 30 % as 'present' (score = 0.5), and \leq 5 % as 'scarce to absent' (score = 0); for

203 zooplankton sampling gears we defined \geq 5 % as 'abundant', < 5 % as 'present', and 0 % as 'scarce to

absent'. We also assembled available anchovy fishery landing records for the SS and qualitative accounts

- 206 criteria to assign qualitative scores ('abundant', 'present', or 'scarce to absent' on a case-by-case basis
- (described in section 2.4). Finally, we reviewed the literature for reports of surveys with spatial and 207
- 208 temporal coverage that would have been expected to encounter anchovy if present; and scored these as
- 209 'abundant', 'present', or 'scarce to absent', as above. We assembled the results of all fishery-independent,
- 210 fishery-dependent, and literature time series (n = 15), and calculated mean categorical scores for each
- 211 year. Where two or more data sources were available for a given year, mean categorical abundance values
- 212 of < 0.5 were considered to represent periods of likely scarcity and values of > 0.5 periods of likely
- 213 abundance. To assess the plausibility of alternative mechanisms influencing anchovy dynamics in the SS,
- 214 we graphically related periods of high and low abundance to environmental indices (previous paragraph
- 215 and section 2.4.13) and indices of anchovy abundance in adjacent open coast regions (see section 2.4.12).
- 216 2.4. **Data Sources**

2.4.1.

217

Strait of Georgia Zooplankton Database

218 The Institute of Ocean Sciences (DFO) in Sidney, British Columbia maintains a database of 219 zooplankton samples collected during both annual monitoring programs and focused studies by 220 researchers from DFO and other institutions. These sampling programs and the database are described in 221 more detail by Mackas et al. (2013). We examined all records in this database for the SS beginning in the 222 year 2000 (n = 1920). Samples prior to 2000 had been analyzed to varying levels of taxonomic resolution and anchovy presence could have been missed. Sample collection methods were diverse, ranging from 223 224 ring nets and bongo nets to Tucker trawls and depth stratified multi-nets. Gears were also fished over 225 different depth ranges.

226 We limited our analysis to annual percent presence of anchovy eggs, larvae, and juveniles, and 227 only included gear deployments that sampled from a depth of at least 15 m and that included the surface. 228 The zooplankton database characterizes fish under 10 mm as larvae and over 10 mm as juveniles. This 229 likely misclassifies some larval anchovy, as transformation takes place between 35 and 40 mm (Watson 230 and Sandknop, 1996). We grouped these size classes as larvae for analysis. As anchovy eggs and larvae 231 were only encountered between March and September, only months within this range were considered for 232 analysis of trends in abundance. A total of 1420 gear deployments between 2000 and 2016 met these 233 criteria. Spatial coverage of zooplankton samples in the SoG has increased significantly since 2014 as 234 part of the Salish Sea Marine Survival Project, and the majority of anchovy have been encountered in 235 2015 and 2016. We therefore limited our mapping of spatial and seasonal patterns of occurrence to the 236 latter two years. 237

- 238

- 239 2.4.2. Strait of Georgia Age-0 Pacific Herring Purse Seine Surveys
- 240 Standardized night-time (6–7 hours beginning near dusk) surveys for age-0 Pacific Herring have been
- conducted by Fisheries and Oceans Canada (DFO) in the Strait of Georgia since 1992 (except 1995) as an
- index of future (age-3) recruitment to the population (Schweigert et al., 2009; Boldt et al., 2015;
- 243 Thompson et al., 2016). A single purse seine set is conducted at each of up to 48 standard stations along
- 244 10 transects during September–October. Transect locations are spaced around the perimeter of the SoG
- 245 (Figure 2). Stations along each transect extend from nearshore (approximately 15 m depth) out into open
- water at 1–2 km intervals, or from one side of a channel to the other. Station water depths range from 11
- to 340 m with an average of 83 m. Significant numbers of anchovy were encountered in these surveys for
- the first time in 2005; since then, a sample of the catch has been measured for standard length. For the
- present study, we evaluated presence or absence of anchovy at the set level for all years (mean annual sets
- 250 = 44, range = 24–48, total = 1056).
- 251 The standardized nature of these age-0 Pacific Herring surveys also provided an opportunity to evaluate
- the effect of water depth on the fine scale distribution of anchovy. To test the hypothesis that anchovy
- 253 were more likely to be present in shallow water, we fit a mixed effects binomial glmm (logit link) relating
- the presence (1) or absence (0) of anchovy in each set to the random categorical variables 'Year' and
- 255 'Transect' and the continuous variable 'Depth (m)' using the "glmer" function in the package "lme4"
- 256 (Bates et al., 2015) in R (R Core Team 2016).
- 257 2.4.3. Strait of Georgia Juvenile Salmon Trawl Surveys
- 258 Surveys to capture juvenile salmon have been conducted by DFO every summer (June/July) and 259 fall (September/October) since 1998 in the Strait of Georgia and associated waters, primarily aboard the 260 CCGS R/V W.E. Ricker. Surveys employ a modified mid-water trawl (approximately 14 m high by 30 m wide; mesh tapering to a 1 cm liner in the cod end) fished at 8-9 km/h and at variable depths (Beamish et 261 262 al., 2000). A standard track line is sampled during each survey (~80–100 sets); other regions were fished 263 as time permits including mainland inlets, the Southern Gulf Islands, PS, and SJF. For the present study, 264 we reviewed a total of 458 sets from surveys conducted in 2015 (24 June-9 July and 16 September-6 265 October) and 2016 (5-14 July and 17-26 October). In both years standard track lines were surveyed in 266 addition to PS and the vicinity of Cowichan Bay in the Southern Gulf Islands. Surveys in 2015 were 267 somewhat more extensive and included Desolation Sound, Whidbey Basin and South PS. Approximately 268 1/2 of tows were conducted with the headrope at the surface, 1/3 at 15 m, 1/6 at 30 m, and the balance at 269 30 to 80 m. Fork lengths were measured on board for a subset of anchovy captured in summer and fall 270 surveys in both 2015 and 2016.
- 271
- 272

273 **2.4.4.** Fraser River Plume Study (Tow Net)

274 Two-vessel surface trawls (henceforward this sampling method is referred to as a "tow net") were 275 conducted by the Fisheries Research Board of Canada as part of a study of the Fraser River plume from 276 1966 to 1969 and again in 1973. The trawl net was approximately 6 m by 3 m and included a 350 µm 277 mesh plankton net integrated into the cod end to catch zooplankton and larval fish. The net was deployed 278 for standardized 10-minute tows. A full description of gear and methods is provided in Barraclough 279 (1967). While some of these data were published in the Fisheries Research Board manuscript report 280 series shortly after they were collected, the Fraser River plume data from 1968, 1969, and 1973 were not. 281 They were recovered recently during a data archaeology project (McKinnell and Perry, 2016). Surveys 282 occurred in the southern Strait of Georgia between April and July but anchovy occurred only in the 283 months of June and July. We therefore considered only tows during these months (n = 196) for catch 284 maps and abundance analyses.

285 **2.4.5.** Strait of G

Strait of Georgia R/V Neocaligus Trawl

286 From 2014 to 2016, DFO conducted experimental trawl surveys in the southern Strait of Georgia 287 using the CCGS R/V Neocaligus. These surveys employed a 4 m by 4 m trawl in 2014 and 2015 and a 15-20 m by 5-6 m trawl in 2016. Coverage in these surveys varied by year, with 2014 and 2015 focusing 288 289 on the edge of Robert's Bank at the Mouth of the Fraser River and 2016 focusing on Howe Sound. 290 Additional sets were also conducted in Cowichan Bay. Due to the very different spatial coverage of these 291 surveys among years we did not include them in the analysis of trends in abundance; however, we did 292 compare the size distribution of anchovy captured from 2014–16 to those captured in other survey 293 programs.

294 **2.4.6.** Puget Sound Mid-Water Trawl Survey

295 The Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife (WDFW) conducted bimonthly mid-water 296 trawl surveys from February 2016 to February 2017 to investigate seasonal and spatial changes in the 297 distribution of the mid-water fish community of PS (we report only survey results from February 2016 to December 2016). The F/V Chasina, a 17.7 m commercial fishing vessel, performed the surveys using a 298 299 mid-water Polish rope trawl with a maximum 7.3 m by 7.3 m opening and a 1 cm mesh liner in the cod 300 end. The trawl was deployed in standardized 15-minute deployments to depths identified by a lead 301 acoustics vessel as having the highest concentration of fish targets. Tow depths ranged from 15 to 141 m 302 (mean = 54 m). Bimonthly surveys consisted of between 16 and 38 sets (184 total) and covered all major 303 basins of PS, also extending into the southern SoG and SJF. 304 2.4.7. **Skagit Bay Surface Trawl Survey**

305 Two-vessel surface tow net surveys have been conducted in Skagit Bay, PS by the National

306 Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) Northwest Fisheries Science Center (NWFSC) since

308 mm in the cod end) was fished at 4–5.5 km/h for 10 minute sets at a series of standard stations (see Rice 309 et al., 2011 for details). Some sampling has occurred between February and November, but the number of 310 sets and seasonal coverage has varied by year. The months with the most consistent coverage were July 311 (all but 2016), August (all years), and September (all but 2004). To assess trends in abundance we limited 312 analysis to percent presence in tows conducted in the latter two months. The number of tows conducted in 313 this period ranged from 16 in 2012 to 90 in 2002 (total = 871; mean = 54).

314 2.4.8. **Historical Tow Net Surveys**

307

Greene et al. (2015) synthesized results of historical two vessel surface 'tow net' surveys

315 316 conducted in the southern SoG (referred to as 'Rosario Basin'), Whidbey Basin, Central PS, and Southern 317 PS from 1972 to 1985, and again in 2003 and 2011. Methods for this work were similar to those for 318 Skagit Bay tow net surveys (section 2.4.7) and are described in detail in Rice et al. (2011) and Greene et 319 al. (2015). The number of tows for each region and year varied from 4 to 158 (mean = 41), with all tows 320 included in the analysis occurring from June to September (n = 1380). Sampling was conducted primarily 321 at night from 1973–85 and during the day in 1972, 2003, and 2011.

322 2.4.9.

