AN ANALYSIS OF THE FISH COMMUNITIES ALONG THE BARBERS POINT OCEAN OUTFALL, 'EWA BEACH, O'AHU, HAWAI‘I, USING REMOTE VIDEO-1996 DATA

Richard E. Brock

## AUTHOR

Dr. Richard E. Brock
Associate Researcher and Fisheries Specialist
Sea Grant Extension Service
Marine Science Building 204
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa
Honolulu, Hawai 'i 96822
Tel.: 808/956-2859
FAX: 808/956-2858

## $\$ 5.00 / \mathrm{copy}$

Please make remittance in U.S. dollars from a U.S. bank or international money order to:
Research Corporation of the University of Hawaii
Mail to: Water Resources Research Center
University of Hawai'i at Mảnoa
2540 Dole St., Holmes Hall 283
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96822 - U.S.A.
Attn: Publications Office
NOTE: Please indicate PR-97-01 on check or money order for our reference.

## an analysis of The fish Communities along

 THE BARBERS POINT OCEAN OUTFALL, 'EWA BEACH, O'AHU, HAWAI'I, USING REMOTE VIDEO- 1996 DATARichard E. Brock

## Project Report PR-97-01

October 1996

PREPARED POR
City and County of Honolulu
Department of Wastewater Management
Project Report
for
"The Assessment of the Impact of Ocean Sewer Outfalls on the Marine Environment Off Oahu, Hawaii"

Project No.: C39805
Project Period: 1 January 1995-31 September 1997
Principal Investigator: Roger S. Fujioka

WATER RESOURCES RESEARCH CENTER
University of Hawai 'i at Mänoa
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96822

Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this publication are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the view of the Water Resources Research Center.


#### Abstract

Because the diffuser of the Barbers Point Ocean Outfall lies below safe diving depths, a remotely controlled video camera system was used to determine the status of the marine fish communities and selected diumally exposed macroinvertebrate species residing on the diffuser. Video reconnaissance was completed over the entire $534-\mathrm{m}$ length. Three visual "transects," which "sampled" approximately $31 \%$ of the total diffuser length, were established on the diffuser pipe. Video sampling of the diffuser fish communities was carried out in January of each year from 1992 through 1995 and in March of 1996. The results of the five annual surveys indicate that the diffuser fish communities are dominated by species that are either small as adults or juvenites of larger species, probably as a result of the presence of only smallscale shelter created by small armor rock and gravel used in constructing the discharge pipe. Because of poor camera resolution, differing angles of the camera, small fish sizes, and the fishes' nature to flee from the approaching camera, the fish census data are highly variable and should be viewed as more qualitative than quantitative in nature. Despite this variability from transect to transect and year to year, only one parameter showed any statistical change over the five annual survey years. This parameter was the mean size of the area sampled to find an individual fish. Little significance should be attached to any change noted in the fish or macrobenthic communities residing on the Barbers Point diffuser because of the variable quality of the data generated by use of the remotely controlled video system.


## CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION ..... 1
MATERIALS AND METHODS ..... 1
RESULTS ..... 3
DISCUSSION ..... 12
REFERENCES CITED ..... 15Figure

1. Rough schematic of the 534 -m-long Barbers Point deep ocean outfall diffuser pipe showing the approximate locations of three fish census transects surveyed by a remotely controlled video recording system on 12 January 1992, 20 January 1993, 27 January 1994, 4 January 1995, and 5 March 1996 ..... 5
Tables
2. Family and species of fishes censused on three transects along the 534 -m-long diffuser pipe of the Barbers Point Ocean Outfall as delineated by use of a remotely controlled video camera system on 5 March 1996 ..... 6
3. Summary of the physical characteristics of three transects carried out at various points along the 534 -m-long Barbers Point Ocean Outfall diffuser in 1992 through 1996 ..... 7

## INTRODUCTION

In recent years controversy has arisen regarding the impact that sewage effluent from the Honouliuli Wastewater Treatment Plant may have on marine communities resident in the receiving waters. The Barbers Point Ocean Outfall, which has been in operation since 1982, currently releases roughly $25.65 \mathrm{mgd}\left(1.12 \mathrm{~m}^{3} / \mathrm{s}\right)$ of primary treated sewage through a $2,670-\mathrm{m}$-long pipe with a diffuser situated at a depth of 61 m offshore of 'Ewa Beach, $\mathrm{O}^{\prime}$ ahu, Hawai' i . The diffuser is comprised of reinforced concrete pipe of three diameters: 146.3 m of 1.98 -m-diameter pipe having 40 discharge ports that are 8.67 cm in diameter on the shoreward end of the diffuser, 176.5 m of 1.68 -m-diameter pipe equipped with 50 ports that are 9.09 cm in diameter in the central part, and 197.5 m of 1.22 -m-diameter pipe outfitted with 58 ports that are 9.50 cm in diameter at the seaward end. Together, these are comprised of $717.3-\mathrm{m}$ sections of the diffuser. Reducers make up the other two $7.3-\mathrm{m}$ sections; one reduces the diameter from 1.98 m to 1.68 m and the second from 1.68 m to 1.22 m . At the terminus of the diffuser are two 15.24 -cm-diameter ports. In all, there are 148 ports (two per pipe section) spread along the 534 m length of the diffuser. The diffuser rests on a gravel pad and has some ballast rock placed at the junctures between sections as well as along both sides of each pipe section up to the midline (springline). Fishes and invertebrates have taken up residence along most of the length of the deep ocean outfall. This study has been undertaken in an attempt to semiquantitatively ascertain the impacts that may be occurring to the communities residing on the diffuser. This report presents a synopsis of the data from the fifth annual sampling effort carried out on 5 March 1996.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Because the fish and diurnally exposed macroinvertebrate communities of interest to this study reside in waters below safe diving depths, a remotely controlled video camera system was used. There are a number of drawbacks as well as positive aspects to using a video camera system to visually census fishes and diumally exposed macroinvertebrates. The drawbacks include problems with poor camera resolution, making species and size identifications difficult, and the problem of adequately controlling the camera to focus-in on rapidly fleeing fishes, adding further difficulty to identification problems. On the positive side, a permanent record of the organisms in the path of the camera is obtained. An additional benefit of using a video system is that it eliminates the need for diving to great depths.

