1	Supporting Information. Elahi, R., Edmunds, P.J., Gates, R.D., Kuffner, I.B., Barnes, B.B.,
2	Chollett, I., Courtney, T.A., Guest, J.R., Lenz, E.A., Toth, L.T., Viehman, T.S., Williams, I.D.
3	2022. Scale dependence of coral reef oases and their environmental correlates. Ecological
4	Applications.
5	
6	Appendix S1.
7	
8	Any use of trade, firm, or product names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply
9	endorsement by the U.S. Government.

10 Section S1. Supporting Methods

11

12 Defining spatiotemporal vs spatial oases

13 We used time-series data from our previous analysis of spatiotemporal oases (Guest et al. 2018) 14 to examine the sensitivity of oasis designation to temporal replication. How many years of data 15 do we need to eliminate errors in designating a given reef site as an oasis? And conversely, what 16 is the error rate when we have only one year of data? The latter question is directly relevant to 17 the spatial analysis we present in this paper. We consider the oases identified from the complete 18 time-series (Guest et al. 2018) as the most accurate designation because they are based on 11 to 19 24 years of data for each of four regions (Florida Keys, US Virgin Islands, main Hawaiian 20 Islands, and French Polynesia).

21

22 We used simulations to examine the consequence of varying the number of years available for 23 analysis. Each simulation consisted of drawing a random number (i) of years from the complete 24 time-series in each region, and then designating each reef site as an oasis or not, based on the 25 proportion of occasions where a site exhibited coral cover two standard deviations above its 26 regional mean value (i.e., z-score > 2). Whereas Guest et al. (2018) considered any site that had a 27 positive z-score to be a potential spatiotemporal oasis, we used two standard deviations in our 28 simulations because this was the threshold used to assign spatial oases in the current study. For 29 each set of simulations (n = 1,000) with a given number of years *i*, we calculated the percent of true/false positives and negatives, with corresponding quartiles. For example, a true positive 30 31 correctly identifies an oasis (i.e., sensitivity), and a false positive misidentifies a site as an oasis. 32 Even with only one year of data, false positive error rates were minimal (0 - 5%) and true oases

33	were always identified correctly (i.e., sensitivity was 100%) for the US Virgin Islands, main
34	Hawaiian Islands, and French Polynesia, (Fig. S1), suggesting that the assignment of oases with
35	the stricter criteria used in this study was robust to subsampling. However, error rates were
36	considerable for the Florida Keys, with sensitivity ranging between 70 and 100%. These
37	misidentifications may be due to the fact that the Florida Keys have been subjected to many and
38	diverse disturbances over the past few decades (e.g., cold-water intrusions, bleaching, disease;
39	Courtney et al. 2020). More disturbances would result in greater variability in coral cover, and
40	thus a higher error rate in oasis designations based on one or only a few years of data.
41	Considering that our current analysis relies on recent data (2012 – 2017; Fig. S2), after decades
42	of coral decline, we consider the designation of spatial oases using our highly-replicated dataset
43	to be reasonably robust to errors arising from frequent disturbances.
44	
45	Coral reef data
46	We used data collected by the United States National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
47	(NOAA) Coral Reef Conservation Program's (CCRP) National Coral Reef Monitoring Program
48	(NCRMP) which monitors reefs in the Pacific and Atlantic Oceans
49	(https://www.coris.noaa.gov/monitoring/). Data on benthic cover in the Pacific Ocean were
50	collected between 2012 and 2017 by the Coral Reef Ecosystem Program of NOAA's Pacific
51	Island Fisheries Science Center. At each randomly selected reef site (McCoy et al. 2016), a
52	digital camera (Canon PowerShot S110, 12.1 megapixel) recorded an area of 0.7 m ² of the
53	benthos at 1 m intervals along a 30 m transect line (30 photographs site ⁻¹). These photographs
54	were analyzed using stratified-random point counts (10 points photograph ⁻¹) to estimate the
55	percentage cover of coral species and genera, as well as other benthic groups (Williams et al.

56 2019). Data on benthic cover in the western Atlantic (Florida, Puerto Rico, and the U.S. Virgin 57 Islands) were collected between 2013 and 2017 by NOAA's NCRMP program and partners. 58 Regions were sampled every two years. A grid-based stratified random design was used to select 59 sample locations. Line-point-intercept transects (15 m in length) were used to estimate benthic 60 cover to the lowest possible taxonomic resolution (scleractinian corals, as well as calcified 61 octocorals and hydrozoan corals), functional group (other benthic organisms), or substratum 62 type. For the purposes of our analyses, we summed the total percentage cover of calcifying 63 corals as our response variable. We acknowledge that using total percent cover may mask 64 important dynamics of coral functional groups or taxa (Nyström 2006, Darling et al. 2019) or 65 population demographics (Hughes 1996, Edmunds and Elahi 2007), but it does correlate well 66 with one measure of a reef community's ability to produce calcium carbonate structures (coral 67 calcification capacity; Guest et al. 2018). Here, we use total cover as an aggregate metric of coral 68 reef condition to illustrate our modeling approach to identifying the correlates of oases, but the 69 approach can be extended to any continuous metric that can be used to assign a binary 70 categorization of oasis / not oasis.

