Effects of habitat, fishing, and fisheries management on reef fish populations in Palau 1

Christina Muller-Karanassos^{1§}, Alex Filous¹, Alan M. Friedlander^{2,3}, Javier Cuetos-Bueno^{4,5}, 3

Marine Gouezo¹, Steven J. Lindfield⁶, Victor Nestor¹, Lincy Lee Marino¹, Geory Mereb¹, 4

- Dawnette Olsudong¹, Yimnang Golbuu¹ 5
- 6

2

7 ¹ Palau International Coral Reef Center, Koror, Republic of Palau

8 ² Pristine Seas, National Geographic Society, Washington, DC, USA

9 ³ Hawai'i Institute of Marine Biology, University of Hawai'i, Kāne'ohe, Hawai'i, USA

10 ⁴ The Nature Conservancy, Guam, USA

⁵ University of Guam Marine Laboratory, Guam, USA 11

- 12 ⁶ Coral Reef Research Foundation, Koror, Republic of Palau
- 13

14 Abstract

Palau has a rich tradition of fisheries management and stewardship of its waters, and as in many 15 island nations, small-scale coral reef fisheries are a vital part of the local culture, economy, and 16 food security. However, reef fisheries in Palau are data-poor and there is increasing concern that 17 18 reef fish stocks are declining. To evaluate the current and future status of these resources, 19 information is needed on the abundance, biomass, and size structure of reef fish resource species. To this aim, the Palau International Coral Reef Center (PICRC) conducted a nation-wide study to 20 investigate the status of commercially important reef fish stocks in 2017. Fishery-independent 21 surveys were conducted by diver operated stereo-video (stereo-DOV) at 94 sites across the 22 23 archipelago. Results showed that fish biomass varied from 0.13 to 293 g m⁻². Habitat was the most significant predictor of fish biomass, with the highest biomass found at western fore-reef 24 25 sites and the lowest at inner reef sites. Region also affected fish biomass, with significantly higher biomass found in the Northern Reefs compared to those around Babeldaob (the largest 26 island in Palau). In channel habitats, marine protected area (MPA) proximity, fishing pressure 27 from Koror (Palau's main population center) and local fishing pressure significantly influenced 28 29 fish biomass. In western fore-reef habitats, fish biomass was significantly affected by region, with differences observed between the Northern Reefs and Babeldaob, and between the Southern 30 Reefs and Babeldaob. Fishing pressure from Koror had a significant effect on fish biomass in 31 inner reef habitats, with a weak negative relationship observed. Using length frequencies from 32 the stereo-DOV surveys we also estimated spawning potential ratio (SPR) for seven species and 33 found the majority had SPR values between 20% and 40%. Overall, the low fish biomass and 34 SPRs suggests that many of Palau's principal fisheries species have been overexploited. This is 35 the first study to evaluate the status of resource reef fish stocks across the main islands of Palau 36 and provides a baseline to assess changes in fish populations over time. 37 38

Keywords: coral reef fisheries, data-limited stock assessment, seafood security, Palau, 39 overfishing 40

41

[§]Corresponding author: Christina Muller-Karanassos - c.karanassos@hotmail.com 42

43

44 Highlights:

- Reef fish biomass was low ($<25 \text{ g m}^{-2}$) at 83% of sites across Palau 45
 - Highest biomass was found in the fore-reef west habitat and Northern Reefs region
- 47 • SPR was 20 - 40% for the majority of assessed species
- 48

49 **1. Introduction**

Palau has a rich tradition of stewardship of its waters and small-scale coral reef fisheries are a 50 vital part of the local culture, economy, and food security (Johannes, 1981, 1998; Richmond et 51 al., 2007). Seafood is the main source of protein for the local population, with the majority of 52 landed reef fish consumed locally by residents (FAO, 2015; Dacks et al., 2020). Subsistence 53 54 fishing is still a major activity in Palau. However over time fishing also became important for the local economy, and currently around half of landed reef fish are sold commercially to residents. 55 56 tourists or exported (Prince et al., 2015; Dacks et al., 2020). Since the 1970s, there have been increasing concerns among fishers that reef fish stocks have declined due to overfishing and 57 unsustainable practices and more recent studies have shown that Palau's fisheries are fully 58 exploited (Johannes, 1981, 1991; Newton et al., 2007). In order to combat this, Palau has 59 implemented measures to help protect its marine resources through the Marine Protection Act 60 1994 (amended in 2015, Marine Protection Amendment 2015). The Act includes regulations on 61 minimum mesh sizes for nets, a ban on fishing using any kind of underwater breathing apparatus 62 and a permanent fishing ban for Bolbometopon muricatum and Cheilinus undulatus. There are 63 also seasonal fishing bans for five species of grouper (Serranidae), including a minimum size 64 limit during the open season, and two species of rabbitfish (Siganidae). In 2020 a bill was 65 passed, banning the export of any living resource in the reef, territorial sea and internal waters of 66 67 Palau (Senate Bill No. 10-63, HD3, CD1). In addition, Palau has developed an extensive network 68 of small marine protected areas (MPAs) as part of the 2003 Protected Areas Network (PAN) Act and the 2006 Micronesia Challenge (Friedlander et al., 2017; Birkeland, 2017). The MPAs range 69 in size from 0.03 km² to 56.6 km², with an average size of 6.26 km². Each MPA has its own 70 fisheries management regulations, but most are no-take, no-entry zones, with some allowing 71 72 harvest during specific times or occasions. Almost 50% of PAN sites have a "poor" enforcement 73 rating, with illegal extraction in no-take sites continuing in most states, although over time enforcement has improved (PAN, 2015). Despite the "poor" enforcement rating, no-take MPAs 74 in Palau have, on average, nearly twice the biomass of resource fishes (i.e., those important 75 76 commercially, culturally, or for subsistence) compared to nearby unprotected areas (Friedlander et al., 2017). In the Northern Reefs of Palau, the states of Ngarchelong and Kayangel passed their 77 78 own statewide fisheries regulations in 2015. These regulations included temporary moratoria on the harvest of six fish species from the family Serranidae from 2015 to 2018 and on *Caranx* 79 ignobilis from 2016 and 2017 for 3 years. Minimum size limits, which aimed to preserve at least 80 20% spawning potential ratio (SPR) were also implemented for 14 species from the families 81 Serranidae, Lutjanidae, Lethrinidae, Acanthuridae, and Scaridae from 2016 and 2017 (Kayangel 82 Public Law 15-16, Ngarchelong Public Law 15-57). Furthermore, the Northern Reef Fisheries 83 Cooperative was set up in 2015 to recover fish stocks and promote sustainable fisheries (The 84 Nature Conservancy, 2016a). Although these measures are important actions taken to preserve 85 the nation's marine resources, there is little information on the status of these fisheries across 86 Palau and this lack of information impedes the evaluation of the efficacy of these management 87 actions. 88

In addition to the benefits they provide to humans, reef fishes also have important functional roles within coral reef ecosystems and overfishing can lead to a degradation of these key ecosystem functions (Bellwood et al., 2004; Pratchett et al., 2014). Herbivorous fishes increase reef resilience and reduce vulnerability to macroalgae phase-shifts by removing algae and sediment through grazing and exposing areas of the reef through bioerosion (Edwards et al., 2014; Bonaldo et al., 2014). This in turn encourages settlement, growth, and survival of coralline algae and coral (Bellwood et al., 2004). Increased fishing pressure can lead to a reduction in
these ecosystem functions, with rates of bioerosion and coral predation particularly affected by
human activity (Bellwood et al., 2012). Finally, predatory fishes are important for maintaining
prey populations and exploitation of predators can lead to an increase in prey abundance, which
can have negative ecological effects at the base of the food web (Dulvy et al., 2004).

100 To ensure sustainable fisheries and maintain healthy coral reefs for future generations, it is vital that effective fisheries management practices are implemented in Palau. This requires 101 accurate assessment of coral reef fish stocks to evaluate the performance of past and present 102 management efforts. To date, several fishery-dependent surveys have been conducted in discrete 103 regions of Palau such as Koror (Palau's main population center) and the Northern Reefs (e.g., 104 Kitalong and Dalzell, 1994; Moore et al., 2014; Prince et al., 2015; Lindfield, 2017; Linfield, 105 2016¹; Prince, 2016a²; Prince, 2016b³). However, there has been limited research on fish 106 populations in Palau using fishery-independent surveys at the archipelago scale (Dochez et al., 107 2019). It is therefore necessary for data to be collected on fish populations across the archipelago 108 109 and evaluate the status of the fish stocks that comprise these fisheries.