There are some well-known problems with using visual census methods to assess coral reef fish populations, regardless of whether a camera or diver is in the water conducting the census. One of these is the simple frightening of wary fishes on the approach of the diver or camera. Another is the underestimation of cryptic species such as moray eels (family Muraenidae) and noctumal species such as squirrelfishes (family Holocentridae) and bigeyes or 'āweoweo (family Priacanthidae). This problem is compounded in areas of high relief and coral coverage that affords numerous shelter sites. Species lists and abundance estimates are more accurate for areas of low relief, although some fishes with cryptic habits or protective coloration, such as scorpionfishes or nohu (family Scorpaenidae) and flatfishes (family Bothidae), might still be missed. Another problem is the reduced effectiveness of the visual census technique in turbid water. This is compounded by the difficulty of counting fishes that move quickly or are very numerous. Additionally, bias related to the experience of the census taker should be considered in making comparisons between surveys. Despite these problems, the visual census technique carried out by divers is probably the most accurate, nondestructive assessment method currently available for counting diumally active fishes (Brock 1982). Use of a remotely controlled video system to obtain census data compounds many of the above problems, but it is probably one of the most cost-effective methods available for assessing fish communities at depths below safe diving limits.

Other than exposed sessile species (corals in shallow water and some sponges in deeper waters), most tropical marine invertebrates are cryptic, remaining under shelter until darkness when they emerge to feed. Only a few motile macroinvertebrates remain fully exposed during the day; among these are some holothurian (sea cucumber) and echinoid (sea urchin) species. Problems with species identification preclude the enumeration of most diurnally exposed invertebrates. Identification of holothurians is based on skin spicule configuration, and spicules are also used for identification of sponges. Thus, in this study, the identification and enumeration of exposed macroinvertebrates are confined to large arthropods (spiny lobsters) and sea urchins, and educated guesses are made as to species of holothurians present along the Barbers Point diffuser pipe.

The video "transect" of fish and macroinvertebrate populations resident to the diffuser pipe along predetermined transects was undertaken by the Oceanographic Team of the Department of Wastewater Management, City and County of Honolulu. In the 1992 and 1993 annual surveys the video camera traveled from 0.5 to 1.5 m above the diffuser pipe, occasionally moving to the right or left side (and down) to survey the substratum alongside the pipe. The camera usually viewed a path from about 1.5 to 3 m in width. For data analysis purposes in all surveys, we assumed that the camera path was approximately 2 m in width and attempted to count only fishes and invertebrates seen in this path. At times, the camera would
tilt up (toward the horizon) to allow a viewing ahead down the pipe. Visibility under these circumstances ranged from about 1 m (in a discharge plume) to about 8 m , which is approximately the length of one pipe section. Because the camera grossly underestimates the number of fishes and invertebrates, we counted everything in the arbitrary 2 -m-wide path, regardless of whether it was encountered directly below the camera (as when viewing from above) or several meters ahead (as when the camera is in a horizontal position). In the 1994 survey the camera was usually maintained at a position on top of the diffuser to allow viewing ahead down the pipe. In 1994, due to exceptional water clarity, fishes could be seen as far as three pipe lengths ahead of the camera; hence many more larger fishes were censused than in previous surveys. In the 1995 survey the camera first traveled along one side of the discharge pipe and then crossed over for its return toward shore along the opposite side of the pipe. Only the counts for the offshore side of the discharge pipe (viewed by the camera on its return toward shore) are used in the 1995 annual assessment because resolution was deemed to be better on that segment. In 1996 two runs were made with the video camera, both starting on the shoreward end of the diffuser. The camera traveled down the middle about 1 to 1.5 m above the pipe in the first run and down the seaward side of the pipe in the second run. The videotape from the second run was utilized for the census of organisms for 1996.

The fish census involved not only the counting of populations but also the estimating of the lengths of all fishes for later use in calculating standing crop. The standing crop of all fishes was estimated by use of linear regression techniques (Ricker 1975). Commencing about 30 years ago, species-specific regression coefficients have been developed by the author and others at the University of Hawai'i, the Naval Undersea Center (see Evans 1974), and the Hawai‘i Division of Aquatic Resources from weight and body length measurements of captured fishes; for many species, sample sizes were in excess of a hundred individuals.

Simple nonparametric statistical procedures were utilized in analyzing the data. Specifically, the Kruskal-Wallis analysis of variance was used to compare means of parameters among the annual surveys, and the Student-Newman-Keuls test was used to discern which means were statistically significant (SAS Institute, Inc. 1985).

