

**NOAA Technical Information Series NESDIS  
DSMR-00101 Version 1.0**

doi: 10.25923/wtmp-1p62



**Data Stewardship Maturity Report for GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global  
Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1)**

Table 1 Legend				
Level 1	Level 2	Level 3	Level 4	Level 5
Ad Hoc	Minimal	Intermediate	Advanced	Optimal
Little or no management	Limited Management	Defined Management, partially implemented	Well-defined Management, fully implemented	Full Management, audited, measured, controlled

Table 1. Scores for the Nine DSMM Key Components at a Glance		
Preservability - 5	Accessibility - 5	Usability - 4.5
Production Sustainability - 2	Data Quality Assurance - 3	Data Quality Control/Monitoring - 3
Data Quality Assessment - 0	Transparency/Traceability - 2.5	Data Integrity - 3

NOAA National Centers for Environmental Information January 2020



**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE**  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service

Cover Image: Data Stewardship Rating Diagram for GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1)

Shades of green are used to represent level 1 through level 5 ratings; denoting Ad Hoc, Minimal, Intermediate, Advanced, and Optimal stages for each of the nine key components, respectively. The dark green level indicates all the practices are completely satisfied. The lighter green levels indicate only some of the practices are satisfied. The lightest green level indicates none of the practices are satisfied.

The stewardship maturity of NCEI data product, GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1), is assessed based on a reference stewardship maturity framework. The current maturity ratings of GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1) are at Level 1 or higher for all nine key components with zero Level 1, two Level 2, three Level 3, one Level 4, and two Level 5 key components.

The National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service (NESDIS) manages the Nation's civil Earth-observing satellite systems, as well as global national data bases for meteorology, oceanography, geophysics, and solar-terrestrial sciences. From these sources, it develops and disseminates environmental data and information products critical to the protection of life and property, national defense, and the national economy, energy development and distribution, global food supplies, and the development of natural resources.

Publication in the NOAA Technical Memorandum series does not preclude later publication in scientific journals in expanded or modified form. The NESDIS series of NOAA Technical Reports is a continuation of the former NESS and EDIS series of NOAA Technical Reports and the NESC and EDS series of Environmental Science Services Administration (ESSA) Technical Reports.

Copies of earlier reports may be available by contacting NESDIS Chief of Staff, NOAA/ NESDIS, 1335 East-West Highway, SSMC1, Silver Spring, MD 20910, (301) 713-3578 .

## ASSESSMENT REVISION HISTORY

<b>Revision</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Date</b>
V01r00	Initial Release	12/08/2021

# **NOAA Technical Information Series NESDIS DSMR-00101**

## **Version 1.0**

doi: 10.25923/wtmp-1p62

Data Stewardship Maturity Report for GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global  
Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1)

Raisa Ionin, Lori Hager

NOAA's National Centers of Environmental Information (NCEI)

151 Patton Avenue, Asheville, NC 28801, (828) 271-4800

### **Recommended Citation**

Raisa Ionin, Lori Hager. (2021), Data Stewardship Maturity Report for  
GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis  
(GDS version 1)

NOAA Technical Information Series NESDIS DSMR-00101 Version 1.0, 20pp.,  
doi: 10.25923/wtmp-1p62

## **Table of Contents**

List of Tables	7
Preface	8
1. Introduction	9
2. Results	10
3. Acknowledgment	15
4. References	16
Appendix I The Scientific Data Stewardship Maturity Matrix (DSMM)	17

## **List of Tables**

Table 1. Scores for the Nine DSMM Key Components at a Glance	1
Table 2. Dataset and Data Stewardship Maturity Assessment Metadata	11
Table 3. Stewardship Maturity Levels and Detailed Justifications for Each of Nine DSMM Key Components for the Dataset.	12

## Preface

In response to the President's Open Government Initiative and related policies, NOAA has committed to providing improved public access to all of its environmental information, to enable research and commercial innovation through ease of data discovery and use [Casey, 2016].