Reef fishes are typically monitored by estimating the biomass of important species on a reef 110 and tracking the changes in their biomass over time (MacNeil et al., 2015). However, formal 111 fisheries stock assessments that specify the status of a given species in reference to an estimate of 112 113 sustainable yield, have historically been beyond the capacity of Palau and similar small island nations to conduct (Johannes, 1998; Prince et al., 2015). Fortunately, novel data-limited methods 114 are emerging that permit the assessment of data deficient fisheries and enable the status of a 115 species to be quantitatively evaluated beyond monitoring changes in their biomass over time 116 (Froese, 2004; Cope and Punt, 2009; Prince et al., 2011; Hordyk et al., 2015). One such method 117 is the Spawning Potential Ratio (SPR) of a fish stock, which is defined as the proportion of the 118 119 unfished reproductive potential left at any given level of fishing pressure in equilibrium and is a measure of the impact of fishing on the potential productivity of a stock (Goodyear, 1993). The 120 length-based spawning potential ratio (LB-SPR) method uses length-composition data of a 121 harvested fish population, instead of age data, together with life history parameters to estimate 122 SPR (Hordyk et al., 2015). SPR can range from 100% in an unexploited stock, to 0% in a 123 124 collapsed stock with no remaining spawning potential (Hordyk et al., 2015). An SPR of 40% is generally used as a proxy for maximum sustainable yield and an SPR of <20% indicates that 125 recruitment rates are impaired and the stock is heavily exploited (Prince et al., 2015; Hordyk et 126 al., 2015). In conjunction with biomass estimates from a diverse assemblage of species, estimates 127 of SPR for keystone fisheries species can substantially improve our understanding of the status 128 129 of data poor coral reef fisheries.

To this aim, the Palau International Coral Reef Center (PICRC) assessed commercially important reef fish populations across the main islands of Palau in 2017 (the Southwest Islands of Sonsorol and Hatohobei states were excluded from the survey due to their remoteness). Fishery-independent surveys using a diver operated stereo-video (stereo-DOV) system were conducted to 1) assess the current biomass and abundance of commercially important reef fish

¹ Lindfield, S.J., 2016. Northern Reefs fishery-dependent data collection: Report on fish stocks – April 2016. Science and Monitoring for the Northern Reef Fisheries Management Project. Project Report, Palau International Coral Reef Center.

² Prince J., 2016a. Length based SPR assessment of eighteen Indo-Pacific coral reef fish populations in Palau. Unpublished report for The Nature Conservancy.

³ Prince J., 2016b. Estimation of SPR based minimum lengths for Indo-Pacific coral reef fish in Palau. Unpublished report for The Nature Conservancy.

across Palau; 2) determine which assessed anthropogenic and biophysical factors are influencing
the biomass of reef fishes in Palau; and 3) estimate the SPR of species with sufficient length data
and available life history parameters. This study provides the first fishery-independent
assessment of the status of commercially important reef fish stocks across the main islands of
Palau and a baseline to assess changes in these resources over time.

140 **2. Methods**

141 2.1. Survey sites

In 2017, a total of 94 sites were surveyed across the Palau Archipelago within six reef habitats, 142 including three back-reef sites, 19 channel sites, 20 fore-reef east sites, 22 fore-reef west sites, 16 143 144 fringing inner reef, and 14 patch reef sites (Fig. 1). Mapping of shallow-water benthic habitats for Palau was conducted in 2007 by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration 145 (NOAA) using high-resolution, multispectral satellite imagery and the total area of each habitat 146 type was calculated based on these habitat maps (Battista et al., 2007). The number of sites was 147 determined based on the total area of each habitat within the study area and previous sampling 148 efforts for B. muricatum and C. undulatus in Palau (Friedlander and Koike, 2013; Polloi et al., 149 2014). Sites were then randomly selected using the open source Geographic Information System 150 (GIS) software QGIS and any selected sites that were < 1 km apart or located inside an MPA 151 were reallocated to another location. MPAs were excluded from this survey since the aim of this 152 project was to assess the status of commercially important fish stocks in locations open to 153 fishing. 154

155 2.2. Fish survey methodology

Fishery-independent surveys were conducted using a diver operated stereo-video system (stereo-156 157 DOV, Goetze et al., 2019), consisting of two GoPro Hero 4 cameras in waterproof housings mounted on a rigid base bar. The survey method involved two SCUBA divers swimming along 158 the reef at two different depths where possible at each site: 15-20 m (deep) (n=90) and 5-10 m 159 (shallow) (n=83). The lead diver operated the stereo-DOV system, pointing the cameras straight 160 161 ahead along the reef for a 15-minute timed swim at each depth and maintaining a steady swimming speed of approximately 20 m/min if there was no current. For sites that did not have 162 different depth strata, only one depth was used. The dive buddy followed closely behind the lead 163 diver towing a floating Global Positioning System (GPS), which was used to calculate the 164 Garmin BaseCamp software (https://www.garmin.com/en-165 transect length using US/software/basecamp/). 166

167 *2.3 Data processing*

Stereo videos were analyzed using the SeaGIS EventMeasure software (Version 4.42), with the 168 length/3D rules set to: maximum range = 8,000 mm, maximum RMS = 20 mm, maximum 169 precision to length ratio = 10%, minimum x coordinate = -2,500 mm and maximum x coordinate 170 = 2,500 mm (Goetze et al., 2019). This ensured that only fish within a 5 m belt and up to 8 m 171 distance away were included in the survey. The left and right videos were imported into 172 EventMeasure and synchronized based on diver hand signals at the beginning of each transect. 173 174 Fork length (FL) measurements were made for selected fish species, from 15 families, that are important for commercial, cultural or subsistence fishing in Palau (Supplementary Online 175 Material - SOM 1), similar to the list of fish species used by Friedlander et al. (2017). When fish 176 could not be identified to the species level, they were grouped into family or genus (e.g., 177 Scaridae spp.). When the precision to length ratio exceeded 10% in EventMeasure, a 3D point 178

was added for the fish and an estimated length was later calculated based on the mean length of
all fish measured for that species. Estimated lengths were only used to calculate overall biomass
at each survey site, they were not included in length analysis of individual taxa. Fish biomass
was calculated using the length-based equation:

183

$$W = aFL^{b}$$

where *W* is the weight of the fish in grams, *FL* is the fork length of the fish in cm, and *a* and *b* are constant values derived from published biomass-length relationships (Kulbicki et al., 2005; Kamikawa et al., 2015; Gumanao et al., 2016; Cuetos-Bueno and Hernandez-Ortiz, 2017) and FishBase (Froese and Pauly, 2019). Weight was then divided by the area of the transect (transect length*5 m) in order to calculate biomass in g m⁻². Fishes were categorized into three trophic groups (piscivores, secondary consumers, and herbivores) based on Friedlander et al. (2017) and information from FishBase (Froese and Pauly, 2019).

191 2.4. Predictor variables

192 Site-specific predictor variables of fish biomass were compiled for input into mixed effects models (Table 1). These anthropogenic and biophysical variables were chosen based on previous 193 studies assessing fishing pressure/impact on fish assemblages (e.g., Harborne et al., 2018; 194 McLean et al., 2016) and data available in this study. Depth was recorded at each site during fish 195 surveys and then classified as shallow (5-10 m) or deep (15-20 m). Habitat type was determined 196 a priori based on NOAA's benthic habitat map of Palau. The six reef habitats were then grouped 197 into four main habitat types (channel, fore-reef east, fore-reef west, and inner reef [fringing 198 inner, patch and back-reefs]) for analyses due to the small number of back-reef sites. Sites were 199 also grouped into three main Regions (Northern Reefs, Babeldaob, and Southern Reefs, Fig. 1). 200 Sites located in the extreme north (Kayangel and Ngarchelong states) were grouped into the 201 Northern Reefs region. Sites located around Babeldaob, the largest island in Palau comprising 202 80% of the total land mass, were grouped into the Babeldaob region, and sites located in Koror, 203 204 Peleliu, and Angaur states were grouped into the Southern Reefs region. This was done based on the presence of different management practices in the Northern Reefs and the different 205 hydrogeological make up of Babeldaob (consisting of volcanic rock covered by soil with the 206 presence of watersheds) and the Southern Reefs (consisting of carbonate rock islands). 207

A proxy for proximity to MPAs was calculated based on distance by water to the nearest 208 209 MPA multiplied by MPA size, since both factors have been shown to affect fish biomass (e.g., Forcada et al., 2009; Friedlander et al., 2017). A proxy for fishing pressure from Koror was 210 based on distance a boat has to travel to the main port. The total population of Palau is 17,661 211 and 65% of the population resides in Koror, making this the main source of fishing pressure. A 212 proxy for local fishing pressure was calculated based on distance a boat has to travel from the 213 nearest dock multiplied by the population of the nearest state. Population data were obtained 214 from the 2015 Census of Population, Housing and Agriculture for the Republic of Palau (Office 215 of Planning and Statistics, 2015). Distance to the nearest pass/channel was determined by 216 measuring the linear distance to the mouth of the nearest channel or access point to the open 217 ocean. A proxy for watershed pollution from Babeldaob, the only island with perennially flowing 218 fresh water in Palau, was calculated by multiplying the percentage of altered land (urban, 219 agricultural, and barren) within the adjacent watershed by the linear distance to the nearest river 220 discharge (Houk et al., 2015). Vegetation data for Palau (2005-2006) was obtained from the 221 United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Forest 222 Service 223 (https://www.fs.usda.gov/detailfull/r5/forest-grasslandhealth/?cid=fsbdev3_046690&width=full)

and the coverage of each altered land type were calculated and then summed for each watershed in Babeldaob using QGIS. A proxy for accessibility (wave energy) was calculated for each site using 10-year wind speed records, fetch distance, and angle of exposure (QuikSCAT wind datasets from 1999 to 2009; https://winds.jpl.nasa.gov) (Houk et al., 2014).