## RESULTS

The first video survey was carried out in January 1992 (see Brock 1993b). The 1992 videotape, which covered the entire length of the 534 -m diffuser, was viewed several times to determine where representative "transects" could best be established. Three transect sites selected as being representative of different parts of the diffuser pipe were sampled using the
visual census technique. These transects were established using known points on the pipe and counting sections of pipe from those points. Establishing transects at known points ensures that these same sites can again be sampled in subsequent annual surveys, thus making data comparable. These same sites were sampled in the 1993, 1994, 1995, and 1996 surveys (Brock 1994a, 1994b, 1995).

The location of each transect is shown in Figure 1. Transect 1 commences at the outfall terminus and continues shoreward for 36.5 m . It "samples" $73 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum at the terminal five sections of the $1.22-\mathrm{m}$-diameter diffuser pipe at a depth of 61 m . Transect 2 is situated near the middle of the diffuser and commences 212 m down from the beginning of the diffuser pipe in about 61 m of water and continues for 80 m along the pipe from that point. This transect samples 11 sections of the 1.68 - m -diameter diffuser pipe, or $161 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum. Transect 3 was established approximately 197.5 m from the end of Transect 2 (or 490 m from the outfall terminus). Comprised of the seven most landward sections of the 1.98 -m-diameter diffuser pipe, this transect, which is located at a depth of about 61 m , samples $102 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum. It commences at the shoreward end of the diffuser (where the pipe emerges from the armor rock cap and discharge ports are evident) and continues for 51 m in a seaward direction. In total, these transects sampled $31 \%$ of the entire diffuser length.

Collectively, approximately $336 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum were sampled. The results of all fish censuses for the 5 March 1996 survey are presented in Table 1, and the data for each transect are discussed below. In tallying the number of species seen on a given transect, all fishes that could not be positively assigned to a given species were lumped into groups such as "labrid unidentified"; in the tally of species, each of these groups was counted as being comprised of a single species, even though more than one species may have been in the group.

The results of the 1996 census carried out at Transect 1 are given in Table 1. Fourteen species of fishes representing 43 individuals were counted. This is equivalent to one new fish species encountered for every $5.2 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom examined or one fish seen for every $1.7 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled. The most abundant fish species included the damselfish Chromis sp. (probably a mix of Chromis hanui and C. agilis), comprising $\mathbf{2 8 \%}$ of the total number counted; the category of labrid unidentified, making up $19 \%$ of the total; and Canthigaster sp., contributing $9 \%$ to the total. The standing crop of fishes on Transect I was estimated at $8 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with the eye-stripe surgeonfish or palani (Acanthurus dussumieri) comprising 29\% of the total and the tableboss or 'a'awa (Bodionus bilunulatus) making up $26 \%$ of the total.

Three species of macroinvertebrates were noted during the census at Transect 1 in March 1996 (Table 2). The species present include three cushion starfish (Culcita novaeguineae), one wana or black-spine sea urchin (Diadema setsosum), and one serrated sea urchin (Chondrocidaris gigantea).
OFFSHORE Makai


Table 1. Family and Species of Fishes Censused on Three Transects Along the 534-m-Long Diffuser Pipe of the Barbers Point Ocean Outfall as Delineated By Use of a Remotely Controlled Video Camera System on 5 Marcb 1996. Areas Sampled on the Three Transects Varied: $73 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ for Transect $1,161 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ for Transect 2 , and $102 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ for Transect 3.

| FAMIILY and Species | Transect |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| MURAENIDAE Gymnothorax sp. |  | 1 |  |
| SERRANIDAE <br> Psendoanthias sp. |  |  | 8 |
| LUTJANIDAE <br> Lufjanus sp. <br> Lutjarus fulvus | 1 | 28 1 | 9 |
| APOGONIDAE Apogon sp. | 1 |  |  |
| MULIIDAE <br> Parupeneus multitasciatus | 3 | 17 | 13 |
| CHAETODONTIDAE <br> Chaetodon sp. Chaetodon ephippium | I | 4 | 1 |
| POMACANTHIDAE <br> Holacumthus arcuatus | 1 |  |  |
| POMACENTRIDAE <br> Chromis hanui <br> Chromis sp. <br> Pomacentrid unidentified | 7 12 1 | 22 28 3 | 68 87 3 |
| LABRIDAE <br> Bodianus bilunulatus <br> Thalassoma sp. <br> Anampses chrysocephalus <br> Labrid unidentified | 8 | 13 | 2 3 15 |
| ACANTHURIDAE <br> Acanthurus olivaceus Acanthurus dussumieri Acantharid unidentified | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| BALISIIDAE <br> Rhinecanthus aculeatus <br> Sufflamen sp. <br> Balistid sp. | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| TETRAODONTIDAE <br> Arothron sp. Canthigaster sp. Canthigater jactator | 4 | 1 | 1 |
| Total No. of Species Total No. of Individuals Estimated Biomass ( $g / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) | 14 43 8 | 15 127 56 | 13 212 13 |