OneStop supports NOAA's efforts by leveraging existing access technologies and infusing specific innovations to provide improved discover, access, and visualization services for NOAA's data. Also, OneStop is viewed by a NESDIS as a pathfinder effort with an initial focus on selected high-priority datasets from NESDIS and other program data meeting OneStop standards, but eventually scalable across NOAA's data. Lastly, OneStop is implementing the USGEO Common Framework for Earth Observation Data and leveraging/supporting the NOAA Big Data Project (BDP) and Big Earth Data Initiative (BEDI) [Casey, 2016].

As with any process of improvement planning, agencies need to find out where they are in terms of their compliance to the federal regulations and what they need to do if any areas of non-compliance are identified. To this end, a unified framework would be beneficial for assessing the current stage of stewardship practices applied to individual datasets and for providing a road map that will guide future investments towards enhanced stewardship of environmental datasets. The value and quality of a dataset depends in part on the stewardship practices applied after its development and production. Therefore, a unified framework providing a holistic view of the quality of stewardship practices applied to individual datasets is beneficial to data stewards and users [Casey, 2016].

The Data Stewardship Maturity Matrix (DSMM), jointly developed by domain (data management, technology, and science) subject matter experts from NOAA's National Centers for Environmental Information (NCEI) and Cooperative Institute for Climate and Satellites – North Carolina (CICS-NC), provides such a consistent framework [Peng *et al.*, 2016]. The DSMM, leveraging institutional knowledge and community practices and standards, defines a graduated maturity scale for each of nine key components of scientific data stewardship to enable a consistent assessment of the measurable stewardship practices applied to a given data set or product.

The NOAA data stewardship maturity technical series captures stewardship maturity assessment results for individual datasets, provides consistent representation and citable documents of those assessments, ensures transparency, and allows better data quality information integration and content-based search and discovery of NOAA data.



**Data Stewardship Maturity Report for GHR SST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1)**

**1. Introduction**

**1.1 Purpose**

The purpose of this document is to describe the results of stewardship maturity assessment for NOAA Climate Data Record for Mean Layer Temperature (Upper Troposphere & Lower Stratosphere from UCAR, Version 2, utilizing the Scientific Data Stewardship Maturity Matrix or DSMM [Peng, et al, 2016]. DSMM defines levels of stewardship maturity stages for Preservability, Accessibility, Usability, Production Sustainability, Data Quality Assurance, Data Quality Control/Monitoring, Data Quality Assessment, Transparency/Traceability, and Data Integrity key components. Each of these components is ranked from ‘Ad hoc’ to ‘Optimal’ (see Appendix I). This report is based on evaluation performed by NOAA OneStop metadata specialists working with Subject Matter Experts and utilizing the DSMM template [Peng, 2016].

**1.2 Scope**

Assessing stewardship maturity - the current state of how datasets are documented, preserved, stewarded, and made accessible publicly, is a critical step towards meeting U.S. federal regulations, organizational requirements, and user needs [Peng et al., 2016]. The goal of this document is to provide consistent and transparent stewardship maturity information to data users and decision-makers.

**1.3 Dataset Abstract**

A Group for High Resolution Sea Surface Temperature (GHR SST) Level 4 sea surface temperature analysis produced daily on an operational basis at Ifremer/CERSAT (France) using optimal interpolation (OI) on a global 0.1 degree grid. It provides a daily cloud-free field of foundation sea surface temperature at approximately 10km resolution (0.1 degree) over the full globe. It is generated by merging microwave and infrared satellite sea surface temperature observations including those from the Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer (AVHRR), the Advanced Along Track Scanning Radiometer (AATSR), the Spinning Enhanced Visible and Infrared Imager (SEVIRI), the Advanced Microwave Scanning Radiometer-EOS (AMSRE), the Tropical Rainfall Measuring Mission Microwave Imager (TMI) and the Geostationary Operational Environmental Satellite (GOES) Imager. The satellite SST observations are intercalibrated using the AATSR sensor as a reference (previously re-calibrated using all available in situ data). The development of the global real-time sea surface temperature at Ifremer/CERSAT is supported by European Commission initially in the frame of MERSEA project.