Elwha and Snohomish Beach Seines

323 From 2001 to 2010 the NWFSC and Tulalip Tribes conducted a beach seine program to monitor 324 juvenile salmon utilization of the Snohomish River Estuary. A similar program has been conducted by the 325 NWFSC at the Elwha River estuary since 2005. These programs employed a 37 m by 3.1 m beach seine 326 with a 3.2 mm mesh bag following methods outlined by Miller et al. (1990). Some seine sites at these 327 locations were primarily freshwater habitats, so to assess annual variation in percent presence we utilized 328 data only for sites where anchovy were encountered at least once. Similarly, we only included sets in 329 months where anchovy were encountered; April to September for the Elwha estuary (total sets = 1031; 330 range = 5-161; annual mean = 86) and August and September for the Snohomish estuary (total sets = 331 139; range = 5-23; annual mean = 14).

332 2.4.10. **Catch Data**

333 Commercial catch data for anchovy in PS were provided by the WDFW. Catches have been 334 sporadic and we were unable to account for changes in fishing effort and closures of the fishery. We 335 therefore could not use these data to infer periods of scarcity. We defined landings of greater than 10,000 kg as reflecting abundance (score = 1), while any landings less than 10,000 kg reflected presence (score = 336 337 0.5). British Columbia commercial catch data were compiled from Canadian fisheries statistics by Warren

- 338 Wulff (DFO) for a 2002 stock status review (Therriault et al., 2002). Landings prior to 1947 were
- 339 identified by region, while those from 1947 to 1951 were not. All catch data after 1951 were from outside

2001. A Kodiak trawl (3.1 m deep by 6.1 m wide; mesh tapering from 76 mm in forward sections to 6

340 of the SS. Again, we were unable to use these data to infer absence of anchovy, but we considered years

- 341 with a documented SoG catch of greater than 10,000 kg to constitute abundance (score = 1).
- 342 **2.4.11.**

Literature Sources

343 Annual reports (1925–1980) of work conducted by the Pacific Biological Station, DFO Pacific 344 Stock Assessment Review Committee Annual Reports from 1987 to 1997, and sources cited within these 345 documents were examined for references to anchovy (all reports reviewed but not cited in the text are 346 listed in the supplementary material). Where abundance or scarcity within the SoG was mentioned, we 347 assigned a score of 1 or 0, respectively. Beamish et al. (1976) reported results of 50 purse seine sets in the 348 southern SoG in July and August of 1974. DFO conducted 400 thirty-minute sets with a 4 m by 4 m 349 surface trawl in the Fraser River plume in early summer from 1989–1994. The methodology of these 350 surveys is reported in Beamish and Neville (1995) with total catches and number of sets reported in 351 Beamish (2014). These surveys were scored for abundance/scarcity based on the same criteria described 352 for other net-based gears in section 2.3.

552 for other net bused gears in section 2.5.

353 **2.4.12.** Anchovy Abundance Beyond the Salish Sea

The abundance of the northern subpopulation of anchovy is not assessed routinely; however, they are caught in surface trawl surveys (targeting juvenile salmon) conducted annually in the Columbia River plume in June by the NWFSC (see Brodeur et al., 2005 for methods). Annual anomalies (deviations from log of mean catch per km) from 1998 to 2016 were provided by Cheryl Morgan (Oregon State University). The number of tows per year ranged from 27–59 (mean = 46). Sampling methodology and sampling area has been standardized throughout the study, although a marine mammal excluder device was installed beginning in 2014 (37 of 47 hauls). This device was installed in the net with the opening

361 facing upward in 2014 and with the opening facing downward for all hauls in 2015 and 2016.

Coastal (non-Puget Sound) Washington and Oregon landing data (weight) for anchovy were obtained from WDFW harvest records. Fisheries for anchovy in Washington and Oregon have used purse seines and lampara nets to provide live bait primarily for recreational and commercial fishers (Litz et al., 2008). Catch data from 1970–2016 were obtained from the Washington fish ticket database, while data from 1929 to 1969 were obtained from a WDFW database containing data derived from annual Washington State Department of Fisheries Statistical Reports. Data for 1969 were not divided by region and may also include PS catch. Data are reported as anomalies from the mean.

369 **2.4.13.** Environmental Data

370 Daily SST and salinity has been measured using consistent methodology at a number of

- 371 lighthouses on the British Columbia Coast and at the Pacific Biological Station in Departure Bay over
- various time periods beginning in 1914 and continuing up to the present. Data for Departure Bay (1914–
- 373 2016), Active Pass (1967–2012), Cape Mudge (1936–1985), Chrome Island (1961–2016), Entrance

- 374 Island (1936–2016), and Race Rocks (1921–2016) were retrieved from http://www.pac.dfo-
- 375 mpo.gc.ca/science/oceans/data-donnees/lighthouses-phares/index-eng.html. Sea surface temperatures
- 376 (1992 to 2016) from weather buoys maintained by Environment Canada at Sentry Shoal and Halibut Bank
- 377 in the SoG were obtained from the Marine Environmental Data Section of DFO. For each time series,
- daily SST and salinity data were converted to monthly anomalies from the monthly mean for all years
- between 1935 and 2016. Months with less than 15 days of data were excluded. Annual temperature and
- 380 salinity indices were then derived by averaging monthly anomalies for all years with at least 11 months of
- data. To avoid splitting the coldest or warmest part seasons, years were centered on 1 October (ie. 2016
- 382 would include 1 October 2015 to 31 September 2016). For the purpose of modeling the relationships with
- 383 SS anchovy abundance these SoG SST and salinity indices were used as a proxies for the entire SS. An
- 384 index of SST for the coastal Northeast Pacific as a whole was derived from NOAA Extended
- 385 Reconstructed SST data (monthly data; 1854 present; 2° lat/long grid) Version 4
- 386 (https://www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/data/gridded/data.noaa.ersst.v4.html). Grid points directly adjacent to the
- 387 coast between 40° N and 60° N were selected for analysis (one grid point for every 2° of latitude).
- 388 Monthly SST anomalies from long-term monthly mean were calculated for each grid point. Where a
- 389 datum was missing the mean of the preceding and following month were used when available, or else the
- 390 anomaly was set to zero. A principal component analysis was applied to monthly anomalies. The first
- 391 principal component explained 93% of covariance in the data. Monthly scores for this principal
- 392 component were averaged for each year (centered on 1 October as above) to derive an annual coastal SST
- index.
- **394 3. Results**

395 **3.1.** Spatiotemporal Distribution and Body Size

396 3.1.1. Regional Patterns in Distribution

397 Anchovy were captured throughout the SS in a variety of surveys, but some spatial patterns were 398 evident. Within the SoG, Malaspina Strait was an area of consistent occurrence in zooplankton tows 399 (Figure 4). At one station in Malaspina Strait (see arrow in Figure 4a) eggs or larvae were encountered in 400 7 of 9 surveys conducted between 11 May and 14 August 2015. Eggs and larvae were also caught at many 401 stations in and around Baynes Sound. The only records of anchovy in the zooplankton data in SJF and 402 Haro Strait were larvae/juveniles captured in March and April 2015, prior to the main occurrence of eggs 403 or larvae within the SoG (with the exception of a single sample in the Fraser River plume; Figure 4). 404 Anchovy were encountered in age-0 Pacific Herring surveys on all transects (Figure 5). The 405 highest frequency of occurrence was on transects 9 - 11 along the northeast shore of the SoG (including

406 Malaspina Strait) and on transect 2 in the Gulf Islands. Most anchovy catches in juvenile salmon trawl
407 surveys also occurred along the northeastern shore of the SoG or in the Fraser River plume (Figure 6). All

408 large catches in these salmon trawl surveys occurred in the Fraser River plume or mainland inlets (Howe

409 Sound and Desolation Sound). Of juvenile salmon trawl sets conducted by DFO in Puget Sound,

410 anchovy were encountered only in South Puget Sound in the fall of 2015 (Figure 6). Surveys in summer

411 2015 and in 2016 did not extend into the South Puget Sound due to limited ship time. Historical (1967–

412 69) tow net surveys provide more information on distribution near the Fraser River plume. In 1967 and

413 1968 anchovy catches were concentrated to the north of the mouth of the Fraser River, while in 1969

414 catches were dispersed throughout all sampled areas of the central SoG (Figure 7).

415 The 2016 WDFW mid-water trawl survey provided a relatively complete spatial and temporal 416 snapshot of anchovy distribution in PS in a year of apparent high abundance. Anchovy were encountered 417 in all the main basins of the Sound. In general, catches were greater within embayments further from the 418 entrance to the Sound (Figure 8). The largest and most consistent catches occurred in South PS. Almost 419 no anchovy were caught in either the June or August mid-water trawls surveys in PS, with the only 420 significant catch occurring in the South Sound in August. The largest catches occurred in October and 421 December (Figure 8). In 2015 and 2016, larval and post-larval anchovy were caught in the Skagit Bay 422 tow net survey, primarily in retention areas such as embayments where they were caught in large numbers 423 (data not shown).

424 **3.1.2**.

1.2. Fine Scale Distribution

425 Qualitative assessment of within-transect catch distribution from the SoG age-0 Pacific Herring 426 surveys suggested that anchovy were more likely to be captured closer to shore (and therefore in 427 shallower water). For example, for transect 11 near Pender Harbour (highest anchovy occurrence for any 428 transect in the survey: 26%, SE = 4%), frequency of occurrence was very high for the station closest to 429 shore (63%, SE = 10%), while anchovy have never been captured at the most offshore station across 18 years of sampling (Figure 5 inset). A mixed effects logistic regression model confirmed that the log-odds 430 431 of encountering anchovy in purse seine sets declined with water depth (intercept = -1.78, slope = -0.006, 432 standard error of slope = 0.002, P < 0.001).

433 **3.1.3.** Life History Stage Timing and Length Frequency Distributions

434 Anchovy eggs and larvae were present in the SoG from March to August of 2015 and 2016, with 435 a peak in June (Figures 4 and 9). Many of the anchovy encountered in the late summer and fall surveys 436 described in the present study were small, post-larval young of the year. Of 2245 fish measured from 437 surface trawl catches in the Southern SoG in June and July of 1967–69 only 11 individuals were greater 438 than 100 mm FL. The other 2234 ranged from 7 to 92 mm FL (mean = 26.7 mm). Of 626 fish measured 439 in fall SoG age-0 Pacific Herring surveys since 2005, 548 (88%) were less than 100 mm FL. A mode of 440 fish (\leq 75 mm FL) first appeared in July in the R/V Neocaligus surveys in 2015, but were not caught in 441 July in either 2014 or 2016 (Figure 10). In 2016, a mode of fish \leq 75 mm FL was evident in the R/V

442 Neocaligus trawl surveys in Howe Sound in August and in age-0 Pacific Herring surveys in September

- 443 (Figure 11). The same mode was apparently present in juvenile salmon trawls in October and PS mid-
- 444 water trawls in October and December, but had increased to between 75 and 100 mm FL. The length of
- 445 age 1+ anchovy caught in February in PS mid-water trawls was primarily between 75 and 100 mm,
- 446 whereas the length of those caught in April was bimodal with modes at 105 and 145 mm. The length of
- 447 anchovy caught in Howe Sound in May by the R/V Neocaligus corresponded to this larger mode.
- 448 Anchovy caught in July in the juvenile salmon trawl surveys in the SoG had a length distribution that
- 449 overlapped with the samples from the R/V Neocaligus in Howe Sound but also included larger fish (145–
- 450 160 mm). In August 2016, most fish in the PS survey were > 125 mm. A mode between 125 and 150 mm
- 451 was present in all surveys from September to December (albeit almost non-existent in PS in December).
- 452 **3.2.** Fluctuations in Abundance
- 453

3.2.1.