71

72 Environmental predictors of coral reef oases

To determine which environmental features were associated with the occurrence of coral oases, we compiled remote sensing data from several sources. We selected predictors hypothesized to influence coral cover from macroecological (> 1000 km) to local scales (< 1 km), including abiotic and socioeconomic covariates. We used the Marine Socio-Environmental Covariates (MSEC) dataset to obtain net primary productivity, wave energy, land area, and human population density (Yeager et al. 2017). We also derived sea-surface temperature, light

79 attenuation in the water column, and storm activity from other published databases (Table S2). 80 These variables were chosen due to previously demonstrated associations with coral cover (e.g., 81 Williams et al. 2015, Darling et al. 2019), or hypothesized relationships based on mechanistic 82 biological understanding (e.g., through laboratory experiments). In addition to using a measure of central tendency (i.e., the mean) for primary productivity, temperature, light attenuation, and 83 84 wave exposure, we also considered a measure of variability (i.e., coefficient of variation; CV). 85 With the mean and CV, we were able to characterize the physical regime in as few parameters as 86 possible. We did not include depth as a covariate because a statistical analysis demonstrated no relationship ($\gamma^2 = 0.002$, P = 0.97) between coral cover and depth at each site. That is, we 87 compared a linear mixed-effects model (random intercepts of sub-jurisdiction) with a coefficient 88 89 for depth to a null model with only an intercept term. We also visualized the relationship 90 between coral cover and depth for each jurisdiction in Fig. S3. The extent to which relationships 91 between environmental covariates and oasis occurrence changes with spatial extent is unclear, 92 and we describe some of our expectations below.

93

Temperature. Sea-surface temperature (SST) was obtained from the National Aeronautics and 94 95 Space Administration (NASA). For each site, we extracted the mean and variance of monthly 96 mean products of SST to characterize the thermal environment in as few parameters as possible. 97 Specifically, level-3 BIN monthly composites (Jan 2003 – Dec 2017) of MODIS SST (nighttime 98 4µm) acquired from NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov/cgi/l3). These were 99 mapped using the SeaDAS (version 7.4) routine l3mappen to a cylindrical equidistant projection 100 with 2.5 arcminute resolution and boundaries of 15S - 29N, 144E - 64W (longitude 0 = 180). 101 Cubic interpolation was used to fill gaps in the data, which resulted primarily from land and

102 persistently cloudy conditions in equatorial Pacific regions. Pixels identified as land (according 103 to the GSHHS version 2.3.7 "high" resolution landmask, mapped to the same projection as 104 above; Wessel and Smith 1996) were removed. The mean and variance was derived from the 105 calculated monthly mean SST. Although it would have been useful to obtain an estimate of 106 higher frequency temperature variability, as corals may benefit from exposure to large thermal 107 fluctuations on daily to weekly scales (e.g., Safaie et al. 2018), we chose to calculate summary 108 statistics using monthly means because of the highly variable number of satellite observations 109 per grid cell over shorter timescales due to cloudy conditions. Moreover, our monthly estimates 110 of SST mean and variance were highly correlated (r > 0.98) with weekly estimates from the 111 global Coral Reef Temperature Anomaly Database (CoRTAD Version 5) from the National 112 Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (www.nodc.noaa.gov/sog/cortad/). We standardized 113 the metric of variability using the coefficient of variation (CV) by squaring the variance and 114 dividing by the mean. At macroecological scales, coral cover in the central-western Pacific was 115 positively associated with average SST (Williams et al. 2015) and average minimum SST 116 (Robinson et al. 2018), consistent with the global distribution of coral reefs in tropical waters. 117 Therefore, we expected a positive association between coral oases and mean SST at 118 macroecological scales, but variable associations at local scales depending on the prevalence of 119 adaptation or acclimatization to 'hot spots' at finer management scales due to variation in water 120 flow and residence time (Craig et al. 2001, Oliver and Palumbi 2011, Palumbi et al. 2014). 121 Similarly, long-term variability in temperature may precondition corals to thermal anomalies and 122 reduce bleaching (Sully et al. 2019), and thus we expected a positive association between coral 123 oases and the CV of temperature, but the consistency of this expectation across spatial extents 124 was unclear.

126	Light attenuation. Light attenuation (quantified as the diffuse attenuation coefficient for
127	downwelling irradiance at 490nm; K_d 490 in m ⁻¹) was obtained from the National Aeronautics
128	and Space Administration (NASA) (Barnes et al. 2013). Higher values of K_d 490 represented
129	greater light attenuation and thus lower water clarity and vice versa. Light attenuation, as
130	measured by K_d 490, includes suspended particles (which both absorb and scatter light) and
131	dissolved organic matter (DOM; which only absorbs light). In contrast, turbidity describes
132	particles and not DOM, and thus we do not use the term turbidity to describe K_d490 (e.g., Sully
133	and van Woesik 2020). For each site, we extracted the mean and variance of K_d490 to
134	characterize the light environment in as few parameters as possible. Specifically, level-3 BIN
135	monthly composites (Jan 2003 – Dec 2017) of K_d 490 (as derived using the KD2 algorithm)
136	acquired from NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov/cgi/l3). These were
137	mapped using the SeaDAS (version 7.4) routine 13mapgen to a cylindrical equidistant projection
138	with 2.5 arcminute resolution and boundaries of $15S - 29N$, $144E - 64W$ (longitude $0 = 180$).
139	Cubic interpolation was used to fill gaps in the data, which resulted primarily from land and
140	persistently cloudy conditions in equatorial Pacific regions. Pixels identified as land (according
141	to the GSHHS "high" resolution landmask, mapped to the same projection as above) were
142	removed. The mean and variance was derived from the monthly mean K_d 490, which was
143	particularly important because seasonal variation (i.e., fewer during cloudy summer months) in
144	the number of satellite observations precluded the use of a finer temporal resolution (e.g., weekly
145	estimates of K_d 490). As with SST, we used CV as a standardized estimate of variability in K_d 490
146	by squaring the variance and dividing by the mean. Due to the fact that high irradiance can
147	exacerbate temperature-related bleaching in corals (Lesser et al. 1990), protection from high

