1	Reduced swimming and metabolic fitness of aquaculture-reared California Yellowtail
2	(Seriola dorsalis) in comparison to wild-caught conspecifics
3	
4	Nicholas C. Wegner <sup>1*</sup> , Mark A. Drawbridge <sup>2</sup> , John R. Hyde <sup>1</sup>
5	
6	<sup>1</sup> Fisheries Resources Division, Southwest Fisheries Science Center, NOAA Fisheries, 8901 La
7	Jolla Shores Dr, La Jolla, CA 92037, USA
8	
9	<sup>2</sup> Hubbs-SeaWorld Research Institute, 2595 Ingraham St, San Diego, CA 92109, USA
10	
11	*Corresponding author. Tel.: +1 8585467080.
12	E-mail address: nick.wegner@noaa.gov (N.C. Wegner).
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

## **ABSTRACT**

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

Aspects of swimming and metabolic physiology were measured in aquaculture-reared California Yellowtail (Seriola dorsalis) in comparison to wild-caught individuals in order to examine potential differences in health and fitness associated with captive rearing, and to help identify areas for targeted improvement in *Seriola* aquaculture. Incremental swimming velocity trials using a swim tunnel respirometer on small yellowtail (mean body length = 18.9 cm, mass = 80.1 g) showed that aquaculture-reared fish had a significantly slower mean maximum sustainable swimming speed ( $U_{\rm crit}$ ) (4.16  $\pm$  0.62 BL s<sup>-1</sup>) in comparison to that of wild-caught fish (4.80  $\pm$  $0.52~\mathrm{BL~s^{-1}}$ ). In addition, oxygen consumption ( $\dot{M}_{\mathrm{O}_{2}}$ ) measurements at varying swimming speeds allowed for estimation of standard metabolic rate, which was significantly higher in aquaculturereared yellowtail (7.31  $\pm$  2.32 vs. 3.94  $\pm$  1.60 mg O<sub>2</sub> kg<sup>-1</sup> min<sup>-1</sup> at 18°C). Aquaculture fish also had a lower aerobic scope  $(9.20 \pm 3.44 \text{ mg O}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ min}^{-1})$  in comparison to wild-caught yellowtail (15.80  $\pm$  5.78 mg O<sub>2</sub> kg<sup>-1</sup> min<sup>-1</sup>), which likely contributed to their reduced capacity for fast sustainable swimming. Reduced physical fitness is commonplace in aquaculture-reared fishes, and the examination of wild-caught yellowtail in this study provides baseline metrics that can be used to gauge the health and fitness of future S. dorsalis production. In particular, the lower standard metabolic rate and higher aerobic scope of wild-caught fish represent desirable metabolic characteristics that if achievable in aquaculture through better-rearing practices could allow for increased feed conversion efficiencies and potentially faster growth. At a minimum, a 35-40% reduction in metabolic costs at low swimming speeds (to those observed for wild-caught yellowtail) should result in substantial cost savings for feed in aquaculture operations.

*Keywords:* oxygen consumption; standard metabolic rate; critical swimming speed; aerobic scope; fitness; exercise

#### 1. Introduction

Species of the carangid genus *Seriola*, or amberjacks, are becoming an increasingly popular target for aquaculture development due to their fast growth rates and high flesh quality. While species such as the Japanese Amberjack (*S. quinqueradiata*) and, to a lesser extent, the Greater Amberjack (*S. dumerili*) have been produced in aquaculture for several decades, these operations have been largely dependent on the regional harvest of wild-caught seed (from larvae to large juveniles) that are then reared to market size (Nakada, 2002; Ottolenghi et al., 2004). In most locations, however, the availability of wild seed is a major biological bottleneck that limits *Seriola* aquaculture outgrowth capacity. With recent advances in hatchery-production techniques, wild-captured or domestically-bred broodstock are now being used to produce eggs and larvae for growout operations. This has greatly increased prospects for further *Seriola* aquaculture development and expansion.

Much of this new work has focused on the yellowtail jack species complex (*S. lalandi*) (Abbink et al., 2012; Moran et al., 2007; Stuart and Drawbridge, 2013), which is allowing for *Seriola* expansion into more temperate waters in areas such as the United States, New Zealand, Australia, and Chile. While *S. lalandi* was previously recognized as a single circumglobal species, recent genetic research has revealed at least three closely-related but distinct species – *S.* 

dorsalis from the Northeast Pacific, *S. aureovittata* from the Northwest Pacific, and *S. lalandi* from the Southern Hemisphere (Martinez-Takeshita et al., 2015), the last of which should likely be further split between the waters of South Africa and the South Pacific (Purcell et al., 2015). The genetic distinction between these species is thought to represent local adaptation to regional environmental conditions and highlights the need for comparative studies of culturing methods as well as the need for caution when translocating seed between regions for aquaculture growout (Purcell et al., 2015).

Despite advances in hatchery production for several species, most of the world's current *Seriola* aquaculture production is still based on the capture of wild juveniles. This is largely because wild-caught seed is generally considered cheaper than hatchery production, especially in places such as Japan where the capture of wild seed has been the standard for more than 50 years (Nakada, 2002; 2008). In addition, hatchery-reared individuals are often thought to be of lower quality, showing higher incidences of deformity and having slower growth rates. Still, hatchery production is a much more sustainable practice that could help prevent overfishing naturally-occurring populations for aquaculture use and, in theory, circumvent the juvenile bottleneck on aquaculture expansion by allowing *Seriola* aquaculture in regions of the world where juveniles are not available for capture from the wild. These concepts, coupled with declines in the availability of wild seed (Nakada, 2008), highlight the need for continued research to optimize domestic production.