## **1.4 Document Maintenance**

This document is generated and maintained by NOAA's National Centers for Environmental Information. More on policy is available at <https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/>.

## **2. Results**

The data stewardship maturity assessment information is summarized in Table 1. Each component is displayed along with its corresponding score in a color-coded table.

<b>Table 2. Dataset and Data Stewardship Maturity Assessment Metadata</b>	
<b>Dataset Title</b>	GHRSSST Level 4 ODYSSEA Global Foundation Sea Surface Temperature Analysis (GDS version 1)
<b>Dataset Information URL</b>	<a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/metadata/geoportal/rest/metadata/item/gov.noaa.nodc%3AGHRSSST-EUR-L4HRfnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA/html">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/metadata/geoportal/rest/metadata/item/gov.noaa.nodc%3AGHRSSST-EUR-L4HRfnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA/html</a>
<b>Data Provider POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	National Centers for Environmental Information, NESDIS, NOAA, U.S. Department of Commerce, 301-713-3277, NCEI. Info@noaa.gov
<b>Dataset POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Jean-Francois Piolle; jfpiolle@ifremer.fr; +33-2-98224691 IFREMER/CERSAT > Institut Francais de Recherche pour l'Exploitation de la Mer, Center d'Exploitation et de Recherche Satellitaire
<b>SMM Version (Document ID and Version Number)</b>	NCDC-CICS-SMM_0001_Rev.1 12/09/2014
<b>SMM POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Ge Peng, ge.peng@uah.edu, University of Alabama-Huntsville
<b>SMM Template Version (Document ID and Version Numbers)</b>	NCDC-CICS-SMM_0001_Rev.1 v4.0 06/23/2015
<b>SMM Template POC</b>	Ge Peng, ge.peng@uah.edu, University of Alabama-Huntsville
<b>SMM Assessment Version (v&lt;nn&gt;r&lt;mm&gt;, e.g., v01r00)</b>	V01r12
<b>SMM Assessment Date (MM/DD/YYYY)</b>	04/17/2019
<b>SMM Assessment POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Raisa Ionin, raisa.ionin@noaa.gov, Earth Resources Technology, Inc.
<b>Stewardship Maturity Ratings (each key component) (kc1/kc2/kc3/kc4/kc5/kc6/kc7/kc8/kc9)</b>	5/5/4.5/2/3/3/0/2.5/3
<b>SMM Original Assessment Date (MM/DD/YYYY)</b>	05/25/2016
<b>SMM Original Assessment POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Raisa Ionin, raisa.ionin@noaa.gov, Earth Resources Technology, Inc.
<b>SMM Last Modified Date (MM/DD/YYYY)</b>	11/17/2021
<b>SMM Last Modification POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Lori Hager, lori.hager@noaa.gov, CASE Consultants International
<b>SMM Modified Date (MM/DD/YYYY)</b>	04/17/2019
<b>SMM Modification POC (Name; E-mail; Affiliation)</b>	Raisa Ionin, raisa.ionin@noaa.gov, Earth Resources Technology, Inc.

Table 3. Stewardship Maturity Levels and Detailed Justifications for Each of Nine DSMM Key Components for the Dataset.