148 light, through cloud cover or productive nearshore waters, can ameliorate coral bleaching 149 associated with exceptional warming events (Fitt and Warner 1995, Mumby et al. 2001). The 150 suspension of sediment in the water column, turbidity, is another mechanism that can reduce 151 light attenuation. Turbidity is typically considered a stressor to corals that requires specific 152 mechanisms of adaptation (Anthony and Larcombe 2000), due to the smothering effects of 153 sedimentation and associated reductions in available light for photosynthesis (Kleypas 1996). In 154 summary, the remotely sensed measurement of light attenuation (K_d 490) is influenced 155 simultaneously by a number of physical and biological processes in the water column, and can 156 have both positive and negative effects on coral physiology, especially in the context of a 157 variable thermal environment. A global analysis demonstrated that coral bleaching was 158 associated positively with K_d490, but associated negatively with the interaction between K_d490 159 and SST; whether the interaction reflected the expectation that light attenuation would be 160 beneficial under thermally stressful conditions was not investigated (Sully and van Woesik 161 2020). Based on these previous case studies and synthesis, we expected a negative, or complex 162 association (e.g., intermediate levels of light attenuation as beneficial; Sully and van Woesik 163 2020), between extinction coefficient K_d 490 and the probability of oasis occurrence. Similarly, 164 we expected a complex association between the CV of light attenuation and oasis occurrence. 165 For example, higher CV indicates greater inconsistency in the detrimental effects or potential 166 benefits of reduced irradiance. We did not have explicit hypotheses about how these 167 relationships would change with spatial extent. 168

Primary productivity. Estimates of net primary productivity (NPP) in the seawater column based
on NOAA CoastWatch were derived from 8-day composite layers from 2003-2013

171 (https://coastwatch.pfeg.noaa.gov/erddap/griddap/erdPPbfp28day.graph?productivity). NPP was 172 modelled on a 2.5 arcminute grid based on photosynthetically available radiation, SST, and 173 chlorophyll a concentration. The mean of each sampling week (8-day composite) was used for 174 calculating the mean and standard deviation for the entire period (2003-2013). These latter two 175 products were downloaded from the MSEC database (Yeager et al. 2017). Each site was then 176 joined to the nearest (straight-line distance) estimate of primary productivity (i.e., centroid of the 177 2.5 arcminute grid cell) using the R package 'fuzzyjoin' (Robinson 2019). Across the Indo-178 Pacific, this metric of net primary productivity was associated with lower coral cover, suggesting 179 unfavorable conditions for corals in eutrophic areas (Darling et al. 2019). In contrast, coral cover 180 across the central-western Pacific was associated positively with mean estimates of chlorophyll 181 a, as well as anomalies in chlorophyll a (Williams et al. 2015, Robinson et al. 2018), interpreted 182 to reflect beneficial effects of increased nutrient supply, either directly as an energetic subsidy to 183 corals, or through the positive, indirect effects of herbivorous fish populations. Thus, the 184 influence of NPP on sites vary with spatial extent.

185

Wave energy. Wave energy flux (the power transmitted per unit of wavefront width) at a 2.5 186 187 arcminute resolution was calculated using the WAVEWATCH III hindcast dataset 188 (http://polar.ncep.noaa.gov/waves/CFSR hindcast.shtml), which spanned 31 years at a 3-hour 189 temporal resolution. Estimates of wave energy were modified at sheltered locations by 190 considering wind speed, fetch and depth (Marchand and Gill 2017). Mean wave energy was 191 calculated for each day, and then used for calculating mean and standard deviation for the entire 192 period (1979-2009). These latter two products were downloaded from the MSEC database 193 (Yeager et al. 2017). Each site was then joined to the nearest (straight-line distance) estimate of