Linear distances were measured using the distance matrix tool, whereas distance by water and boat were measured using the measure line tool in QGIS. For MPA proximity, fishing pressure from Koror, local fishing pressure, and watershed pollution, distances were inversely scaled so that increasing distances yielded higher MPA proximity, higher fishing pressure, and higher effect of watershed pollution, respectively. See SOM 2 for parameter values used for analysis for each survey site.

234 2.5. Statistical analysis

All statistical analyses were conducted using R version 4.0.3. Linear mixed effects models 235 (LMM) were used to test the effect of predictor variables on fish biomass and to compare 236 biomass between trophic groups using the 'lmer' function in the 'lme4' package. The four 237 habitat types (channel, fore-reef east, fore-reef west, and inner reef [fringing inner, patch and 238 back-reefs]) were also examined separately using LMM. Depth was added as a random effect to 239 account for repeated measures at the same site. Stepwise model selection was carried out using 240 the 'drop1()' function to find the most simplified model, where the least significant parameters 241 were removed from the model until all variables were significant. Where significant effects were 242 found, pairwise comparisons were conducted using the 'Ismeans' function. Prior to statistical 243 analysis, continuous variables were normalized and tested for collinearity using the 'cor()' 244 function with the "pearson" method; none of the variables were found to be correlated. In 245 246 addition, biomass data were examined for normality using histograms and the Shapiro-Wilk test, and subsequently ln+1 transformed. Homogeneity of variances of discrete variables was tested 247 using Levene's test; with no significant variance found between groups. Following analyses, 248 residuals were plotted and checked for normality using the Shapiro-Wilk test. Biomass 249 interpolation maps were created using the Inverse Distance Weighting method in QGIS. Data are 250 presented as mean values ± 1 standard deviation. 251

252 2.6. Size structure and spawning potential ratio

The size structure of 12 species with sufficient actual length measurements (n>100 each) were 253 examined. SPR was estimated for seven of these species that had locally available life history 254 parameters using the LB-SPR method (Hordyk et al., 2015; Prince et al., 2015). LB-SPR uses 255 maximum likelihood methods to estimate the ratio of fishing mortality to natural mortality (F/M) 256 and selectivity-at-length parameters (SL₅₀ and SL₉₅; i.e., the lengths at 50% and 95% selectivity 257 by fishing), which in turn are used to calculate the SPR (Hordyk et al., 2015). Inputs to LB-SPR 258 include L₅₀ (length at which 50% of population reaches sexual maturity), L₉₅ (length at which 259 95% of population reaches sexual maturity), L_∞ (asymptotic length), M/K (natural mortality/rate 260 at which L_{∞} is approached) and observed fish length data (Table 2). Life history ratios of M/K 261 and L_m/L_{∞} were derived at the family level from a meta-analysis of all available age, growth and 262 maturity studies after going through a process of quality control to account for studies where the 263 data has been constrained by heavy fishing pressure (J. Prince 2021, pers. comm., 7 April). The 264 Shiny application on The Barefoot Ecologist's LB-SPR R Toolbox website 265 (http://barefootecologist.com.au/) was used for SPR estimations. 266

267 **3. Results**

268 3.1. Fish biomass

269 3.1.1 Overall biomass

Biomass and abundance were recorded for 106 species (SOM 3). A total of 11,773 fishes were observed during the surveys, with actual length measurements for 5,518 individuals and estimated length measurements for the remaining 6,255. Total fish biomass varied by an order of magnitude across sites from 0.13 to 293 g m⁻², with a mean biomass of 17.83 \pm 32.09 g m⁻². Hot spots of high biomass were observed at some Northern Reefs sites, including to the east of Ngarchelong and at Kayangel, and sites along the fore-reef west of Koror (Fig. 2A). Low biomass was observed at inner reef sites in the southern lagoon and around Babeldaob.

Mean biomass was significantly different between trophic groups (LMM: p<0.001), with 277 significantly lower herbivore biomass $(5.39 \pm 10.11 \text{ g m}^{-2})$ than piscivore biomass $(6.96 \pm 27.63 \text{ m}^{-2})$ 278 279 g m⁻²) (p < 0.001). There was no significant difference in biomass between piscivores and secondary consumers (5.47 \pm 11.48 g m⁻²). The highest herbivore biomass was seen at a fore-280 281 reef site to the west of Koror (113.88 g m⁻²). The lowest herbivore biomass was observed at sites to the east of Babeldaob, in the Northern Reefs and the Southern Reefs (Fig. 2B). The highest 282 biomass of secondary consumers was observed at a fore-reef site to the west of Koror (79.42 g 283 m⁻²) and at several sites in the Northern Reefs. There was an overall low biomass of secondary 284 285 consumers across the rest of Palau (Fig. 2C). The highest biomass of piscivores was seen in the 286 Northern Reefs, including one site to the east of Ngarchelong (285.69 g m⁻²) and to the northeast in Kayangel (156.35 g m⁻²). High piscivore biomass was also seen at a fore-reef site in the 287 southwest of the archipelago (122.95 g m⁻²) and at other sites in the Northern Reefs. Low 288 biomass of piscivores was seen within the lagoon around Babeldaob and in the western Northern 289 Reefs (Fig. 2D). 290

Lutjanus gibbus, Caranx sexfasciatus, and Sphyraena qenie accounted for the highest percentages of total fish biomass observed during the surveys (16.12%, 11.75%, and 9.47%, respectively) (Fig. 3). L. gibbus was also the most abundant species observed (2,712), followed by Naso lituratus (1,314). Chlorurus spilurus had the highest frequency of occurrence, occurring in 68% of transects surveyed, followed by L. gibbus (59%) (SOM 3).

296 3.1.2 Drivers of fish biomass

Habitat and region were the only significant predictors of fish biomass (LMM: p<0.001 and 297 p=0.008, respectively) (Table 3). The highest biomass was found in fore-reef west sites $(30.38 \pm$ 298 26.04 g m⁻²) and the lowest was found in patch reef habitats (4.76 \pm 2.59 g m⁻²) and fringing 299 inner reefs (6.03 \pm 3.44 g m⁻²). Significant differences were found between fore-reef west and 300 301 channel (p=0.001), fore-reef west and fore-reef east (p=0.044), fore-reef west and inner reef (p<0.001), and fore-reef east and inner reef (p=0.017) (Fig. 4a; SOM 4). For region, a significant 302 difference was found between the Northern Reefs (25.69 \pm 33.19 g m⁻²) and Babeldaob (7.37 \pm 303 5.00 g m⁻²) (p=0.006) (Fig. 4b; SOM 4). 304

In the channel habitat, region, MPA proximity, fishing pressure from Koror, local fishing 305 306 pressure and wave energy significantly affected fish biomass (LMM: p=0.041, p<0.001, p=0.013, p=0.007 and p=0.013 respectively) (Table 3). However, when pairwise comparisons 307 308 were conducted, there were no significant differences among the three regions (SOM 4). A positive relationship was observed for MPA proximity ($R^2=0.331$), whereas weak negative 309 relationships were observed for fishing pressure from Koror (R²=0.048), local fishing pressure 310 $(R^2=0.041)$ and wave energy $(R^2=0.037)$ in the channel habitat (Fig. 5). In the fore-reef east 311 habitat, fish biomass was significantly affected by region and MPA proximity (LMM: p=0.016 312

and p=0.002, respectively) (Table 3). However, when pairwise comparisons were conducted, 313 there were no significant differences among the three regions and there was a weak negative 314 relationship observed for MPA proximity (R²=0.088) (Fig. 5; SOM 4). In the fore-reef west 315 habitat, fish biomass was significantly affected by region (LMM: p=0.008) (Table 3). 316 Significantly higher fish biomass was seen in the Northern Reefs compared to Babeldaob 317 318 (p=0.016) and in the Southern Reefs compared to Babeldaob (p=0.010)(Fig. 5; SOM 4). In the inner reef habitat, fish biomass was significantly affected by MPA proximity (LMM: p=0.048) 319 320 (Table 3), however the R^2 value (0.017) was very low (Fig. 5; SOM 4). Fishing pressure from Koror was also significant in the inner reef (LMM: p=0.010), with a negative relationship 321 observed ($R^2=0.056$). 322