Abundance Time Series

454 A number of sources indicated a period of anchovy abundance in the SS in the 1940s. 455 Commercial landings occurred annually in the SoG between 1940 and 1946, ranging from 47,000 kg to 456 just over 1 million kg. Commercial catches of 17,000 and 21,000 kg were recorded in PS in 1946 and 457 1947 respectively (Figure 12). The annual reports of the Pacific Biological Station make specific 458 reference to anchovy abundance within the SoG in 1940, 1941 and 1947. From the late 1940s to the 459 1950s information is sparse. Commercial catches for BC were reported in 1947, 1948 and 1950, but these 460 were not broken down by region so it is not possible to tell if part of the catch was made in the SoG. The 461 annual report of the Pacific Biological Station for 1948 indicated that anchovy were scarce in that year 462 (Foerster, 1948). The report for 1951 (Hart, 1951) indicated that large schools of age-1 anchovy appeared in the SoG in that year, but there is no evidence that these fish persisted. The report of 1969 (Radway, 463 1969) indicated that anchovy had not been abundant in the SoG since 1951, but this is the only reference 464 465 to this two-decade period.

466 A peak in abundance at the end of the 1960s was evident in results of the Fraser River plume 467 study (Figures 7 and 13). Small commercial catches were also reported for PS in 1969–1971 (Figure 12). 468 No anchovy were encountered in Fraser River plume study in 1966 or 1973. A purse seine survey in the 469 SoG in 1974 (Beamish, 1976) encountered no anchovy despite suitable gear and considerable effort (50 470 sets). From the early 1970s to the early 1990s information regarding anchovy abundance comes primarily 471 from tow net surveys conducted in the southern SoG and PS. A small number of tows conducted in the 472 southern SoG and Central PS (18 total) suggested a possible year of higher abundance in 1976, and tows 473 in Whidbey Basin suggested elevated abundance from 1983-85 (Figure 13). Surface trawl surveys in the 474 Fraser River Plume from 1989 to 1993 (Beamish, 2014) encountered no anchovy in 400 sets. Beginning 475 with age-0 Pacific Herring surveys in the early 1990s, various fishery-independent data sets provide a

fairly coherent picture of trends in abundance up to the present (Figures 13 and 14). Elevated frequency of
occurrence was observed in age-0 Pacific Herring surveys, Skagit Bay tow net surveys, and Snohomish

- 478 River estuary beach seines in 2005. No anchovy were encountered in zooplankton tows at stations in the
- 479 SoG in 2005; however, eggs and larvae were encountered in 2006. This result contrasted with other
- 480 survey programs, which did not detect abundance in 2006 (Figure 13). A noteworthy increase in
- 481 abundance was detected in 2015 and 2016. Only Elwha beach seine data were inconsistent with this trend.

482 3.2.2. **Relationship with Environmental Variables and Northern Subpopulation Abundance** 483 Some, but not all, periods of qualitatively inferred SS anchovy abundance corresponded to, or closely 484 lagged, periods of elevated SST in the Salish Sea and along the Pacific Coast (Figure 14). However, no 485 evidence of anchovy abundance was detected during other warm periods (eg. late 1990s). Some periods of abundance also corresponded to or lagged periods of lower salinity, but this pattern was weak. Catch 486 487 per unit effort in Columbia Plume trawl surveys was relatively constant, with one strong peak in 2004 and 488 2005 which corresponded to inferred abundance of anchovy in the SS in 2005. Coastal Washington and 489 Oregon commercial anchovy catch was also relatively constant with a small peak in 2009 and a very 490 dramatic increase in 2016.

491 A quantitative anchovy abundance index was significantly related to an index of Salish Sea SST only 492 when SST was unlagged and averaged over two years (slope = 0.46, P = 0.04; Figure 15). At a lag of 3 493 years, the relationship between the 2- and 3-year averaged SST index and anchovy abundance became 494 significantly negative. The unlagged index of coastal SST was positively and significantly related to 495 anchovy abundance whether averaged over 1, 2 or 3 years; at a 1-year lag only SST for a single year was 496 significantly related to abundance. Three year-averaged coastal SST lagged by 3 years was significantly 497 negatively related to anchovy abundance. The relationship between coastal SST and abundance was most significant for the unlagged index averaged over 2 years (slope = 0.57, P < 0.01). A possible negative 498 499 relationship between the unlagged SS salinity index and anchovy abundance was marginally 500 nonsignificant.

501 **4. Discussion**

502 **4.1.**

1. Life-History Distribution Within the Salish Sea

503Our results suggest that when anchovy are abundant in the SS they consistently utilize certain504regions including the Fraser River plume, mainland shore of the SoG, and South Puget Sound. This is505generally consistent with historical accounts and recent anecdotal observations of anchovy in the SS. Hart506(1934) cited results of a survey of fishers indicating that within the SoG, locations noted for anchovy507abundance were the coastal area between Victoria and Ladysmith on the southeast side of Vancouver508Island and the eastern shores between Boundary Bay and Pender Harbour. Canadian fisheries statistics for

509 catches between 1940 and 1946 indicated that fishing occurred in the vicinity of the Fraser River, Howe

510 Sound, and along the mainland shore of the SoG. Only in 1946 were small catches recorded from the 511 western SoG (near Nanaimo). The 1942 report of the Pacific Biological Station (Foerster, 1942) reported 512 that anchovy were important in diets of Chinook Salmon from the east coast of the SoG but not 513 elsewhere, and the 1947 report (Foerster, 1947) indicated that anchovy occurred regularly on the lower 514 east coast of the SoG but were rare elsewhere. In 2016, recreational fishers observed anchovy schools 515 around the entrance to Howe Sound from spring through late fall. Schools were often on the surface and 516 very close to shore, and were being fed on by seabirds, harbor seals (*Phoca vitulina richardii*), and 517 humpback whales (Megaptera novaeangliae) (Jason Assonitis, pers. com.). This historical and observed 518 distribution of Northern Anchovy in the SoG is consistent with an association with lower salinity water. 519 Engraulids are frequently associated with the influence of rivers (Checkley et al., 2017). Richardson 520 (1981) suggested that the Fraser River Plume could provide suitable conditions (stable and productive) for 521 anchovy spawning and might represent a secondary spawning center for the northern subpopulation. The 522 plume of the Fraser River turns north once it enters the SoG (Thomson, 1981), and the waters of the 523 mainland shore are lower in salinity than the northwestern shore (Tully and Dodimead, 1956). The 524 salinity of Howe Sound and the other major inlets is also affected by inflows from large mainland rivers.

525 While the trawl data that we report indicated the presence of anchovy throughout PS, the most 526 consistent occurrence was in South Sound. Observations by South Puget Sound residents that various size 527 classes of anchovies are present year-round (Duane Fagergren, pers. com.) corroborate this result. Catches in WDFW trawls were consistently low in the SJF and opening of PS. This region is subject to strong 528 529 tidal mixing (Moore et al., 2008) and may represent an area of depressed primary productivity and poor 530 foraging for planktivorous fish, as was found at the northern exit from the SoG (McKinnell et al., 2014). 531 Interestingly, our results contrast with the scat-based harbor seal diet analysis of Lance and Jefferies 532 (2009) which suggested that anchovy were relatively important in seal diets in Hood Canal and the San 533 Juan Islands but not South PS. This difference could reflect a shift in anchovy distribution since the 534 period of these scat studies (1995–1997). Alternatively, it could be partially due to different temporal 535 coverage among regions, with only Hood Canal and the San Juan Islands sampled in 2005, a year of high 536 anchovy abundance based on results of the present study. One interesting result of 2016 WDFW PS mid-537 water trawls was that catches were very infrequent in summer (June and August). Catches were also 538 almost absent when Canadian juvenile salmon surveys extended into PS in June/July and 539 September/October. It is unclear if this pattern is a consequence of movement of anchovy out of PS, 540 redistribution to areas less vulnerable to mid-water trawl gear, or a shift to a patchier distribution during 541 the summer months.

542 The egg and larval timing and size frequency shifts documented in the present study are543 consistent with year-round residence, spawning, and successful recruitment of anchovy within the SS.

544 Early fishery scientists in British Columbia believed that spawning occurred within the SoG (Foerster, 545 1941) and Pike (1951) inferred that spawning occurred in Southern BC due to the presence of ripe females in mid- to late- summer. Richardson (1981) suggested the Fraser River plume as a possible 546 547 spawning location for anchovy. However, because eggs had not been observed in the SoG at the time, 548 Therriault et al. (2002) remained uncertain whether anchovy reproduced in British Columbia waters. Our 549 results suggest that spawning can occur in the SoG as early as March, peaks in June, and continues to at 550 least September. Small, age-0 fish appear in net-based surveys in July or August and remain present 551 through fall and winter, with a size mode between 75 and 100 mm by late fall and close to 100 mm by the 552 following spring. This is consistent with the results of Pike (1951) who found that average lengths of age-553 1 anchovy in BC were 107 mm for females and 105 mm for males. While winter data in the present study 554 are limited to PS trawl surveys, other threads of evidence confirm that age 1+ anchovy are present in the 555 SS throughout the year. Schools of anchovy were observed being pushed into shallow water by harbor 556 seals (Phoca vitulina), sea lions (Zalophus californianus or Eumetopias jubatus), river otters (Lontra 557 canadensis), and birds in January of 2016 near the entrance to Howe Sound, with scales and mortalities 558 washing up on shore (Dianne Sanford, pers. comm.). Anchovy were also present in 11 of 27 Chinook 559 Salmon stomachs caught by recreational anglers in Howe Sound and near Vancouver from December 560 2016 to March 2017, standard lengths of these fish ranged from 123 to 168 mm (J. Qualley, unpublished 561 data).