194 wave energy (i.e., centroid of the 2.5 arcminute grid cell) using the R package 'fuzzyjoin' 195 (Robinson 2019). At macroecological scales, coral cover is associated negatively with mean 196 wave energy (Robinson et al. 2018, Darling et al. 2019) and the magnitude of wave anomalies 197 (Williams et al. 2015), due to fragmentation and mortality caused by large physical disturbances. 198 However, wave energy can also mitigate the deleterious effects of high temperature anomalies at 199 local scales through the effects of internal waves (Wall et al. 2015, Wyatt et al. 2020), hurricanes 200 (Manzello et al. 2007), and water flow (Nakamura and van Woesik 2001), and thus the 201 consistency of wave energy effects across spatial extent is unclear. 202 203 Storms. Storm data were obtained from the International Best Track Archive for Climate 204 Stewardship (IBTrACS v03r10) (Knapp et al. 2010) which merges storm information from 205 multiple climate centers into one product with a common format. Initial dates vary according to 206 the source agency, but all data are available from 1897 through 2016 or 2017. Data for 2017 for

207 the North Atlantic basin (the only basin missing data with sampling that year) were

208 complemented with data from NOAA's National Hurricane Center. We limited our study to

storms at Saffir-Simpson intensity three (i.e., Category 3; sustained wind speed \ge 96 knots) and

above. Storms reaching Category 3 and higher are considered major storms because of their

211 potential for generating waves of sufficient energy to cause significant loss of life and damage

212 (Simpson and Saffir 1974). For each site, we calculated the number of major storms within a

213 radius of 100 km. This area of influence reflects the grid size commonly used in storm

- 214 climatological studies (Elsner et al. 2012) and encompasses potential damage from storms to
- coral communities observed in situ (Woodley et al. 1981, Treml et al. 1997, Puotinen 2004,
- 216 Gardner et al. 2005). The frequency of major storms was calculated for 30 years before the date

of site sampling to provide an estimate of storm exposure that was comparable to the duration of other metrics considered in this study. As described for 'wave energy' above, we expected that over large spatial extents, periodic cyclone impacts would have a negative impact on coral cover because of physical damage to the reef. However, hurricanes can also provide short-term relief from thermal stress (Manzello et al. 2007), which may result in a more complex relationship with coral oases at smaller spatial extents.

223

224 Land area. The total amount of land area within a 50 km radius of each site was used as a proxy 225 for terrestrial inputs (e.g., nutrients, pollution) onto coral reefs, and was calculated using the 0.25 226 arcminute the global, self-consistent, hierarchical, high-resolution shoreline (GSHHS) database 227 (Wessel and Smith 1996). This product was downloaded from the MSEC database (Yeager et al. 228 2017). We hypothesized that greater land area would be associated with a lower probability of 229 oasis occurrence, if land area is indeed a proxy for negative terrestrial influences to nearshore 230 coral reefs. The amount of rainfall and the inclination of land likely influence the flow of 231 terrestrial subsidies into nearshore habitats, but we do not consider these characteristics in our 232 analysis.

233

Human population density. The number of people within a 50 km radius of each site in 2015 was
used as a proxy for human impacts on coral reefs. The population count estimates were produced
by the Socioeconomic Data and Applications Center at a resolution of 0.5 arcminute. This
product was downloaded from the MSEC database (Yeager et al. 2017). Human population
density is typically assumed to be correlated positively with harmful impacts, including
pollution, fishing, and coastal modifications. Coral cover was associated negatively with

uninhabited islands in the central Pacific (Smith et al. 2016), and associated negatively with
population gravity (a function of human population size and reef accessibility) (Darling et al.
2019) in the Indo-Pacific. In contrast, human population size was not associated with coral cover
in a global synthesis (Bruno and Valdivia 2016), and thus the overall effect of this factor is not
clear and may depend on spatial extent.

245

246 <u>Summarizing predictors and assessing multicollinearity</u>

247 Each site was associated with a 2.5 arcminute grid cell for the purposes of our statistical model. 248 Temperature and light attenuation were estimated using the centroid of the site grid cells. For the 249 variables that were calculated for each specific site (i.e., land area, human population density), 250 the mean value was calculated using all the sites within a grid cell. The same was done for 251 estimates of primary productivity and wave energy, but in this case, the mean value was the same 252 as the individual value for each site, because the resolution of these two predictors was 2.5 253 arcminutes. Lastly, the total number of storms over the past 30 years was calculated as the mean 254 across all sites within a given grid cell. The distributions of all covariates at each management 255 scale are visualized in Figs. S4-S7.

256

We assessed multicollinearity among the predictors using variance inflation factors (VIF; Table S3) and Pearson correlation coefficients (r), for each scale of analysis. In general, we followed the approach suggested by Zuur et al. (2010) and removed predictors with the highest VIFs and correlation coefficients sequentially until all VIFs < 3 and r < 0.7, but we also considered the hypotheses being tested. Specifically, there were strong correlations (r > 0.7) between human population density and land use area, as well as the mean and CV of SST at several spatial

extents included in our analysis. When there were strong correlations, we chose to retain
population density rather than land area as an overall measure of human impacts, and we chose
to retain the variability (CV) of SST rather than the mean, to test the hypotheses outlined above.
However, we emphasize that these estimates will be more difficult to interpret due to their
covariance with the other known predictors.

268

269 When predictors were standardized at the cross-basin and basin spatial extents, we removed land 270 area and mean SST (Table S3). When predictors were standardized by region, we removed land 271 area but retained both mean and CV of SST (Table S3). At the sub-regional scale, we were able 272 to retain all the predictors (Table S3). Some sub-regions displayed no variability in the predictors 273 and thus the standardized predictor was undefined. Therefore, we added a small ($\leq 5\%$ of the 274 minimum observed value) value to human population density, storms, and land area. Due to the 275 fact that land area was not included at the three larger spatial extents, we also chose to remove it 276 from the sub-regional analysis. The total number of grid cells (i) was 890 across 32 sub-regions 277 (Table S1).