323 *3.2. Size structure and spawning potential ratio*

Size structure was examined for 12 species (SOM 5) and from the seven species where size at 324 maturity values were available in Palau, the percentage of fish below L₅₀ ranged from 27% for 325 Hipposcarus longiceps to 70% for Scarus rubroviolaceus (Table 4). From these seven species 326 with available life history parameters to calculate LB-SPR, the majority had SPR values between 327 20% and 40% (Table 5). H. longiceps had the highest SPR (53%), but as the length frequency 328 distribution was bi-modal, this resulted in a poor fit of the model. This was due to a dominance 329 of juvenile fish (< 200 mm) recorded on the fringing inner-reefs, patch reef and back reefs, and 330 predominately sub-adult and adult fish recorded on the fore-reefs and channel habitats. If the 331 model was run only including fish on the fore-reefs and channel habitats (n = 66), SPR was 332 estimated at 34% and SL₅₀ was 310 mm. The lowest SPR estimate was observed for Siganus 333 *puellus* (16%). 334

335 **4. Discussion**

- 336 *4.1. Fish biomass*
- 337 4.1.1 Overall biomass

Biomass is an in situ measurement of the amount of living organisms on coral reefs and in this 338 339 case, provides an indication of the availability of commercially important resource species across Palau. The results of this study indicate that fish biomass varied considerably across the survey 340 sites, with the highest biomass observed in the Northern Reefs, driven primarily by large schools 341 of piscivores (S. genie and C. sexfasciatus) and secondary consumers (L. gibbus). The fore-reefs 342 west of Koror also had a high fish biomass, driven by large schools of piscivores (C. 343 sexfasciatus), secondary consumers (L. gibbus), and herbivores (N. lituratus). Harborne et al. 344 (2018) calculated a potential standing stock of 107 g m⁻² for the biomass of all reef fishes in 345 Palau. Similarly, MacNeil et al. (2015) estimated resident reef fish biomass in the absence of 346 fishing should equal ~100 g m⁻², with biomass <25 g m⁻² potentially leading to negative 347 ecosystem effects due to overexploitation. In this study only 16 out of 94 sites had biomass >25 348 g m⁻² (averaged across depth), suggesting that 83% of sites may be overexploited. The fish 349 biomass estimates calculated by Harborne et al. (2018) and MacNeil et al. (2015) include all 350 non-cryptic reef fishes, whereas the current study was limited to a subset of commercially 351 important reef fishes in Palau (SOM 1). In addition, all the study sites in MacNeil et al. (2015) 352 and Harborne et al. (2018) were located in the fore-reef habitat, which typically supports higher 353 biomass of reef fishes (Harborne et al., 2018). This study included data from different reef 354 habitats, which may have led to lower overall biomass estimates. However, most fore-reef sites 355 in our study had a total fish biomass much lower than 25 g m⁻² (SOM 2). 356

MPAs provide a baseline to measure the difference in biomass of similar habitats that have 357 been exploited by fisheries. In 2014, Friedlander et al. (2017) surveyed seven MPAs across Palau 358 and found that total resource fish biomass ranged from ~ 80 g m⁻² (patch reef habitat) to ~ 360 g 359 m^{-2} (channel habitat). In contrast, three sites in this study had a total fish biomass >80 g m⁻² and 360 the majority of sites had much lower values. All sites surveyed in this study are open to fishing 361 362 and it was therefore expected that biomass would be lower than MPA sites. However, the substantially lower biomass at the majority of sites suggests that reef fishes have been 363 overexploited in Palau. It is noted that MacNeil et al. (2015), Harborne et al. (2018) and 364 Friedlander et al. (2017) all used data collected using underwater visual census (UVC) surveys 365 whereas the current study used stereo-DOV surveys to estimate fish biomass. It is possible that 366 the stereo-DOV methodology used in this study could result in lower biomass estimates than 367 UVC surveys due to differences in the swimming speed of the transect (Goetze et al., 2015). 368 During slower moving and non-instantaneous UVC surveys, there is a greater likelihood of the 369 larger mobile species moving into transect boundaries which can lead to overestimates of 370 biomass (Ward-Paige et al., 2010). Furthermore, direct comparisons between UVC and stereo-371 DOV have been conducted by Holmes et al. (2013), which showed that although the total 372 abundance of fish was similar between UVC and stereo-DOV, UVC recorded higher abundances 373 374 of larger-bodied fisheries species compared to stereo-DOV due to visual observers having a 375 greater ability than video cameras to recognize fish towards the edge visibility. UVC surveys 376 have been shown to be less accurate at estimating fish lengths and sample area compared to stereo-DOV surveys (Harvey et al., 2001, 2004), however stereo-DOV has limitations on the 377 number of actual measurements collected, with this study only able to measure ~50% of fish. 378 Wilson et al. (2018) found that fish biomass estimates using UVC were ~50% greater than 379 stereo-DOV, however once lengths were estimated for unmeasured fish (as we did in this study), 380 381 biomass estimates between UVC and stereo-DOV were similar. Overall, fish biomass estimates from UVC and stereo-DOV should be broadly comparable when examined at higher taxonomic 382 levels, and along with the added benefit of accurate length measurements, these results provides 383 384 an important reference point from which large-scale changes in the amount of fish observed on 385 Palau's coral reefs can be evaluated.

386 4.1.2 Drivers of fish biomass

From the drivers investigated in this study, habitat was found to be the main driver of fish 387 biomass across sites, with the highest biomass observed in western facing fore-reefs, and the 388 lowest biomass observed in inner reefs (patch reefs and inner fringing reefs). Higher parrotfish 389 abundance has been found in western and eastern fore-reefs compared to the inner reefs of Palau, 390 391 which tend to have lower habitat complexity (Gouezo et al., 2019a). Furthermore, Roff et al. (2019) found substantial variability in herbivore biomass (5.6 \pm 0.7 g m⁻² to 66.4 \pm 16.3 g m⁻²) 392 and predator biomass across sites in Palau, with 10-fold higher herbivore biomass and 17-fold 393 higher predator biomass found in western facing reefs compared to eastern facing reefs. The west 394 side of the archipelago likely has higher herbivore biomass due to its geomorphology and habitat 395 heterogeneity, which may provide food subsidies and nursery habitats for herbivores (Roff et al., 396 2019); whereas higher predator biomass (Serranidae and Lutjanidae) may be due to the 397 proximity of spawning aggregation sites (Colin, 2012). In addition, a recent study by Gouezo et 398 al. (2021), showed that the western outer reefs of Palau have higher levels of particle retention 399 and expected coral larval supply compared to the eastern outer reefs, which may also affect the 400 supply and retention of fish larvae. 401

Region was also found to be a significant predictor of fish biomass, with significantly higher 402 biomass observed in sites located in the Northern Reefs compared to sites around Babeldaob. 403 The reefs around Babeldaob are easy to access and the inner reefs may be affected by watershed 404 pollution, leading to lower overall biomass (Richmond et al., 2007). Conversely, the Northern 405 Reefs are remote and located far away from Koror, with accessibility dependent on good weather 406 407 conditions. However, fishing pressure from Koror and wave exposure, a proxy for accessibility, were not significant in our analyses. Other factors that could explain the high fish biomass in the 408 409 Northern Reefs include naturally high productivity of the area and good management practices (The Nature Conservancy, 2016b). The Northern Reefs are often regarded as some of the best 410 fishing grounds in Palau and in recent years this area has been managed differently to the rest of 411 Palau, as detailed in the introduction (Lindfield, 2016¹). These management strategies may have 412 had a positive effect on fish biomass in this region; however, although fishers have shown a high 413 degree of compliance with MPAs, there is evidence to suggest there is little compliance with 414 other regulations such as species-specific laws (Carlisle and Gruby, 2018). 415

Fish biomass at channel sites was positively influenced by MPA proximity as fish biomass 416 increased closer to large MPAs. MPAs can also act as a source of fish larvae to areas open to 417 fishing, leading to increased recruitment and replenishment of fish populations (Harrison et al., 418 419 2012). Channel sites that had the highest fish biomass include those in Kayangel, located close to 420 the large Ngeruangel Marine Reserve, protected since 1996, and in Ngarchelong near the large 421 Ebiil Channel Marine Conservation Area, established in 1999. Similar to the high fish biomass found in Ebiil (Friedlander et al., 2017), previous monitoring has shown that the Ngeruangel 422 MPA also has high biomass of resource fish (Gouezo et al., 2019b). Spillover of fishes and 423 export of fish larvae could explain the higher fish biomass seen in channel habitats that are in 424 close proximity to these MPAs. However, although MPAs also had a significant effect in the 425 426 fore-reef east and inner reef habitats, only weak negative relationships were found. The reason that MPAs only had a significant positive effect in channels may be due to the close proximity of 427 several survey sites to MPAs protecting channel habitats, which may have experienced a higher 428 429 spillover of fish compared to other sites. For example, two sites are ~3 km from the center of Ebiil MPA, two sites are ~1 km from the center of Ngederrak MPA and one site is ~1 km from 430 431 the center of Ngerumekaol MPA. Sand channels are corridors that provide transit pathways among hard bottom habitats and are important feeding and spawning locations for many vagile 432 species (Friedlander et al., 2007). Channels near MPAs are important for energy transfer to and 433 from these protected areas and can benefit fisheries through net emigration of adults and 434 juveniles ("spillover") (Rowley, 1994). The fact that these MPAs are protecting channel habitats 435 increases the efficacy of the MPA, because these protected areas are high quality habitats that 436 likely generate high spillover. 437