This study focuses on the health and fitness of the California Yellowtail, *S. dorsalis*, for which hatchery-rearing and growout protocols are currently being tested and are in high demand for US

aquaculture development (Jirsa et al., 2011; Rotman et al., 2017; Stuart and Drawbridge, 2011; Stuart and Drawbridge, 2013; Stuart et al., 2010). To better understand the often referenced inferiority of aquaculture-produced seed, this study establishes baseline physiological metrics of the health and fitness of aquaculture-reared S. dorsalis in comparison to wild-caught counterparts and in comparison to metrics available for other Seriola species. Specifically, we examine aspects of S. dorsalis swimming performance (e.g., critical swimming speed, cost of transport), which have been used as indicators of fish "physiological well-being" (Brauner et al., 1994; Claireaux et al., 2005; Farrell et al., 1997; Hammer, 1995; McKenzie et al., 2012; Plaut, 2001), and are likely representative of regular "health checks" made by large-scale Seriola aquaculture operations [fish health is regularly checked by observing the swimming speed and behavior of individuals during feeding, and the swimming activity of the school as a whole (Nakada, 2008)]. In addition, we compare the metabolic physiology of culture-reared and wild-caught individuals as differences in metabolic fitness affect fish growth, feed conversion efficiency, and likely provide insight into how exercise training and other manipulations may positively affect fish health and growth (Davison and Herbert, 2013; Palstra et al., 2015).

107

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

## 2. Materials and methods

109

108

2.1 Fish collection and husbandry

111

112

113

114

110

Aquaculture-reared *S. dorsalis* were derived from eggs produced by wild-captured broodstock housed at the Hubbs-SeaWorld Research Institute and reared according to current protocols (Stuart and Drawbridge, 2013). Young juveniles were transferred to the Southwest Fisheries

Science Center (SWFSC) at approximately 5-6 cm body length (= total length, BL) where they were housed in  $300 \times 150 \times 90$  cm ( $l \times w \times h$ ) oval tanks (approximately 3,200 l) and held at ambient ocean temperature. Wild-caught yellowtail were captured at 12-15 cm BL by hook and line from local waters (<20 km from shore) associated with drifting kelp. Upon transfer to the SWFSC these fish were housed in identical tanks and temperatures as the aquaculture-reared individuals. Both aquaculture-reared and wild-caught yellowtail were fed commercial pellet fish feed (BioTrout, Bio-Oregon, Longview, WA) to satiation 1-2 times daily six days a week. Wild-caught fish were held 2-4 months in captivity before swim tunnel experimentation. All yellowtail husbandry and experimentation was conducted in accordance with protocol SW1401 of the SWFSC Animal Care and Use Committee.

# 2.2 Swim tunnel experimentation

Exercise endurance testing and respirometry measurements were made on 10 aquaculture-reared ( $18.63 \pm 1.12$  cm BL,  $90.19 \pm 19.88$  g; condition factor =  $1.38 \pm 0.14$ ; means  $\pm$  standard deviation) and seven wild-caught ( $19.31 \pm 1.35$  cm BL,  $65.80 \pm 13.35$  g, condition factor =  $0.91 \pm 0.07$ ) *S. dorsalis* following methods established for active pelagic fishes [including the closely related *S. lalandi* (Clark and Seymour, 2006; Brown et al., 2011)] using a Brett-style swim tunnel respirometer. The acrylic, variable-speed 5.41 swim tunnel respirometer (Loligo Systems, Tjele Denmark) had a  $30 \times 7.5 \times 7.5$  cm working section and was contained within a surrounding buffer tank for thermal insulation and to provide properly aerated seawater for flushing the system between respirometry measurements. The buffer tank was fed by a continuous influx of ambient filtered seawater that averaged  $17.64 \pm 1.61$ °C across experiments. Fish were starved

for approximately 24 hours before being placed in the swim tunnel, where they were allowed to swim steadily at a preferred, low, sustainable speed (typically about 20-25 cm s<sup>-1</sup>) with a continuous inflow of aerated seawater for a 1 h acclimation period prior to experimentation.

The maximum sustainable swimming speed (critical swimming speed,  $U_{\rm crit}$ ) was determined by increasing the velocity of the swim tunnel water by 5 or 10 cm s<sup>-1</sup> steps every 30 minutes until the fish could no longer maintain steady swimming (defined as no longer being able to stay off the screen at the back of the working section) or erratic and non-directional burst activity occurred.  $U_{\rm crit}$  was determined by the equation:

148 
$$U_{\text{crit}} = U_{\text{i}} + U_{\text{ii}} (T_{\text{i}} / T_{\text{ii}})$$
 (1)

where  $U_i$  is the fastest swimming speed maintained for the full 30 minutes,  $U_{ii}$  is the velocity step (5 or 10 cm s<sup>-1</sup>),  $T_i$  is the time swimming at the highest velocity (at which fatigue occurred), and  $T_{ii}$  is the length of time for each step in swimming speed (30 min). Water velocity within the swim tunnel was calibrated using a vane wheel flow probe connected to a handheld flowtherm NT (Höntzsch GmbH, Waiblingen, Germany). Following experimentation, swim tunnel water velocity was corrected for both the cross-sectional area of the vane probe and for the solid blocking effect of the fish in the tunnel according to Bell and Terhune (1970) resulting in true velocity step increases of 3.8 to 4.1 and 7.6 to 10.2 cm s<sup>-1</sup> depending on fish size.

The oxygen consumption rate  $(\dot{M}_{\rm O_2})$  was determined for each fish at each swimming speed using a fiber optic oxygen sensor within the swim tunnel respirometer connected to a Fibox 3 fiber

optic oxygen transmitter (PreSens Precision Sensing GmbH, Regensburg, Germany). Shortly (1-2 min) after the step increase in swimming speed, the swim tunnel respirometer was temporarily sealed from the inflow and outflow of fresh seawater from the surrounding buffer tank using manual valves, and the oxygen concentration within the now closed system was recorded once every 5 s. The oxygen level was allowed to drop until the swim tunnel water reached approximately 80% saturation, at which point the system was flushed (to return the oxygen saturation level to near 100%) and then resealed to continue  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  measurements if time allowed within that velocity step.