278 Section S2: Supporting Tables

- 279 Table S1. The number of grid cells (*i*) sampled within each sub-region, nested within region and
- 280 basin, used in the present analysis of oases.

Basin	Region	Sub-region	i
Western Atlantic	Florida	Keys-lower	34
Western Atlantic	Florida	Keys-middle	31
Western Atlantic	Florida	Keys-upper	38
Western Atlantic	Florida	Southeast Florida	41
Western Atlantic	Florida	Tortugas	51
Western Atlantic	Puerto Rico	Puerto Rico-east	46
Western Atlantic	Puerto Rico	Puerto Rico-north	21
Western Atlantic	Puerto Rico	Puerto Rico-southwest	66
Western Atlantic	US Virgin Islands	St. John	10
Western Atlantic	US Virgin Islands	St. Thomas	18
Western Atlantic	US Virgin Islands	St. J & St. T offshore	16
Western Atlantic	US Virgin Islands	St. Croix	33
Pacific	Mariana Islands	Guam	30
Pacific	Mariana Islands	Marianas-lower	24
Pacific	Mariana Islands	Marianas-middle	18
Pacific	Mariana Islands	Marianas-upper	6
Pacific	Mariana Islands	Rota	8
Pacific	Northwest Hawaiian Islands	French Frigate	30
Pacific	Northwest Hawaiian Islands	Kure	8
Pacific	Northwest Hawaiian Islands	Lisianski	16
Pacific	Northwest Hawaiian Islands	Pearl & Hermes	23
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Hawaii	74
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Kahoolawe	7
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Kauai	26
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Lanai	32
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Maui	37
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Molokai	41
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Niihau	19
Pacific	Main Hawaiian Islands	Oahu	47
Pacific	American Samoa	Manua Islands	12
Pacific	American Samoa	Rose	4
Pacific	American Samoa	Tutuila	23

Table S2. Table of predictors considered in this study. 283

Description	Years	Units	Source
Net primary productivity of carbon, mean of weekly means	2003-2013	mg C m ⁻² day ⁻¹	Yeager et al. 2017
Net primary productivity of carbon, standard deviation of weekly means	2003-2013	mg C m ⁻² day ⁻¹	Yeager et al. 2017
Wave energy flux, mean of weekly means	1971-2009	kW m ⁻¹	Yeager et al. 2017
Wave energy flux, standard deviation of weekly means	1971-2009	kW m ⁻¹	Yeager et al. 2017
Land area within a 50 km radius		km ²	Yeager et al. 2017
Human population count within a 50 km radius	2015	individuals	Yeager et al. 2017
Sea-surface temperature, mean of monthly means	2003-2017	°C	NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov)
Sea-surface temperature, standard deviation of monthly means	2003-2017	°C	NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov)
Light attenuation, mean of monthly means	2003-2017	$K_d 490$ in m ⁻¹	NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov)
Light attenuation, standard deviation of monthly means	2003-2017	K_d490 in m ⁻¹	NASA OBPG archives (https://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov)
Number of category 3, 4, 5 storms within a 100 km radius	30 years prior to site survey	count	IBTrACS v03r10, Knapp et al. 2010

284	Table S3. Variance inflation factors (VIF) for the final set of predictors considered for each
285	spatial extent. The variance inflation factor was not included (NA) in the table for predictors that
286	were removed due to multicollinearity (i.e., correlation coefficients > 0.7 or VIF > 3.0). Note that
287	land area was not used for any of the analyses due to collinearity at three of the four spatial
288	extents.

Predictor	Cross-basin	Basin	Region	Sub-region
Human population density within 50km (log)	1.76	1.49	1.33	1.32
Light attenuation (CV)	1.36	1.23	1.31	1.19
Light attenuation (mean)	2.36	2.09	1.41	1.45
Land area within 50km (log)	NA	NA	NA	1.41
Number of storms in past 30 years	1.29	1.20	1.18	1.03
Net primary productivity (CV)	1.35	1.30	1.25	1.11
Net primary productivity (mean)	1.91	1.22	1.30	1.18
Sea-surface temperature (CV)	2.15	2.35	1.53	1.41
Sea-surface temperature (mean)	NA	NA	1.67	1.28
Wave energy (CV)	1.12	1.11	1.27	1.26
Wave energy (mean)	1.83	1.28	1.44	1.32

290 Table S4. Bayesian *P* values for lack of fit between data simulated from posterior predictive

- 291 distributions and observations for each scale of analysis. Extremely small Bayesian P values (P <
- 292 0.05) indicate that the model predicted a smaller metric (e.g., the number of oases per grid cell)
- than observed in the data; extremely large Bayesian P values (P < 0.95) indicate that the model
- 294 predicted a larger metric than observed in the data. Goodness of fit was evaluated using a
- 295 Pearson χ^2 discrepancy metric for binomial data and a Freeman-Tukey discrepancy metric. The

296 Pearson discrepancy was calculated as $\chi^2 = \sum_i \left(\frac{y_i - p_i n_i}{\sqrt{p_i n_i (1 - p_i)}}\right)^2$, where y_i is the observed number

of oases, p_i is the estimated probability of detection, and n_i is the number of visits, in grid cell *i*.