438 Fishing pressure from Koror and the nearest dock also had a weak effect on fish biomass in channels, with higher biomass seen at sites with lower fishing pressure. Fish biomass at inner 439 reef sites were also weakly affected by proximity to Koror, with higher biomass seen at sites 440 located further from Koror and biomass decreasing as distance to Koror decreased. This suggests 441 that channel and inner reefs closer to Koror and channels closer to docks belonging to states with 442 higher populations have greater fishing pressure. Channel sites with higher wave energy also had 443 lower fish biomass, which is the opposite relationship expected, since sites with high wave 444 energy should be more difficult to access. In the western facing fore-reefs, differences in fish 445 biomass between the Southern Reefs and Babeldaob and the Northern Reefs and Babeldaob were 446

primarily driven by large schools of fishes (e.g., *C. sexfasciatus*, *L. gibbus*, and *N. lituratus*)
observed at the western facing fore-reefs in the south and north of Palau.

449 *4.2 Size structure and spawning potential ratio*

The high percentage of fish below L_{50} for some species such as *S. rubroviolaceus* (70%) and *Plectropomus leopardus* (65%), may indicate a lack of fish in larger size classes and therefore overfishing of adult fish. A low percentage of fishes below L_{50} , such as for *H. longiceps* (27%), may suggest there are low numbers of fish in smaller size classes and insufficient recruitment (Neumann and Allen, cited in Schultz et al., 2016).

SPR is a well-established biological reference point that can be used to inform 455 456 management decisions in data-poor fisheries. However, due to limited the availability of life history parameters and sample sizes, the present study was only able to assess SPR for seven out 457 of the 106 species observed. Reliable estimates of the biological parameters that describe the life 458 history of a species are required to obtain accurate LB-SPR estimates, and these parameters can 459 vary across region, they can be biased by sample size, and biased by sampling from stocks that 460 have been subjected to intense fishing mortality. This prerequisite is a limitation in many coral 461 reef fisheries that harvest diverse assemblages of fishes and although sampling programs in 462 Palau have aimed to collect data to inform stock assessments (Prince et al., 2015; Prince, 2016a², 463 2016b³) life history estimates may continue to improve, this is especially true for S. 464 rubroviolaceus and S. puellus where size at maturity estimates used in this study are considered 465 preliminary. In addition to life history data, it is also important to have sufficient length 466 measurements for each species since insufficient sample size can lead to an inaccurate 467 assessment of size structure (Hordyk et al., 2015). This study made the assumption that fish 468 469 originated from the same stock for all species assessed as in Prince et al. (2015), since dividing the data among regions or habitats would reduce sample sizes, and therefore, accuracy of the 470 results. 471

For this study we used updated family-based life-history ratios (J. Prince 2021, pers. 472 comm., 7 April) and updated size at maturity values for H. longiceps (Lindfield, Coral Reef 473 Research Foundation, unpublished data) so these fishery-independent SPR assessments are not 474 directly comparable to previous assessments in Palau (Prince et al., 2015; Prince, 2016a²). 475 476 Overall, our results showed that SPR levels were typically greater than 20% indicating that there is enough spawning biomass for populations to replenish populations but remaining at levels 477 typically less than SPR 40% which would equate to optimal sustainable yield in fisheries. 478 Although it is clear that fishing pressure is impacting populations of reef fish in Palau, these 479 levels of SPR are greater than the more dire estimates published by Prince et al. (2015) and 480 481 Prince (2016a)² where SPR levels were less than 20% for the majority of species, indicative of heavy fishing pressure. Our results however should not be treated as a cause for optimism, as 482 differences may be attributed to this study being the first to use fishery-independent data for LB-483 SPR assessments, not following the typical use of catch data for fishery assessments. The length-484 frequency data for *H. longiceps* provided insight into to the potential bias of data collection with 485 486 surveys on the fringing inner reefs, patch reef and back reefs being dominated by small (< 200 mm) individuals, resulting in a bimodal size distribution from juvenile and adult populations 487 488 (SOM 5). The corresponding selectivity-at-length (SL) values computed by the LB-SPR assessment were much smaller (SL_{50%} = 127 mm) compared to previous catch data (SL_{50%} = 276 489 mm) presented in Prince et al. (2015). As these LB-SPR models can only fit a single logistic 490 selectivity curve and when there are high proportions of juvenile fish, this unrealistically 491 assumes that the M/K which applies to adults also applies to equally juveniles, which would not 492

be the case in nature. In an attempt to account for this, LB-SPR modelling on the subset of lengths from only fore-reef and channel habitats resulted in the fitting of a selectivity curve to the adult mode of the population and produced a lower and likely more realistic SPR level of 0.34. However, the reliability of this estimation is reduced due to a lower sample size of length measurements (n = 66) and further additional length measurements to refine the selectivity curve would be beneficial before making conclusions on this species.

Species with lower SPR values did not necessarily relate to low biomass values, and vice 499 500 versa. For example, L. gibbus had a high mean biomass (4.92 g m⁻² per site), due to their schooling behavior, and an SPR of 35%, whereas H. longiceps had a low mean biomass (0.69 g 501 m⁻² per site) and a greater SPR (or a similar SPR based on a presumably adult population). This 502 could be reflective of ongoing density-dependent responses, where biomass is maintained despite 503 reduced fish sizes, due to the removal of adult fish creating space for more juveniles (Houk et al., 504 2018). As H. longiceps is one of the most frequently landed species in Palau (Lindfield, 2017), 505 the low density encountered during diving transects may also be reflective of the behavior of this 506 507 species, being relatively shy of divers (Lindfield et al., 2014). Overall, the application of LB-SPR to our fishery-independent data provides another useful metric to track changes over time 508 and assess the hopeful recovery of fish populations with improving management. 509

510 **5.** Conclusions

The results of this study indicate that reef fish biomass in the fished waters of Palau is generally 511 low in comparison to previous research in both local MPAs and theoretical estimates of 512 productivity for coral reef regions. Habitat was the most important predictor of fish biomass with 513 the western facing fore-reefs naturally supporting the highest biomass of resource reef fish. High 514 515 biomass was also associated with the Northern Reefs of Palau. As noted previously, the Northern Reefs are the most remote and have the most conservative fisheries management measures, 516 including closed seasons, size limits, and limited entry, although compliance is variable. Fishing 517 pressure from Koror explained patterns of fish biomass in the channels and inner reefs and local 518 fishing pressure explained patterns of fish biomass in the channels only. SPR estimates showed 519 that these stocks should be maintaining biomass, but likely have declined from their historical 520 abundance. This suggests that Palau could benefit from a wider application of state specific 521 522 fisheries management actions and/or nationwide policies that regulate the harvest of 523 commercially important reef species.

These results highlight the need for improved fisheries management to ensure this resource continues to provide the ecosystem services that Palauan communities depend on. This study provides the first quantitative and fishery-independent baseline to detect future changes in fish biomass and SPR estimates over time; and as a reference to whether the fishery remains stable, improves, or continues to decline in response to future resource utilization patterns.

529 6. Acknowledgements

We would like to thank previous staff members at PICRC including Michelle Dochez, Adelle
Lukes Isechal, John Swords, Harlen Herman, Daley Chiokai, Anna Parker and others for
assisting with field work and data processing during this project. We also thank Dr. Jeremy
Prince for providing updated life history ratios used for the LB-SPR assessments. This study was
made possible with support from NOAA's Coral Reef Conservation Program.