2.3 Calculation of oxygen consumption, standard metabolic rate, aerobic scope, and cost of transport

Typically, 2-3 sequential  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  traces (from ~100-80% oxygen saturation,  $R^2 > 0.990$ ) were recorded during each 30 min velocity step, and these were combined to determine a single mean oxygen consumption rate for each individual at each speed. Following the completion of the experiment, the fish was removed from the swim tunnel for mass and length measurements, and the respirometer was resealed to measure background respiration, which was subtracted from fish  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$ .

To compensate for differences in fish mass and water temperature between trials,  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  measurements were adjusted to a water / body temperature of 18°C (using  $Q_{10}=2$ ) and to a body mass (M) of 80 g (using  $M^{0.80}$ ) (Pirozzi and Booth, 2009; Schmidt-Nielsen, 1984). Oxygen consumption data were then used to create an exponential regression relationship for  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  vs.

swimming speed for each individual. Each regression line was extrapolated to a swimming speed of 0 cm s<sup>-1</sup> to estimate the standard metabolic rate for that fish. [Note: In some cases, slow swimming speeds (typically <30 cm s<sup>-1</sup>) were accompanied with added pectoral fin movement and unnatural swimming positions likely associated with swimming below the minimum speed required to maintain hydrostatic equilibrium within the swim tunnel. As in similar studies on pelagic fishes (e.g., Sepulveda et al., 2003), higher than expected  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  measurements at these slow speeds (defined as low-speed  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  measurements that were higher than those of faster speeds) were thus not included in regression analyses for estimating standard metabolic rate. Likewise, as some component of metabolic demand at the final (fastest, non-sustainable) swimming speed would have been derived anaerobically,  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  measurements at this speed were not included in analyses other than determining aerobic scope.] Aerobic scope for each individual was determined by subtracting the standard metabolic rate from the highest observed oxygen consumption rate ( $\dot{M}_{\rm O_{2max}}$ ) during swimming (in all cases this was at the fastest swimming speed).

Cost of transport (COT, mg O<sub>2</sub> kg<sup>-1</sup> m<sup>-1</sup>) was calculated using mass and temperature-adjusted  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  data using the equation:

$$COT = \dot{M}_{O_2} / U \tag{2}$$

where U is the swimming speed. Cost of transport data were plotted for each fish versus swimming speed and the resulting second-order polynomial function was used to estimate the optimal swimming speed,  $U_{\rm opt}$  (defined by the lowest consumption of oxygen per distance swam

207 or vertex of the COT parabola), for each individual. [Note: slower swimming speeds with unnatural swimming movements needed to generate lift were included in this analysis.] 208 209 2.4 Statistics 210 Means  $\pm$  standard deviation of the various swimming and metabolic metrics were calculated 211 from individual fish data. Pairwise comparisons of metrics between aquaculture-reared and 212 wild-caught yellowtail were conducted using a two-tail t-test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). 213 214 215 2.5 Condition factor and deformities Following experimentation in the swim tunnel respirometer, all fish were measured and 216 condition factor (reported above) was determined as (mass/length) x 100. In addition, fish were 217 examined for obvious external deformities that could have affected swimming performance. 218 Due to differences in body shape (condition factor), aquaculture-reared fish were later 219 euthanized with an overdose of MS-222 and radiographic images were taken using a portable 220 MinXray HF 100H+ (MinXray, Northbrook, IL, USA) to examine potential skeletal deformities. 221 222 223 3. Results 224 Fish swimming and oxygen consumption data are shown in Table 1. The mean maximum 225 sustainable swimming speed for 10 aquaculture-reared yellowtail (77.08  $\pm$  9.36 cm s<sup>-1</sup>, 4.16  $\pm$ 226 0.62 BL s<sup>-1</sup>) was significantly slower than that determined for seven wild caught individuals of 227 similar size  $(92.93 \pm 13.32 \text{ cm s}^{-1}, 4.80 \pm 0.52 \text{ BL s}^{-1})$  (P = 0.011). Aggregate data showing the 228

relationship between  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_2}$  and swimming velocity for the 10 aquaculture-reared and seven wild-

caught yellowtail are shown in Figure 1A, and these data reveal that at low, basal swimming speeds (20-30 cm s<sup>-1</sup>) the oxygen consumption rates of aquaculture-reared yellowtail were 36-42% higher than their wild-caught counterparts. Extrapolation of regression equations for individual fish to a swimming speed of 0 cm s<sup>-1</sup> shows that the estimated standard metabolic rate of aquaculture-reared yellowtail  $(7.31 \pm 2.32 \text{ mg O}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ min}^{-1})$  was significantly greater than that of wild-caught individuals  $(3.94 \pm 1.60 \text{ mg O}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ min}^{-1})$  (P = 0.003)  $(18^{\circ}\text{C}, \text{mass} = 80 \text{ g})$ . Although not significant, the lower maximum oxygen consumption rate  $(\dot{M}_{\rm O_{2max}})$  for aquaculture-reared yellowtail ( $16.52 \pm 1.54$  vs.  $19.74 \pm 5.74$  mg  $O_2$  kg<sup>-1</sup> min<sup>-1</sup>), coupled with their significantly higher standard metabolic rate, resulted in a significantly lower aerobic scope in comparison to wild-caught fish  $(9.20 \pm 3.44 \text{ vs. } 15.80 \pm 5.78 \text{ mg O}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ min}^{-1})$  (P = 0.024). This higher standard metabolic rate also appeared to contribute to a higher cost of transport for aquaculture-reared individuals (aggregate data for COT vs. swimming velocity shown in Fig. 1B). However,  $U_{\text{opt}}$  did not differ significantly between aquaculture and wild-caught animals  $(67.45 \pm 9.90 \text{ or } 3.63 \pm 0.53 \text{ BL s}^{-1} \text{ vs. } 70.24 \pm 16.73 \text{ cm s}^{-1} \text{ or } 3.65 \pm 0.92 \text{ BL s}^{-1}).$ None of the wild-caught or aquaculture-reared yellowtail showed obvious external deformities. However, sagittal radiographic images revealed that four of the nine aquaculture fish examined