To avoid division by zero we added 0.001 to p_i in the denominator (Tobler et al. 2015, Kéry and

299 Royle 2016). The Freeman-Tukey discrepancy was calculated as $\sum_{i} \left(\sqrt{y_i} - \sqrt{p_i n_i} \right)^2$.

300

Spatial extent	Pearson χ^2	Freeman-Tukey
Cross-basin	0.46	0.21
Basin	0.18	0.24
Region	0.12	0.20
Sub-region	0.15	0.13

302	Table S5. The direction of each predictor's coefficient at each spatial extent, along with the
303	associated probability of the direction (i.e., the proportion of Markov chain iterations that were
304	positive, or negative). Missing values (NA) in the table were for predictors that were removed
305	due to multicollinearity (see Table S3), or for predictors whose coefficient switched from
306	positive to negative at different spatial extents (e.g., mean wave energy). Coefficient of variation,
307	CV.

		Cross-			
Predictor	Direction	basin	Basin	Region	Sub-region
Human population density within 50km (log)	Negative	0.961	0.843	0.782	0.967
Light attenuation (CV)	Negative	0.598	NA	0.761	0.76
Light attenuation (CV)	Positive	NA	0.625	NA	NA
Light attenuation (mean)	Positive	0.891	1	1	1
Number of storms in past 30 years	Negative	0.846	0.566	0.579	NA
Number of storms in past 30 years	Positive	NA	NA	NA	0.559
Net primary productivity (CV)	Negative	0.715	0.773	0.611	0.819
Net primary productivity (mean)	Negative	0.607	NA	NA	NA
Net primary productivity (mean)	Positive	NA	0.728	0.692	0.595
Sea-surface temperature (CV)	Negative	0.875	0.846	NA	NA
Sea-surface temperature (CV)	Positive	NA	NA	0.995	0.886
Sea-surface temperature (mean)	Negative	NA	NA	NA	0.596
Sea-surface temperature (mean)	Positive	NA	NA	1	NA
Wave energy (CV)	Negative	0.967	0.796	0.595	NA
Wave energy (CV)	Positive	NA	NA	NA	0.797
Wave energy (mean)	Negative	0.601	NA	0.758	NA
Wave energy (mean)	Positive	NA	0.503	NA	0.624

311 Section S3: Supporting Figures



312

310

Figure S1. Results of simulations to understand the sensitivity of coral oasis designation to temporal replication (number of years with coral cover data), using time-series data from Guest et al. (2019). In all plots, the y-axis represents the median percent value (with upper and lower quartiles) of, for example, the true positive rate (green). That is, what percentage of simulations assigned each site the 'true' designation of an oasis, or not? The true designation is based on the complete time series of coral cover data within a region. We also include true negative, false negative, and false positive rates.



321

322 Figure S2. Patterns of coral cover (%) by year and region. Note that some regions were sampled

323 only in a single year (e.g., American Samoa, Mariana Islands, Northwest Hawaiian Islands).

- 324 Boxplots display the median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted as circles
- 325 beyond whiskers when the values are $1.5 \times IQR$ from the first or third quartile.



Figure S3. The relationship between coral cover (%) and depth (m) at the reef sites in each
region. The orange and blue points represent sites in the western Atlantic and Pacific basins,
respectively. The line represents a smoothed fit using a generalized additive model to illustrate
that there is no consistent effect of depth on coral cover.



Figure S4. Distributions of covariates, standardized relative to the entire dataset (i.e., cross-basin
extent). Boxplots display the median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted

- as circles beyond whiskers when the values are $1.5 \times IQR$ from the first or third quartile. Sea-
- 336 surface temperature, SST; coefficient of variation, CV.





338 339 Figure S5. Distributions of covariates, standardized relative to each ocean basin (Pacific, western 340 Atlantic). Boxplots display the median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted

- 341 as circles beyond whiskers when the values are $1.5 \times IQR$ from the first or third quartile. Sea-
- 342 surface temperature, SST; coefficient of variation, CV.





343 344 Figure S6. Distributions of covariates, standardized relative to each region. Boxplots display the 345 median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted as circles beyond whiskers

- 346 when the values are $1.5 \times IQR$ from the first or third quartile. Sea-surface temperature, SST;
- 347 coefficient of variation, CV.





Figure S7. Distributions of covariates, standardized relative to each sub-region. Boxplots display 350 the median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted as circles beyond whiskers

- 351 when the values are $1.5 \times IQR$ from the first or third quartile. Sea-surface temperature, SST;
- 352 coefficient of variation, CV.





Figure. S8. The statistical model correctly identified a greater percentage of cells with detected
coral oases than a null model at four spatial extents. See *Methods* for details. Boxplots display
the median and interquartile range (IQR) of data, with outliers plotted as circles beyond whiskers
when the values are 1.5 × IQR from the first or third quartile.