535 7. References

- 536
- Battista, T.A., Costa, B.M., Anderson, S.M., 2007. Shallow-Water Benthic Habitats of the
 Republic of Palau. NOAA Technical Memorandum. NOS NCCOS 59, Biogeography
 Branch. Silver Spring, MD.
- Bellwood, D.R., Hughes, T.P., Folke, C., Nyström, M., 2004. Confronting the coral reef crisis.
 Nature 429, 827-833. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature02691.
- Bellwood, D.R., Hoey, A.S., Hughes, T.P., 2012. Human activity selectively impacts the
 ecosystem roles of parrotfishes on coral reefs. Proceedings of the Royal Society B:
 Biological Sciences 279(1733), 1621-1629. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2011.1906.
- Birkeland, C., 2017. Working with, not against, coral-reef fisheries. Coral Reefs 36, 1-11.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-016-1535-8.
- 547 Bonaldo, R.M., Hoey, A.S., Bellwood, D.R., 2014. The ecosystem roles of parrotfishes on
 548 tropical reefs. Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review 52, 81-132.
 549 http://dx.doi.org/10.1201/b17143-3.
- Carlisle, K.M., Gruby, R.L., 2018. Why the path to polycentricity matters: evidence from
 fisheries governance in Palau. Environmental Policy and Governance 28(4), 223–235.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/eet.1811.
- Colin, P.L., 2012. Timing and location of aggregation and spawning in reef fishes. Pages 117–
 158 in Y. Sadovy de Mitcheson and P. L. Colin, editors. Reef fish spawning aggregations:
 biology, research and management. Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht, Netherlands.
 https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-94-007-1980-4_5.
- 557 Cope, J.M., Punt, A.E., 2009. Length-Based Reference Points for Data-Limited Situations:
 558 Applications and Restrictions. Marine and Coastal Fisheries 1, 169–186.
 559 https://doi.org/10.1577/C08-025.1.
- Cuetos-Bueno, J., Hernandez-Ortiz, D., 2017. Length–weight relationships of six coral reef-fish
 species from Chuuk, Federated States of Micronesia. Journal of Applied Ichthyology 33,
 645-646. https://doi.org/10.1111/jai.13339.
- 563 Dacks, R., Lewis, S.A., James, P.A., Marino, L.L., Oleson, K.L., 2020. Documenting baseline
 564 value chains of Palau's nearshore and offshore fisheries prior to implementing a large-scale
 565 marine protected area. Marine Policy, 103754. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2019.103754.
- Dochez, M., Friedlander, A., Gouezo, M., Isechal, L., Lindfield, S., Nestor, V., Olsudong, D.,
 Otto, E., Muller-Karanassos, C., 2019. Monitoring Fish Populations in the Northern Reefs of
 Palau from 2015-2017. Palau International Coral Reef Center Technical Report No. 19-13.
 https://picrc.org/picrcpage/wp-
- 570 content/uploads/2019/08/07_NR_2015_16_17_Technical_Report_02_Jul_2018_AMF_MDD 571 __CK_GR_AMF_July26_2019_V2_CK3-2.pdf.
- 572 Dulvy, N.K., Freckleton, R.P., Polunin, N.V.C., 2004. Coral reef cascades and the indirect
 573 effects of predator removal by exploitation. Ecology Letters 7, 410-416.
- 574 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2004.00593.x.
- Edwards, C.B., Friedlander, A.M., Green, A.G., Hardt, M.J., Sala, E., Sweatman, H.P., Williams,
 I.D., Zgliczynski, B., Sandin, S.A., Smith, J.E., 2014. Global assessment of the status of coral
 reef herbivorous fishes: evidence for fishing effects. Proceedings of the Royal Society B:
- 578 Biological Sciences 281(1774), p.20131835. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2013.1835.
- FAO, 2015. Palau and FAO: Partnering to improve food security and income-earning
 opportunities. http://www.fao.org/3/a-av265e.pdf.

- Forcada, A., Valle, C., Bonhomme, P., Criquet, G., Cadiou, G., Lenfant, P., Sánchez-Lizaso,
 J.L., 2009. Effects of habitat on spillover from marine protected areas to artisanal fisheries.
 Mar Ecological Progress Series 379, 197-211. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps07892.
- 584 Friedlander, A.M., Brown, E., Monaco, M.E., 2007. Defining reef fish habitat utilization patterns
- in Hawaii: comparisons between marine protected areas and areas open to fishing. Marine
 Ecology Progress Series 351, 221-233. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps07112.
- Friedlander, A., Koike, H., 2013. Analysis of Catch Quota for Kemedukl and Maml in Palauan
 Water: Stock Assessment for Humphead Wrasse and Bumphead Parrotfish. Palau
- 589 International Coral Reef Center Technical Report 14-01. http://picrc.org/picrcpage/wp-590 content/uploads/2016/01/Friedlander_Koike-
- 591 Stock_Assessment_For_Maml_Kemedukl_FINAL2.pdf.
- Friedlander, A.M., Golbuu, Y., Ballesteros, E., Caselle, J.E., Gouezo, M., Olsudong, D., Sala, E.,
 2017. Size, age, and habitat determine effectiveness of Palau's Marine Protected Areas. PLoS
 ONE 12(3), e0174787. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0174787.
- Froese, R., 2004. Keep it simple: three indicators to deal with overfishing. Fish and Fisheries 5,
 86–91. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-2979.2004.00144.x.
- Froese, R., Pauly, D. (Editors), 2019. FishBase. World Wide Web electronic publication.
 www.fishbase.org.
- Goetze, J.S., Jupiter, S.D., Langlois, T.J., Wilson, S.K., Harvey, E.S., Bond, T., Naisilisili, W.,
 2015. Diver operated video most accurately detects the impacts of fishing within periodically
 harvested closures. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 462, 74–82.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2014.10.004.
- Goetze, J.S., Bond, T., McLean, D.L., Saunders, B.J., Langlois, T.J., Lindfield, S., Fullwood,
 L.A.F., Driessen, D., Shedrawi, G., Harvey, E.S., 2019. A field and video analysis guide for
 diver operated stereo-video. Methods in Ecology Evolution 10, 1083–1090.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.13189.
- Goodyear, C.P., 1993. Spawning stock biomass per recruit in fisheries management: foundation
 and current use. p. 67-81. In Smith, S.J., Hunt, J.J., Rivard, D. [ed.] Risk evaluation and
 biological reference points for fisheries management. Can. Spec. Publ. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 120.
- https://www.researchgate.net/publication/251832024_Spawning_Stock_Biomass_per_Recrui
 t_in_Fisheries_Management_Foundation_and_Current_Use.
- 612 Gouezo, M., Golbuu, Y., Fabricius, K., Olsudong, D., Mereb, G., Nestor, V., Wolanski, E.,
- Harrison, P., Doropoulos, C., 2019a. Drivers of recovery and reassembly of coral reef
 communities. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 286, 20182908.
 https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2018.2908.
- Gouezo, M., Otto, E.I., Jonathan, R., Mereb, G., Nestor, V., Olsudong, D., Parker, A., 2019b.
- The status of Ngeruangel Marine Reserve after 22 years of protection and a major typhoon
- disturbance. Palau International Coral Reef Center Technical Report No. 19-12.
 http://picrc.org/picrcpage/wp-
- 620 content/uploads/2019/11/01_REPORT_NgeruangelReserve_2018_REPORT_FINAL.pdf.
- 621 Gouezo, M., Wolanski, E., Critchell, K., Fabricius, K., Harrison, P., Golbuu, Y., Doropoulos, C.,
- 622 2021. Modelled larval supply predicts coral population recovery potential following
- disturbance. Marine Ecology Progress Series 661: 127-
- 624 145. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps13608.