[^0]Table 2. Summary of the Physical Characteristics of Three Transects Carried Out at Various Points Along the 534-m-Long Barbers Point Ocean Outfall Diffuser in 1992 through 1996

| Parameter | $\begin{gathered} 1992 \\ \text { Transect } \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} 1993 \\ \text { Transect } \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} 1994 \\ \text { Transect } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} 1995 \\ \text { Transect } \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} 1996 \\ \text { Transect } \end{gathered}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Transect Length (m) | 36.5 | 80 | 51 | 36.5 | 80 | 51 | 36.5 | 80 | 51 | 36.5 | 80 | 51 | 36.5 | 80 | 51 |
| Area Sampled ( $\mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) | 73 | 161 | 102 | 73 | 161 | 102 | 73 | 161 | 102 | 73 | 161 | 102 | 73 | 161 | 102 |
| No. of Fish Species | 11 | 13 | 13 | 10 | 16 | 7 | 14 | 17 | 11 | 16 | 12 | 10 | 14 | 15 | 13 |
| No. of Fish Individuals | 294 | 413 | 221 | 52 | 97 | 48 | 127 | 303 | 86 | 106 | 191 | 207 | 43 | 127 | 212 |
| No. of $\mathrm{m}^{2}$ Sampled New Fish Species | 6.6 | 12.4 | 7.8 | 7.3 | 10.1 | 14.6 | 5.2 | 9.5 | 9.3 | 4.6 | 13.4 | 10.2 | 5.2 | 10.7 | 7.8 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { No. of } \mathrm{m}^{2} \\ & \text { Sampled/ } \\ & \text { lndividual } \\ & \text { Fish } \end{aligned}$ | 0.2 | 0.4 | 0.5 | 1.4 | 1.7 | 2.1 | 0.6 | 0.5 | 1.2 | 0.7 | 0.8 | 0.5 | 1.7 | 1.3 | 0.5 |
| Fish Biomass ( $\mathrm{g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) | 13 | 41 | 51 | 18 | 13 | 12 | 67 | 206 | 46 | 27 | 29 | 16 | 8 | 56 | 13 |
| No. of Macroinvert. Species | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 |
| No. of Macroinvert. Individuals | 8 | 13 | 22 | 14 | 28 | 16 | 7 | 9 | 12 | 11 | 9 | 14 | 5 | 17 | 14 |

NOTE: lncluded are summery dand from the fish and invertebrate censuses carried out an each transect location. The 1992, 1993, 1994, and 1995 dara are from Brock (1993b, 1994, 1994b, 1995, respectively).

In the 1995 survey at Transect 1,16 species of fishes representing 106 individuals were counted (Brock 1995). This is equivalent to one new fish species encountered for every $4.6 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom examined or one fish seen for every $0.7 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled. The most abundant fish species were members of the genus Chromis, and the standing crop was estimated at $27 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with the eye-stripe surgeonfish or palani (Acanthurus dussumieri) comprising $34 \%$ of the total and the orangebar surgeonfish or na'ena'e (Acanthurus olivaceus) making up $22 \%$ of the total.

In the 1994 survey at Transect 1,14 species of fishes representing 127 individuals were seen (Brock 1994b). This amounts to one new fish species encountered for every $5.2 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of
substratum sampled or one fish seen for every $0.6 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. The most abundant fish species were the juvenile snapper (Lutjanus sp., probably the ta'ape or L. kasmira), which comprised $44 \%$ of the total, and the damselfishes Chromis hanui and Chromis sp., which contributed $29 \%$ of the total. In terms of standing crop, which was estimated at $67 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, the most important contributors were Acanthurus olivaceus, comprising $36 \%$ of the total, and the manybar goatfish or moano (Parupeneus multifasciatus) accounting for $41 \%$.

Noted in the January 1993 survey of Transect 1 were 10 species of fishes ( 52 individuals) comprising an estimated biomass of $18 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ (Brock 1994a). This amounted to one new fish species encountered for every $7.3 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one individual fish seen for every $1.4 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. Of the identifiable species, the most abundant were the damselfishes Chromis hanui and Chromis sp., which comprised $63 \%$ of the total number of fishes present. The most important contributors to the standing crop on Transect 1 were a single Acanthurus olivaceus, comprising $44 \%$ of the total; two bluespine unicomfish or kala (Naso unicornis), making up 13\%; and a single barred filefish or 'ō'ili (Cantherhines dumerilii), accounting for $23 \%$.

In the January 1992 survey at Transect 1, 11 species of fishes representing 294 individuals with an estimated biomass of $13 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ were censused (Brock 1993b). This amounts to one new fish species encountered for every $6.6 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one individual fish seen for every $0.2 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. Of the species that could be identified, the most abundant were Lutjanus sp., which comprised $86 \%$ of the fishes censused, and the damselfishes Chromis hanui and Chromis sp. In terms of standing crop, juvenile snappers (Lutjanus sp.) comprised $57 \%$ of the total and Acanthurus olivaceus accounted for $22 \%$.

Transect 2 sampled $161 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum over 11 sections of pipe (Figure 1). The March 1996 survey at Transect 2 resulted in 15 species ( 127 individuals) having an estimated standing crop of $56 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ (Table 1). This amounts to one new fish species encountered for every $10.7 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one new individual fish seen for every $1.3 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ sampled. The most abundant species were the damselfishes Chromis hanui and Chromis sp., contributing $17 \%$ and $22 \%$ of the total, respectively; and juvenile snappers (Lutjanus sp.), comprising $22 \%$ of the total number. The standing crop was estimated at $56 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with the eye-stripe surgeonfish or palani (Acanthurus dussumieri) comprising 67\% of the total and the manybar goatfish or moano (Parupeneus mulnifasciatus) contributing $18 \%$ to the total.