DSMM Key Component	Stewardship Maturity Rating, Justification, and Comments
<b>Preservability</b>	<p>Level 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Archived by NCEI, which is NOAA designated repository. NOAA is compliant to NARA standards</li> <li>▪ Metadata following ISO 19115-2 standards.</li> <li>▪ Compliant to OIAS RM</li> <li>▪ Plans to update metadata to ISO 19115-1 at a later date</li> <li>▪ Using NCEI Silver Spring Archive Management System, AMS.</li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p>
<b>Accessibility</b>	<p>Level 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Collection level searchable online</li> <li>▪ Granule level is searchable online</li> <li>▪ Additional search options available from collection level site</li> <li>▪ Direct file download available from</li> <li>▪ FTP: <a href="ftp://ftp-oceans.ncei.noaa.gov/pub/data.nodc/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/">ftp://ftp-oceans.ncei.noaa.gov/pub/data.nodc/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/</a></li> <li>▪ HTTP: <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/data/oceans/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/data/oceans/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/</a></li> <li>▪ THREDDS:</li> <li>▪ <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/thredds-ocean/catalog/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/catalog.html">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/thredds-ocean/catalog/ghrsst/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/catalog.html</a></li> <li>▪ Dissemination reports are available to the public <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/ghrsst-long-term-stewardship-and-reanalysis-facility/">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/ghrsst-long-term-stewardship-and-reanalysis-facility/</a></li> <li>▪ Future technology changes are planned</li> <li>▪ Data set is also accessible through NASA PODAAC site: <a href="https://podaac.jpl.nasa.gov/dataset/EUR-L4HRnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA?ids=Collections:ProcessingLevel&amp;values=GHRSSST:*4*">https://podaac.jpl.nasa.gov/dataset/EUR-L4HRnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA?ids=Collections:ProcessingLevel&amp;values=GHRSSST:*4*</a></li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p>
<b>Usability</b>	<p>Level 4.5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The format is interoperable: nc.bz2 for granules</li> <li>▪ User Guide [GHRSSST, 2011] is available online</li> <li>▪ All GHRSSST collections have error estimate</li> <li>▪ All GHRSSST collections have enhanced online capability (e.g., visualization, multiple data formats) TDS, DAP (*data servers maintained at NCEI); access from metadata main landing page; to access those go to a landing page.</li> <li>▪ <a href="https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/archive/arc0072/0123222/1.1/data/0-data/GHRSSSTUserGuidev91.pdf">https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/archive/arc0072/0123222/1.1/data/0-data/GHRSSSTUserGuidev91.pdf</a></li> <li>▪ A GHRSSST User Guide, Quick Start Guide, GHRSSST Data Specification (GDS) manual, and other relevant documents describing GHRSSST data sets can be found in the archive accession, Documentation for The Group for High Resolution Sea Surface Temperature (GHRSSST) data archived at NODC (NODC Accession 0123222), <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/metadata/landing-page/bin/iso?id=gov.noaa.nodc:0123222">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/metadata/landing-page/bin/iso?id=gov.noaa.nodc:0123222</a>.</li> <li>▪ No external ranking</li> <li>▪ No Algorithm or ATBD documents exist for GHRSSST collections</li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p> <p>No algorithm documents are present here for GHRSSST. Data providers have them, but these are not available at NCEI. Will be planned for the future.</p>