- Gumanao, G.S., Saceda-Cardoza, M.M., Mueller, B., Bos, A.R., 2016. Length–weight and
 length–length relationships of 139 Indo-Pacific fish species (Teleostei) from the Davao Gulf,
 Philippines. Journal of Applied Ichthyology 32, 377-385. https://doi.org/10.1111/jai.12993.
- Harborne, A.R., Green, A.L., Peterson, N.A., Beger, M., Golbuu, Y., Houk, Y., Spalding, M.D.,
- Taylor, B.M., Terk, E., Treml, E.A., Victor, S., Vigliola, L., Williams, I.D., Wolff, N.H., zu
 Ermgassen, P.S.E., Mumby, P.J., 2018. Modelling and mapping regional-scale patterns of
- fishing impact and fish stocks to support coral-reef management in Micronesia. Biodiversity
 Research 28(12), 1729-1743. https://doi.org/10.1111/ddi.12814.
- Harrison, H.B., Williamson, D.H., Evans, R.D., Almany, G.R., Thorrold, S.R., Russ, G.R.,
 Feldheim, K.A., Herwerden, L., Planes, S., Srinivasan, M., Berumen, M.L., Jones, G.P.,
 2012. Larval export from marine reserves and the recruitment benefit for fish and fisheries.
 Current Biology 22(11), 1023-1028. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2012.04.008.
- Harvey, E., Fletcher, D., Shortis, M., 2001. A comparison of the precision and accuracy of
 estimates of reef-fish lengths determined visually by divers with estimates produced by a
 stereo-video system. Fishery Bulletin 99(1), 63–71.
- 640 https://spo.nmfs.noaa.gov/sites/default/files/pdf-content/2001/991/Harvey.pdf.
- Harvey, E., Fletcher, D., Shortis, M., Kendrick, G., 2004. A comparison of underwater visual distance estimates made by SCUBA divers and a stereo-video system: Implications for
 underwater visual census of reef fish abundance. Marine and Freshwater Research 55(6),
 573-580. https://doi.org/10.1071/MF03130.
- Holmes, T.H., Wilson, S.K., Travers, M.J., Langlois, T.J., Evans, R.D., Moore, G.I., Douglas,
 R.A., Shedrawi, G., Harvey, E.S., Hickey, K.A., 2013. comparison of visual- and stereovideo based fish community assessment methods in tropical and temperate marine waters of
 Western Australia. Limnology and Oceanography: Methods 11(7), 337-350.
 https://doi.org/10.4319/lom.2013.11.337.
- Hordyk, A., Ono, K., Valencia, S., Loneragan, N., Prince, J., 2015. A novel length-based
 empirical estimation method of spawning potential ratio (SPR), and tests of its performance,
 for small-scale, data-poor fisheries. ICES Journal of Marine Science 72(1), 217–231.
 https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsu004.
- Houk, P., Benavente, D., Iguel, J., Johnson, S., Okano, R., 2014. Coral Reef Disturbance and
 Recovery Dynamics Differ across Gradients of Localized Stressors in the Mariana Islands.
 PLoS ONE 9(9), e110068. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0110068.
- Houk, P., Camacho, R., Johnson, S., McLean, M., Maxin, S., Anson, J., Joseph, E., Nedlic, O.,
 Luckymis, M., Adams, K., Hess, D., Kabua, E., Yalon, A., Buthung, E., Graham, C.,
- Leberer, T., Taylor, B., van Woesik, R., 2015. The Micronesia Challenge: Assessing the
 Relative Contribution of Stressors on Coral Reefs to Facilitate Science-to-Management
 Feedback. *PLoS ONE* 10(6), e0130823. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0130823.
- Houk, P., Cuetos-Bueno, J., Tibbatts, B., Gutierrez, J., 2018. Variable density dependence and
 the restructuring of coral reef fisheries across 25 years of exploitation. Scientific Reports 8,
 5725. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-23971-6.
- Johannes, R.E., 1981. Words of the Lagoon: Fishing and Marine Lore in the Palau District of
 Micronesia. University of California Press. 245 pp.
- https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=TloVDfV7QLoC&oi=fnd&pg=PA1&ots=W
 LE-8P4r00&sig=dl31y4R_Lh0BOWrngATqV8Wu6xI#v=onepage&q&f=false.
- Johannes, R.E., 1991. Some suggested management initiatives in Palau's nearshore fisheries, and
 the relevance of traditional management. Palau Marine Resources Division Technical Report.

- 671 91.14. https://spccfpstore1.blob.core.windows.net/digitallibrary-
- 672 docs/files/6d/6d64da523349a7a35adba6cfb4c35369.pdf?sv=2015-12-
- 673 11&sr=b&sig=IcEsoem2C5vE0HOpctM2nUCnMa3AbFjb%2FctboW0U5ns%3D&se=2021-
- 674 07-12T05%3A18%3A05Z&sp=r&rscc=public%2C%20max-age%3D864000%2C%20max-
- stale%3D86400&rsct=application%2Fpdf&rscd=inline%3B%20filename%3D%22Johannes
 Palau_91.pdf%22.
- Johannes, R.E., 1998. The case for data-less marine resource management: examples from
 tropical nearshore finfisheries. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 13, 243-246.
- 679 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-5347(98)01384-6.
- Kamikawa, K.T., Cruz, E., Essington, T.E., Hospital, J., Brodziak, J.K.T., Branch, T.A., 2015.
 Length-weight relationships for 85 fish species from Guam. Journal of Applied Ichthyology
- 682 31, 1171–1174. https://doi.org/10.1111/jai.12877.
- Kitalong, A., Dalzell, P., 1994. A preliminary assessment of the status of inshore coral reef fish
 stocks in Palau [pdf]. Inshore Fisheries Research Project Technical Document No. 6. South
 Pacific Commission Noumea, New Caledonia.
- 686 https://spccfpstore1.blob.core.windows.net/digitallibrary-
- 687 docs/files/ea/ea8aba027fd37ac14541a1606883e384.pdf?sv=2015-12-
- 688 11&sr=b&sig=ZRg57serLv6M3KKPqbrzjAEd4R5OWvbxJbwA8ErjygU%3D&se=2021-07 689 12T05%3A21%3A28Z&sp=r&rscc=public%2C%20max-age%3D864000%2C%20max-
- stale%3D86400&rsct=application%2Fpdf&rscd=inline%3B%20filename%3D%22Kitalong_
 94 Palau.pdf%22.
- Kulbicki, M., Guillemot, N., Amand, M., 2005. A general approach to length-weight
 relationships for New Caledonian lagoon fishes. Cybium 29(3), 235-252. http://sficybium.fr/en/node/1297.
- Lindfield, S.J., Harvey, E.S., McIlwain, J.L., Halford, A.R., 2014. Silent fish surveys: bubblefree diving highlights inaccuracies associated with SCUBA-based surveys in heavily fished
 areas. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 5(10), 1061–1069. https://doi.org/10.1111/2041210X.12262.
- Lindfield, S.J., 2017. Palau's reef fisheries: changes in size and spawning potential from past to
 present. Technical report, Coral Reef Research Foundation, 23pp.
 https://coralreefpalau.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Lindfield-2017-Palaus-reef-fishery-
- 702 past-and-present-report.pdf.
- MacNeil, M.A., Graham, N.A.J., Cinner, J.E., Wilson, S.K., Williams, I.D., Maina, J., Newman,
 S., Friedlander, A.M., Jupiter, S., Polunin, N.V.C., McClanahan, T.R., 2015. Recovery
- potential of the world's coral reef fishes. Nature 520, 341–344.
- 706 http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature14358.
- 707 Marine Protection Amendment (RPPL No. 9-50 of 2015).
- 708http://extwprlegs1.fao.org/docs/pdf/pau152478.pdf.
- McLean, M., Cuetos-Bueno, J., Nedlic, O., Luckymiss, M., Houk, P., 2016. Local Stressors,
 Resilience, and Shifting Baselines on Coral Reefs. PLoS ONE 11(11), e0166319.
 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0166319.
- Moore, B., Rechelluul, P., Victor, S., 2014. Creel survey and demographic assessments of
- coastal finfish fisheries of southern Palau. Secretariat of the Pacific Community.
 https://spccfpstore1.blob.core.windows.net/digitallibrary-
- 715 docs/files/34/3420d0b59e74e131342b4f149d3c55ed.pdf?sv=2015-12-
- 716 11&sr=b&sig=vkJmm5Kx5W5YAsJNnOvF9g%2BDzTLzCvEjFrfjeIf0FSQ%3D&se=2021-