562 Timing and distribution of anchovy catches reported in the present study should be considered in 563 any future effort to assess abundance in the SS. Mid-water trawl surveys in open water may be a poor 564 method to assess anchovy abundance. While multiple lines of evidence suggest that anchovy were 565 abundant in 2016, SoG juvenile salmon trawl surveys only caught anchovy in 10 of 93 tows in July and 3 of 84 tows in October (albeit 4 of these catches were very large). This contrasts with anchovy encountered 566 567 in 17 of 48 age-0 Pacific Herring survey purse seine sets conducted in September, despite purse seine sets 568 sampling a volume of water at least three orders of magnitude smaller than the trawl sets. The significant 569 negative effect of bottom depth on likelihood of encountering anchovy in the age-0 Pacific Herring 570 surveys suggests the possibility of a very nearshore distribution in the SS by late summer and fall. This 571 nearshore distribution is also consistent with observations by fishers and members of the public. 572 Spawning biomass assessments of anchovy in the California Current have relied on egg and larval 573 density-based methods (Richardson, 1981; Emmett et al., 1997; MacCall et al., 2016). Given evidence of 574 patchy and nearshore distribution of adult and sub-adult anchovy in the SS, it is likely that any future 575 attempts at formal stock assessment should also focus on early life-history stages in mid-summer. 576

578 **4.2.** Fluctuations in Abundance

579 Anchovy have been intermittently abundant in the SS throughout the period of historical and 580 paleo-archaeological record. In Burrard Inlet (Vancouver, BC) anchovy were the third most abundant fish 581 in First Nations archaeological sites up to 3000 years old (Pierson, 2011), and McKenchie and Moss 582 (2016) report that anchovy remains were present at 37% of 94 First Nations archaeological sites within 583 the SS. Anchovy scales were present in the majority of laminated strata dated to the period from 1861 to 1900 in the anoxic basin of Saanich Inlet, but were scarce in the 20th century (O'Connell, 1998). 584 585 Nineteenth century accounts of fishery resources describe anchovy as abundant or formerly abundant 586 (Suckley, 1860). In British Columbia, anchovy were described by Langevin (1873) as being "taken with 587 great ease in any quantity," although it is not clear if this refers to waters within the SS. Swan (1894) 588 characterized anchovy as so abundant in PS as to be harvested by bucket. Unfortunately, accounts prior to 589 the 1940s are not detailed enough to define periods of abundance and scarcity, although it is clear that 590 both occurred. Hart (1934) makes reference to a questionnaire on fish distributions and abundance that 591 was distributed to fishers throughout BC. Three respondents to this questionnaire indicated that anchovy 592 became abundant in 1928 after an absence of approximately 15 years. The Pacific Biological Station 593 report for 1935 (Hart, 1935) includes the statement: "...all enquiries elicit the information that in southern 594 British Columbia this species is much less common than it was two or three years ago. This apparent 595 decline in abundance has occurred in spite of the fact that the species has been practically free from 596 exploitation." These statements are consistent with a period of abundance between 1928 and the early 597 1930s; however, given a lack of specific reference to abundance in the SoG we did not include this in our 598 reconstructed time series.

599 The data sources assembled for the present study suggest several periods of anchovy abundance in the SS since the 1940s, separated by periods of scarcity. While data were inadequate to characterize 600 601 abundance through large sections of the time series, it would be surprising if sustained high abundance of 602 anchovy would have gone un-documented in the scientific literature or management agency records. 603 Since 2000, multiple data sources provide a generally consistent picture. One inconsistency among data 604 series was the absence of anchovy in 2005 zooplankton samples and their presence in 2006. Sampling 605 gear and effort for surveys reported in the zooplankton database varied considerably from year to year, 606 and 2005 was the year with the second lowest number of sets included in the analysis (23 as compared to 607 a mean of 83). All samples with anchovy in 2006 were obtained using a Tucker trawl. This gear type 608 samples a larger volume of water than most other gear types reported in the zooplankton database and 609 was only utilized in 2000, 2006, and 2007. Another inconsistency in the data was the Elwha beach seine 610 program, which did not detect a period of abundance in 2015–16. The Coastal Watershed Institute has 611 also been conducting beach seine surveys in the Elwha estuary since 2007, and while anchovy were

612 caught in several sets in 2007 and a single set in 2010, no anchovy were caught in other years including

- 613 2015 or 2016 (Anne Shaffer, pers. comm.). It seems possible that the strongly tidally mixed JDF does not 614 exhibit the same trends in anchovy abundance as PS and the SoG.
- We detected a more significant positive relationship between coastal SST and anchovy abundance 615 616 than between SST within the SS and anchovy abundance. This could suggest that SS abundance is 617 controlled by reproduction and recruitment on the outer coast, or that our reconstructed SST index did a 618 poor job of reflecting the environmental conditions influencing reproduction and recruitment success 619 within the SS. Nevertheless, both our quantitative and qualitative results suggest that periods of SS 620 anchovy abundance have tended to correspond to, or closely lag, periods of elevated ocean temperature. 621 As the SS is close to the northern edge of the distribution of anchovy it seems likely that periods of 622 warmer ocean temperature could result in higher productivity. The northern population of anchovy 623 generally spawn later than the central subpopulation, which spawns throughout the winter (Richardson, 624 1981; Emmett et al., 1997; the present study, see Auth et al., 2018). Therefore, in the SS, warm water 625 temperatures may be necessary to facilitate rapid growth by larvae and juveniles to achieve an adequate 626 size to survive the winter. Winter temperatures in the SS could also present problems for anchovy in cold 627 years; mean minimum January SST in the southern SoG is between 6 and 7 °C (based on Departure Bay 628 SST), close to the critical lower temperature (6.5 °C) demonstrated by Brewer (1976) for anchovy. 629 Observations of anchovy schooling in very shallow water, and mortalities on the beach near Howe Sound in January of 2017 (Dianne Sanford pers. comm.) were consistent with the possibility of low temperature 630 631 thermal stress. However, deep waters of the SS do not get as cold in the winter (Thomson, 1981; Chandler 632 et al., 2016), and could provide a thermal refuge if utilized.
- 633 Due to the lack of a continuous time series of stock size for the northern subpopulation of 634 anchovy outside the Salish Sea, we were unable to directly test the hypothesis that this population 635 expands into the Salish Sea during periods of high abundance. Anchovy catch in Columbia River plume 636 surveys has remained relatively low and consistent from 1998 to 2016, with the exception of a marked 637 increase in 2004 and 2005, which did correspond to an increase in SS anchovy (Figure 14). The status of 638 anchovy in the Columbia River plume region in 2015 and 2016 is very uncertain, low CPUE in the 639 Columbia River plume surveys could indicate low abundance, or could be a consequence of some 640 combination of the introduction of a marine mammal excluder device reducing catches and the highly unusual oceanic conditions of the warm water "blob" changing anchovy distributions (Cheryl Morgan, 641 642 pers. comm.). A very unusual event also occurred in the northern subpopulation commercial fishery in 643 2016, with by far the largest landings on record (Figure 14). The significance of this event is uncertain. 644 The fishery concentrated on anchovy primarily within the Columbia Estuary. Increased effort may also 645 have been driven by a shift from marketing anchovy exclusively for bait to marketing it for human

- 646 consumption, and by reduced purse seine fishing opportunities (Cyreis Schmitt, Oregon Department of
- 647 Fish and Wildlife, pers. com.). Whether this high catch reflects a real increase in the northern
- 648 subpopulation, a contraction into nearshore habitat during low population abundance (MacCall et al.,
- 649 2016; Davidson et al., 2017), or a response to unusual oceanographic conditions remains uncertain.

650 If fluctuations in SS anchovy abundance were driven by fluctuations of adjacent coastal 651 populations, it follows that fish would need to move into the SS at some point during their life history. 652 The SJF, the main connection between the inner SS and adjacent shelf habitat, is characterized by net 653 outward estuarine surface flows during summer (Thomson, 1981). It seems unlikely that the very small 654 age-0 anchovy (< 50 mm FL) that are encountered in the SoG in mid-summer could have migrated from 655 the outer coast against this prevailing flow. However, when infrequent, low-pressure systems result in a 656 switch to poleward winds during summer, estuarine circulation can break down, and low salinity surface 657 water from the northern Washington shelf can be transported far into the SJF at relatively high velocity 658 (Thomson et al., 2007). Interestingly, 2005, a year where coastal anchovy abundance corresponded to SS 659 anchovy abundance, was characterized by a very late spring transition (switch to northerly winds) with 660 strong southerly wind stress events occurring into late May (Kosro et al., 2006). Transient summer 661 inflows of coastal surface waters provide a plausible mechanism for anchovy recruitment to the SS in 662 some years.

663 Laroche and Richardson (1981) inferred from catch patterns that mature anchovy in the northern 664 subpopulation moved offshore to spawn in mid-summer, with only immature individuals remaining 665 nearshore in bays and estuaries, and that all life history stages overwintered together nearshore. Pike 666 (1951) found that most age-2 anchovy females were mature, at a mean SL of 128 mm. The results of the present study suggest that fish of this size are present in the SS in June and July, and have not all migrated 667 668 offshore to spawn. However, low encounter frequency of anchovy in summer mid-water trawl surveys in 669 Puget Sound could be consistent with part of the mature population migrating offshore. While it remains 670 possible that adult anchovy in the SS are exclusively the product of spawning outside of the SS, it seems 671 unlikely that this is the case, at least for the recent (2015-2016) increase in abundance for which size 672 frequency and distribution data are available. If fluctuations in abundance are driven primarily by 673 conditions within the SS, some remnant population must remain even during poor conditions. The fact 674 that at least some anchovy have been caught in all 24 years of the SoG age-0 Pacific Herring surveys 675 suggests that this is plausible. Early accounts (Swan, 1894) describe anchovy as arriving in SS waters 676 from elsewhere as a distinct run, being present from May to November. It is possible that historical 677 abundance was driven by migration of fish from outside the SS (possibly during a period of very large

678 coastal populations), while contemporary dynamics are driven by recruitment within the SS. If the

679 frequency and duration of warm periods increases, anchovy may become a more persistent and important680 component of the SS ecosystem.