Table 3. Stewardship Maturity Levels and Detailed Justifications for Each of Nine DSMM Key Components for the Dataset.	
DSMM Key Component	Stewardship Maturity Rating, Justification, and Comments
<b>Production Sustainability</b>	<p>Level 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The dataset is no longer supported, the end date is 2009: <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/ghrsst-long-term-stewardship-and-reanalysis-facility/">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/ghrsst-long-term-stewardship-and-reanalysis-facility/</a></li> </ul> <p>Comments: Changes for technology are available from individual dataset producers. NOAA does not have them documented.</p>
<b>Data Quality Assurance</b>	<p>Level 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ DQA procedure defined, documented and implemented based on this publication: [Dash, 2012] and is available online <a href="http://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002">http://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002</a></li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p>
<b>Data Quality Control/ Monitoring</b>	<p>Level 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Limited Quality Control metrics are available: <a href="https://www.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/socd/sst/squam/index.php">https://www.star.nesdis.noaa.gov/socd/sst/squam/index.php</a></li> <li>▪ Sampling and analysis are frequent and systematic but not automatic</li> <li>▪ Procedure documented and available online</li> <li>▪ Community metrics defined and partially implemented</li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p>
<b>Data Quality Assessment</b>	<p>Level 0</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ No Algorithm Based Documentation (ATBD) available</li> </ul> <p>Comments: One publication was found: <a href="http://marine.copernicus.eu/documents/PUM/CMEMS-OSI-PUM-010-003-010.pdf">http://marine.copernicus.eu/documents/PUM/CMEMS-OSI-PUM-010-003-010.pdf</a></p>
<b>Transparency / Traceability</b>	<p>Level 2.5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Limited product information available, metadata only on the GHRSSST ODYSSEA landing page: <a href="https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/metadata/landing-page/bin/iso?id=gov.noaa.nodc:GHRSSST-EUR-L4HRfnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA">https://www.ncei.noaa.gov/access/metadata/landing-page/bin/iso?id=gov.noaa.nodc:GHRSSST-EUR-L4HRfnd-GLOB-ODYSSEA</a></li> <li>▪ Product information available in literature: [Dash, 2012] and is available online <a href="http://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002">http://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002</a></li> <li>▪ GHRSSST datasets are under Configuration Management principles: <a href="https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4700465">https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4700465</a></li> <li>▪ Data citation DOI is available from PODAAC site: <a href="https://doi.org/10.5067/GHGOY-4FE01">10.5067/GHGOY-4FE01</a>No UID</li> <li>▪ No ATDB</li> </ul> <p>Comments:</p>

Table 3. Stewardship Maturity Levels and Detailed Justifications for Each of Nine DSMM Key Components for the Dataset.

DSMM Key Component	Stewardship Maturity Rating, Justification, and Comments
<b>Data Integrity</b>	<p>Level 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Data archive integrity verifiable - Checksum technology is available, each GHRSSST_L4_ODYSSEA_GFSSTA package is accompanied by a manifest in XML format containing hash digests generated using various algorithms, including MD5, SHA-1, SHA-384, etc. That includes checksums (.md5) for every file package. <a href="https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/archive/arc0013/0037323/0037323.1.1.xml">https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/archive/arc0013/0037323/0037323.1.1.xml</a></li> <li>▪ Data authenticity is verifiable (since data can be downloaded via HTTPS and HTTPS uses certificates to prove site authenticity)</li> <li>▪ NCEI-MD does not provide digital signatures for data dissemination</li> </ul> <p>Comments:            Example of a checksum file (.md5 file) can also be seen at <a href="ftp://podaac-ftp.jpl.nasa.gov/allData/ghrsst/data/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/2009/001/">ftp://podaac-ftp.jpl.nasa.gov/allData/ghrsst/data/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA/2009/001/</a>            PODAAC ftp site: <a href="ftp://podaac-ftp.jpl.nasa.gov/allData/ghrsst/data/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA">ftp://podaac-ftp.jpl.nasa.gov/allData/ghrsst/data/L4/GLOB/EUR/ODYSSEA</a></p>

### **3. Acknowledgment**

This work is supported by the NOAA OneStop Project.

We thank the dataset POCs for their valuable input, as well as the collaborative efforts of the OneStop teams, especially the Metadata team. We would also like to show appreciation to Ge Peng for her contributions.

The draft of this data stewardship maturity report is systematically generated by a tool created by Kieran Hodnett and populated with the stewardship maturity assessment done by the author(s) of this report. The tool was developed based on a Word template created collaboratively by Robert Partee II, Raisa Ionin, Paul Lemieux III, Ge Peng, Don Collins, and Sonny Zinn with helpful input from the NOAA Central Library and the NCEI Communication Team.