- 717 07-07T06%3A45%3A56Z&sp=r&rscc=public%2C%20max-age%3D864000%2C%20max 718 stale%3D86400&rsct=application%2Fpdf&rscd=inline%3B%20filename%3D%22Moore_1
- 719 5_Palau_creel_survey.pdf%22.
- Newton, K., Côté, I., Pilling, G., Jennings, S., Dulvy, N., 2007. Current and Future Sustainability
 of Island Coral Reef Fisheries. Current Biology 17, 655-658.
- 722 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2007.02.054.
- Office of Planning and Statistics, 2015. 2015 Census of Population Housing and Agriculture for
 the Republic of Palau. https://www.palaugov.pw/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/2015-Census of-Population-Housing-Agriculture-.pdf.
- Polloi, K., Golbuu, Y., Mereb, G., Koshiba, S., Friedlander, A., Koike, H., 2014. An Assessment of maml and kemedukl in Palau and management recommendations: A report to The Nature Conservancy-Micronesia Program. Technical Report No. 14-07. 37 pp.
- 729 http://picrc.org/picrcpage/wp-
- content/uploads/2016/01/Polloi_Assessment_Recommendations_March2014.pdf.
- Pratchett, M.S., Hoey, A.S., Wilson, S.K., 2014. Reef degradation and the loss of critical
 ecosystem goods and services provided by coral reef fishes. Current Opinion in
- Environmental Sustainability 7, 37-43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2013.11.022.
- Prince, J.D., Dowling, N.A., Davies, C.R., Campbell, R.A., Kolody, D.S., 2011. A simple costeffective and scale-less empirical approach to harvest strategies. ICES Journal of Marine
 Science 68, 947–960. https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsr029.
- Prince, J., Victor, S., Kloulchad, V., Hordyk, A., 2015. Length based SPR assessment of eleven
 Indo-Pacific coral reef fish populations in Palau. Fisheries Research 171, 42-58.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2015.06.008.
- PAN, 2015. Protected Areas Network Status Report 2003-2015. Palau Protected Areas Network
 Office: Ministry of Natural Resources, Environment & Tourism. https://palaugov.pw/wp content/uploads/2016/10/PAN-Status-Report-2003-2015.pdf.
- Richmond, R.H., Rongo, T., Golbuu, Y., Victor, S., Idechong, N., Davis, G., Kostka, W., Neth,
 L., Hamnett, M., Wolanski, E., 2007. Watersheds and coral reefs: conservation science,
 policy, and implementation. BioScience 57, 598-607. https://doi.org/10.1641/B570710.
- Roff, G., Bejarano, S., Priest, M., Marshell, A., Chollett, I., Steneck, R.S., Doropoulos, C.,
- Golbuu, Y., Mumby, P.J., 2019. Seascapes as drivers of herbivore assemblages in coral reef
 ecosystems. Ecological Monographs 89(1). https://doi.org/10.1002/ecm.1336.
- Rowley, R.J., 1994. Marine reserves in fisheries management. Aquatic Conservation Marine and
 Freshwater Ecosystems 4(3), 233–254. https://doi.org/10.1002/aqc.3270040305.
- Schultz, L.D., Mayfield, M.P., Whitlock, S.L., 2016. Sample sizes needed to describe lengthfrequency of smallbodied fishes: an example using larval Pacific lamprey. Journal of Fish
 and Wildlife Management 7(2), 315–322. https://doi.org/10.3996/112015-JFWM-112.
- The Nature Conservancy, 2016a. Improving Fisheries Management In Palau's Northern Reefs.
 http://walker-foundation.org/Files/walker/2016/NRFCBrochure_short.pdf.
- The Nature Conservancy, 2016b. Palau's Northern Reef Fisheries Management Plan 2016.
 https://chm.cbd.int/api/v2013/documents/6FE95FE4-BB12-0F51-0C3F-
- 758 7CB651CAD80A/attachments/PALAUS%20NORTHERN%20REEF%20FISHERIES%20M
 759 ANAGEMENT%20PLAN%202016-hfmay25.pdf.
- Ward-Paige, C., Mills Flemming, J., Lotze, H.K., 2010. Overestimating fish counts by non instantaneous visual censuses: consequences for population and community descriptions.
- 762 PLoS ONE 5(7), e11722. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0011722.

763	Wilson, S.K., Graham, N.A.J., Holmes, T.H., MacNeil, M.A., Ryan, N.M., 2018. Visual versus
764	video methods for estimating reef fish biomass. Ecological Indicators 85, 146-152.
765	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2017.10.038.
766	
767	
768	
769	
770	
771	
772	
773	
774	
775	
776	
777	
778	
770	
780	
700	
701	
702	
787	
704 705	
705	
700	
707	
700	
709	
790	
791	
792	
793	
794	
795	
796	
797	
798	
799	
800	
801	
802	
803	
804 805	
805	
806 007	
807	
808	

809	Table 1.	Assessed	predictor	variables	of resource	fish	biomass.
-----	----------	----------	-----------	-----------	-------------	------	----------

Q	1	n
٥	т	υ

Variable	Category	Data type	Derivation
Depth	Biophysical	Categorical	Recorded during fish surveys and categorized as shallow or deep
Habitat	Biophysical	Categorical	NOAA Palau habitat map
Region	Anthropogenic/ Biophysical	Categorical	Sites mapped and geographically divided into 3 main areas of Palau: Northern Reefs, Babeldaob and Southern Reefs
MPA proximity	Anthropogenic	Continuous	Distance by water to nearest MPA (inverse) multiplied by MPA size
Koror fishing pressure	Anthropogenic	Continuous	Distance by boat from Koror (inverse)
Local fishing pressure	Anthropogenic	Continuous	Distance by boat from the nearest dock (inverse) multiplied by the population of that state
Distance to pass	Anthropogenic/ Biophysical	Continuous	Linear distance to the nearest reef pass
Watershed pollution	Anthropogenic/ Biophysical	Continuous	Percentage of altered land in adjacent watershed multiplied by linear distance to nearest river discharge (inverse)
Wave energy	Anthropogenic/ Biophysical	Continuous	Wave energy calculated from wind speed, fetch distance and angle of exposure

Table 2. Life history parameters for seven commercially important resource species with
 sufficient actual length measurements for SPR estimates.

Species	Ν	L ₅₀	L95	L∞	M/K	L_{50}/L_{∞}	Source
Lutjanus gibbus	385	245	320	340	0.977	0.72	1, 2
Acanthurus nigricauda	358	190	200	241	0.518	0.79	1, 2
Naso lituratus	334	205	238	238	0.518	0.79	1, 2
Scarus rubroviolaceus	207	292	390	448	0.94	0.652	1, 2
Siganus puellus	162	177	190	298	1.651	0.594	3, 2
Plectropomus leopardus	110	291	315	450	1.165	0.646	1, 2
Hipposcarus longiceps	107	251	273	385	0.94	0.652	4,1

815 1 Prince $(2016a)^2$

816 2 J. Prince (2021, pers. comm., 7 April)

817 3 Prince $(2016b)^3$

818 4 Lindfield (Coral Reef Research Foundation, unpublished data)

Predictor	Df	AIC	LRT	Pr(>Chi)
		All habitats (L	MM)	
		474.15		
Habitat	3	502.85	34.699	1.411e-07 ***
Region	2	479.89	9.742	0.008 **
		Channel (LM	[M]	
		86.009		
Region	2	88.385	6.3757	0.041 *
MPA proximity	1	106.308	22.2989	2.333e-06 ***
Koror fishing pressure	1	90.192	6.1828	0.013 *
Local fishing pressure	1	91.396	7.3868	0.007 **
Wave energy	1	90.188	6.1794	0.013 *
	-	Fore-reef east (l	LMM)	
		112.00	0.0000	
Region	2	116.32	8.3222	0.016 *
MPA proximity	1	119.65	9.6489	0.002 **
]	Fore-reef west (LMM)	
		113.65		
Region	2	119.30	9.6516	0.008 **
		Inner reef (LN	(MM)	
		141.24	• • • •	
MPA proximity	1	143.15	3.909	0.048 *
Koror fishing pressure	1	145.85	6.615	0.010 *
Significance codes: p<0.0)01(***), j	p<0.01(**) and p	><0.05(*)	

Table 3. Results of mixed effects models (LMM) for predictors of fish biomass.

Table 4. Size structure of twelve resource fish species with sufficient actual length

873 measurements.

Species	Ν	Mean length (mm)	Median length (mm)	% below L ₅₀
Chlorurus spilurus	501	183	184	No L ₅₀ available
Lutjanus gibbus	384	248	249	45
Acanthurus nigricauda	358	199	200	40
Naso lituratus	334	202	200	55
Scarus schlegeli	226	183	181	No L ₅₀ available
Scarus rubroviolaceus	207	260	252	70
Siganus puellus	162	175	182	45
Lutjanus monostigma	129	302	303	No L ₅₀ available
Plectropomus leopardus	110	262	252	65
Hipposcarus longiceps	107	240	243	27
Kyphosus vaigiensis	105	265	264	No L ₅₀ available
Caranx sexfasciatus	101	341	359	No L ₅₀ available

877 Table 5. Output from LB-SPR assessment including spawning potential ratio (SPR) and
878 selectivity-at-length (SL₅₀ and SL₉₅), measurements are in fork length.

Species	SPR (%)	SL ₅₀ (mm)	SL ₉₅ (mm)
Lutjanus gibbus	35	212	282
Acanthurus nigricauda	38	160	193
Naso lituratus	20	169	208
Scarus rubroviolaceus	21	173	235
Siganus puellus	16	195	259
Plectropomus leopardus	31	168	202
Hipposcarus longiceps	53	127	166

Figure 1. Fish stock monitoring sites sampled in 2017 within each reef habitat across Palau. MPAs are shown with red polygons and regions are delineated with black dashed lines.



Figure 2. Interpolation maps showing resource fish biomass across Palau for (A) total biomass,
(B), herbivores, (C) secondary consumers and (D) piscivores. Color scale from blue to red,

corresponds to increasing biomass in grams m^{-2} . Note that color ramps are on different scales.



Figure 3. Resource fish species percentage contribution to total biomass. Only species that contributed >1% are included.



Figure 4. Box plots showing total resource fish biomass across habitats (a) and regions (b) with outliers removed. Median (black line), mean (), upper and lower quartiles, and 5th and 95th percentiles are shown. Habitat types and regions with the same letter are not significantly different ($\alpha = 0.05$).



928 Figure 5. Regression plots and box plots showing assessed predictor variables that significantly affected resource fish biomass by habitat type. Continuous variables were normalized prior to 929 analysis and distances used for MPA proximity, fishing pressure (local and Koror) and watershed 930 pollution were inversely scaled. For the box plots, median (black line), mean (\$), upper and 931 lower quartiles, and 5th and 95th percentiles are shown. Regions with the same letter are not 932 933 significantly different ($\alpha = 0.05$).

934