681 **4.3.** Ecosystem Implications

682 The Salish Sea is an ecosystem in a state of flux, and when abundant, anchovy may play pivotal 683 roles as competitors, prey, or predation buffers. The changing quality of the SS as a nursery for culturally, 684 economically and ecologically valuable Pacific salmon stocks has received considerable recent attention (e.g., Beamish et al., 2000; Beamish et al., 2010; Beamish et al., 2012; Zimmerman et al., 2015). Some 685 686 species and stocks of Pacific salmon exhibited drastic declines in early marine survival in the 1970-80s 687 and have not yet recovered. It is currently unclear how abundant anchovy could influence survival of 688 juvenile Pacific salmon in the SS. Chamberlin et al. (2017) suggested that while abundant Pacific Herring 689 (the dominant forage fish in the Salish Sea) may inhibit juvenile Chinook Salmon growth through 690 competition, larger juvenile Chinook Salmon may experience enhanced growth when Pacific Herring 691 small enough to utilize as prey are abundant. Anchovy are planktivorous, and potentially could also act as 692 competitors to juvenile salmon. As anchovy spawn throughout the summer in the SS, larvae and small 693 juveniles may be more accessible to piscivorous juvenile salmon than larger age-0 Pacific Herring 694 produced by late winter spawning. Indeed, in 2016 larval and post-larval anchovy were observed in the 695 stomach contents of juvenile Chinook Salmon captured in summer juvenile salmon trawl surveys in the 696 SoG (C. Neville, unpublished data) and in hook and line sampling in the Southern Gulf Islands (W. Duguid, unpublished data). Recent work in the California Current has suggested that age-0 anchovy 697 698 abundance may be a key regulator of juvenile Chinook Salmon growth during the transition to piscivory 699 (Litz et al., 2016). If anchovy become consistently abundant in the SS it will be important to consider 700 their role in the trophic ecology of juvenile Pacific salmon.

701 In addition to acting as competitors or prey, abundant anchovy could potentially reduce predation 702 pressure on juvenile salmon and other species in the SS. The presence of one highly abundant prey 703 species has the potential to buffer predation mortality and increase survival of other prey species in an 704 ecosystem (eg. Willette et al., 1999; Weitkamp et al., 2011; Wells et al., 2017). Harbour seal abundance 705 has increased dramatically in the SS in recent decades, and there is mounting evidence that seal predation 706 is impacting juvenile salmon survival (Berejikian et al., 2016; Thomas et al., 2016; Chasco et al., 2017). Harbor seals in the Salish Sea do eat anchovy, particularly in winter and spring (Lance and Jefferies, 707 708 2009; Lance et al., 2012), and could be expected to target them when abundant. Concurrent with 709 increased abundance of anchovy, acoustic tag-based survival estimates for Nisqualley River juvenile 710 Steelhead (Oncorhynchus mykiss) migrating out of PS increased from 6% to 38% between 2014 and 2016 711 (Megan Moore, NOAA, pers. com.). Predation buffering by abundant anchovy is one hypothesis to

r12 explain this change. Interactions among predators and multiple prey species may also exhibit more

713 complex dynamics. For example, off California predation pressure on juvenile Chinook Salmon by

- common murres (*Uria aalge*) is low when juvenile rockfish (*Sebastes spp.*) are abundant offshore, but
- increases when murres switch to feeding on anchovy which overlap spatially with the juvenile salmon
- closer to the coast (Wells et al., 2017).

717 Given that anchovy have been scarce during the bulk of the period of intensive fisheries research 718 in the SS, hypotheses about their role in the ecosystem remain very speculative. Nevertheless, British 719 Columbia coastal waters are warming (Chandler et al., 2016), and results of the present study suggest that 720 this warming may lead to more consistent abundance of anchovy in the SS. It has been suggested that 721 warming of the SS may be directly and/or indirectly related to declines in survival of juvenile Pacific 722 Salmon, particularly Coho Salmon (Beamish et al., 2010) and Chinook Salmon (Beamish et al., 2012). If 723 anchovy become more abundant they could exacerbate the negative effects of warming as competitors 724 and/or mitigate warming effects as prey and/or buffers against predation. Conversely it is also 725 conceivable that changes in the SS due to warming, including reduced predation by juvenile salmon, 726 could play a causal role in increased anchovy abundance through higher juvenile anchovy survival. 727 Regardless of the polarity of causal relationships, our results suggest that anchovy should be taken 728 account in attempts to model the response of the SS ecosystem to a changing climate.

729 **4.4.** Conclusions

730 Anchovy have not been considered an important species in the Salish Sea ecosystem during the period of 731 modern fisheries research. However, this species was at least periodically abundant in the SS prior to the 732 20th century, and has experienced periodic spikes in abundance over the past century. Probably the most 733 pronounced of these periods since the 1940s began in 2014 or 2015 and has extended at least into the 734 spring of 2017. Historical and contemporary data indicate that anchovy exhibit consistent patterns of distribution in the SS. The Fraser River plume and mainland shore of the SoG and South PS appear to be 735 736 regions of consistent occurrence. Spawning, possibly concentrated in the Fraser River Plume, peaks in 737 mid-summer. Age-0 anchovy may be concentrated in nearshore habitats by fall and adults are present in the SS year-round. Abundance of anchovy in the SS appears to correspond to, or lag, periods of elevated 738 739 ocean temperature, and is positively correlated with two year-averaged indices of Salish Sea and coastal 740 SST. While plausible mechanisms exist by which abundance of anchovy in coastal regions could 741 influence abundance within the Salish Sea, this does not seem to be a necessary cause for fluctuations in 742 abundance. Continued warming of the Salish Sea may lead to greater abundance and persistence of 743 anchovy, with potentially important consequences for the ecosystem as a whole. Population genetic 744 research is warranted to test the hypothesis that anchovy within the SS are largely reproductively isolated 745 from the rest of the northern subpopulation. Development of a systematic survey to assess spawning stock

biomass in the SS may also be warranted. Studies investigating the current and future trajectories of the

747 SS ecosystem should consider possible interactions between temperature, anchovy abundance, and other

species in the ecosystem.

749 5. Acknowledgements

- 750 This is Publication Number #### from the Salish Sea Marine Survival Project: an international,
- collaborative research effort designed to determine the primary factors affecting the survival of juvenile
- 752 Chinook and Coho Salmon and Steelhead in the combined marine waters of Puget Sound and Strait of
- 753 Georgia (marinesurvivalproject.com). The authors would like to thank Cheryl Morgan (OSU) and Kym
- Jacobson (NOAA) and Kristen Hinton and Lorna Wargo (WDFW) for providing Columbia River plume
- 755 Survey and Washington/Oregon catch data, respectively. Bruce Bradshaw (Marine Environmental Data
- 756 Section DFO) provided SST data from SoG buoys. Anne Shaffer (Coastal Watershed Institute) provided
- visitive useful insights and shared additional Elwha beach seine data. The manuscript benefitted from thorough
- reviews by Dr. Richard Brodeur (NOAA) and an anonymous reviewer. Other data presented in this study
- vere collected by the authors and other collaborators through research funded by NOAA, WDFW, and
- 760 DFO. The first author was supported through an NSERC CGS scholarship and a MITACS accelerate
- fellowship in partnership with the Pacific Salmon Foundation as part of the Salish Sea Marine Survival
- 762 Project. The manuscript benefited from a review by Joshua Chamberlin (NOAA).

763 **6. References**

764

771

774

- Auth, T.D., Daly, E.A., Brodeur, R.D., Fisher, J.L., 2018. Phenological and distributional shifts in
- ichthyoplankton associated with recent warming in the northeast Pacific Ocean. Glob. Chang. Biol. 24,
 259–272.
- Bakun, A., 2006. Wasp-waist populations and marine ecosystem dynamics: navigating the "predator pit"
 topographies. Prog. in Oceanogr. 68, 271–288.
- Barraclough, W.E., 1967. Occurrence of larval herring (*Clupea pallasii*) in the Strait of Georgia during
 July 1966. J. of the Fish. Res. Board of Can. 24 (11), 2455–2460.
- Bates, D., Maechler, M., Bolker, B., Walker, S., 2015. Fitting linear mixed–effects models using lme4. J.
 of Stat. Softw. 67 (1), 1–48, doi:10.18637/jss.v067.i01.
- Beamish, R.J., Jordan, F.P., Scarsbrook, J.R., Page, R., 1976. An initial study of fishes inhabiting the
 surface waters of the Strait of Georgia. M.V. Caligus July–August, 1974. Fish. Res. Board of Can.
- 780 Manuscr. Rep. Ser. 1377.
- Beamish, R.J., Neville, C.M., 1995. Pacific salmon and Pacific herring mortalities in the Fraser River
 plume caused by river lamprey (*Lampetra ayresi*). Can. J. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 52 (3), 644–650.
- Beamish, R.J., McCaughran, D., King, J.R., Sweeting, R.M., McFarlane, G.A., 2000. Estimating the
 abundance of juvenile Coho Salmon in the Strait of Georgia by means of surface trawls. N. Am. J. of
 Fish. Manag. 20, 369–375.
- Beamish, R.J., Sweeting, R.M., Lange, K.L., Noakes, D.J., 2010. Early marine survival of Coho Salmon
 in the Strait of Georgia declines to very low levels. Mar. and Coast. Fish.: Dyn., Manag., and Ecosyst.
 Sci. 2, 424–439.
- 792793 Beamish, R.J., Sweeting
- Beamish, R.J., Sweeting, R.M., Neville, C.M., Lange, K.L., Beacham, T.D., Preikshot, D., 2012. Wild
 Chinook Salmon survive better than hatchery salmon in a period of poor production. Environ. Biol. of
 Fishes 94, 135–148.
- 796

- Beamish, R.J., 2014. The Fishes, in: Beamish, R., McFarlane, G. (Eds.), The Sea Among Us: The
 Amazing Strait of Georgia. Harbour Publishing, Madeira Park, British Columbia, pp. 103–182.
- Beare, D., Burns, F., Jones, E., Peach, K., Portilla, E., Greig, T., McKenzie, E., Reid, D., 2004. An
 increase in the abundance of anchovies and sardines in the north–western North Sea since 1995. Glob.
 Chang. Biol. 10, 1209–1213.
- 803
- Berejikian, B.A., Moore, M.E., Jeffries, S.J., 2016. Predator–prey interactions between harbor seals and
 migrating steelhead trout smolts revealed by acoustic telemetry. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 543, 21–35.
- 806
- 807 Boldt, J.L., Thompson, M., Fort, C., Rooper, C.N., Schweigert, J., Quinn II, T.J., Hay, D., Therriault,
- 808 T.W., 2015. An index of relative biomass, abundance, and condition of juvenile Pacific Herring (Clupea
- *pallasi*) in the Strait of Georgia, British Columbia. Can. Manuscr. Rep. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 3081, x–
 80.
- 811