Four species of diurnally exposed macroinvertebrates were encountered on Transect 2 in the March 1996 survey. In this census there were two Diadema setosum, one black sea cucumber (Holothuria atra), one brown sea cucumber (Bohadschia vitiensis), and thirteen serrated sea urchins (Chondrocidaris gigantea).

The January 1995 survey at Transect 2 resulted in 12 fish species ( 191 individuals) being censused (Brock 1995); this amounts to one new fish species encountered for every $13.4 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one new individual fish seen for every $0.8 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on this transect. The most abundant species were Chromis hanui, making up $8 \%$ of the total; Chromis sp., comprising $56 \%$ of the total; and labrid unidentified, contributing $24 \%$ to the total. The standing crop was estimated at $29 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with the yellowfin surgeonfish or pualu (Acanthurus xanthopterus) comprising $29 \%$ of the total and both Acanthurus dussumieri and Acanthurus olivaceus each contributing $18 \%$ to the total.

Noted in the January 1994 survey at Transect 2 were 17 species representing 303 individual fishes. The most abundant species were the juvenile snapper Lutjanus sp. ( $24 \%$ of the total), the damselfishes Chromis hanui and Chromis sp. ( $33 \%$ of the total), and a group of unidentified wrasses, labrid unidentified ( $19 \%$ of the total). From a comparative standpoint, the 17 species of fishes translates to one new fish species encountered for every $9.5 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled and one individual fish seen for every $0.5 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. The standing crop of fishes at Transect 2 was estimated at $206 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$; the important contributors to this high standing crop were six amberjacks or kahala (Seriola dumerili) that wandered through the census area (making up $49 \%$ of the total), Acanthurus olivaceus (comprising $15 \%$ of the total), Acanthurus dussumieri (contributing $12 \%$ to the total), and the ringtail surgeonfish or pualo (Acanthurus mato-comprising $8 \%$ of the total).

In the January 1993 survey at Transect 2, 16 species of fishes representing 97 individuals were censused. The most abundant species at this transect were juvenile bluelined snapper or ta'ape (Lutjanus kasmira), which comprised $29 \%$ of the total numbers counted, and the damselfish Chromis hanui, which made up $32 \%$. This amounts to one new species encountered for every $10.1 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one fish seen for every $1.7 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. The standing crop of fishes was estimated at $13 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with the species contributing most heavily including two Acanthurus xanthopterus ( $38 \%$ of the total), a single individual of the bridled triggerfish or humuhumu mimi (Sufflamen fraenatus- $16 \%$ of the total), and a single individual of the barred filefish or 'o'ili (Cantherhines dumerilii- $21 \%$ of the total).

In the January 1992 survey of Transect 2, 13 species of fishes representing 413 individuals were censused (Brock 1993b). This translates to one new species seen for every $12.4 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one fish seen for every $0.4 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ sampled. The most common species of fishes seen were Lutjanus kasmira, Chromis hanui, and the manybar goatfish or moano (Parupeneus multifasciatus). Important species by weight included a single blue trevally or 'omilu (Caranx melampygus- $-42 \%$ of the total), Sufflamen fraenatus ( $24 \%$ of the total), the
juvenile snapper (Lutjanus sp.- $11 \%$ of the total), and the smooth puffer or kēkē (Arothron hispidus- $10 \%$ of the total). The biomass of fishes was estimated at $41 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$.

Transect 3 was established on the first seven (most landward) sections of the diffuser pipe that are not fully covered with armor rock (see Figure 1). The March 1996 survey of this transect noted 13 fish species representing 212 individuals. The damselfish Chromis hanui comprised $32 \%$ of the total while Chromis sp. made up $41 \%$ of the total. This translates into one new fish species encountered for every $7.8 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled one new individual fish seen for every $0.5 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom censused. The standing crop of fishes was estimated at $13 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, with Parupeneus multifasciatus making up to $32 \%$ of the total and the ' a 'awa or Bodianus bilunulatus contributing $26 \%$ to the total.

Three macroinvertebrate species were seen on Transect 3, including twelve Chondrocidaris gigantea, one Bohodschia vitiensis, and one Holothuria atra.

In the January 1995 survey, Transect 3 sampled 10 species representing 207 individual fishes (Brock 1995). The most common species were Chromis hanui ( $16 \%$ of the total), Chromis sp. ( $55 \%$ of the total), and labrid unidentified ( $20 \%$ of the total). The group of unidentified labrids is probably comprised of the saddleback wrasse or hīnālea lauwili (Thalassoma duperrey), the twospot wrasse Cheilinus bimaculatus, and the smalltail wrasse Pseudojuloides cerasinus. The amount of substratum sampled to encounter one new fish species was $10.2 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$, and $0.5 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom was sampled for each new individual fish seen on this transect. The standing crop of fishes was estimated at $16 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, and the category of labrid unidentified comprised $53 \%$ of this total while Acanthurus xanthopterus contributed $21 \%$ to the total.

The January 1994 visual census conducted on Transect 3 yielded 11 species of fishes representing 86 individuals (Brock 1994b). This amounts to one new fish species seen for every $9.3 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one individual fish seen per $1.2 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. The most abundant species were Chromis sp., which made up $40 \%$ of the total numbers present, and the unidentified wrasses, labrid unidentified, which made up $27 \%$ of the total. The estimated standing crop of fishes on Transect 3 was $46 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, and the species contributing the greatest amount included Acanthurus xanthopterus and A. mata (each contributing $21 \%$ of the total) and A. dussumieri ( $28 \%$ of the total).