359

Figure S9. The relationship between mean light attenuation, the coefficient of variation (CV) in sea-surface temperature, and median predicted probability of oasis occurrence (ψ) at the regional extent in Florida (related to Figure 6).



363

Figure S10. The relationship between mean sea-surface temperature (SST), the coefficient of variation (CV) in SST, and median predicted probability of oasis occurrence (ψ) at the regional extent in Florida (related to Figure 6).

367 Supporting References

- Anthony, K., and P. Larcombe. 2000. Coral reefs in turbid waters: sediment-induced stresses in
 corals and likely mechanisms of adaptation. Pages 239-244 *in* Proceedings of the 9th
- 370 International Coral Reef Symposium, Bali, Indonesia.
- 371 Barnes, B. B., C. Hu, B. A. Schaeffer, Z. Lee, D. A. Palandro, and J. C. Lehrter. 2013. MODIS-
- derived spatiotemporal water clarity patterns in optically shallow Florida Keys waters: A
 new approach to remove bottom contamination. Remote Sensing of Environment
 134:377-391.
- Bruno, J. F., and A. Valdivia. 2016. Coral reef degradation is not correlated with local human
 population density. Scientific Reports 6:29778.
- 377 Craig, P., C. Birkeland, and S. Belliveau. 2001. High temperatures tolerated by a diverse
 378 assemblage of shallow-water corals in American Samoa. Coral Reefs 20:185-189.
- 379 Darling, E. S., T. R. McClanahan, J. Maina, G. G. Gurney, N. A. Graham, F. Januchowski-
- 380 Hartley, J. E. Cinner, C. Mora, C. C. Hicks, and E. Maire. 2019. Social-environmental
- 381 drivers inform strategic management of coral reefs in the Anthropocene. Nature Ecology
- 382 & Evolution **3**:1341-1350.
- Edmunds, P. J., and R. Elahi. 2007. The demographics of a 15-year decline in cover of the
 Caribbean reef coral *Montastraea annularis*. Ecological Monographs 77:3-18.
- Elsner, J. B., R. E. Hodges, and T. H. Jagger. 2012. Spatial grids for hurricane climate research.
 Climate Dynamics 39:21-36.
- Fitt, W., and M. Warner. 1995. Bleaching patterns of four species of Caribbean reef corals. The
 Biological Bulletin 189:298-307.

389	Gardner, T. A., I. M. Cote, J. A. Gill, A. Grant, and A. R. Watkinson. 2005. Hurricanes and
390	Caribbean coral reefs: impacts, recovery patterns, and role in long-term decline. Ecology
391	86 :174-184.
392	Guest, J. R., P. J. Edmunds, R. D. Gates, I. B. Kuffner, A. J. Andersson, B. B. Barnes, I. Chollett,
393	T. A. Courtney, R. Elahi, K. Gross, E. A. Lenz, S. Mitarai, P. J. Mumby, H. R. Nelson, B.
394	A. Parker, H. M. Putnam, C. S. Rogers, and L. T. Toth. 2018. A framework for
395	identifying and characterising coral reef "oases" against a backdrop of degradation.
396	Journal of Applied Ecology 55:2865-2875.
397	Hughes, T. P. 1996. Demographic approaches to community dynamics: a coral reef example.
398	Ecology 77 :2256-2260.
399	Kéry, M., and J. Royle. 2016. Applied hierarchical modelling in ecology—Modeling
400	distribution, abundance and species richness using R and BUGS. 783 pages.
401	Elsevier/Academic Press.
402	Kleypas, J. 1996. Coral reef development under naturally turbid conditions: fringing reefs near
403	Broad Sound, Australia. Coral Reefs 15:153-167.
404	Knapp, K. R., M. C. Kruk, D. H. Levinson, H. J. Diamond, and C. J. Neumann. 2010. The
405	international best track archive for climate stewardship (IBTrACS) unifying tropical
406	cyclone data. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 91:363-376.
407	Lesser, M., W. Stochaj, D. Tapley, and J. Shick. 1990. Bleaching in coral reef anthozoans:
408	effects of irradiance, ultraviolet radiation, and temperature on the activities of protective
409	enzymes against active oxygen. Coral Reefs 8:225-232.

410	Manzello, D. P., M. Brandt, T. B. Smith, D. Lirman, J. C. Hendee, and R. S. Nemeth. 2007.
411	Hurricanes benefit bleached corals. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences
412	104 :12035-12039.
413	Marchand, P., and D. Gill. 2017. waver: Calculate Fetch and Wave Energy. R package version
414	0.2. 0.
415	McCoy, K., A. Heenan, J. M. Asher, P. Ayotte, K. Gorospe, A. E. Gray, K. Lino, J. P. Zamzow,
416	and I. D. Williams. 2016. Pacific Reef Assessment and Monitoring Program. Data report:
417	ecological monitoring 2015: reef fishes and benthic habitats of the main Hawaiian
418	Islands, Northwestern Hawaiian Islands, Pacific Remote Island Areas, and American
419	Samoa.
420	Mumby, P. J., J. R. Chisholm, A. J. Edwards, S. Andrefouet, and J. Jaubert. 2001. Cloudy
421	weather may have saved Society Island reef corals during the 1998 ENSO event. Marine
422	Ecology Progress Series 222:209-216.
423	Nakamura, T., and R. van Woesik. 2001. Water-flow rates and passive diffusion partially explain
424	differential survival of ocrals during the 1998 bleaching event. Marine Ecology Progress
425	Series 212 :301-304.
426	Nyström, M. 2006. Redundancy and response diversity of functional groups: implications for the
427	resilience of coral reefs. AMBIO: A Journal of the Human Environment 35 :30-35.
428	Oliver, T., and S. Palumbi. 2011. Do fluctuating temperature environments elevate coral thermal
429	tolerance? Coral Reefs 30 :429-440.
430	Palumbi, S. R., D. J. Barshis, N. Traylor-Knowles, and R. A. Bay. 2014. Mechanisms of reef
431	coral resistance to future climate change. Science 344 :895-898.