- 812 Brewer, G.D., 1976. Thermal tolerance and resistance of the anchovy, *Engraulis mordax*. Fish. Bull. 74 (2), 433–435.
- 814
- 815 Brodeur, R.D., Fisher, J.P., Emmett, R.L., Morgan, C.A., Casillas, E., 2005. Species composition and
- community structure of pelagic nekton off Oregon and Washington under variable oceanographic
 conditions. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 298, 41–57.
- 818
- 819 Brodeur, R.D., Buchanan, J.C., Emmett, R.L., 2014. Pelagic and demersal fish predators on juvenile and 820 adult forage fishes in the Northern California Current: spatial and temporal variations. Calif. Coop.
- 821 Ocean. Fish. Investig. Rep. 55, 96–116.
- 822
 823 Chamberlin, J.W., Greene, C.M., Beckman, B.R., Rice, C.A., Hall, J.E., 2017. Competitor or predator:
 824 how size and abundance structure individual growth in an ontogenetically piscivorous fish. Ecol. and
 825 Evol. 7 (17), 6981–6995.
- 826
- 827 Chandler, P.C., King, S.A., Perry, R.I., 2016. State of the Physical, Biological, and Selected Fishery
- Resources of Pacific Canadian Marine Ecosystems in 2015. Can. Tech. Rep. in Fish. and Aquat. Sci.
 3179.
- 830
- 831 Chasco, B., Kaplan, I.C., Thomas, A., Acevedo–Gutiérrez, A., Noren, D., Ford, M.J., Hanson, M.B.,
- 832 Scordino, J., Jeffries, S., Pearson, S., Marshall, K.N., 2017. Estimates of Chinook salmon consumption in
- Washington State inland waters by four marine mammal predators from 1970 to 2015. Can. J. of Fish.
 and Aquat. Sci. https://doi.org/10.1139/cjfas-2016-0203.
 - 834 835
 - Chavez, F.P., Ryan, J., Lluch–Cota, S.E., Ñiquen, M., 2003. From anchovies to sardines and back:
 multidecadal change in the Pacific Ocean. Sci. 299 (5604), 217–221.
 - Checkley Jr, D.M., Asch, R.G., Rykaczewski, R.R., 2017. Climate, anchovy, and sardine. Annu. Rev. of
 Mar. Sci. 9, 469–493.
 - 841

- 842 Cury, P., Bakun, A., Crawford, R.J.M., Jarre, A., Quiñones, R.A., Shannon, L.J., Verheye, H.M., 2000.
- Small pelagics in upwelling systems: patterns of interaction and structural changes in "wasp-waist"
 ecosystems. ICES J. of Mar. Sci. 57, 603–618.
- 845
- 846 Dale, K.E., Daly, E.A., Brodeur, R.D., 2017. Interannual variability in the feeding and condition of
- Bale, K.E., Daly, E.A., Brodeur, K.D., 2017. Interaindar variability in the recently and condition of
 subyearling Chinook salmon off Oregon and Washington in relation to fluctuating ocean conditions. Fish.
 Oceanogr. 26 (1), 1–16.
- Bavidson, P.C., Sydeman, W.J., Thayer, J.A., 2017. Are there temporal or spatial gaps in recent estimates
 of anchovy off California. Calif. Coop. Ocean. Fish. Investig. Rep. 58, 1–13.
- 852 853 Emmett, R.L., Bentley, P.J., Schiewe, M.H., 1997. Abundance and distribution of anchovy eggs and
 - larvae (*Engraulis mordax*) off the Oregon coast, mid 1970's vs. 1994 and 1995, Forage fishes in marine
- 855 ecosystems. Alaska Sea Grant College Program, Fairbanks, AK, pp. 505–508.
- 856
- Foerster, R.E., 1941. Report of the Pacific Biological Station for 1941. Fisheries Research Board of
 Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 859
- Foerster, R.E., 1942. Annual Report of the Pacific Biological Station for 1942. Fisheries Research Board
 of Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 862

- Foerster, R.E., 1947. Annual Report of the Pacific Biological Station for 1947. Fisheries Research Board
 of Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- Foerster, R.E., 1948. Annual Report of the Pacific Biological Station for 1948. Fisheries Research Board
 of Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 868

875

669 Gartz, R., 2004. Length-weight relationships for 18 fish species common to the San Francisco estuary.

- 870 Interag. Ecol. Progr. for the San Franc. Estuary 17 (2), 49–57.871
- Greene C., Kuehne, L., Rice, C., Fresh, K., Penttila, D., 2015. Forty years of change in forage fish and
 jellyfish abundance across greater Puget Sound, Washington (USA): anthropogenic and climate
 associations. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 525, 153–170.
- Hart, J.L., 1934. Annual Report on the Investigation of Ocean Fisheries 1933–34. Biological Board of
 Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 878
 879 Hart, J.L., 1935. Annual Report on the Investigation of Ocean Fisheries 1934–35. Biological Board of
 880 Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 881
 882 Hart, J.L., 1951. Annual Report for 1951 of the Pacific Biological Station. Fisheries Research Board of
 883 Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- Kosro, P.M., Peterson, W.T., Hickey, B.M., Shearman, R.K., Pierce, S.D., 2006. Physical versus
 biological spring transition: 2005. Geophys. Res. Lett. 33 (L22S03), 1–6.
- Lance, M.M., Jeffries, S.J., 2009. Harbor seal diet in Hood Canal, South Puget Sound and the
- 889 San Juan Island archipelago. Contract Report to Pacific States Marine Fisheries Commission for
- Job Code 497; NOAA Award No. NA05NMF4391151. Washington Department of Fish and
 Wildlife, Olympia, Washington.
- Lance, M.M., Chang, W-Y., Jefferies, S.J., Pearson, S.F., Acevedo-Gutiérrez, A., 2012. Harbor seal diet
 in northern Puget Sound: implications for recovery of depressed fish stocks. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 464,
 257–271.
- 896
- Langevin, H.L., 1873. Annual report of the Department of Marine and Fisheries for the year ending the
 30th June, 1872. Queen's Printer, Ottawa, Ontario.
- Laroche, J.L., Richardson, S.L., 1981. Reproduction of anchovy, *Engraulis mordax*, off Oregon and
 Washington. Fish. Bull. U.S. 78, 603–618.
- Lindegren, M., Checkley Jr., D.M., Rouyer, T., MacCall, A.D., Stenseth, N.C., 2013. Climate, fishing,
 and fluctuations of sardine and anchovy in the California Current. Proc. of the Natl. Acad. of Sci. 110,
 13672–13677.
- 906

- Litz, M.N.C., Emmett, R.L., Heppell, S.S., Brodeur, R.D., 2008. Ecology and distribution of the northern
 subpopulation of Northern Anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*) off the U.S. West Coast. Calif. Coop. Ocean.
- 909 Fish. Investig. Rep. 49, 167–182.
- 910 911 Litz, M.N.C., Miller, J.A., Copeman, L.A., Teel, D.J., Weitkamp, L.A., Daly, E.A., Claiborne, A.M.,
- 912 2016. Ontogenetic shifts in the diet of juvenile Chinook Salmon: new insight from stable isotopes and
- 913 fatty acids. Environ. Biol. of Fish. DOI: 10.1007/s10641-016-0542-5.

915 MacCall, A.D., 1990. Dynamic geography of marine fish populations. Washington Sea Grant Program,

- 916 Seattle, Washington.917
- MacCall, A.D., Sydeman, W.J., Davison, P.C., Thayer, J.A., 2016. Recent collapse of anchovy biomass
 off California. Fish. Res. 175, 87–94.
- 920
 921 McHugh, J.L., 1951. Meristic variations and populations of anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*). Berkeley:
 922 University of California Press, Oakland, CA.
- Mackas, D., Galbraith, M., Faust, D., Masson, D., Young, K., Shaw, W., Romaine, S., Trudel, M., Dower,
 J., Campbell, R., Sastri, A., Bornhold Pechter, E.A., Pakhomov, E., El–Sabaawi, R., 2013. Zooplankton
 time series from the Strait of Georgia: Results from year–round sampling at deep water locations, 1990–
 2010. Prog. in Oceanogr. 115, 129–159.
- 928
- 929 McClatchie, S., Field, J., Thompson, A.R., Gerrodette, T., Lowry, M., Fiedler, P.C., Watson, W., Nieto,
- K.M., Vetter, R.D., 2016. Food limitation of sea lion pups and the decline of forage off central and
 southern California. R. Soc. Open Sci. 3 (4), 160192.
- 932

McKechnie, I., Moss, M.L., 2016. Meta-analysis in zooarchaeology expands perspectives on Indigenous
 fisheries of the Northwest Coast of North America. J. of Archaeol. Sci.: Rep. 8, 470–485.

935

McKinnell, S., Curchitser, E., Groot, C., Kaeriyama, M., Trudel, M., 2014. Oceanic and atmospheric
extremes motivate a new hypothesis for variable marine survival of Fraser River Sockeye Salmon. Fish.
Oceanogr. 24 (4), 322–341.

939

McKinnell, S., Perry, R.I., 2016. Number, size composition and food of larval and juvenile fish caught
with a two-boat surface trawl in the Strait of Georgia 1968, 1969, and 1973. Can. Data Rep. of Fish. and
Aquat. Sci. 1264.

943

944 Miller, B., Gunderson, D., Dinnel, P., Donnelly, R., Armstrong, D., Brown, S., 1990. Recommended

945 guidelines for sampling soft–bottom demersal fishes by beach seine and trawl in Puget Sound,

- 946 Recommended protocols for measuring selected environmental variables in Puget Sound, Volume 2. US
- 947 Environmental Protection Agency and Fisheries Research Institute Report, Puget Sound Estuary Program,
 948 Washington.
- 949
- Moore, S.K., Mantua, N.J., Newton, J.A., Kawase, M., Warner, M.J., Kellogg, J.P., 2008. A descriptive
 analysis of temporal and spatial patterns of variability in Puget Sound oceanographic properties. Estuar.,
 Coast. and Shelf Sci. 80 (4), 545–554.
- 952 Coast. and Shelf Sci. 80 (4), 545–554 953
- 954 O'Connell, J.M., 1998. Holocene fish remains from Saanich Inlet, British Columbia, Canada: A
- 955 paleoecological study (M.Sc. Thesis). University of Victoria, British Columbia, Canada.
- 956
- Parnel, M.M., Emmett, R.L., Brodeur, R.D., 2008. Ichthyoplankton community in the Columbia River
 plume off Oregon: effects of fluctuating oceanographic conditions. Fish. Bull. 106, 161–173.
- 959
- Pierson, N., 2011. Bridging troubled waters: zooarchaeology and marine conservation on Burrard Inlet,
 southwest British Columbia (MA Thesis). Simon Fraser University, British Columbia, Canada.
- Pike, G.C., 1951. Age, growth and maturity studies on the Pacific anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*) from the
 coast of British Columbia (M.A. Thesis). University of British Columbia, British Columbia, Canada.