Seven species of fishes representing 48 individuals were censused in the January 1993 survey at Transect 3 (Brock 1994a). This amounts to one new fish species encountered for every $14.6 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled or one fish seen for every $2.1 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom on the transect. The most abundant identifiable fish species was Chromis sp., which comprised $60 \%$ of the total number of individuals at this site. The standing crop of fishes was estimated at
$12 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$; a single sleek unicomfish or kala holo (Naso hexacanthus) contributed $75 \%$ to this amount.

In the January 1992 survey at Transect 3,13 species of fishes were seen, or one new fish species was encountered for every $7.8 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of substratum sampled (Brock 1993b). The number of individual fishes encountered at this transect was 221, or one fish for every $0.5 \mathrm{~m}^{2}$ of bottom sampled. The most abundant fish species appeared to be juvenile snappers (Lutjanus sp.), which made up $53 \%$ of the total number censused. Other common species included Chromis sp. and Parupeneus multifasciatus. The standing crop of fishes, estimated at $51 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$, was comprised of three Acanthurus xanthopterus ( $43 \%$ of the total), one Acanthurus olivaceus ( $21 \%$ of the total), and ten Parupeneus multifasciatus ( $8 \%$ of the total).

The physical characteristics and survey results for the three transects censused annually from 1992 through 1996 are summarized in Table 2. In general, the number of species of fish was similar for the five survey years, whereas the number of individual fish decreased from 1992 to 1993, increased from 1993 to 1994, and remained about the same from 1994 to 1995 , and decreased in 1996. The estimated biomass has been similar through all years except for 1994 when it was greater at all transects. Other than the 1994 biomass estimate, the physical characteristics and survey results for the Barbers Point deep-ocean outfall diffuser are similar to those obtained for the Sand Island deep-ocean outfall diffuser using the same methods (Brock 1992a, 1992b, 1993a).

A concern of this study is to address the question of change in the marine communities resident to the Barbers Point deep-ocean outfall diffuser. A nonparametric statistical comparison of the various parameters over the five years using the Kruskal-Wallis analysis of variance suggests that despite the changes among the survey periods (as shown in Table 2), only one parameter changed in a significant manner. Specifically, the mean amount of substratum censused to find an individual fish did change significantly among the five survey years ( $p>0.04$ ). There were no significant changes on the three transects for the mean number of fish species encountered ( $p>0.65$, not significant), the mean number of individual fish censused ( $p>0.09$, not significant), and the mean estimated biomass of fishes ( $p>0.14$, not significant). The mean amount of substratum covered to encounter a new fish species also did not significantly change ( $p>0.99$, not significant). Further analysis using the nonparametric Student-Newman-Keuls test revealed that the mean amount of substratum censused to find an individual fish was significantly greater in 1993 and 1996; changes among other annual survey years did not show any statistically significant differences. The mean number of invertebrate species censused did not change significantly among the five survey years ( $p>0.07$, not significant), nor did the mean number of invertebrates censused change significantly among the five survey years ( $\rho>0.27$, not significant).

## DISCUSSION

Despite the changes in the number of species and abundance of fishes on each transect among the five annual surveys, only the mean number of square meters examined to find an individual fish showed a statistically significant change. However, the application of statistical procedures to the data derived using a video camera to census the transects is probably not appropriate because of a number of drawbacks inherent with the method. These drawbacks, which are discussed below, result in data that are more qualitative than quantitative in nature, thus making comparisons among years tenuous.

The identification of a number of species of fishes in this study was not difficult because of their size (adult pualu or Acanthurus xanthopterus and kala or Naso unicornis), color (moano or Parupeneus multifasciatus and masked angelfish or Holacanthus arcatus), extreme abundance (ta'ape or Lutjanus kasmira), or diumal habits (damselfish or Chromis hanui). Despite this, a number of the fishes were difficult or impossible to identify because of (1) poor camera resolution due to a lack of water clarity or the camera's field of view, (2) rapid movement of the individual fishes seeking cover, (3) small size of fishes, or (4) fishes being on the periphery of the camera's field of view. Some of these fishes were small Chromis sp. (probably C. hanui or C. agilis), small Lutjanus sp. (probably juvenile L. kasmira), and small wrasses (family Labridae; possibly Cheilinus bimaculatus, Pseudocheilinus spp., Thalassoma spp., or Pseudojuloides cerasinus). In terms of abundance, these unidentified fishes were important but, in general, contributed little to the biomass estimates because of their small size.

Similarly, only large invertebrates can be seen with enough detail to allow identification and censusing. The identification of the two sea cucumbers (Bohadschia vitiensis and Holothuria atra) is tentative because accurate identification requires examination of skin spicules with a microscope.