248

247

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

# 4. Discussion

250

251

252

249

The results of this study show reduced fitness of aquaculture-reared yellowtail in comparison to wild-caught individuals as manifested through several physiological metrics including critical

had varying degrees of shortening and or thickening of vertebrae in the caudal region.

swimming speed, oxygen consumption rates, standard metabolic rate, aerobic scope, and cost of transport. Most previous comparisons of the swimming and metabolic capacity of wild-caught and culture-reared fishes have shown similar gaps in fitness (Basaran et al., 2007; Brauner et al., 1994; Duthie, 1987; McDonald et al., 1998; Shustov and Shchurov, 1988; Young and Cech Jr, 1993), and this is often thought to be the result of domestication selection through multiple generations of captive breeding (Araki et al., 2008; Zhang et al., 2016). However, in this study, the culture-reared juveniles came from wild-captured broodstock (i.e., were F1 generation), and thus domestication selection through multiple generations did not occur. Such reductions in fitness are thus likely associated with rearing in a suboptimal aquaculture setting (e.g., lower water or diet quality, decreased physical activity), or may reflect suboptimal phenotypes having a higher chance for survival in captivity. Both scenarios are likely at work and highlight the need for both genetic studies for the selection of broodstock that produce the highest quality offspring as well as experimentation to determine best rearing practices (i.e., determination of feed, water, and other environmental impacts on fish fitness and growth).

Although some of the observed fitness differences in this study may have resulted from the survival of suboptimal phenotypes, none of the aquaculture-reared fish tested in the swim tunnel experiments showed major external deformities. However, all of the culture-reared fish did have a more compact (anterio-posteriorly compressed) and deeper (dorso-ventrally elongated) body shape in comparison to the wild-caught fish resulting in a significantly greater body condition factor, or greater mass per length. Radiographic examination of aquaculture-reared fish following exercise showed that many had varying degrees of minor vertebral abnormalities (typically irregular compressions and thickening of vertebrae in the caudal region), which are

common in aquaculture and often result in decreased swimming performance (Boglione et al., 2013). Such vertebral deformities are typically thought to be related to deficient nutritional regimes or other environmental stressors during early rearing (Boglione et al., 2014; Boglione et al., 2013; Cahu et al., 2003; Lall and Lewis-McCrea, 2007). However, recent work has also suggested that the lack of exercise commonplace in aquaculture operations decreases skeletal mineralization and can lead to vertebral defects (Deschamps et al., 2009; Solstorm et al., 2016).

Despite the fitness gap typically observed between aquaculture-reared and wild-caught fish, there

are some cases in which cultured fish do not show obvious inferiority (Peake et al., 1997; Thorstad et al., 1997). This suggests that optimal rearing conditions can produce fish of similar or perhaps even better quality than that of wild stocks. Interestingly, the standard metabolic rates determined for aquaculture-reared S. lalandi in previous studies (Brown et al., 2011; Clark and Seymour, 2006) are similar to those of the wild-caught *S. dorsalis* examined in the present study when adjusted for size and temperature (Table 2), and this likely reflects the better established rearing protocols for S. lalandi. For S. dorsalis, rearing techniques from eggs and larvae to market size are still largely in their infancy (Stuart and Drawbridge, 2013), and the metrics determined herein for wild-caught animals can provide helpful achievable standards (benchmarks) for enhancing the swimming and metabolic fitness of those reared in aquaculture. 

In addition to customary efforts to enhance the nutritional and water quality aspects of aquaculture, there has been renewed interest over the last several years to "farm a fitter fish" through the use of exercise conditioning (Palstra and Planas, 2011, Palstra and Planas, 2013). Such exercise training can be induced by forcing fish to swim against a current, and this is

thought to help provide active fish species with increased physical activity that is typically lacking during aquaculture growout. In many cases, exercise has been shown to have substantial health benefits as manifested through increased growth rates and better feed conversion efficiencies (for review see Davison and Herbert, 2013). For some species, including most salmonids, swimming against a current promotes schooling behavior and decreases energetically-costly agonistic interactions (e.g., aggressive biting behavior) (Adams et al., 1995; Christiansen and Jobling, 1990; East and Magnan, 1987), which in turn appear to reduce stress as often indicated by lower circulating cortisol and catecholamine levels (Davison, 1997; Woodward and Smith, 1985). A reduction in stress lowers metabolism and, in theory, allows more energy to be partitioned toward growth (Barton, 1997; Barton and Iwama, 1991; Pankhurst and Van Der Kraak, 1997; Pickering, 1992). While it is still somewhat unclear for salmonids the extent to which increased growth rates result directly from changes in behavior, stress, feeding or a suite of other interrelated factors, exercise-induced growth and feed conversion benefits of similar magnitude are prevalent in many other active fishes that do not display such obvious exercise-induced changes in behavior (Ibarz et al., 2011; Li et al., 2013; Nakagawa et al., 1991; Palstra et al., 2015; Yogata and Oku, 2000). This suggests that exercise-induced enhancements to health and growth may result largely from physiological changes, which could parallel the swimming and metabolic differences observed between aquaculture-reared and wild-caught fish in this study. While only preliminary exercise training studies have been conducted for S. dorsalis, these have shown positive increases in growth (Peters, 2009), and work on other Seriola species (S. lalandi and S. quinqueradiata) have shown up to a 46% increase in growth rate and a up to a 32% decrease in the feed conversion ratio associated with exercise training (Brown et al., 2011; Palstra et al., 2015; Yogata and Oku, 2000). For S. lalandi, Palstra et al.