432	Puotinen, M. 2004. Tropical cyclones in the Great Barrier Reef, Australia, 1910–1999: a first
433	step towards characterising the disturbance regime. Australian Geographical Studies
434	42 :378-392.
435	Robinson, D. 2019. fuzzyjoin: join tables together on inexact matching. R package version 0.1.5.
436	Robinson, J. P., I. D. Williams, L. A. Yeager, J. M. McPherson, J. Clark, T. A. Oliver, and J. K.
437	Baum. 2018. Environmental conditions and herbivore biomass determine coral reef
438	benthic community composition: implications for quantitative baselines. Coral Reefs
439	37 :1157-1168.
440	Safaie, A., N. J. Silbiger, T. R. McClanahan, G. Pawlak, D. J. Barshis, J. L. Hench, J. S. Rogers,
441	G. J. Williams, and K. A. Davis. 2018. High frequency temperature variability reduces
442	the risk of coral bleaching. Nature communications 9:1-12.
443	Simpson, R. H., and H. Saffir. 1974. The hurricane disaster potential scale. Weatherwise 27:169.
444	Smith, J. E., R. Brainard, A. Carter, S. Grillo, C. Edwards, J. Harris, L. Lewis, D. Obura, F.
445	Rohwer, and E. Sala. 2016. Re-evaluating the health of coral reef communities: baselines
446	and evidence for human impacts across the central Pacific. Proceedings of the Royal
447	Society B: Biological Sciences 283:20151985.
448	Sully, S., D. Burkepile, M. Donovan, G. Hodgson, and R. Van Woesik. 2019. A global analysis
449	of coral bleaching over the past two decades. Nature communications 10:1-5.
450	Sully, S., and R. van Woesik. 2020. Turbid reefs moderate coral bleaching under climate-related
451	temperature stress. Global Change Biology.
452	Tobler, M. W., A. Zúñiga Hartley, S. E. Carrillo-Percastegui, and G. V. Powell. 2015.
453	Spatiotemporal hierarchical modelling of species richness and occupancy using camera
454	trap data. Journal of Applied Ecology 52:413-421.

- 455 Treml, E., M. Colgan, and M. Keevican. 1997. Hurricane disturbance and coral reef
- development: a geographic information system (GIS) analysis of 501 years of hurricane
 data from the Lesser Antilles. Pages 541-546 *in* Proc 8th Int Coral Reef Symp.
- 458 Wall, M., L. Putchim, G. Schmidt, C. Jantzen, S. Khokiattiwong, and C. Richter. 2015. Large-
- 459 amplitude internal waves benefit corals during thermal stress. Proceedings of the Royal
 460 Society B: Biological Sciences 282:20140650.
- Wessel, P., and W. H. Smith. 1996. A global, self-consistent, hierarchical, high-resolution
 shoreline database. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 101:8741-8743.
- Williams, G. J., J. M. Gove, Y. Eynaud, B. J. Zgliczynski, and S. A. Sandin. 2015. Local human
 impacts decouple natural biophysical relationships on Pacific coral reefs. Ecography
 38:751-761.
- 466 Williams, I. D., C. S. Couch, O. Beijbom, T. A. Oliver, B. Vargas-Angel, B. D. Schumacher, and
- 467 R. E. Brainard. 2019. Leveraging automated image analysis tools to transform our
 468 capacity to assess status and trends of coral reefs. Frontiers in Marine Science 6.
- 469 Woodley, J., E. Chornesky, P. Clifford, J. Jackson, L. Kaufman, N. Knowlton, J. Lang, M.
- 470 Pearson, J. Porter, and M. Rooney. 1981. Hurricane Allen's impact on Jamaican coral
 471 reefs. Science 214:749-755.
- Wyatt, A. S., J. J. Leichter, L. T. Toth, T. Miyajima, R. B. Aronson, and T. Nagata. 2020. Heat
 accumulation on coral reefs mitigated by internal waves. Nature Geoscience 13:28-34.
- 474 Yeager, L. A., P. Marchand, D. A. Gill, J. K. Baum, and J. M. McPherson. 2017. Marine Socio-
- 475 Environmental Covariates: queryable global layers of environmental and anthropogenic
- 476 variables for marine ecosystem studies. Ecology **98**:1976-1976.

- 477 Zuur, A. F., E. N. Ieno, and C. S. Elphick. 2010. A protocol for data exploration to avoid
- 478 common statistical problems. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 1:3-14.