#### 4. References

Casey, K. (2016), The NOAA OneStop data discover and access framework project, Version: June 3, 2016. <https://cdn.ioos.noaa.gov/media/2017/12/OneStop-IOOS-DMAC-03-June-2016.pdf>

Peng, G. (2015) The scientific data stewardship maturity assessment model template, Version: NCDC-CICS-SMM-0001-Rev.1 v4.0 6/23/2015. doi:10.6084/m9.figshare.1211954.

Peng, G., J.L. Privette, E.J. Kearns, N.A. Ritchey, and S. Ansari (2015), A unified framework for measuring stewardship practices applied to digital environmental datasets, *Data Science Journal*, 13, 231-253, doi: 10.2481/dsj.14-049.

Peng, G., J. Lawrimore, V. Toner, C. Lief, R. Baldwin, N. Ritchey, D. Brinegar, and S. A. Delgreco (2016) assessing stewardship maturity of the global historical climatology network-monthly (GHCN-M) dataset: use case study and lessons learned, *D-Lib Magazine*, 22, doi:10.1045/november2016-peng.

GHRSSST User Guide version 9.1, 2011, retrieved online: <https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/archive/arc0072/0123222/1.1/data/0-data/GHRSSSTUserGuidev91.pdf> (Accessed December 22, 2016)

Dash, P. et al. (2012), Group for High Resolution Sea Surface Temperature (GHRSSST) analysis fields inter-comparisons—Part 2: Near real time web-based level 4 SST Quality Monitor (L4-SQUAM), *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 77-80, 31–43, doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002

Dash, P. et al. (2012), Group for High Resolution Sea Surface Temperature (GHRSSST) analysis fields inter-comparisons—Part 2: Near real time web-based level 4 SST Quality Monitor (L4-SQUAM), *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 77-80, 31–43, doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2012.04.002



## Appendix I: The Scientific Data Stewardship Maturity Matrix (DSMM)

Table A1: This matrix (Version: NCDC-CICS-SMM-0001-Rev.1. 12/09/2014) describes the criterion used to evaluate data stewardship maturity for each of the nine DSMM key components [Peng *et al.*, 2015].

<b>DSMM Component</b>	<b>Level 1 <i>Ad hoc</i> Little or no management</b>	<b>Level 2 <i>Minimal</i> Limited management</b>	<b>Level 3 <i>Intermediate</i> Defined management, partially implemented</b>	<b>Level 4 <i>Advanced</i> Well-defined management, fully implemented</b>	<b>Level 5 <i>Optimal</i> Full management, audited, measured, controlled</b>
<b><i>Preservability</i></b> <i>(The state of being preservable)</i>	Any storage location  Data only	Non-designated repository  Redundancy  Limited archiving metadata	Designated archive  Redundancy  Community-standard archiving metadata  Conforming to limited archiving standards	Level 3 +  Conforming to community archiving standards	Level 4 +  Archiving process performance controlled, measured, and audited  Future archiving standard changes planned
<b><i>Accessibility</i></b> <i>(The state of being searchable and accessible publicly)</i>	Not publically available person-to-person	Publically available direct file download (e.g., via anonymous FTP server)  Collection or dataset level searchable online	Level 2 +  Non-standard data service  Limited data server performance  Granule/file level searchable  Limited search metrics	Level 3 +  Community-standard data service  Enhanced data server performance  Conforming to community search metrics  Dissemination report metrics defined and implemented internally	Level 4 +  Dissemination reports available online  Future technology and standard changes planned