299

300

301

302

303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

(2015) achieved 46% faster growth rates in exercised fish while providing them with the same amount of food as non-exercised controls.

Such large increases in growth without a change in food consumption require changes to metabolic efficiency in the form of lower maintenance costs (e.g., a lower standard metabolic rate) or lower costs of growth (more efficient nutrient assimilation and tissue generation). The significantly higher standard metabolic rate of the aquaculture-reared fish in this study in comparison to wild-caught fish and those of other *Seriola* metabolic studies (Table 2), suggests maintenance metabolic costs in cultured *S. dorsalis* could be lowered by up to 50%, which would potentially allow more energy to be allocated toward growth. Such decreases in standard or resting metabolic rate have been shown in some cases for Rainbow Trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) (Skov et al., 2011; Woodward and Smith, 1985) and Zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) (Bagatto et al., 2001) following exercise training at optimal swimming speeds. Although not statistically significant, Brown et al. (2011) showed a 7-8% decrease in standard metabolic rate for exercised *S. lalandi* in comparison to non-exercised controls (Table 2), which likely contributed to the 10% increase in growth rate experienced by the exercised fish.

In addition to changes in standard metabolic rate, exercise training has also been shown in some cases to increase  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_{2max}}$  (Gallaugher et al., 2001; Li et al., 2013), contributing to a higher aerobic scope. Although not statistically significant, the  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_{2max}}$  of the wild-caught fish in this study was approximately 20% greater than that of aquaculture-reared fish. This appears to contribute to the 15% higher  $U_{\rm crit}$  in the wild-caught fish, and, in conjunction with a lower metabolic rate, contributes to a 72% larger aerobic scope (Table 1). Gallaugher et al. (2001) suggested that

increases in  $\dot{M}_{\rm O_{2max}}$  associated with exercise training can facilitate the balance of multiple energetically-demanding physiological processes. In the context of promoting fish growth, an increase in maximum aerobic performance may allow for an increase in digestive metabolic capacity (specific dynamic action), and thus growth could potentially be enhanced through the simple digestion and assimilation of more feed. Indeed, Palstra et al. (2015) suggested that if exercised-conditioned *S. lalandi* had been given additional feed in their experiments (i.e., fed to satiation and not limited to what was given to control fish), growth would have likely increased by more than the observed 46%. As such, Davison and Herbert (2013) and others have hypothesized that a high aerobic scope may be a good predictor of the success of exercise training, although this has not always proved to be the case (Khan et al., 2014).

# 5. Conclusions

By comparing aquaculture-reared and wild-captured *S. dorsalis*, this study suggests that aspects of both the swimming and metabolic physiology of this species can be improved in culture growout operations. Assuming similar growth rates, a 35-40% reduction in the metabolic costs of aquaculture-reared yellowtail while swimming at basal speeds (to those observed in wild-caught fish) (Figure 1A), should result in lower feed requirements and substantial cost savings to aquaculture producers. In addition, the observed differences in standard metabolic rate and aerobic scope in this study in conjunction with the success of exercised induced-growth in closely related *Seriola* species, suggests exercise conditioning could have potentially large impacts on *S. dorsalis* physiology and growth and highlights the need for such experimentation. Finally, this study provides baseline physiological metrics that can be used to quantify *S. dorsalis* 

fitness. Such metrics may be advantageous in providing time-sensitive quantifications and screenings to fish health and fitness in aquaculture in comparison to more traditional and time and resource-intensive growout trials of large numbers of fish over several months. Acknowledgements This work was supported by the NOAA Fisheries Office of Aquaculture. The authors thank H. Dewar, A. Mau, L. Robertson, L. Schwebel, and K. Stuart for help in fish rearing, data analysis, constructive conversation, and reviewing versions of this manuscript. 

# References 392 393 Abbink, W., Garcia, A.B., Roques, J.A.C., Partridge, G.J., Kloet, K., Schneider, O., 2012. The 394 effect of temperature and pH on the growth and physiological response of juvenile 395 yellowtail kingfish Seriola lalandi in recirculating aquaculture systems. Aquaculture. 396 330, 130-135. 397 Adams, C.E., Huntingford, F.A., Krpal, J., Jobling, M., Burnett, S.J., 1995. Exercise, agonistic 398 behaviour and food acquisition in Arctic charr, Salvelinus alpinus. Environmental 399 400 Biology of Fishes. 43, 213-218. Araki, H., Berejikian, B.A., Ford, M.J., Blouin, M.S., 2008. Fitness of hatchery-reared salmonids 401 in the wild. Evolutionary Applications. 1, 342-355. 402 Bagatto, B., Pelster, B., Burggren, W.W., 2001. Growth and metabolism of larval zebrafish: 403 effects of swim training. Journal of Experimental Biology. 204, 4335-4343. 404 405 Barton, B., 1997. Stress in finfish: past, present and future - a historical perspective. in: Iwama, G.K., Pickering, A.D., Sumpter, J.P., Schreck, C.B. (Eds.), Fish Stress and Health in 406 Aquaculture. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 1-33. 407 408 Barton, B.A., Iwama, G.K., 1991. Physiological changes in fish from stress in aquaculture with emphasis on the response and effects of corticosteroids. Annual Review of Fish Diseases. 409 410 1, 3-26.

1, 3-26.

Basaran, F., Ozbilgin, H., Ozbilgin, Y.D., 2007. Comparison of the swimming performance of farmed and wild gilthead sea bream, *Sparus aurata*. Aquaculture Research. 38, 452-456.

Bell, W.H., Terhune, L.D.B., 1970. Water tunnel design for fisheries research, Fisheries Research Board of Canada Technical Report, pp. 69.