Most of the fishes encountered on the transects at the Barbers Point deep-ocean outfall diffuser are small (less than 8 cm ) and usually seek shelter on the approach of the video camera, making visual assessment difficult. In the surveys, these small fishes were usually only seen when the video camera was held in a near-vertical position just above the rocky substratum adjacent to the diffuser pipe. Larger fishes were usually only seen when the camera was held in a near-horizontal position, and when seen these fishes were at a distance, leaving the area of the approaching camera. Thus it is evident that the camera angle plays a large role in the general sizes of fishes seen, and because the control of the camera is difficult, considerable variability in the field of view results. Manipulation of the remotely operated and tethered video camera is difficult, especially when considering that more than 60 m of electrical cable are between the camera and the operator on the surface vessel. Not only does wind create
difficulties with keeping the surface vessel on station, but currents may interact with the cable and camera below-all impacting the field of view and fishes seen. Added to this is the fact that both large and small fishes can only be seen when water clarity permits. Further, the effluent from the diffuser discharge ports often obscures the field of view (depending on the local currents), again adding variability to the resulting data.

Through the survey years, changes were made in the operation of the video camera. In the 1996 survey, the camera first traveled down the centerline of and about 1 to 1.5 m above the discharge pipe. This run commenced at the point where the discharge ports first appear and moved toward the terminus. The second run was similar except the camera was situated along the seaward side of the pipe instead. Because the camera was held in reasonably close proximity to the substratum, the videotape of the latter run was used for our survey. In 1995, the camera was primarily operated along one side of the diffuser pipe beading toward the terminus; upon reaching the terminus, the camera was moved to the opposite side for the return trip toward shore. For the January 1994 survey, the camera was kept principally on a track that ran down the middle of the top of the diffuser pipe and was primarily focused abead rather than straight down. During the 1992 and 1993 surveys, the camera was focused primarily downward and moved on a track that went along one side of the pipe and crossed over to the other side. The census of small fishes was probably better in 1992 and 1993 than in 1994. The change in camera operation in 1994 resulted in a better viewing of the larger fishes that were present ahead of the camera, but the time that the video camera was focused on the small armor rock adjacent to the diffuser where many of the small fishes reside was decreased. Thus the 1994 census not only probably reflects a more accurate assessment of the few larger (high biomass) fishes present (these fishes usually leave the area prior to the arrival of the camera), but it also reflects a greater underestimate of the small fishes in the transect area. The emphasis in the 1995 and 1996 surveys on the small-scale cover of the caprock alongside the diffuser probably resulted in a better estimate of the small fishes resident to the area, making these data comparable with the 1992 and 1993 data. Again, these changes have all added to the variability in the resulting data.

The estimated standing crop of fishes ranged from 13 to $51 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in the January 1992 survey, from 12 to $18 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in the January 1993 census, from 46 to $206 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in the January 1994 survey, 16 to $29 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in the January 1995 census, and from 8 to $56 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in the March 1996 sampling effort. In many cases, just a few individual large fish contributed heavily to the biomass estimates. Major contributors to the biomass in the censuses undertaken in 1992, 1993, and 1995 were the orangebar surgeonfish or na'ena'e (Acanthurus olivaceus) on Transect 1, the bridled triggerfish or humuhumu mimi (Sufflamen fraenatus) on Transect 2, and the yellowfin surgeonfish or pualu (Acanthurus xanthopterus) on Transect 3. Besides the
above species, in 1994 six amberjacks or kahala (Seriola dumerili), with an estimated weight of more than 16 kg , were encountered on Transect 2 and on both Transects 2 and 3 were seen a number of eye-stripe surgeonfish or palani (Acanthurus dussumieri) that added substantially to the estimated standing crop at each site. In 1995 and 1996 Acanthurus dussumieri contributed heavily to the estimated standing crop at Transects 1 and 2.

Goldman and Talbot (1975) suggested that a reasonable maximum biomass of coral reef fish is about $200 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$. Space and cover are important agents governing the distribution of coral reef fishes (Sale 1977). Similarly, the standing crop of fishes on a reef is correlated with the degree of vertical relief. Thus Brock (1954), using visual techniques on Hawaiian reefs, estimated the standing crop of fishes to range from $4 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ on sand flats to a maximum of $186 \mathrm{~g}_{\mathrm{g}} \mathrm{m}^{2}$ in an area of considerable vertical relief. The large variation seen in standing crop of fishes on coral reefs is tied to the structural diversity of the habitat (Risk 1972). Some authors (Risk 1972; Gladfelter and Gladfelter 1978; Brock et al. 1979; Ogden and Ebersole 1981; Anderson et al. 1981; Shulman et al. 1983; Shulman 1984; Eckert 1985; Walsh 1985; Alevizon et al. 1985) view reef structure as an important factor in determining the species composition of coral reef fish communities. Thus some of the evidence suggests that both biomass and species composition are influenced by the complexity of the local topography.

The substratum in the vicinity of the Barbers Point outfall diffuser appears to be a sandy plain. Sand habitats typically support a low diversity of fish species and biomass (i.e., biomass ranging from 0.5 to $20 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$; Brock 1954; Brock et al. 1979; Brock and Norris 1989). The deployment of the diffuser pipe situated on a gravel pad with some ballast stone placed up to the midline of the pipe as well as at the ends of most pipe sections provides additional local topographical structure, which has probably influenced the development of the fish community. Because of the small graded sizes used, the ballast stone and gravel pad provide only small-scale shelter. Small-scale shelter is favorable for species that are either small as adults or juveniles of larger species. The average size of the fishes censused in the surveys supports this contention. Thus the presence of a few adult fishes of species that attain some size (up to 30 cm ) will add substantially to the biomass estimates.