<p><b>Usability</b></p> <p><i>(The state of being easy to use)</i></p>	<p>Extensive product-specific knowledge required</p> <p>No documentation online</p>	<p>Non-standard data format</p> <p>Limited documentation (e.g., user's guide online)</p>	<p>Community standard-based interoperable format &amp; metadata</p> <p>Documentation (e.g. source code, product algorithm document, processing or/and data flow diagram) online</p>	<p>Level 3 +</p> <p>Basic capability (e.g., subsetting, aggregating) &amp; data characterization overall/global,</p> <p>e.g., climatology, error estimates) available online</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>Enhanced online capability (e.g., visualization, multiple data formats)</p> <p>Community metrics of data characterization (regional/cell) online</p> <p>External ranking</p>
<p><b>Production Sustainability</b></p> <p><i>(The state of data production being sustainable and extendable)</i></p>	<p>Ad Hoc or Not applicable</p> <p>To obligation or deliverable requirement</p>	<p>Short-term</p> <p>Individual PI's commitment (grant obligations)</p>	<p>Medium-term</p> <p>Institutional commitment (contractual deliverables with specs and schedule defined)</p>	<p>Long-term Institutional commitment</p> <p>Product improvement process in place</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>National or international commitment</p> <p>Changes for echnology planned</p>
<p><b>Data Quality Assurance</b></p> <p><i>(The state of data quality being assured)</i></p>	<p>Data quality assurance (DQA) procedure unknown or none</p>	<p>Ad Hoc and random</p> <p>QA procedure not defined and documented</p>	<p>DQA procedure defined and documented and partially implemented</p>	<p>DQA procedure well documented, fully implemented and available online with master reference data</p> <p>Limited data quality assurance metadata</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>DQA procedure monitored and reported</p> <p>Conforming to community quality metadata &amp; standards</p> <p>External review</p>

<p><b>Data Quality Control/Monitoring</b></p> <p><i>The state of data quality being controlled and monitored</i></p>	<p>None or Sampling unknown or spotty</p> <p>Analysis unknown or random in time</p>	<p>Sampling and analysis are regular in time and space</p> <p>Limited product-specific metrics defined &amp; implemented</p>	<p>Level 2 +</p> <p>Sampling and analysis are frequent and systematic but not automatic</p> <p>Community metrics defined and partially implemented</p> <p>Procedure documented and available online</p>	<p>Level 3 +</p> <p>Anomaly detection procedure well-documented and fully implemented using community metrics, automatic, tracked and reported</p> <p>Limited quality monitoring metadata</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>Cross-validation of temporal &amp; spatial characteristics</p> <p>Physical consistency check</p> <p>Conforming to community quality metadata &amp; standards</p>
<p><b>Data Quality Assessment</b></p> <p><i>(The state of data quality being assessed)</i></p>	<p>Algorithm/method/model</p> <p>Theoretical basis assessed (methods and results online)</p>	<p>Level 1 +</p> <p>Research product assessed (methods and results online)</p>	<p>Level 2 +</p> <p>Operational product assessed (methods and results online)</p>	<p>Level 3 +</p> <p>Quality metadata assessed</p> <p>Limited quality assessment metadata</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>Assessment performed on a recurring basis</p> <p>Conforming to community quality metadata &amp; standards</p> <p>External ranking</p>
<p><b>Transparency/Traceability</b></p> <p><i>(The state of being transparent, trackable, and traceable)</i></p>	<p>Limited product information available</p> <p>Person-to-person</p>	<p>Product information available in literature</p>	<p>Algorithm Theoretical Basis Document (ATBD) &amp; source code online</p> <p>Dataset configuration managed (CM)</p> <p>Unique Object Identifier (OID) assigned (dataset, documentation, source code)</p> <p>Data citation tracked (e.g., utilizing Digital Object Identifier</p>	<p>Level 3 +</p> <p>Operational Algorithm Description (OAD) online, OID assigned, and under CM</p>	<p>Level 4 +</p> <p>System information online</p> <p>Complete data provenance online</p>

<p><b>Data Integrity</b></p> <p><i>(The state of data integrity being verifiable)</i></p>	Unknown or no data ingest integrity check	Data ingest integrity verifiable (e.g., checksum technology)	(DOI system) Level 2 + Data archive integrity verifiable	Level 3 + Data access integrity verifiable Conforming to community data integrity technology standard	Level 4 + Data authenticity verifiable (e.g., data signature technology) Performance of data integrity check monitored and reported