411

412

413

415 Boglione, C., Pulcini, D., Scardi, M., Palamara, E., Russo, T., Cataudella, S., 2014. Skeletal anomaly monitoring in rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss, Walbaum 1792) reared 416 under different conditions. PLOS ONE. 9, e96983. 417 Boglione, C., Gisbert, E., Gavaia, P., Witten, P.E., Moren, M., Fontagné, S., Koumoundouros, 418 G., 2013. Skeletal anomalies in reared European fish larvae and juveniles. Part 2: main 419 typologies, occurrences and causative factors. Reviews in Aquaculture. 5, S121-S167. 420 Brauner, C.J., Iwama, G.K., Randall, D.J., 1994. The effect of short-duration seawater exposure 421 on the swimming performance of wild and hatchery-reared juvenile coho salmon 422 423 (Oncorhynchus kisutch) during smoltification. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences. 51, 2188-2194. 424 Brown, E.J., Bruce, M., Pether, S., Herbert, N.A., 2011. Do swimming fish always grow fast? 425 Investigating the magnitude and physiological basis of exercise-induced growth in 426 juvenile New Zealand yellowtail kingfish, Seriola lalandi. Fish Physiology and 427 Biochemistry. 37, 327-336. 428 Cahu, C., Infante, J.Z., Takeuchi, T., 2003. Nutritional components affecting skeletal 429 development in fish larvae. Aquaculture. 227, 245-258. 430 431 Christiansen, J.S., Jobling, M., 1990. The behaviour and the relationship between food intake and growth of juvenile Arctic charr, Salvelinus alpinus L., subjected to sustained 432 exercise. Canadian Journal of Zoology. 68, 2185-2191. 433 434 Claireaux, G., McKenzie, D.J., Genge, A.G., Chatelier, A., Aubin, J., Farrell, A.P., 2005. Linking swimming performance, cardiac pumping ability and cardiac anatomy in 435 rainbow trout. Journal of Experimental Biology. 208, 1775-1784. 436

437 Clark, T.D., Seymour, R.S., 2006. Cardiorespiratory physiology and swimming energetics of a high-energy-demand teleost, the yellowtail kingfish (Seriola lalandi). Journal of 438 Experimental Biology. 209, 3940-3951. 439 Davison, W., 1997. The effects of exercise training on teleost fish, a review of recent literature. 440 Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology. 117A, 67-75. 441 Davison, W., Herbert, N.A., 2013. Swimming-enhanced growth. in: Palstra, A.P., Planas, J.V. 442 (Eds.), Swimming Physiology of Fish: Towards Using Exercise to Farm a Fit Fish in 443 Sustainable Aquaculture. Springer, Heidelberg, pp. 177-202. 444 445 Deschamps, M.-H., Labbé, L., Baloche, S., Fouchereau-Péron, M., Dufour, S., Sire, J.-Y., 2009. Sustained exercise improves vertebral histomorphometry and modulates hormonal levels 446 in rainbow trout. Aquaculture. 296, 337-346. 447 Duthie, G.G., 1987. Observations of poor swimming performance among hatchery-reared 448 rainbow trout, Salmo gairdneri. Environmental Biology of Fishes. 18, 309-311. 449 East, P., Magnan, P., 1987. The effect of locomotor activity on the growth of brook charr, 450 Salvelinus fontinalis Mitchill. Canadian Journal of Zoology. 65, 843-846. 451 Farrell, A.P., Bennett, W., Devlin, R.H., 1997. Growth-enhanced transgenic salmon can be 452 453 inferior swimmers. Canadian Journal of Zoology. 75, 335-337. Gallaugher, P.E., Thorarensen, H., Kiessling, A., Farrell, A.P., 2001. Effects of high intensity 454 exercise training on cardiovascular function, oxygen uptake, internal oxygen transport 455 456 and osmotic balance in chinook salmon (Oncorhynchus tshawytscha) during critical speed swimming. Journal of Experimental Biology. 204, 2861-2872. 457 Hammer, C., 1995. Fatigue and exercise tests with fish. Comparative Biochemistry and 458 459 Physiology. 112A: 1-20.

- Ibarz, A., Felip, O., Fernández-Borràs, J., Martín-Pérez, M., Blasco, J., Torrella, J.R., 2011.
- Sustained swimming improves muscle growth and cellularity in gilthead sea bream.
- Journal of Comparative Physiology. 181B, 209-217.
- Jirsa, D., Davis, A., Stuart, K., Drawbridge, M., 2011. Development of a practical soy-based diet
- for California yellowtail, *Seriola lalandi*. Aquaculture Nutrition. 17, e869-e874.
- Khan, J.R., Trembath, C., Pether, S., Bruce, M., Walker, S.P., Herbert, N.A., 2014.
- Accommodating the cost of growth and swimming in fish—the applicability of exercise-
- induced growth to juvenile hapuku (*Polyprion oxygeneios*). Frontiers in Physiology. 5,
- 468 448.
- Lall, S.P., Lewis-McCrea, L.M., 2007. Role of nutrients in skeletal metabolism and pathology in
- fish An overview. Aquaculture. 267, 3-19.
- 471 Li, X.-M., Yu, L.-J., Wang, C., Zeng, L.-Q., Cao, Z.-D., Fu, S.-J., Zhang, Y.-G., 2013. The effect
- of aerobic exercise training on growth performance, digestive enzyme activities and
- 473 postprandial metabolic response in juvenile qingbo (*Spinibarbus sinensis*). Comparative
- Biochemistry and Physiology. 166A, 8-16.
- 475 Martinez-Takeshita, N., Purcell, C.M., Chabot, C.L., Craig, M.T., Paterson, C.N., Hyde, J.R.,
- Allen, L.G., 2015. A tale of three tails: Cryptic speciation in a globally distributed marine
- fish of the genus *Seriola*. Copeia. 103, 357-368.
- 478 McDonald, D.G., Milligan, C.L., McFarlane, W.J., Croke, S., Currie, S., Hooke, B., Angus, R.B.,
- Tufts, B.L., Davidson, K., 1998. Condition and performance of juvenile Atlantic salmon
- 480 (*Salmo salar*): effects of rearing practices on hatchery fish and comparison with wild fish.
- 481 Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences. 55, 1208-1219.