Controlling all of the sources of variation inherent with the use of the remotely controlled video camera is difficult if not impossible. The remotely controlled video camera is used for the annual engineering inspection of the Barbers Point discharge pipe by Department of Wastewater Management personnel and probably provides sufficient resolution and information with respect to the physical status of the ouffall and diffuser, but it appears to be inadequate for monitoring the status of fish and macrobenthos on the diffuser. Until an alternative can be found, the remotely controlled video system is the only low-cost means available to view the marine communities on the diffuser. Until a more accurate means of visual
assessment is available, the biological data generated by the remotely controlled video camera should be viewed as qualitative, with little statistical rigor.

## REFERENCES CITED

Alevizon, W., R. Richardson, P. Pitts, and G. Serviss. 1985. Coral zonation and patterns of community structure in Bahamian reef fishes. Bull. Mar. Sci. 36:304-318.

Anderson, G.R.V., A.H. Ehrlich, P.R. Ehrlich, J.D. Roughgarden, B.C. Russell, and F.H. Talbot. 1981. The community structure of coral reef fishes. Am. Nat. 117:476-495.

Brock, R.E. 1982. A critique on the visual census method for assessing coral reef fish populations. Bull. Mar. Sci. 32:269-276.

Brock, R.E. 1992a. An analysis of the fish communities along the Sand Island deep ocean outfall using remote video. I. 1990 data. Spec. Rep. 04.02:92, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu. 6 pp.

Brock, R.E. 1992b. An analysis of the fish communities along the Sand Island deep ocean outfall using remote video. 11. 1991 data. Spec. Rep. 04.08:92, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu. 14 pp .

Brock, R.E. 1993a. An analysis of the fish communities along the Sand Island deep ocean outfall using remote video. III. 1992 data. Spec. Rep. 01.15.93, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu. 15 pp .

Brock, R.E. 1993b. An analysis of the fish communities along the Barbers Point deep ocean outfall, O'ahu, Hawai'i, using remote video. 1992 data. Project Rep. PR-94-02, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawail at Manoa, Honolulu. 10 pp.

Brock, R.E. 1994a. An analysis of the fish communities along the Barbers Point deep ocean outfall, 'Ewa Beach, $\mathrm{O}^{\prime}$ ahu, Hawai 'i, using remote video-1993 data. Project Rep. PR-94-17, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu. 13 pp .

Brock, R.E. 1994b. An analysis of the fish communities along the Barbers Point Ocean Outfall, 'Ewa Beach, O'ahu, Hawai'i, using remote video-1994 data. Project Rep. PR-94-19, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu. 15 pp .

Brock, R.E. 1995. An analysis of the fish communities along the Barbers Point Ocean Outfall, 'Ewa Beach, O‘ahu, Hawai'i, using remote video-1995 data. Project Rep. PR-95-10, Water Resources Research Center, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Honolulu. 15 pp .

Brock, R.E., C. Lewis, and R.C. Wass. 1979. Stability and structure of a fish community on a coral patch reef in Hawaii. Mar. Biol. 54:281-292.

Brock, R.E., and J.E. Norris. 1989. An analysis of the efficacy of four artificial reef designs in tropical waters. Bull. Mar. Sci. 44:934-941.

Brock, V.E. 1954. A preliminary report on a method of estimating reef fish populations. J. Wildl. Mgmt. 18:297-308.

Eckert, G.J. 1985. Settlement of coral reef fishes to different natural substrata and at different depths. In Proc. 5th Int. Coral Reef Congress, vol. 5, 385-390. Tahiti.

Evans, E.C., ed. 1974. Pearl Harbor biological survey-final report. Report No. NUC-TN1128, Naval Undersea Center, Hawail Laboratory.

Gladfelter, W.B., and E.H. Gladfelter. 1978. Fish community structure as a function of habitat structure on West Indian patch reefs. Rev. Biol. Trop. 26 (Supplement 1):65-84.

Goldman, B., and F.H. Talbot. 1975. Aspects of the ecology of coral reef fishes. In Biology and geology of coral reefs, ed. O.A. Jones and R. Endean, vol. 3, Biology 2, 124-154. New York: Academic Press.

Ogden, J.C., and J.P. Ebersole. 1981. Scale and community structure of coral reef fishes: A long-term study of a large artificial reef. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 4:97-104.

Ricker, W.E. 1975. Computation and interpretation of biological statistics of fish populations. Bull. Fish. Res. Bd. Canada 191. 382 pp.

Risk, M.J. 1972. Fish diversity on a coral reef in the Virgin Islands. Atoll Res. Bull. 153:1-6.
Sale, P.F. 1977. Maintenance of high diversity in coral reef fish communities. Am. Nat. 111:337-359.

SAS Institute, Inc. 1985. SAS user's guide: Basics, version 5 edition. SAS Institute Inc., Cary, North Carolina. 1, 290 pp.

Shulman, M.J. 1984. Resource limitation and recruitment patterns in a coral reef fish assemblage. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 74:85-109.

Shulman, M.J., J.C. Ogden, J.P. Ebersole, W.N. McFarland, S.L. Miller, and N.G. Wolf. 1983. Priority effects in the recruitment of juvenile coral reef fishes. Ecology 64:15081513.

Walsh, W.J. 1985. Reef tish community dynamics on small artificial reefs: The influence of isolation, habitat structure, and biogeography. Bull. Mar. Sci. 36:357-376.


[^0]:    NoTE: In the body of the tabie are the numbers of each species censused. At the foot of the table are species and abundance coals and the estimated biomass for each transect.