968

- 966 R Core Team (2016). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
 967 Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL https://www.R-project.org/.
- Radway, A.K., 1969. Annual Report and Investigator's Summaries 1969. Fisheries Research Board of
 Canada, Nanaimo, British Columbia.
- 972 Rice, C.A., Greene, C.M., Moran, P., Teel, D.J., Kuligowski, D.R., Reisenbichler, R.R., Beamer, E.M.,
- 873 Karr, J.R., Fresh, K.L., 2011. Abundance, stock origin, and length of marked and unmarked juvenile
- Chinook Salmon in the surface waters of Greater Puget Sound. Trans. of the Am. Fish. Soc. 140 (1), 170–189.
- 976
- Richardson, S.L., 1981. Spawning Biomass and early life of anchovy, *Engraulis mordax*, in the northern
 subpopulation off Oregon and Washington. Fish. Bull. 78, 855–876.
- 980 Sabatés, A.N.A., Martín, P., Lloret, J., Raya, V., 2006. Sea warming and fish distribution: the case of the
- small pelagic fish, *Sardinella aurita*, in the western Mediterranean. Glob. Chang. Biol. 12 (11), 2209–
 2219.
- 983
- Schnute, J.T., Boers, N.M., Haigh, R., Couture–Beil, A., 2008. PBS Mapping 2.57: User's Guide. Can.
 Tech. Rep. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 2549.
- 986
- 987 Schwartzlose, R.A., Alheit, J., Bakun, A., Baumgartner, T.R., Cloete, R., Crawford, R.J.M., Fletcher,
- 988 W.J., Green–Ruiz, Y., Hagen, E., Kawasaki, T., Lluch–Belda, D., Lluch–Cota, S.E., MacCall, A.D.,
- 989 Matsuura, Y., Nevárez–Martínez, M.O., Parrish, R.H., Roy, C., Serra, R., Shust, K.V., Ward, M.N.,
- Zuzunaga, J.Z., 1999. Worldwide large–scale fluctuations of sardine and anchovy populations. South
 African J. of Mar. Sci. 21 (1), 289–347.
- 992
- Schweigert, J.F., Hay, D.E., Therriault, T.W., Thompson, M., Haegele, C.W., 2009. Recruitment
 forecasting using indices of young–of–the year Pacific Herring (*Clupea pallasi*) abundance in the Strait of
 Georgia (BC). ICES J. of Mar. Sci. 66, 1681–1687.
- 995 G 996
- Suckley, G., 1860. Report upon the fishes exclusive of the Salmonidae, Reports or Explorations and
 Surveys to ascertain the most practical and economical route for a railway from the Mississippi River to
 the Pacific Ocean, vol. XII, book II, Thomas H. Ford Printer, Washington, D.C., pp. 350–368.
- 1000
- Swan, J.G., 1894. Notes on the fisheries and fishery industries of Puget Sound, Bulletin of the United
 States Fish Commission for 1893. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C., pp. 371–380.
- 10031004 Therriault, T.W., McDiarmid, A.N., Wulff, W., Hay, D.E., 2002. Review of anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*)
- biology and fisheries, with suggested management options for British Columbia. Can. Sci. Advis. Secr.
 Res. 2002/112.
- 1007
- Therriault, T.W., Hay, D.E., Schweigert, J.F., 2009. Biologic overview and trends in pelagic forage fish
 abundance in the Salish Sea (Strait of Georgia, British Columbia). Mar. Ornithol. 37, 3–8.
- 1010
- 1011 Thomas, A.C., Nelson, B.W., Lance, M.M., Deagle, B.E., Trites, A.W., 2016. Harbour seals target 1012 juvenile salmon of conservation concern. Can. J. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 999, 1–15.
- 1012 juvenil 1013
- 1014 Thompson, M., Fort, C., Boldt, J., 2016. Strait of Georgia juvenile herring survey, September 2014. Can.
- 1015 Manuscr. Rep. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 3087.

1022

1025

1028

1031

Thomson, R.E., 1981. Oceanography of the British Columbia coast. Can. Spec. Publ. in Fish. and Aquat.
Sci. 56, 1–291.

- 1020 Thomson, R.E., Mihály, S.F., Kulikov, E.A., 2007. Estuarine versus transient flow regimes in Juan de 1021 Fuca Strait. J. of Geophys. Res.: Oceans 112 (C9), 1–25.
- 1023 Tourre, Y.M., Lluch–Cota, S.E., White, W.B., 2007. Global multi–decadal ocean climate and small– 1024 pelagic fish population. Environ. Res. Lett. 2 (3), 1–9.
- Tully, J.P., Dodimead, A.J., 1956. Properties of the water in the Strait of Georgia, British Columbia, and influencing factors. J. of the Fish. Res. Board of Can. 14 (3), 241–319.
- 1029 Velarde, E., Ezcurra, E., Anderson, D.W., 2015. Seabird diet predicts following-season commercial catch
 1030 of Gulf of California Pacific Sardine and anchovy. J. of Mar. Syst. 146, 82–88.
- Watson, W., Sandknop, E.M., 1996. Engraulidae, in: Moser, H.G. (Ed.), The early stages of fishes in the
 California Current region. Allen Press Inc., Lawrence, KS, pp. 173–183.
- 1034
- 1035 Weitkamp, L.A., Orsi, J.A., Myers, K.W., Francis, R.C., 2011. Contrasting early marine ecology of
- 1036 Chinook salmon and coho salmon in Southeast Alaska: insight into factors affecting marine survival.
 1037 Mar. and Coast. Fish. 3 (1), 233–249.
- 1038

1039 Wells, B.K., Santora, J.A., Henderson, M.J., Warzybok, P., Jahncke, J., Bradley, R.W., Huff, D.D.,

- Schroeder, I.D., Nelson, P., Field, J.C., Ainley, D.G., 2017. Environmental conditions and prey–switching
 by a seabird predator impact juvenile salmon survival. J. of Mar. Syst. 174, 54–63.
- 1043 Willette, T.M., Cooney, R.T., Hyer., K., 1999. Predator foraging mode shifts affecting mortality of 1044 juvenile fishes during the subarctic spring bloom. Can. J. of Fish. and Aquat. Sci. 56 (3), 364–376.
- 1045

- Zimmerman, M.S., Irvine, J.R., O'Neill, M., Anderson, J.H., Greene, C.M., Weinheimer, J., Trudel, M.,
- Rawson, K., 2015. Spatial and temporal patterns in smolt survival of wild and hatchery Coho Salmon in
- 1048 the Salish Sea. Mar. and Coast. Fish. 7 (1), 116–134.

1049 **7. Tables**

1050

- 1051 Table 1. Data sets utilized to investigate spatiotemporal distribution and trends in abundance of Northern Anchovy in the Salish Sea. 'Spatial Sets'
- 1052 indicates the number of gear deployments used in maps of spatiotemporal distribution. 'Time Series Sets', indicates the number of gear
- 1053 deployments used in developing a quantitative index of anchovy abundance. 'Qualitative Time Series' indicates whether or not a given data set
- 1054 was included in a qualitative index of anchovy abundance.

			Depth		Months	Spatial	Time Series	Qualitative		
	Gear/Deployment Time	Figures	Range (m)	Years Used	Used	Sets (N)	Sets (N)	Time Series	Methods Reference	Comments
SoG Zooplankton Database	Various, analysis limited to sets fished from at least 15 m to the surface	4, 9, 13	0-420	2000-16	Mar-Sept	435	1420	Yes	Mackas et al. 2013	
SoG Age-0 Herring Surveys	183 by 27 m purse seine (9.5 mm mesh bunt)	5, 11, 13	0	1992-94, 1996- 2016	Sept-Oct	1056	1056	Yes	Schweigert et al. 2009, Boldt et al. 2015, Thompson et al. 2016	Night time sets at standard stations
SoG Juvenile Salmon Trawl Surveys	${\sim}14$ by 30 m rope trawl with 1 cm cod end liner, 30 minute tows	6, 11	0-80	2015-16	June-July, Sept-Oct	458	NA	No	Beamish et al. 2000	Most sets on standard (1998 to present) track lines.
Fraser River Plume Study (tow net)	3 by 6 m surface trawl; 1.3 cm cod end; integrated 350 μm plankton net,10 minute tows	7, 13	0	1966-69, 1973	June-July	196	196	Yes	Barraclough 1967, McKinnell and Perry 2016	Effort varied between years, trawl fished between two vessels
SoG R/V Neocaligus Trawl	4 by 4 m (2014-15) and 5-6 by 15-20 m (2016) trawls with ~1.3 cm cod end, 15 minute tows	10, 11	0-30	2014-16	May-Sept	NA	NA	No		Focused on edge of Robert's Bank in 2014-2015 and Howe Sound in 2016
Puget Sound Midwater Trawl	7.3 by 7.3 m trawl with 1 cm liner in cod end, 15 minute tows	8, 11	15-141	2016	Feb-Dec	184	NA	No		Sets at depth of acoustic targets identified by lead vessel
Skagit Bay Townet Surveys	3.1 by 6.1 m trawl, 6 mm cod end, 10 min tow	13	0	2001-16	Aug-Sept	NA	871	Yes	Rice et al. 2011	Two vessel trawl
Southern SoG Townet	3.1 by 6.1 m trawl, 6 mm cod end, 10 min tow	13	0	1974-77, 2003, 2011	June-Sept	NA	226	Yes	Greene et al. 2015	Two vessel trawl; primarily nighttime in 73-85 daytime in 1972, 2003, and 2011
Whidbey Basin Townet	3.1 by 6.1 m trawl, 6 mm cod end, 10 min tow	13	0	1972, 1983-85, 2003, 2011	June-Sept	NA	444	Yes	Greene et al. 2015	Two vessel trawl; primarily nighttime in 73-85 daytime in 1972, 2003, and 2011
Central Puget Sound Townet	3.1 by 6.1 m trawl, 6 mm cod end, 10 min tow	13	0	1976-85, 2002- 03, 2011	June-Sept	NA	513	Yes	Greene et al. 2015	Two vessel trawl; primarily nighttime in 73-85 daytime in 1972, 2003, and 2011
South Puget Sound Townet	3.1 by 6.1 m trawl, 6 mm cod end, 10 min tow	13	0	1976-82, 2003, 2011	June-Sept	NA	197	Yes	Greene et al. 2015	Two vessel trawl; primarily nighttime in 73-85 daytime in 1972, 2003, and 2011
Snohomish Beach Seine	37 by 3.1 m (bag) beach seine, 3.2 mm mesh in bag, ideal swept area = 1200 m^2	13	0	2001-09	Aug-Sept	NA	139	Yes	Miller et al. 1990	Only included sets at sites where anchovy encountered at least once
Elwha Beach Seine	37 by 3.1 m (bag) beach seine, 3.2 mm mesh in bag, ideal swept area = 1200 m^2	13	0	2005-16	Apr-Sept	NA	1031	Yes	Miller et al. 1990	Only included sets at sites where anchovy encountered at least once
BC Commercial Catch Records	NA	12	NA	1940-2016		NA	NA	Yes		Commercial catch data specific to the SoG only reported for 1940-46
Puget Sound Commercial Catch Records	NA	12	NA	1940-2016		NA	NA	Yes		Provided by WDFW
Annual Reports of Pacific Biological Station and related documents	NA	NA	NA	See Suppl. Material		NA	NA	Yes	See Suppl. Material	
Beamish and Neville Plume Surveys	4 by 4 m trawl, 5 mm mesh cod end	NA	0	1989-93	June-July	NA	400	Yes	Beamish and Neville 1995	
Beamish Strait of Georgia Purse Seine	402 by 33 m purse seine, 6 mm bunt	NA	0	1974	July-Aug	NA	50	Yes	Beamish 1976	