482 McKenzie, D.J., Höglund, E., Dupont-Prinet, A., Larsen, B.K., Skov, P.V., Pedersen, P.B., Jokumsen, A., 2012. Effects of stocking density and sustained aerobic exercise on 483 growth, energetics and welfare of rainbow trout. Aquaculture. 338, 216-222. 484 Moran, D., Smith, C.K., Gara, B., Poortenaar, C.W., 2007. Reproductive behaviour and early 485 development in yellowtail kingfish (Seriola lalandi Valenciennes 1833). Aquaculture. 486 262, 95-104. 487 Nakada, M., 2002. Yellowtail culture development and solutions for the future. Reviews in 488 Fisheries Science. 10, 559-575. 489 Nakada, M., 2008. Capture-based aquaculture of yellowtail. in: Lovatelli, A., Holthus, P.F. 490 (Eds.), Capture-based aquaculture. Global overview. FAO Fisheries Technical Paper No. 491 508. FAO, Rome, pp. 199-215. 492 Nakagawa, H., Nishino, H., Nematipour, G.R., Ohya, S., Shimizu, T., Horikawa, Y., Yamamoto, 493 S.-i., 1991. Effects of water velocities on lipid reserves in Ayu. Nippon Suisan Gakk. 57, 494 1737-1741. 495 Ottolenghi, F., Silvestri, C., Giordano, P., Lovatelli, A., New, M.B., 2004. Capture-based 496 Aquaculture. The Fattening of Eels, Groupers, Tunas and Yellowtails. FAO, Rome, 308 497 498 pp. Palstra, A.P., Planas, J.V., 2011. Fish under exercise. Fish Physiology and Biochemistry. 37, 499 259-272. 500

Palstra, A.P., Planas, J.V. (Eds.), 2013. Swimming Physiology of Fish: Towards Using Exercise

to Farm a Fit Fish in Sustainable Aquaculture. Springer, Heidelberg, 428 pp.

501

503 Palstra, A.P., Mes, D., Kusters, K., Roques, J.A.C., Flik, G., Kloet, K., Blonk, R.J.W., 2015. Forced sustained swimming exercise at optimal speed enhances growth of juvenile 504 yellowtail kingfish (Seriola lalandi). Frontiers in Physiology. 5, 506. 505 506 Pankhurst, N.W., Van Der Kraak, G., 1997. Effects of stress on reproduction and growth of fish. in: Iwama, G.K., Pickering, A.D., Sumpter, J.P., Schreck, C.B. (Eds.), Fish Stress and 507 Health in Aquaculture. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 73-93. 508 Peake, S., McKinley, R.S., Scruton, D.A., Moccia, R., 1997. Influence of transmitter attachment 509 procedures on swimming performance of wild and hatchery-reared Atlantic salmon 510 511 smolts. Transactions of the American Fisheries Society. 126, 707-714. Peters, C.J., 2009. Continuous exercise enhances swim performance and alters growth rate, IGF-512 I, and cortisol in juvenile marine finfish in aquaculture. University of San Diego. Masters 513 Thesis, 176 pp. 514 Pickering, A.D., 1992. Rainbow trout husbandry: management of the stress response. 515 Aquaculture. 100, 125-139. 516 Pirozzi, I., Booth, M.A., 2009. The routine metabolic rate of mulloway (Argyrosomus japonicus: 517 Sciaenidae) and yellowtail kingfish (Seriola lalandi: Carangidae) acclimated to six 518 519 different temperatures. Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology. 152A, 586-592. Plaut, I., 2001. Critical swimming speed: its ecological relevance. Comparative Biochemistry 520 and Physiology. 131A, 41-50. 521 522 Purcell, C.M., Chabot, C.L., Craig, M.T., Martinez-Takeshita, N., Allen, L.G., Hyde, J.R., 2015. Developing a genetic baseline for the yellowtail amberjack species complex, Seriola 523 lalandi sensu lato, to assess and preserve variation in wild populations of these globally 524 important aquaculture species. Conservation Genetics. 16, 1475-1488. 525

526 Rotman, F., Stuart, K., Drawbridge, M., 2017. Effects of taurine supplementation in live feeds on larval rearing performance of California yellowtail Seriola lalandi and white seabass 527 Atractoscion nobilis. Aquaculture Research. 48, 1232-1239. 528 529 Schmidt-Nielsen, K., 1984. Scaling: Why is Animal Size So Important? Cambridge University Press, 241 pp. 530 Sepulveda, C.A., Dickson, K.A., Graham, J.B., 2003. Swimming performance studies on the 531 eastern Pacific bonito Sarda chiliensis, a close relative of the tunas (family Scombridae) 532 I. Energetics. Journal of Experimental Biology. 206, 2739-2748. 533 534 Shustov, Y.A., Shchurov, I.L., 1988. Quantitative estimation of stamina of wild and hatcheryreared Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar L.). Aquaculture. 71, 81-87. 535 Skov, P.V., Larsen, B.K., Frisk, M., Jokumsen, A., 2011. Effects of rearing density and water 536 current on the respiratory physiology and haematology in rainbow trout, Oncorhynchus 537 mykiss at high temperature. Aquaculture. 319, 446-452. 538 Solstorm, F., Solstorm, D., Oppedal, F., Fjelldal, P.G., 2016. The vertebral column and exercise 539 in Atlantic salmon—Regional effects. Aquaculture. 461, 9-16. 540 Stuart, K.R., Drawbridge, M., 2011. The effect of light intensity and green water on survival and 541 542 growth of cultured larval California yellowtail (Seriola lalandi). Aquaculture. 321, 152-156. 543 Stuart, K.R., Drawbridge, M.A., 2013. Captive spawning and larval rearing of California 544 545 yellowtail (Seriola lalandi). Aquaculture Research. 44, 728-737. Stuart, K.R., Keller, M., Drawbridge, M., 2010. Efficacy of formalin and povidone-iodine 546 disinfection techniques on the eggs of three marine finfish species. Aquaculture 547 548 Research. 41, e838-e843.

549	Thorstad, E.B., Finstad, B., Økland, F., McKinley, R.S., Booth, R.K., 1997. Endurance of farmed
550	and sea-ranched Atlantic salmon Salmo salar L. at spawning. Aquaculture Research. 28,
551	635-640.
552	Woodward, J.J., Smith, L.S., 1985. Exercise training and the stress response in rainbow trout,
553	Salmo gairdneri Richardson. Journal of Fish Biology. 26, 435-447.
554	Yamamoto, KI., Itazawa, Y., Kobayashi, H., 1981. Gas exchange in the gills of yellowtail,
555	Seriola quinqueradiata under resting and normoxic condition. Bulletin of the Japanese
556	Society of Scientific Fisheries. 47, 447-451.
557	Yogata, H., Oku, H., 2000. The effects of swimming exercise on growth and whole-body protein
558	and fat contents of fed and unfed fingerling yellowtail. Fisheries Science. 66, 1100-1105.
559	Young, P.S., Cech Jr, J.J., 1993. Improved growth, swimming performance, and muscular
560	development in exercise-conditioned young-of-the-year striped bass (Morone saxatilis).
561	Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences. 50, 703-707.
562	Zhang, Y., Timmerhaus, G., Anttila, K., Mauduit, F., Jørgensen, S.M., Kristensen, T., Claireaux,
563	G., Takle, H., Farrell, A.P., 2016. Domestication compromises athleticism and respiratory
564	plasticity in response to aerobic exercise training in Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar).
565	Aquaculture. 463, 79-88.
566	
567	
568	
569	
570	
571	

**Table 1:** Comparison of swimming and metabolic metrics (means  $\pm$  standard deviation) for aquaculture-reared (n=10) and wild-caught (n=7) California Yellowtail, *S. dorsalis* 

		$U_{ m crit}$	SMR (mg O <sub>2</sub>	$\dot{M}_{ m O_{2max}}$	Aerobic Scope	$U_{ m opt}$
	BL (cm)	(BL s <sup>-1</sup> )	kg <sup>-1</sup> min <sup>-1</sup> )	(mg O <sub>2</sub> kg <sup>-1</sup> min <sup>-1</sup> )	(mg O <sub>2</sub> kg <sup>-1</sup> min <sup>-1</sup> )	(BL s <sup>-1</sup> )
Aquaculture	$18.63 \pm 1.12$	$4.16 \pm 0.62*$	7.31 ± 2.32*	$16.52 \pm 1.54$	9.20 ± 3.44*	$3.63 \pm 0.53$
Wild	$19.31 \pm 1.35$	$4.80\pm0.52 \textcolor{red}{\ast}$	$3.94 \pm 1.60*$	$19.74 \pm 5.74$	$15.80 \pm 5.78$ *	$3.65 \pm 0.92$

For direct comparison, metabolic data for each individual were adjusted to a mass of 80 g using  $M^{0.80}$  and a water temperature of 18°C using  $Q_{10} = 2.0$ . Statistical significance between aquaculture-reared and wild-caught fish is indicated with an asterisk (\*). Abbreviations: BL, body length;  $U_{\text{crit}}$ , critical swimming speed; SMR, standard metabolic rate;  $\dot{M}_{\text{O}_{2\text{max}}}$ , maximum oxygen consumption rate;  $U_{\text{opt}}$ , optimal swimming speed.

**Table 2:** Comparison of *Seriola* spp. standard metabolic rates (SMR), showing the elevated oxygen consumption rate of aquaculture-reared *S. dorsalis* in the current study

	Adjusted SMR*	Reported SMR	Mass	Temp	
Species	(mg O <sub>2</sub> kg <sup>-1</sup> min <sup>-1</sup> )	(mg O <sub>2</sub> kg <sup>-1</sup> min <sup>-1</sup> )	(g)	(°C)	Source
S. dorsalis (aquaculture)	5.07	7.31	80	18.0	current study
S. dorsalis (wild)	2.73	3.94	80	18.0	current study
S. lalandi (non-exercised)	2.47	2.87	699	21.1	Brown et al. (2011)
S. lalandi (exercised)	2.29	2.66	699	21.1	Brown et al. (2011)
S. lalandi	1.78	1.55	2000	20	Clark and Seymour (2006)
S. lalandi	2.66	3.31	1900	25	Clark and Seymour (2006)
S. quinqueradiata	2.43	2.30	989	19.2	Yamamoto et al. (1981)

\*For direct comparison, reported metabolic data from each study were adjusted to a mass of 1 kg using  $M^{0.80}$  and to a water temperature of 20°C using  $Q_{10} = 2.0$ . All SMR estimates for *S. lalandi* are from aquaculture-reared fish. *S. quinqueradiata* from Yamamoto et al. (1981) were reared to experimental size in an aquaculture setting, but were likely captured from the wild as young juveniles. Data from Yamamoto et al. (1981) are for canulated resting fish.

Figure 1: **(A)** Oxygen consumption  $(\dot{M}_{\rm O_2})$  and **(B)** Cost of transport (COT) of aquaculture-reared (grey circles) and wild-caught (black circles) California Yellowtail, *S. dorsalis*, swimming at variable speeds in a swim tunnel respirometer. For direct comparison all data were adjusted to a mass of 80 g using  $M^{0.80}$  and water temperature of 18°C using  $Q_{10} = 2.0$ . These regression lines are for observational purposes only and show aggregate data from all fish; standard metabolic rate and  $U_{\rm opt}$  data presented in the Results were determined as means from individual fish data.