- 1056 8. Figures Captions
- 1057 1058

1059 Figure 1. The Salish Sea consists of the Strait of Georgia (SoG), Strait of Juan de Fuca (SJF) and Puget

1060 Sound (PS). Inset box (a) corresponds to Figure 2 and maps of SoG zooplankton sample data (Figure 4)

and age–0 Pacific Herring surveys (Figure 5); box (b) corresponds to Figure 3 and maps of PS mid–water

trawl surveys (Figure 7). Bathymetry data are the GEBCO_2014 Grid, version 20150318,

- 1063 http://www.gebco.net.
- 1064

1065 Figure 2. The Strait of Georgia and northern Strait of Juan de Fuca. Sites referenced in the present study

1066 include (SST and salinity data sites indicated in italics): (JI) Jervis Inlet, (DS) Desolation Sound, (CM)

1067 *Cape Mudge*, (SS) Sentry Shoal, (TI) Texada Island, (PH) Pender Harbour, (HS) Howe Sound, (BS)

1068 Baynes Sound, (MS) Malaspina Strait, (CI) Chrome Island, (HB) Halibut Bank, (BI) Burrard Inlet, (EI)

1069 Entrance Island, (DB) Departure Bay, (RB) Roberts Bank, (BB) Boundary Bay, (L) Ladysmith, (SGI)

1070 Southern Gulf Islands, (AP) Active Pass, (SSI) Saltspring Island, (CB) Cowichan Bay, (SI) Saanich Inlet,

1071 (SJI) San Juan Islands, (HSt) Haro Strait, (V) Victoria, (RR) Race Rocks. Bathymetry data are the

1072 GEBCO_2014 Grid, version 20150318, http://www.gebco.net. Note: The deepest part of Jervis Inlet is

- 1073 depicted here as 500 m deep but in fact reaches depths of up to 670 m.
- 1074

Figure 3. Puget Sound and the eastern part of the Strait of Juan de Fuca (SJF). Sites referenced in the
present study include: (SSG) Southern Strait of Georgia, (SJI) San Juan Islands, (SB) Skagit Bay, (WB)
Whidbey Basin, (EE) Elwha River Estuary, (SE) Snohomish River Estuary, (CPS) Central Puget Sound,
(TN) Tacoma Narrows, (NE) Nisqually River Estuary, (SPS) South Puget Sound. Bathymetry data are the
GEBCO_2014 Grid, version 20150318, http://www.gebco.net.

1080

1081 Figure 4. Locations (red filled points) of anchovy eggs (a–c) and larvae/juveniles (d–f) encountered in

1082 435 zooplankton samples (x indicate tows with no catch of anchovy eggs, larvae, or juveniles) covering at

least the top 15 m of the water column and collected between March and August of 2015 and 2016.

1084 Arrow in (a) indicates the location of a station in Malaspina Strait where eggs or larvae were encountered

1085 in 7 of 9 tows conducted between 11 May and 14 August 2015.

1086

1087 Figure 5. Proportion of sets encountering anchovy in fall (September or October) night time age–0 Pacific

1088 Herring surveys conducted by DFO between 1992 and 2016 in the SoG. One set was conducted annually

1089 (except 1995) at each of 3 to 5 stations on each numbered transect. Inset shows % presence at each station

1090 on transects 10 and 11 (Malaspina Strait); x indicates stations with no catches.

1092

- Figure 6. Tow locations and log + 1 transformed anchovy catch per hour in DFO juvenile salmon trawl
 surveys in 2015 (a. 24 June to July 9 and b. 16 September to 6 October) and 2016 (c. 5 July to 14 July and
 d. 17 to 26 October); x indicates tows with 0 catch.
- 1096

Figure 7. Tow locations and log + 1 transformed anchovy catch per tow (a–e) in June and July surface
two-vessel trawl surveys in 1966–69 (a–d) and 1973 (e); x indicates tows with 0 catch.

1099

1100 Figure 8. Tow locations and log + 1 transformed anchovy catch (numbers) per tow in February (a), April

- (b), June (c), August (d), October (e), and December (f) for mid–water trawl surveys conducted by
- 1102 WDFW in 2016; x indicates tows with 0 catch.
- 1103

Figure 9. Monthly % presence of anchovy eggs and larvae/juveniles in zooplankton samples from the Strait of Georgia and Strait of Juan de Fuca covering at least the top 15 m of the water column between

- Strait of Georgia and Strait of Juan de Fuca covering at least the top 15 m of the water column between
 February and October of 2015 and 2016. Error bars are standard error of proportions.
- 1107

1108Figure 10. Monthly size frequency distribution (fork length in mm) of anchovy caught in DFO surveys by1109the R/V CCGS Neocaligus in 2014, 2015 and 2016. Fishing locations were the edge of Robert's Bank in

- 1110 2014 and 2015 and Howe Sound in 2016.
- 1111

1112 Figure 11. Monthly size (fork length in mm) frequency distribution of anchovy caught in four survey

- 1113 programs between February and December 2016, sample sizes for each survey in each month are 1114 indicated on the panels.
- 1115

1116 Figure 12. Reported commercial catches of anchovy (kg) from 1940 to 2016 in a. Puget Sound and b. the

1117 Strait of Georgia (see section 2.4.10 and Table 1 for details). The dashed horizontal line indicates the

1118 threshold (10,000 kg) between catches considered to indicate 'abundance' (score = 1) vs those considered

- 1119 to indicate only 'presence' (score = 0.5) in generating a qualitative index of abundance. Note that vertical
- 1120 axis range differs between the two panels.
- 1121
- 1122 Figure 13. Proportion of sets capturing anchovy in a variety of fishery–independent surveys from 1966 to
- 1123 2016 (see section 2.4 and Table 1 for details): a. SoG Zooplankton Database, b. SoG Age–0 Pacific
- 1124 Herring Surveys, c. Fraser River Plume Study (tow net), d. Southern Strait of Georgia tow net, e. Skagit

1125 Bay tow net, f. Whidbey Basin tow net, g. Central Puget Sound tow net, h. South Puget Sound tow net, i.

- 1127 catches considered to indicate 'abundance' (score = 1), 'presence' (score = 0.5), or 'scarcity/absence'
- 1128 (score = 0) in generating a qualitative index of abundance. Note that vertical axis range and threshold
- 1129 levels differ between (a) and (b-j). Error bars indicate standard error of proportion.
- 1130

1126

- Figure 14. Indices of a. SST (Salish Sea and Coastal), b. Salish Sea Salinity, and c. abundance (densities in Columbia River plume surveys and outer coast commercial catch) of the northern subpopulation of Northern Anchovy off Washington and Oregon from 1936 to 2016. Details of how these indices were derived are provided in the text. Note that the 2016 value for commercial anchovy catch is off the scale of
- the y-axis (9.1). The grid along the bottom of the figure summarizes a qualitative index of anchovy
- abundance in the Salish Sea. Numbers in each grid cell indicate the number of contributing data sets for
- 1137 each year. Cells are shaded where at least two datasets contribute to the abundance index for that year.
- 1138 The top row (green) indicates years with and index > 0.5, the middle row (yellow) and index of 0.5, and
- 1139 the bottom row (red) and index of < 0.5. Periods of inferred abundance (index > 0.5, at least 2
- 1140 contributing datasets) are highlighted in green across all index time series. More details of index
- 1141 derivation are provided in the text.
- 1142

1143 Figure 15. Coefficient estimates and 95% confidence intervals for linear regressions relating a Salish Sea 1144 Northern Anchovy abundance index derived from frequency of anchovy catches in fishery-independent 1145 surveys to a. a composite index of Strait of Georgia SST anomalies (1935 to 2016), b. first principal component scores of NOAA reconstructed monthly SST adjacent to the coast between 40° N and 60° N, 1146 c. a composite index of Strait of Georgia salinity anomalies (1935 to 2016). Predictor variables were 1147 1148 averaged over 1 to 3 years and lagged over 0 to 3 years. Data points were weighted by the total number of 1149 data sets contributing to the quantitative anchovy abundance index for that year. All significant (alpha = 1150 0.05) estimates are indicated with black circles. For additional details on how indices of anchovy 1151 abundance, temperature and salinity were derived refer to the text.

1152

Snohomish Beach Seine, j. Elwha Beach Seine. The dashed horizontal lines indicate thresholds between

1153 9. Supplementary Material1154

- 1155 Literature sources reviewed for references to Northern Anchovy in the Salish Sea but not directly cited in
- 1156 the present study.





























Neocaligus Surface Trawl Puget Sound Midwater Trawl SoG Age-O Herring Survey SoG Juvenile Salmon Trawl









